Gérard FRANCILLON

B A L I

Tourism
Culture
Environment

Universitas Udayana
UNESCO
1979
CONTENTS

FOREWORD

INTRODUCTION
  notes: p.15

I TOURISTS IN BALI
  notes: p.31

II TOURISM IN THE BALINESE ECONOMY
  costs of tourism: p.34; the tourists' spending pattern: p.37; the redistribution of income: p.41; a wealth indicator: p.41; handicrafts: p.45; matters of group size: p.51; employed or involved?: p.52
  notes: p.57

III TOURISM IN THE BALINESE SOCIETY
  land: p.59; culture: p.75; people: p.90;
  notes: p.103

IV TOURISM IN THE BALINESE FUTURE
  notes: p.115

CONCLUSION

Appendix I

BACKGROUND INFORMATION ON BALI
  geography: p.125; economy: p.127; culture and society: p.128; history: p.133;
  government and local administration: p.139

Appendix II

SUMMARIES OF REPORTS
  notes: p.147

BIBLIOGRAPHY
FIGURES IN TEXT

Table I  Visitors to Indonesia and Bali before 1965 and after p.11
II  Tourists arrivals, a comparison of monthly average numbers p.21
III  Number of entries by air and by sea p.31
IV  The fall-out of tourism, a comparison over five years p.35
V  Average expenses per tourist per day p.39
VI  Average amounts received from the tourists p.39
VII  Distribution of benefits from the handicraft trade p.45
VIII  Some examples of monthly'average lowest salaries' p.49
IX  Employment in Bali p.53
X  Frozen land in Bualu p.62
XI  A selection of growth rates (1965-1974) p.71
XII  "What is the object of your visit?" p.77
XIII  Number of thefts in Hindo-Balinese temples p.81
XIV  Schools at Batubulan and Mas p.100
XV  Rate of secondary school drop-out p.101
XVI  Value of exports of sculptures p.104
XVII  Population numbers p.147

Plate 1  Children's 'cak' p.29
II  The lamp post at Klungkung p.73
III  Traditional ceremony in a modern setting p.85
IV  Tin roofs at Besakih p.91

Map p.155
FORWORD

There is an increasing awareness in developed and developing countries alike that tourism, in its most aggressive and intensive manifestations, might not be merely a harmless and easy to exploit source of foreign currency, but also a powerful and sometimes dangerous instrument of social, cultural and environmental change. As there has been relatively little research on the effects of tourism on people and natural resources, the Unesco General Conference, at its 17th Session, included a pilot study on the effects of tourism on social, economic and cultural life in its Regular Programme.

This project is part of the Quality of the Environment Programme of the Sector of Applied Social Sciences in Unesco. The Island of Bali, known throughout the world for its artistic, spiritual and natural qualities, is now threatened by a rapidly expanding tourist influx and, for this reason, was the first location to be chosen for study. The staff of the Udayana University of Denpasar, Bali had examined some aspects of the problem; their experience was utilized, with Unesco support, to produce a more complete study on the impact of tourism on the socio-economic development of Bali. This was undertaken by the Udayana University in 1974 and incorporated, with the previous findings, in the present document by the author in his capacity as Unesco consultant.

This paper thus brings together the results of three reports prepared by the University's teaching and research staff. Their most impressive work of research on the development of Bali produced so far is the massive report entitled "A Development Strategy for the Province of Bali." It was
compiled and produced between May and August 1972 at the request of BAPPENAS, the Indonesian office of national planning and development, as a source document for the preparation of the Second Five Year Plan.

Since then, a number of other reports have concentrated on specific aspects of tourism as a major objective in national development, with due regard always to its influence on the culture of Bali.

On examining the report "The Influence of Mass Tourism on the Way of Life in the Balinese Society" it was decided to investigate further points and to integrate them into a single final report. The three main documents which have been used here are summarized in Appendix II but relevant data from a number of other memoirs have been included; these are listed in the Bibliography. However, most of the material come from the three reference reports. Information was also obtained by direct enquiries and personal contacts during one week in June and nearly four in September 1974. As an anthropologist by training and profession, the author was inclined at one stage to see the problem from inside and take sides. But also as an anthropologist, he aimed at making a scientific presentation, with due regard to the facts and the opinions of the Rector and staff of the University, in attempting to assess the influence of tourism on a culture as unique as that of Bali.

Forward to the Second Edition

Over the past two years there has been a constant demand for this compilation, which has been long out of print.

A fourth report on "The Impact of Tourism on the Village Community Development" was completed by June 1975 and an English translation was made with the support of Unesco. The findings were considered an additional reason for preparing a second, revised edition of BALI, Tourism, Culture, Environment.

The Bibliography has been brought up to date and notice has been duly taken of certain remarks and criticisms expressed regarding the first edition.

September 1977
NOTE

on the Spelling and Pronunciation of Indonesian and Balinese Words

The spelling of Indonesian words follows the new convention approved and adopted in 1972 by the Governments of Indonesia and Malaysia. The rendering of most sounds will offer no difficulty to English readers. They have however to be warned that c now replaces the former Malaysian ch and Indonesian tj, and that sy now stands for the former sh and sj, respectively, but it is not a frequent sound and it will not be met in these pages.

The transliteration of the Balinese has not been officially codified, and I have followed the Indonesian usage. It is phonetically imperfect, but it is a fair approximation and is far less cumbersome than any of the phonetic scripts available. At places in the text, I felt it necessary to describe the correct pronunciation of one word or another in order to avoid possible confusion.

For the sake of simplicity, and again to follow the Indonesian usage, I have also abstained, in the Sanskrit names of deities, kings, etc., from the diacritic signs which are the norm in Indian studies.
INTRODUCTION

Bali has been visited a number of times over the past dozen centuries or so. The history of these visits is that of intrusions and invasions of armies and ideologies. As such it could be outlined as a textbook model and it would be the history of kings and princes, of their alliances and wars, of the movements of their troops and the installation of their courts. Such a history has been reconstructed from foreign and indigenous sources. But lists of events carry very little substance in general and in the case of Bali, it is soon realized that a chronological synopsis has little significance. However, for the reader who is not acquainted with Bali, more details of the main historical events are to be found in Appendix I. It would therefore be better to look at the succession of historical events as so many steps towards the integration of the various elements which together compose the culture of Bali.

The harmony of this unique construction has been celebrated so very often and by such talented authors that it seems unnecessary to make another attempt. The exercise will be limited here to pointing out the particular historical events which apparently have influenced most the culture of Bali, assuming that it was, from the beginning, capable of an active choice. This view probably does not constitute an advance in our understanding of Balinese culture, as it merely put the problem some way further back into times where conjecture remains more important than documentation.

Yet, despite its shortcomings, this paper, it is hoped,
might induce the experts on MAB Project 7 'Ecology and rational use of island ecosystems' (1) to consider the case of Bali, not included in the sample of islands with severe problems. In a formal perspective though, Bali has its place in the same problem scale as the Galapagos but at the opposite end. Indeed, it is more in socio-cultural terms than biological terms that the isolation of Bali is best appreciated. The impact of tourism here is on the society, culture and mentality of the Balinese, who cannot play the passive role of objects for ever.

Balinese culture, to keep to its most conspicuous manifestations, consists of Arts, Religion and Way of Life. To subdivide the arts into music and dance, painting and sculpture is famous for its harmony and balance into arbitrary imported moulds. This is not to blame the rigidity of the English language in this respect, for just the same applies to Bahasa Indonesia, the language of the reports. The difficulty, in the case of the Balinese culture more than anywhere else, is to communicate the holism of the phenomenon. No doubt it could be overcome by using Balinese or Javanese words and concepts, but then there would no longer be any communication. One has to stay conscious of the notion that art here is for religion and religion is the way of life and vice-versa. It is however necessary, as the authors have done themselves, to include successive chapters entitled Arts, Religion, Society. It is also legitimate to some extent to begin with religion, as this seems to be the most integrative framework for most Balinese folk activities. But while using alien categories and terms we have to remain aware that the more one cuts the facts down to a set plan, the further one gets from the completeness of reality. One just has to think of the example of the priest's surrogate who performs a purification ritual by acting out a drama with the puppets of a shadow play. Is such a performance artistic (music, dance, painting, sculpture, literature, ...), religious (dogmatics, liturgy, thaumaturgy, hieromancy, ...), or social (involving local corporate groups in their efforts to solve a crisis, to restore order and hierarchy, ...)?

There is little need yet to insist in such broad terms on the balanced character of the culture of Bali. Its history has made it, and from one crisis to the next it has been able to keep its balance. More, it has been capable of making the best of most
crises. The history of Balinese culture is the history of a syncretism. Not a succession of accidental adaptations, but most likely what has to be seen as a systematic and sustained effort to achieve a successful harmony.

The culture of Bali has shown great powers of resistance and adaptation to change. Indeed, the history of the first contacts on record show that the imports were not taken up wholesale but assimilated. Hinduism and the caste system in Bali are neither what they are in India at present nor presumably what they were at the time. Much later on, the Dutch established relations with the northern princedoms. The history of these few contacts is short, one century or so, but it tells a lot. It shows that the foreign bodies were sorted out and then assimilated. A walk through the streets of Singaraja, the capital of the first Dutch Residents, offers a striking demonstration of the integration of many Dutch items of material culture into a Balinese setting. The distinctions are not easily seen, and the dividing line, if any, is blurred. Yet both worlds are present and noticeable, if not distinguishable. This, and a few more facts (2), tend to indicate that Dutch influence, at its nineteenth century pace, was evenly worked through the local culture. During all that time there was hardly one fact in particular which deserved the block letters of a chapter heading in history books (3).

In the early twentieth century, the idea became increasingly unbearable to western governments that enclaves of independent States should subsist and thereby stand in defiance of their imperial authority. Pretexts were soon found to incorporate these areas, and on 20 September 1906, a detachment of Dutch colonial forces made for Denpasar in the princedom of Badung. Here they were opposed to the ruler, his kin, his court and all his truly dedicated followers. The Dutch forces had to open fire at one stage, and had to keep firing until all the white-clad nobility of the Badung princedom were dead (4). Suicide and fighting to the death ('puputan') were the ends similarly chosen by the rulers of Tabanan in 1906 and Klungkung in 1908.

But even so, acculturation continued, and it would be worth facing criticism to support the view that these gory showdow
were, mostly in their forseen effects, wise decisions for the traditional overlords of the traditional South to take. Could it be that the Princes had understood what was going on and knew that it was best for them to withdraw in style, as it were? With the barrier of their stiff and stern tradition removed, Bali could proceed and adapt itself to the changing outside world in whatever respect it was to affect the Balinese people.

After the first world war, development maintained a pre-war, nineteenth century pace for some time, even after the Royal Shipping Company began calling regularly at Bali ports and built a couple of hotels in the early 1920s. It is not the few hundred visitors a year who made up the phenomenon of tourism at the time, although undoubtedly they were the primer. A large proportion of these tourists were indeed persons of influence. They were orientalists and antiquaries who studied religion and literature, prehistory and archaeology, as well as culture in a broader sense. They inventoried and preserved what they thought was in immediate danger, and created libraries and museums. They were artists who became so fascinated as to settle down there as permanently as the circumstances allowed: Walter Spies, the painter, Colin McPhee, the musicologist among others. They were undoubtedly responsible for making Bali known and envied in the West. Their action was characterized in several distinctive ways. They had come to learn and to absorb the Balinese culture, but they were already gifted artists and learned scholars. They were able to make the most out of what Bali had to offer them. And it has to be recognized here that they also brought much with them. Painters and sculptors gave a new impetus to Balinese artists. The musicologist Colin McPhee in particular, besides studying Balinese music as it had never been done before, revived a number of orchestra and dance groups and corporations. The encouragement he gave, if only by showing deep and competent interest, was decisive in the conservation and revival of several forms of gong music and dance which had almost been forgotten in the 1930s. So it can be said that they gave as much as they took, and what they took was not taken away. Thus, their actions and interactions were probably comparable in essence to those of the Javanese monk Empu Kuturan who toured Bali in the
eleventh century and organized the cults and designed temples and shrines into sites which seemed to have been waiting for his genial touch. Indeed, they were not tourists in the contemporary sense, but much more inspired travellers.

The second world war introduced a new pace, as well as new elements, such as the Japanese Navy from 1942 to 1945, and new concerns: Independence proclaimed in 1945 and fought for until late 1949. A very few foreigners of pre-war quality remained. Those who returned in the 1950s were disheartened by the gradual deterioration — mainly in the economic sector.

The external influences, often in mutual conflict, were also of a very different kind. Then the events of the Movement of 30 September 1965 stopped the inflow of visitors to Indonesia. The numbers — as given by the Directorate General of Tourism — fell from 36,000 in 1964 to 30,000 in 1965 and 19,000 in 1966. For their part, the Department of Immigration sources indicate that less than 15,000 visited Indonesia in the year 1966. The decrease thus reached nearly 50 percent.

None of the Reports give any figure for Bali for those years. However, a rough estimate can be made on the basis of the available data. From 19,000 in 1966, the number of visitors to the whole of Indonesia rose again to 52,000 in 1968 when only 5,800 aliens visited Bali. Assuming that the fluctuations in numbers were almost exactly parallel as between Indonesia and Bali, it can be inferred that a mere 2,150 came to Bali in 1966, the year when the 300 double-room Bali Beach Hotel opened at Sanur (5).

The first fifteen years of Independence, with no development, and even some regression towards the end of the period, with a rate of just about 2,000 visitors a year, were the calm ahead of the gale which started soon after.

There had been visitors to Bali, guests or tamu as the tourists are still called, but they are no longer so, for Tamu agung, honoured guests they cannot be. They come and go too fast, they keep away from the Balinese world, they stay apart from the Balinese, there is no communication besides the few words for "important activities" (6) listed in the guide books. They are only tourists,
"an international economic factor" as the League of Nations Economic Commission aptly named them as early as 1936. Now tens of thousands (7) are coming to see Bali as it has been shaped by a dozen centuries of contact and interaction of high intensity, sometimes disruptive, but most often integrative. They are not going to see that, they are not going to be shown anything of the kind (8). They are only going to be shown what they expect to see and what fits best the image advertised by the tourist industry and trade. The 1.3 million visitors forecast as coming to Bali for an average four-day stay in 1982, in the 8,000 rooms of "international and 'acceptable' standards" built on the site of Nusa Dua on the barren Bukit Peninsula will remain there. That is Mass Tourism.

There is ample evidence that Balinese society is strong. It has already shown great powers of selection and adaptation to change provided the changes coincide with its objectives, while others were eschewed as much as possible. The greatest dangers faced by the culture and society of Bali, in the recent decades, have been the unavoidable Japanese occupation and the fighting during the struggle for Independence, the troubled period preceding the Movement of 30 September 1965 and its immediate aftermath. Those 25 years killed cultural tourism. Mass tourism has taken its place. Fortunately, the demands of this new form of tourism are such that they will have to be satisfied by means well above the capacity of the people themselves and will not be drawn from the core of the culture. It may even be said, therefore, that Balinese culture is now entering another of those eras of isolation such as it has known on a number of occasions in its past history. In the years or decades ahead, the Balinese will probably be left alone, giving them the time to reflect and to profit from the lessons of the period from 1940 to 1965. Tourism should not concern them too much. However impressive and threatening, it is marginal.

Using the evidence presented by the Udayana University research teams, attempts will be made to arrive at a somewhat clearer distinction. There are several areas and levels in Balinese society and culture. Not all are affected by modern tourism. There is, of course, a lot of interaction, but it involves only a
Table 1. VISITORS TO INDONESIA AND BALI BEFORE 1965 AND AFTER

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Indonesia Directorate General of Tourism</th>
<th>Department of Immigration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1964</td>
<td>35,915</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1965</td>
<td>29,367 (-18.25%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1966</td>
<td>19,311 (-34.25%)</td>
<td>14,694 (-49.9%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1967</td>
<td>33,234</td>
<td>27,107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1968</td>
<td>52,000</td>
<td>51,330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1969</td>
<td>75,000</td>
<td>39,187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971</td>
<td>160,816 (estimate)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1972</td>
<td></td>
<td>23,110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1973</td>
<td></td>
<td>47,340</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Sources: mainly after Tunnard and Pollacco 1971:50,66 and 68 and UNUD 1974:table 1.7)
few mediating groups. These will have to be identified, and their relative importance assessed, in the course of this review.
Notes:

(1) This is one of the projects of the intergovernmental Man and the Biosphere (MAB) Programme of the Unesco.

(2) In the social field as well. See for example two articles on "Non-conformity in villages of Northern Bali" by I Wayan Bhadra and J.L. Swellengrebel, pp. 189-98 and 199-218 in Bali, Further Studies ...

(3) With apologies to the memory of the many victims of the three consecutive attacks on the Principality of Buleleng on the north coast of Bali in 1846, 1848 and 1849 when finally the fort of Djagaraga fell to Gen. Michels. What is meant here is that the bloody encounters were hardly heard of and echoed either in the rest of the country or in Holland. Not so for the following event ...


(5) The dubious validity of the exercise is the more apparent as one realizes that 25 per cent of the visitors to Indonesia are leisure oriented, a proportion which rises to over 80 per cent for the visitors to Bali.


(7) Hundreds of thousands according to the previsions of the Directorate of Tourism for the next ten years.

(8) Compare Tunnard and Pollacco, p. 109, regarding Central Java: "The Mission feels ... that the local population tends to hide the cultural traits which have the greatest interest for visitors".
I. TOURISTS IN BALI

Who are the tourists? The question has to be asked and, perhaps, one may start with the official definition of the United Nations Conference on International Travel and Tourism (Rome, 1963) or that of the Presidential Instruction No. 9, dated 6 August 1969, as quoted in Report II, p.67. The latter uses an adaptation of the former: "A tourist is a person who travels from his place of residence for a visit to another place for the sake of the travel and the visit". This wide definition, however, comprises criteria which make it difficult to decide who are the tourists and who are the excursionists, day visitors, officials or returning residents on the basis of the statistics made available to the research teams. A total of 53,775 in 1973 is however considered as likely to be wholly made up of tourists to Bali, whereas one would hesitate to claim that many more than 25 percent of the 270,000 visitors to Indonesia in 1973 travelled for pleasure only.

Visitors to Bali are not all of one kind. There is no such thing as an average tourist who stays four days, eats in a restaurant or coffee shop four times a day, visits two places of interest, etc., as the statistics of Report III show him to behave.

Tourists have to be distinguished according to their objectives, their nationalities and their age-groups of which there are three main categories. Furthermore, all tourists may be classified in a time perspective, for example, whether pre- or post-Independence.

Before the opening of the International Airport in
1969, there was probably a number of pre-war style travellers, scholars and artists, a number that was small but quite significant in proportion to the whole, even shortly before the end of the period. There was also a number of eccentrics who were not yet called 'hippies'. They were then known as globe-trotters since they were mostly to be found along the east-west routes through the archipelago from Pulau Pinang in Malaysia and Medan or from Singapore and Jakarta to Dili in Portuguese Timor and Darwin via Bali. Their Balinese stay varied in length of weeks or months. Their number was also quite small, but it has now increased significantly and their name has changed. These travellers' role is important in the Balinese perception of the tourist (1). There was also that class of affluent tourists which patronized the Bali Hotel, Hotel Denpasar and Hotel Satria after the 1920s and Cooks Hotel at Kuta shortly before the war. Then the Bali Beach Hotel opened at Sanur in 1966-67 to cater to a class of high-spending tourists, composed by now not so much of the affluent per se but businessmen, diplomats, western and westernized residents of Singapore and other places in Asia on 'local leave' or again businessmen on extended stopovers and long-range tourists on multiple destination round-the-world travel.

After the airport was made accessible to large capacity jet airplanes, the inflow of visitors rose from nearly 5,800 in 1968 to over 53,000 in 1973 (2). With such figures, the earlier types of tourists lost much of their significance, even if available statistics indicated that they did not in fact decrease in actual numbers. Quite simply, what has happened was that they had either merged into more-or-less corresponding classes or merited, even less than before, a separate count.

At present there are a small number of affluent tourists who are merely day visitors on ex-luxury liners which cruise round Asian ports or around the world. Are they simply following in the wake of the royal honeymoonsers Leopold and Astrid of Belgium? No, for they are only 'skimming' Bali, hardly disembarking for more than half a day and having 'cultural shows' and art dealers board their ships. Their actual number is undoubtedly small and, furthermore, it is merged into the number of entries by sea which
is itself increasing quite fast (even faster it seems than that of travellers by air, judging from the figures provided by the Provincial Office of Immigration for the years from 1969 to 1970) (3).

There are also large numbers of patrons of international class hotels, half a dozen of which are now operating in Bali. Their percentages must be guessed as since the Reports do not provide all the facts necessary for a proper calculation of their numbers and the writer had no authority to conduct a direct enquiry. However, an approximation might be between ten and fifteen thousand in 1973. This is based on a comparison of the number of rooms and beds and the rate of occupancy at two famous first-class hotels with that of the other twenty-four economy-class hotels. This leaves out of the count all the 3,566 rooms of the 120 hotels scattered in seven districts of Bali (no figure is given for the district of Bangli in Report III) as well as those of innumerable 'homestays' (4). Since these tourists have to spend over 24 U.S. dollars per day on accommodation alone, some confirmation of the guess is provided by looking at the tables on pp. 50-2 of Report III. They actually number 26 out of the sample of 100 respondents interviewed in May-June 1974, and their general expenditures are in line with their choice of accommodations, though mostly for restaurant, tour and transport expenses. This is the class which is handled by the international chains of hotels working with associated airlines and affiliated travel bureaux.

Then, there are the masses of tourists who spend one to fifteen U.S. dollars per day on accommodation. This class could also be subdivided again - but not very profitably - according to the amount spent. At the bottom of the spending scale are those eccentrics, globe-trotters and 'hippies' and a little higher up, the low-priced charter flight passengers. The latter are more seasonal than the other classes, being mostly students and teachers (5) drawn into the huge movement of the northern hemisphere summer holidays. In any event, monthly temperature variations are slight and tourism does not appear to be affected by the fluctuating rainfall rates. The seasonal movements by country of origin cancel each other out, except for the sharp lows of June and September which must coincide with several other factors, as yet undetermined, to cause very significant drops (see Table II).
The objectives of the tourists are many and varied. The Reports, somewhat redundantly, devote an intense attention to them. A major attraction is said to be the scenery. Bali's lakes, volcanoes, terraced rice-fields and temples are justly famous. They appeal mostly to tourists over fifty years of age and to particular nationalities, primarily the Japanese, while the pleasures of the sea and the beach attract much younger tourists (30-35 years) also arranged by nationality. Japanese bathers, boaters or surfers are conspicuously absent, but surfing attracts Australian youths who find a compensation for the short and quiet swell in the fact that there are no sharks about. Maximum exposure sunbathing is indulged in by the northern Europeans. Thus the beaches, albeit secondary attractions, do have strong appeal. This is evident from the proliferation of new bungalows, individually owned and rented or offered as separate hotel rooms. Built in the coconut groves bordering the sea, they have created new problems to be examined later on in relation to the system of land tenure.

Balinese culture, art, music and dance are obviously what the four-day tourist expects to be shown to him. Accordingly, the authentic 'objets d'art', to bring back home and use as 'conversation pieces', are offered to him at the hotel doorstep, or more conveniently still, in the air-conditioned arcade shops. The dances and ceremonies are performed in the hotel compounds, quite impressively reproducing temple and/or palace architecture. The four-day tourist, of necessity, is a superficial consumer of culture, but his motivations are clear, coinciding with the slogans of the tourist promotion agencies and his possible expenditure is known well enough for planned exploitation.

Similar objectives motivate a substantial number of well-informed tourists who have read more than travel agents' brochures. There is not a wide choice of literature about Bali, but it is of a high quality whether the genre considered is a novel, a travelogue or a scientific study of culture and behaviour. The cultural tourist spends a lot more than four days in Bali, a lot less on food and accommodation and a lot more on curios. An indication of this tendency is to be found in the tabulated results of the May-June enquiry on pp.50-52 of Report III, but the analysis unfortunately makes no elaboration of its findings. In the view of
Bali Monthly Numbers of Visitors by Nationality 1971

N.B.: EUR includes GB, D, F, I and CH. "Others" have been left out.

Badung District
Monthly Average Rainfall (1968-71)

Table II
the authors of the three Reports, 'Cultural Tourism' is more desirable and is usually opposed to 'Mass Tourism', perceived by them as the cause of so many of the current ills.

It should not be inferred from this brief review of the categories of tourists according to their interests are mutually exclusive. Certainly, a small number of visitors come to Bali to collect objets d'art and antiques even though most declare on the immigration forms that they come for pleasure and not for business. On the other hand, there must be quite a number of sunbathers and surfers who do come only for pleasure to the exclusion of anything else.

The preceding creates another distinction to be made between the different categories of tourists and one which is economically based. Cruise tourists and antique collectors obviously do not have the same spending patterns. Neither appears as such in the tabulated results of the direct interviews made for Report III, but some surprising differences between one column and the next invite interpretation. This will be done at some length when dealing with socio-economic aspects, but based on their absolute numbers alone, it may be said that the main source of foreign currency is from the four-day tourists. One example is respondent № 57, who actually stayed four days, spend 200 U.S. dollars on accommodation and 100 dollars on food, but a mere 60 dollars on tours and transport and 100 dollars on souvenirs — the price of one 50 cm long carved figure in polished heavy wood of a fisherman, as may be commonly found in a first-class hotel arcade shop. This is easily accountable as income from the tourist industry. In contrast, there is respondent № 3, who stayed three days spent fifty dollars on accommodation and food, nothing on tours or transport, but 300 dollars on souvenirs and "etc." (250 and 50 respectively). This is clearly not the kind of customer on whom the tourist industry may rely. Indeed, it is often through the careful examination of direct interviews and systematic questionnaires that the existence of some of the marginal categories of tourists comes to light. The role and the influence of these typical tourists, taken separately, goes beyond their total expenditures. For this latter factor alone, the many low spenders with one dollar per day for a bed in a so-called
'homestay', two dollars per day for food at the beach foodstalls, twenty-five cents per week on transport by micro-bus and not much else apart from second-hand clothes bought in local markets have no place in the statistics. None of them appear among the one hundred interviewees of the sample, but their role in the social and moral fields is quite important. Between this extreme and the previous cases, there are a wide range of medium- to low-spending groups of various classes of 'Social Tourism'.

How much of these distinctions into real or realistic categories figures in the Reports? Very little in fact since the University staff and research teams appear to have been involved themselves in the entanglement of the effects of tourism, a phenomenon they sought to explain. In addition, little distinction has been made between mass and magnitude, cultural interests and interests in culture. Indeed, it is difficult for our Balinese colleagues to see the tourists as we think we see them, and the subjectivity of their perception is scarcely minimized by their scientific endeavour.

A quantitative description is obtained in the second chapter of Report III by working out averages. The one hundred questionnaires boil down to the following picture: The tourist stays four days in Bali (6) and spends 44.58 U.S. dollars per day (7). He has, as the research team "took for granted", four meals a day, namely, breakfast, lunch, dinner and supper. He makes three tours and sees two kinds of show. He has shown a growing tendency in recent years to use buses rather than taxis and, while on tour, to patronize the tourist shops at Celuk for souvenirs made of gold and silver and those at Mas and Ubud for woodcarvings. He also purchases photographic film, postcards and stamps. The four-day tourist is thus the major currency provider; he is a reliable source of profit and, as such, he is responsible for the development of the instruments necessary for the satisfaction of his desiderata.

Between this flat, silhouette of a tourist and the raw, unpolished impressions obtained from the common folk, there is scope for nuance. But in that respect it may come as a surprise that there is actually little difference between the popular image which dates obviously from the pre-war model and the present one.
"By tourist one usually understands a white-skinned, red-haired man, with a body size well above the Balinese mean. He is always seen as one wearing neat and clean clothes, travelling in a car and accompanied. He is associated with the rich and indeed he always carries a lot of money." (8)

Random and informal conversations with villagers, reveal that there is still more in the name 'Belanda' or Dutchman, applied to all white foreigners than just a commonly accepted label for foreigner. 'Belanda' is the usual term for foreigner throughout Indonesia, but only Bali has such a wide experience of the various nations of the world. Can so little difference be perceived between the present-day tourist and the followers of Cornelis de Houtman? ... The stereotype still carries the features of the Residents, District Officers and traders of former days. The Report goes on: "This image survives although the white-skinned and red-haired people are no longer rich and wear ragged and filthy clothes, they go barefoot and carry their belongings in bundles strapped on their backs." Now here it is no longer the villagers who notice the difference, but the academic who reflects upon the impression which the new style of tourists makes on him. As for the villager himself, he does not seem to perceive that the tourist in such detail. The details to which he assigns a differential value are not those one might expect. The tourist, he says when asked to elaborate, is one who takes pictures, who wears sunglasses, etc. These are the impressions of the remote villager whose way of life is not affected in any major consciously noticeable way. On the other hand, someone in frequent contact with the tourists is much less indifferent, and can therefore be expected to be able to discriminate. To one village headman of the Regency of Tabanan, the tourists are just an unbearable nuisance. They enter compounds without being invited, they step on stones or lean on statues which are not there for that purpose, even when told not to; they think everything is for sale and can be bought. "They cannot even tie their loincloth properly", he said. Evidently, there had been too many foreigners intruding on his compound so conveniently situated at a bend of the road and looking so inviting with its dozens
of little black fibre-roofed altars. Evidently, he too lumped together all tourists into one category and he had just reached the point where he had to vent his verbal wrath on the undesirable visitors — highly unusual behaviour for a representative of a people who are known the world over for their hospitality, their placid character and their gleaming smiles of welcome.

Surely a latent hostility of this kind — with its fitful manifestations — is largely due to an ignorance which is so glaring in the roughcast judgments as to what kind of people the guests actually are.

But there is probably more to it. A truly distrustful attitude always lurks beneath the surface. Equally ignorant as to what the hosts actually are, rare are the tourists who will admit that they had not found the openhanded hospitality they were told exists, or that they had been treated with suspicion and disdain by the Balinese. Of course, the prima facie evidence is that the Balinese's first and immediate response is a smile (9), and it would take some more expert face-reading to realize that this is a façade, a rather pleasant one, but a mask nonetheless. It should not cause one to ignore the grins and horribly threatening faces of the stone divinities at every street corner and the other phantasmal representations of the evil as well as the good spirits (10). How many tourists would accept that this is the actual face of the Balinese, hidden behind a smile? As for hospitality, it is true that the compound gateway is not closed with a locked gate, but a wall does stand across the doorway. Even though it is there to ward off malevolent spirits and shield the compound from the stranger's view — and is probably only effective for those ends since it would not prevent any one from entering — it is nonetheless the opposite of an invitation. This is a hard thing for a tourist, conditioned by his local tourist agent, to realize and to admit that beneath the veneer there exists a different reality. This veneer is of a unique quality and there is no intent to depreciate it. Furthermore, knowing what it is there for, makes the whole complexus all the more fascinating, estimable and worthy of passionate study.
But nevertheless, one must see the cacti and the broken glass splinters stuck on the top of the walls of the private family residences for what they are. One must also realize what the village children are doing when they scream abuse at the Barong dragon in the village processions, teasing him and pulling his hair, and when they behave in much the same way towards the lone foreigner who happens to be present. Both are perceived as good but dangerous monsters. Much of the excitement of the children is play, but there exists a deeper fear which must be overcome.

This may very well be the role of these artistic displays which are so attractive in Balinese culture, i.e. to placate the threat of the dangerous spirits and occult forces which abound in Bali and are a constant danger at all times and all stages of life, but which exist nowhere but in the minds of the people.

The foregoing may help us understand the ambivalent attitude of the Balinese towards tourism. This is reflected in the language used in the Reports: "The character and attitude of good manners and mutual confidence, of faithfulness, of humility, of simplicity, of mutual help, of renunciation of material goods, of love towards one's duties", are things of the past. "Of course, their decline today is not to be attributed wholly to mass tourism, but it has to be recognised as attested by a comparison between the situation prior to the opening of the international airport and now, that the elimination of moral values is in direct proportion to the growth of concrete buildings all over the place." (11)

Need one list here all the evils which derive from this degeneration of moral values? They make up most of the 220 pages of Report I and can be summed up under a few headings: People, mostly the young, think more about themselves than about their duties to the community. People, mostly the young, are now interested in money, from whatever source even by accepting tips, offering the services of prostitutes, selling valuable antiques obtained from their own families or others through confidence tricks or theft. People, mostly the young,
show a growing lack of respect towards their elders, for example, by keeping their hands stuck in their pockets or, resting on their hips. They demonstrate a lack of consideration for the traditional rules of conduct by seeking isolation in the exercise of what the authors call 'romantic love'.

Is it necessary here to emphasize that the virtues of the past are things of the past for most cultures of the present world? And to point to the poor quality which fares at the local cinemas which nightly show packed houses the vilest examples of human behaviour to be seen? These are much more likely to be adopted as models by Balinese youth than the few dozen nudists or a handful of possible drug addicts spread over tens of miles of beaches.

Might it be suggested that, consequently, the anathema pronounced against 'hippies', in particular, and tourism, in general, is formulated in terms of the particular Balinese cultural idiom? It arises from a need to concentrate all the responsibility for the ills of modern society in one of its many aspects, and to assign the cause of these ills to what is actually one of the effects. Like Barong, the frightening and benevolent village dragon, tourism is both feared and wooed.
Notes:

(1) See McKean, 1971, *Pengaruh-pengaruh asing* ...

(2) See Table I, above.

(3) **Table III**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>By Air</th>
<th>By Sea</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1969</td>
<td>10,813</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>22,390</td>
<td>720</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971</td>
<td>30,790</td>
<td>2,233</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(4) In 1973, two wards of Kuta (Tegal and Pande) declared a total of 31 'pensions', that is, bed and breakfast, ranging in capacity from one to half a dozen double-bed rooms, rarely more. 'Homestay' is the officially accepted term for residences at which paying guests are accommodated.

(5) About 1/3. In his sample of 50 interviewees, Coucy lists 18 students or teachers, one of whom was an Australian and three were staying at Sanur, presumably in the higher spending class.

(6) This juncture provides the opportunity to clear an ambiguity in the use of the word 'income' in the first sentence of p. 4, chapter II, "By income we mean the money spent by the tourists in Bali". Literally, the Indonesian original sentence reads: "By income, we mean income which originates from the tourists from the moment they first set foot on Bali" which is considerably closer to the general acceptance of the word.

(7) *Strategi Pembangunan*, I, p. 71, evaluated the average expenditure at 35 dollars a day in 1971.

(8) Report I : 55

(9) Compare Geertz 1972 : 1 "As we wandered around, uncertain, wistful, eager to please, people seemed to look right through us with a gaze focused several yards behind us on some more actual stone or tree. Almost nobody greeted us; but nobody scowled or said anything unpleasant to us either, which would have been almost as satisfactory. If we ventured to approach someone [...], he moved, negligently but definitely, away."

(10) Compare Mead's cognate interpretation: "... But in Bali it is impossible to regard every contributor to the arts as a deviant, a misfit, a maimed individual who seeks to heal his diseased soul through artistic expression. My husband and I made a collection of casual carvings from a mountain village, carvings which in the cleverness and resourcefulness with which they
express, in outrageous and grotesque forms, fears and attitudes toward the human body, can be paralleled only from children's psychotic wards or the purposely disassociated products of the Surrealists. Yet these carvings are not the work of one or two specially aberrant or specially gifted individuals but of some sixty male inhabitants of a village of about eight hundred people; and the carvers ranged in age from seven to seventy, and in physique and character they ran the whole gamut of Balinese personality. They differed from their fellow citizens in that they knew how to carve rather better, and perhaps gave less time to dancing or to music — that was all. Otherwise they were simple Balinese peasants working within a flexible tradition which allows fancy free play. (1970: 334-5, orig. 1940)

(11) Report I : 60
II. TOURISM IN THE BALINESE ECONOMY

For some time now the Government of Indonesia has been making an effort towards the development of tourism as a major economic asset. The first five-year plan (REPELITA 1969-1973) provided for a preferential regime to be applied to Bali and to serve in later years as a model for future tourism development policies.

Investments and Returns

Of the 265,000 million rupiah devoted to the improvement of communications and tourism, Bali has obtained the necessary 7,069 million to upgrade the airport at Tuban (renamed Ngurah Rai International Airport) and improve the road system of the central area of Denpasar-Bedugul-Kintamani-Bangli where most of the 94 recognized tourist resorts are situated. On the whole, this policy has produced the expected effects since in the period considered, the rates of growth were very remarkable in most activities (See Table IV).

The allocation (1) of public funds in the REPELITA programme to communication projects has been closely accompanied by a parallel developing inflow of tourists, income in foreign currency, and private investments. The sources (Strategi Pembangunan, I, p.76) also show that an increasing share of private investments has been allocated to the Hotel sector rising from 30 percent of the funds of private origin as of December 1970 to 81 percent as of June 1972. Over the same period may be observed a growth of private funds allocated to Hotel and Catering equivalent to 295 percent from 1970 to 1971 and 923 percent from
1971 to the middle of 1972. The private investments in industry which from 11 percent of the total in 1970 fell to 7 percent of the total in June 1972, were still reckoned to have trebled between 1970 and 1971 (297 percent) and doubled from January to June 1972 (208 percent).

The curves show a distinctly general growth of the most spectacular kind. They have been combined in Table IVa to exhibit as much as possible their relative ups and downs on a common time scale, between 1969 and 1973, the years for which documents are available.

The same table shows the number of visitors to Bali growing from 11,000 in 1969 to nearly 54,000 in 1973 while Bali's earnings of foreign currency grew in the same period from 2 to nearly 9 million U.S. dollars, not to mention the value of exports to both the domestic and the foreign markets, which grew from 2.5 to 6 million dollars (converted from rupiahs at 410 per U.S. dollar). There are fifteen commodities ranging in foreign exportability from cattle and rubber to monitor-lizard skins through coffee, tamarind and woodcarvings. There was a small slump in the real exports in 1971. The statistics of the Export Division of the Provincial Department of Commerce dated 16 May 1974 show that the decrease has mostly affected the main exports (cattle, rubber, coffee) in both volume and value. This is neither explained, nor is it apparently explicable in terms of tourism.

Costs of Tourism

If the foreign currency earnings must be considered as earned for the nation and for Bali, one can probably say that such is not the case of the REPELITA allocations and privately invested funds. They mostly represent the costs of tourism. True, the road network was due for repair, but the cost of an international airport is certainly to charged against the tourism account. There is no need to develop this point at great length but if it were not for tourism as it stands, it could be postulated that the REPELITA efforts, choosing from among the quantified examples available, would have emphasized irrigation projects which have instead been allocated 155 million rupiahs in 1969-

As to what are the costs of tourism, the only limit imposed is that of the imagination of the investigator. Besides the loss of potential earning power which results from the use of good cultivators as poor guides, fertile rice-fields as scorched parking-lots, precious irrigation water to fill useless hotel swimming-pools, etc. there are also far less quantified aspects. In this respect, one striking example is the loss of traditional values which at the other, very remote, end of the causal chain involved the cost of an increased police force to supplement the decreasing authority of banjar (hamlet) elders, or the cost of the reinforced customs and legal apparatus to control the trade and export of antiques sold by a growing number of disbelievers in the non-monetary value of such sacred articles. These elements can certainly be quantified and fed into the general sum of profits and costs related to tourism in Bali, but so far the data have not been collected to this end. Such a work would need unrestrained co-operation at the provincial level of all public services and private organizations as well as some considerable means to integrate the data, whether mechnically or electronically or both.

So far, these elements, which are well recognized, have been inventoried in the chapters where they belong, as qualitative facets of a deterioration of the moral norms of the society.

The Tourist's Spending Pattern

To the flat question asked of the tourists at the airport "How long have you been in Bali and how much have you spent (hotel, restaurant, tour, performances, souvenirs, transport, etc.)", flat answers were given.

Averaging the answers produced the results shown on Table V. On proceeding to check the accuracy of the responses from the consumers' side, the authors found after their parallel enquiry conducted with two hundred more questionnaires given to the recipients of the amounts spent by the tourists, that the
figures were comparable (Table VI).

The differences between the estimates obtained from the tourists and those obtained from the recipients were correctly treated as resulting from low and high estimates and found to be insignificant. Nevertheless, some comments have to be made.

First of all, the tourists expenditure patterns, as mentioned earlier, are not as uniform as could be inferred from the figures opposite and one would gain a much greater understanding of tourist spending behaviour from closer analysis of the data. The validity of this attempt is unfortunately impaired by the sample size. Its results are at least an encouragement to collect more data along these lines. There is no doubt, however, that much very useful information could be found in the material collected for the World Bank and for other private bodies involved in the development of tourism in Bali, e.g. their feasibility studies.

The major dividing lines between the economic categories of tourists being the hotel rates, it should be profitable to compare the tourists who spend over 24 dollars per day on accommodation and those who spend one dollar only on this item, and then count them. The other items of expenditure would then carry much more significance. I have already noted that the one-dollar-a-night 'homestayers' were not approached during the May-June 1974 enquiry. Actually, only one of them is listed among the 100 respondents and the reason for the absence of this class of visitors is most likely that the greater numbers enter the island via the Gilimanuk ferry, the cheapest route. Also, since they tend to stay for weeks and even months, the chances of meeting the more affluent ones in the departure lounge of the airport are proportionally much less than those of meeting the four-day tourists. This is to be regretted for their mass — not their sheer numbers — is all the more considerable as due to their longer stays. Only seven one to six dollar-a-day tourists appear among the 100 respondents of the Report. If one compares this percentage (7 percent) to the 1972 situation when 7,357 'homestayers' registered with the Police at Kuta and Ubud out of a total of 47,340 visitors to Bali during that year, then a percentage of 15.5 percent is obtained. Even if many factors have
Table V.  AVERAGE EXPENSES PER TOURIST PER DAY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>U.S. dollars</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotel</td>
<td>17.15</td>
<td>38.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>9.56</td>
<td>21.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tour/guide fee</td>
<td>3.99</td>
<td>8.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entertainment</td>
<td>1.16</td>
<td>2.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Souvenirs</td>
<td>9.16</td>
<td>20.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport, not including the fare on tours</td>
<td>2.32</td>
<td>5.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>1.24</td>
<td>2.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>44.58</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table VI  AVERAGE AMOUNTS RECEIVED FROM THE TOURISTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>U.S. dollars</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotel</td>
<td>14.47</td>
<td>37.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>10.78</td>
<td>28.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tours/guides</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>10.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entertainment</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>1.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Souvenirs</td>
<td>6.39</td>
<td>16.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport</td>
<td>0.80</td>
<td>2.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>1.24</td>
<td>3.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>38.43</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
not been taken into account because they are either unknown (the number of homestayers at Sanur and other seaside resorts, etc.) or unsuspected, the difference is important and the validity of the sample becomes accordingly questionable.

The Redistribution of Income

Second in importance is the redistribution of income, the main subject of Report III. A large amount of data have been collected for the purpose but unfortunately a sizeable part of these data is of little value. This is particularly the case of Supplement I which lists over six pages of names, addresses and numbers of rooms of all hotels in Bali; Supplement II which lists 36 restaurants, with their names, addresses, phone and licence numbers and capacity (for half of them only, with no explanation as to the wide variations noted, for instance from 36 percent in the case of Restaurant Pagi Sore to 200 percent in that of Bali Bay Supper Club); Supplement III, a list of 38 travel agents; Supplement IV, a list of 144 antique shops, etc. A number of other tables only provide raw material that remains unprocessed in the text e.g. Table 3.4 of p.65 "Guide fees, taxi and bus fares for every tour". The analysis, nevertheless, achieves some results in a few cases, when in particular the average sums received by the various economic units as tabulated above: hotels, restaurants, etc. are broken down to their constituent parts. The average four dollars which a tourist spends per day on tour is thus found to be the sum of 1.80 dollars on taxi and bus fares, .58 dollars on guide fees and 1.62 on travel bureau charges.

A Wealth Indicator

As both the reports and the other sources used here make frequent allusions to the advantages derived from tourism, for the nation as well as the ordinary citizen, it is felt that somewhat more than the aforesaid is needed to indicate the true situation of the population and to decide how much of the improved welfare, an immediately observable fact, is due to tourism.

Table IVb shows the evolution of an activity, the
weaving of endek cloth on handlooms. Endek is a tie-dyed cloth peculiar to Bali as for its design and colours. Technically, it differs from the batik and it is not so well-known or marketed outside Bali (except perhaps in the Lesser Sundas, the land of ikat as the tie-dye technique is commonly known), but the statistics do not give any figure for the export of endek as such, whether on the foreign or the domestic market.

I have chosen endek as an index for the following reasons. Firstly, it is one of the few activities which have been recorded accurately and regularly during recent years by a competent agency, the Directorate of Industry. Secondly, in contrast with the very few other activities for which data of comparable value are available, handweaving produces goods which in the first place are both Balinese by origin in their manufacture and traditional in their use, unlike 'trade' wood-carvings. In addition, they do not appear in any significant way as an export commodity and, being used for everyday garments, the endek cloths are thus consumed entirely locally. In the third place, they are consumed by the common people, urban as well as rural, unlike ice-cubes and carbonated beverages, the consumption of which is directly correlated with the movements of tourism. It indicates most authentically that there is an increased availability of incally that there is an increased availability of income among the mass of the population, which is neither employed nor directly concerned with tourism without excluding those who are. It is an index of the evolution of the purchasing capacities for goods that are half necessity and half prestige or luxury within all strata of the population. Its fluctuations, nonetheless follow the general economic evolution of the Island.

Thus, this weaving industry may be the most apparent reference parameter. Nothing else would indicate the growing consumption capacity of the Balinese folk in such a neutral way. If available, the changes in the protein/starch ratio of the diet would be useful indicators, but it is well known that it is not until a long term adaptation by education and acculturation among others, that diet composition changes to reflect a wealthier
mode of life. Similarly, an increase in the consumption of rice correlated to a decrease in that of maize would not simply mean that an increased income helps people to improve the quality of the staple consumed. There are strong and deep-rooted cultural determinant to this which would invalidate the choice of this indicator. Indeed, only one-half of the population of Bali eats white rice and one-fourth eats no rice but maize and various kinds of beans, but this ratio corresponds largely to the relative distribution of rice growers and maize growers and to the availability of irrigable land. Thus geographically, the contrast between the rice eaters and the maize eaters corresponds to that between the lowland and the highland Balinese. But this is at the same time the most fundamental contrast — culturewise — between the two poles of Balinese civilization. One extreme example of this overall structural contrast is seen in the fact that whereas the lowland Balinese dispose of the dead in three stages, — by interment, cremation and, finally, scattering ashes in the sea — the highlanders, or the more traditional among them, 'expose' their dead on the bare ground.

An investigation of the increase in the consumption of foreign luxury goods could also have been envisaged, but radio-sets and wrist-watches, among the most obvious choices, are mostly attractive to a limited age-class and sex namely the younger men, or 16.9 percent of the total for the 15-34 year olds, and to urban people, a mere 10 percent of the total population. From other Malaysian and Eastern Indonesian experience I came to think that the position of gold could be examined for this purpose. But the difficulties ahead are easily foreseen. Not all the available wealth is necessarily converted into gold, and even if it were, it would have to be gauged how much is exhibited in the form of jewellery compared with what is hidden and hoarded — the proportion in which they are vary to high degree with the particular culture under consideration.

Consequently, the use of the endek cloth indicator alone would lead one to agree with the conclusion reached by the authors of Report III that tourism is profitable.

"It is obvious that tourism is playing a very important
role in yielding foreign exchange for Indonesia in general and for Bali in particular ... It can also be seen that the income of the people in this area... is increasing, new roads for employment ... are open to people, so that they are able to enjoy a higher as well as an extra income" (p.39).

Yet, we would hardly agree wholeheartedly with this for we cannot help notice that if the increased profit does spread out among the whole population, urban and rural, it does so in a way that is quite subtle to assess and with such a lag as to cause discontent and create unwanted migration to urban and tourist centres. Most of all, this wealth grows rather thin by the time it reaches the common folk. The curves of Table IV have been arranged so as to clarify their parallel evolution. As for quantities, the figures have to be read as well. In particular, it has to be noted that one length of endek cloth only costs about 2.50 U.S. dollars!

It is conclusive though that the one-year lag of the 1971 slump in exports, whatever its causes were, had a deferred effect on the people's purchasing capacity and, similarly, that the 1972 recovery was only felt in the cloth output of the following year, which eventually achieved a rate of growth equal to that of the other economic activities. How directly can it be related to tourism? Was it not rather a result of the 208 percent growth of private investment in industry as noted between December 1971 and June 1972? During that time neither the inflow of tourists nor their money showed any significant slackening.

Note that if the figures for active and total hand-weaving workshops run contrary to those of production and employment, it is only as a result of the concentration of the means of production with a view to increasing the output per handloom. This is also in accordance with the increase of private investment in industry.

What the evidence obtained from the use of the hand-woven cloth indicator does afford, is only a hypothesis. At best, it will have given a strong impression which has still to be
tested in the field and possibly confirmed by a closer look at the real situation in the form of detailed studies of household budgets within the hamlet (banjar) (2). There, new and more precise indicators could probably be found. Unfortunately, there can be no great choice for the reasons already stated above, which point to the necessity for the indicators to be goods that are computed and tabulated in Government statistics as well as so much needed and wanted by the whole population that they would show the fluctuations in welfare with a greater precision.

Handicrafts

A more substantial piece of information is provided under the heading 5. Art/Souvenir Shops, p. 8 f., of Report III. It concerns the income of woodcarvers as investigated on a previous occasion quoted as a "Feasibility Study of the Development of Woodcarving Industry in the Province of Bali". Woodcarvers receive up to 60 percent from the sale of statues of a size of 60 cm and over, but the ratio is reversed in favour of the art dealer in the case of sculptures smaller than 60 cm. This information seems to apply only to the independent wood carver. On the other hand, the woodcarver, who is under contract to an art dealer, receives less than 29 percent of the sale-price and even less when capital investment is deducted.

Table VII. THE DISTRIBUTION OF BENEFITS FROM THE HANDICRAFT TRADE

| Handicraftsman       | 20 % |
| Capital investor     | 19 % |
| Art shop             | 36 % |
| Guides and drivers   | 25 % |
| (commissions)        |     |
|                      | 100 %|

Reference to Table 9 of p. 33 and to p. 187 of Report I indicates that wood has to be imported in rather large quantities: 20,000 tons of wood identified as ebony, 4,000 m3 of "manilkara", 52,5 kg of sandalwood for the year 1971. Whatever the reliability of these figures and of the species identification, it seems evident that funds have to be made available on a large scale for
the purchase of wood overseas, and that such an expenditure is beyond the means of most of the 22,287 handicraftsmen (3) who were registered in 1971. This total includes woodcarvers, silversmiths and goldsmiths, weavers and basket-and mat makers. But even for the art-dealer, who, in the view of the authors of the Reports, is somewhat better off than the exploited artists, there must be insurmountable problems. On the one hand, compare the total value exported with the number of exported items at $0.98 U.S. dollars a piece, according to one source and $0.74 dollars according to another, and, on the other hand, evaluate the average earnings of the individual craftsman judging from the value of the exports: 2.50 U.S. dollars for the whole of 1971. Obviously, woodcarving is not, under such conditions, an economic proposition of any great appeal. However, in view of the fact that there is actually a sizeable production, a viable trade, and presumably an equivalent consumption of woodcarvings and other handicraft products considered typical of Bali, more research is needed to find out why it is so. At first glance it would appear that, apart from the rare antique pieces and a few recent works of comparable craftsmanship and inspiration, what is offered in 1974 on the market is inferior to the production of even ten years ago. There has been a dreadful loss of quality in the craftsmanship with no gain in invention and style. As the middle of the chain seems to keep making some profit at the expense of the underpaid woodcarvers on the one end and also at the expense of the overcharged tourist on the other, all agree that the blame is to be put on the practice of granting commission to the guides and drivers (4). One wonders too, how the whole machine keeps on running? Who organizes the purchase of and provides the capital for an unbelievable shipment of 20,000 tons of ebony? Another question is for what purpose the handicraft industry should be encouraged officially if so few profit from it? Report III, p.9, mentions and makes use of some material from the "Feasibility Study..." already mentioned. Its conclusions and recommendations are not reproduced in the Report. They are, however, likely to be favourable to a planned development of handicrafts.

The question of capital and the salaries of woodcarvers is approached in Strategi Pembangunan (5). The difficult position
of the independent craftsman who gathers together enough capital on his own to carry on production attracts sympathy from the authors and still more from the reader, to both of whom the association of competitive interests of the art shop owner and the craftsman is unlikely it seems, to constitute a sound foundation for an association of the traditional type (sekehe). However, the artists and craftsmen are expected to adapt the traditional model to their trade and to modern conditions of work.

The salaries of a craftsman are shown on p.15 of Report III to rank only fourth highest even among the "average lowest salaries" with a monthly 5,000 Rp., well below the salaries paid in international hotels (17,500 Rp.), in travel bureaux and in restaurants (see Table VIII). There is again little indication in what way the figures have been derived, but the whole picture shows some consistency with another source, the report "Kesempatan Bekerja" of August 1972 (6) in which the monthly salary of a sculptor is given as 5,446.93 Rp. which compares favourably with a worker's pay of 4,370.50 Rp. and both are greater than that of a peasant with 3,414.61 Rp. On the other hand, this latter figure differs wildly from that computed from the report "Strategi Pembangunan" vol.1 (7) in which the monthly income of the peasant is given as only 621.75 Rp.; that of a fisherman as 1,020.23 Rp. and that of an employee as 3,024.33 Rp. As for the salary of the handweaver, it is indicated as 2,125 Rp. per month. (8)

These discrepancies call for a complete re-examination of the question with a reassessment of the data and in particular, a review of the methods applied. It is true that an estimate of the income of a cultivator is an arduous task, which, for that matter, necessitates a careful choice of criteria and a uniform definition of the modes of calculation. Nothing of the kind is done in the reports which are available. Yet one must agree that employees of international class hotels do stand at the top of the scale, while peasants must be found at or near the bottom, if the cash referent is used alone. As the rural population of Bali amounts to 90 percent of the total, it is surely important to know whether tourism benefits them at all.

The general tone of Report IV reveals a constantly
growing conviction that tourism development is economic growth and, therefore, is good for the nation and thence for the Balinese. But rarely do the authors provide satisfactory evidence to substantiate this contention. More often adverse elements are seen to complicate matters and the authors are faced with complex situations wherein a number of factors come into conflict and make it impossible at first reading to distinguish their respective roles and decide which are favourable and which are not.

In the past, the villages of Mas and thereabouts used to find it difficult, during two months of the wet season, to carry on until the next harvest. Many villagers had to move out and work on building sites, public works projects, etc. From 1971 onwards, tourist demand placed such pressure on the craftsmen that at the height of the tourist season there was a shortage of labour to work in the fields. The situation is now reversed and outside labourers have to be hired. Yet, the same period still means hardship because the rains often render the roads impassable – especially the side roads to banjar Nyuh Kuning and banjar Pengosekan – and the hamlets' famous sculptures, paintings and plaited mats and wickerwork cannot be sold, except through the art shops found along the main roads of Ubud and Mas. But as we know (See p. 99 below), the artshop owners tend to value the works according to their size rather than their esthetic merits, while the tourists would rather buy the smaller pieces of 'portable art'.

Here we have a badly entangled situation nearing deadlock: overstocking, decline of quality, etc.

Two remedies are suggested (p.17): one is the improvement of the side roads so that the tourists may be driven to the actual centre of production; the second is the allocation of loans equivalent to these two months of scarcity to enable the artists and craftsmen to escape from the art dealers' grasp which, incidentally, confirms the unfavourable impression gained from the previous Reports about their role. All the more now that three newly created artists associations are showing encouraging results:

At banjar Pengosekan "the painters and sculptors used to work at home where they usually displayed four or five of their
SOME EXAMPLES OF MONTHLY 'AVERAGE LOWEST SALARIES'
according to the following three sources (in Rp.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employees of:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International hotels</td>
<td>Carvers</td>
<td>&quot;Employees&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17,500</td>
<td>5,446.93</td>
<td>3,024.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel bureaux</td>
<td></td>
<td>Handweavers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12,000</td>
<td></td>
<td>2,125.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restaurants</td>
<td>&quot;Workers&quot;</td>
<td>Fishermen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5,030</td>
<td>4,370.50</td>
<td>1,020.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Handicraftsmen</td>
<td>Painters</td>
<td>Peasants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5,000</td>
<td>4,003.28</td>
<td>3,414.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art/Souvenir shops</td>
<td>&quot;Workers&quot;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4,800</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drivers</td>
<td>Painters</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4,500</td>
<td>4,003.28</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art organisations</td>
<td>&quot;Workers&quot;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4,022</td>
<td>4,370.50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotels of economy class</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TABLE VIII**
own works. In addition they have formed three large associations and exhibit their works at the house of their respective chairmen. The associations [the Balinese word sekehe (traditional association) is not used in this connection] are comprised of twenty to thirty members each.

"The objectives are to purchase jointly the equipment and materials for the trades, to offer all the works on the market to facilitate the choice of the buyers. The associations also intend to help the young to develop their talents.

"These three associations have already done much for the welfare of the banjar, they have contributed to the construction of one three classroom elementary school, helped to complete several gong orchestras and offered contributions to temples. The net monthly profit per artist averages 30,000 Rp." (Report IV : 15)

This really seems to be an outstanding achievement given the difficulties mentioned above, some of which apply whether the artists are associated or contracted or neither of the two. And it also argues strongly in favour of the development of traditional arts along their traditional lines of organization, rather than through the largely-imported systems of government loans or individual contracts with private dealers.

It is to be regretted that this is not clearly stated in the Report. The reason is likely to be that the authors — as well as the artists and local authorities — are too prone to favour resorting to Government help, citing the lack of capital as the main cause of hardship, whereas Balinese traditional society can provide its own means of organization capable of adaptation to the changing conditions of the socio-cultural environment — i.e., the tourist art market.

Matters of Group-size

It appears from Report III that "the number of fulltime employees engaged in the tourist industry is estimated at 10,269 persons" 10 percent of whom are non-Balinese. The numbers are the highest for hotel and art-shop employees who make up more than half this total. To the 22,287 craftsmen already cited, 1,929 performing artists, dancers and musicians can be added, but not being full-timers they are not included in the forecast of
the future role of tourism in increasing employment. This speculation on p.19 of Report III is somewhat vitiated by errors of various origins (9) but most of all there seems to be little justification in considering the total Balinese work-force as the sum of the 10-64 year age group, a decision however that was previously taken in 1972 for the chapter on demography in Strategi Pembangunan (10). The conclusion, nevertheless reflects an order of magnitude which is admissible, namely, that "the tourist industry is only capable of absorbing .48 percent of the total population of Bali which numbered 2,117,475 at the time of the 1971 Census". Obviously, this is of very little absolute significance, and the percentage is further reduced to .44 percent as it leaves out the 1,000 non-Balinese full-timers. But it would grow to 1.58 percent of the total 1971 population if part-time craftsmen, dancers and musicians were included. Tourism, it seems sufficiently clear, does affect Bali and the Balinese, but only about 1 percent of them (+/- .5 %) are more or less directly involved at the present time.

Employed or Involved?

On the basis of the estimated potential work-force of 1,405,000 (i.e. 66.3 percent of the total population, Report III calculates the percentage of those directly involved in the tourist industry who number 10,269, as .73 percent. It would serve no useful purpose to refine on these figures and exclude the 1,000 non-Balinese. The percentage would then be reduced to only .66 percent. Further, one could exclude the rural population of 1,900,000 or nearly 90 percent of the total population of Bali who, although involved in tourism at least as objects, are not 'directly employed'. Still better, one could assess the position of the latter in that sector of the workforce which is neither agricultural nor industrial but tertiary, who number 309,100 which constitutes 22 percent of the labour force (11). They would then be found to represent 3.32 percent of the population, from which hotel and restaurant staff, guides and drivers are most likely to come. The attractive advantage of this procedure is that the part-timers would thus appear in the sector of the potential workforce that is neither employed in industry (7.6 percent) nor in services, but in the so-called agricultural sector
Table IX. EMPLOYMENT IN BALI

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Potential workforce</td>
<td>66.35% of the total population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All full-time employees</td>
<td>.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balinese full-time employees</td>
<td>.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Handicraftsmen</td>
<td>1.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dancers and musicians</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All full-time employees</td>
<td>.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balinese full-time employees</td>
<td>.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All full-time employees</td>
<td>3.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balinese full-time employees</td>
<td>2.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Handicraftsmen</td>
<td>2.57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dancers and musicians</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(67.7 percent or 941,185). The 24,216 handicraftsmen and dancers and musicians would then account for 2.57 percent of the agricultural/rural populations.

The disadvantageous position of the rural population is thereby confirmed. Tourism is all the less likely to bring profit to this 90 percent of the people as it brings them fewer employment opportunities for less income. Let us examine as closely as the evidence allows, the income of dance and music groups who, on the whole, number an average of 35 performers and earn a mean 113,570 Rp. monthly according to an estimate worked out from 28 cases reviewed in Report II (12). This seems to give a quite acceptable monthly income of about 3,250 Rp. per performer. Unfortunately for this mode of calculation, dance and music groups do not share out the profits among the performers. Such groups are corporate sekehe (13), associations with a chair-
man, a council, a secretary, a treasurer, various officers and other lay members, some of whom never appear on the stage, but are nevertheless full participants in the fortunes of the association — if only as share-holders of the valuable metallophones. A complete set may cost up to 800,000 Rp., one million or more. There may therefore be many more than 30 to 40 members who have equal rights in the benefits, if any, of the association.

That is one difficulty, but there are several others. All the groups do not perform every day. Some do, sekehe 'Dharma Astuti' of Denpasar declared it performs a minimum of six times a week; sekehe 'Eka Naya Sandi' of Gianyar, twenty-one times a month. But sekehe 'Pamaksan Dalem' which is keeper of a sacred Barong at Kuta, does not perform on request, except for occasional few scenes from the Ramayana drama. As for sekehe 'Duwe' of Ketewel Puseh in Gianyar, it only performs when needed for ritual purposes. Tourists are admitted, however, to the representations of the myth of the seven Bidadari princesses, a very high class dance, but only under rather strict conditions. For instance, photography is forbidden. Of the 28 dance and music groups interviewed for the first part of Report II ("The Role of Art in the Development of Tourism in Bali"), less than half offer a more or less regular programme for tourists, and, on the whole, this amounts to an average of only four performances a month, without counting the others for which the timing is determined either by the particular Balinese calendar or by other means relating to religion. Fees are paid here also, but no amount is indicated. Probably, a large share of the dues in those cases is not in cash but made in the form of particular services or goods. Here again it would be of great interest to make an accurate comparison of the types of payment in order to ascertain whether the growing preference for profane performances is due to the prospect of cash returns.

Lastly, and this will be another blow to the method used to find how much of the income of the part-time entertainers is derived from tourist spending, the dance and drama groups are not wholly rural. Firstly, the distinction between town and country is only clear at the ends of the scale, but there is considerable blurring in between. Towns in Bali are, as is the
case so very often elsewhere, clusters of villages around a palace or temple. The urban population of Denpasar consists mostly of people of the central desa (walled villages) plus some of the people of the peripheral desa whose main body of population is engaged in agriculture on whatever rice-fields have not yet been transformed into parking lots, bus stations and the like. Only a few quantified examples are to be found in the demography section of Strategi Pembangunan (14). The desa of Pamechutan, which is quite central in Denpasar shows 33.3 percent employed in services, 2.5 percent in industry and 8 percent in agriculture. In contrast a peripheral desa, Padang Sambian, has only 5.2 percent employed in services, and a negligible .7 percent in industry, but as many as 46.6 percent are cultivators. Secondly, as if to increase the degree of uncertainty, 56.2 percent in Pamechutan and 47.5 percent in Padang Sambian are unemployed or, more literally as well as more accurately, not working. The mean stands at 51.35 percent for this sample of 2o desa drawn from the preliminary results of the 1971 Census. The data offered here serve to sustain the view that there are good grounds for finding the same blend of urban and rural populace in the dance and music groups as there is in the desa-villages themselves because the dance and music sekehe like many other associations are territorially-based. On the principle of local recruitment within a desa, they cut across the other associative ties even accross those of a more professional nature, while remaining traditional like the sekehe of masons and coconut collectors, or else modern in the case of the associations of guides and drivers. There is, therefore, little hope of finding music and dance groups that are homogeneously rural or urban and just as little chance on that basis, given the statistical evidence available, of finding how much of the benefits of tourism reach the people, as individuals or as groups.

The exercise so far, may have shown at most that the problem has to be further examined and by other means. There will have to be direct, intensive, down-to-earth studies of three local groups either simultaneously by three teams of anthropologists or by the same team on separate occasions, yielding comparable results to clarify the organizational principles of the smallest
territorial units, the banjar or ward which often seems to be a derivation or an outgrowth of a sekehe association, whithout excluding the contentious creation of new ones and the dissolution of other unsuccessful one. It is only by a proper study of the most fundamental units of the most concrete nature of Balinese society that some understanding may be obtained of their interaction and integration into larger interacting groups and, finally, of the global society. The channels of redistribution of income then stand out clearly between the participant as well as the non-participant groups.

It is now evident, therefore, that data presented here are inadequate for the purpose. The few attempts just made to submit them to different treatments do not result in greater understanding. They merely show that the collection of different orders of facts is a necessity, before an integrative appreciation of the place of tourism in the Balinese economy can be achieved. This effort should begin with a microstudy of the banjar socio-economic unit.
Notes:

(1) Indicated as being credited in four instalments from 1969 to 1973, that is 1969-70, 1970-71, etc.

(2) See Geertz 1959:994 "... the basic territorial political unit is the hamlet, or banjar. Banjar, which may or may not be spatially isolated, depending upon the size of the settlement, contain anywhere from a dozen to several hundred nuclear families, averaging perhaps about eighty or ninety. In most parts of Bali, the banjar may be rather simply defined as all those people subject to the decisions taken in one hamlet meeting house ...

To the banjar are allocated ... general governmental and legal functions ..., house-land is corporately owned by the banjar as a whole, the hamlet also may regulate the distribution of dwelling places, and so control immigration ...

The hamlet also has significant tax powers. It may fine people for infractions of local custom, ... most banjar have sizeable treasuries and may even own rice land ... Nowadays, a few banjar even own trucks or buses ...

...the banjar also acts as a communal work group for certain ritual purposes, especially for cremations "

(3) Report I:167 enumerates only 92 "original woodcarvers" of any artistic value, the unnumbered rest being imitators.

(4) Commission rates range from a mere 1o to 20 percent according to Report III to 25 percent above, but up to 40 percent according to Report II:17o and to Kesempatan Bekerja:81.


(6) Kesempatan Bekerja:73,81


(8) same, vol.II, sect.C:38

(9) Quantities had to be accepted as they were given, except when resulting from sums which could be checked. Percentages have all been checked and corrected as necessary.

(10) Strategi Pembangunan, vol.II, sect.D:12 and annex 2.4

(11) Table 1.3, Strategi Pembangunan, II.D gives "Agriculture: 67.7 percent; Industry: 7.6 percent; Services: 22 percent; Others: 2.7 percent". The workforce there is calculated, not as previously from the 1o-64 year age-group, but from those over 10 years old.

(12) Report II:1o-7 and Tables I to VII

(13) It is difficult to transliterate the Balinese word sekehe, association, without a special phonetic script. Report I wrote sekaha; Report IV writes sekeha in the Indonesian version and sekehe in the English version. These variations make it clear that the sounds involved are just as badly coded by a as by e. To begin with, the first vowel (sekehe) is very brief and should
either be written with the Malay pepet (e) or better not written at all. The second and the third vowels are pronounced like the final a of ada in the Malay pronunciation of the Peninsula (rather like the French eu in 'fleur', or the German o — only slightly more open or more neutral) so that a good pronunciation of sekehe should be something like skeho where the most important thing to be heard is the consonant h and the near to neutral vowel which follows it.

(14) _Strategi Pembangunan_, vol.II, sect.D:31 and annex 2.5
III. TOURISM IN THE BALINESE SOCIETY

The influence of tourism on the Balinese society is most conspicuous in the rapid growth of hotel-building and of land transactions which the great inflow of tourists has generated. It is not so conspicuous in its effects on culture and notably less so in moral matters. Yet, in both the latter fields, the changes apparently related to the impact of tourism are just as real as in the former.

Land

A division into two broad traditional categories of land-rights has already been mentioned. This is the distinction between the original Balinese (Bali Age among whom all land is held communally and inalienably by the local group) and the lowland Balinese (Bali dataran among whom most land is individually and/or communally held in appanage from the rulers and is alienable under certain conditions). As the development of tourism so far has mostly affected the south coast, the southern peninsula and, to a limited extent, the inland districts of Badung and Gianyar — but not so much further inland — it is not necessary to examine the situation in the uplands, the more so that there is little recent documentation on the situation there, whether in the Report or elsewhere. The division does not mean that the particular culture of the mountain people of Bali is not attractive to tourists. Although it is evidently not so glamorous and resplendent, its stern and sober aspects as a shadow culture, the reverse of that of the plains, is receiving growing attention from those tourists curious for the primitive or out after the unusual, if the not the bizarre as the tour operators claim.
Trunyan and Tenganan will offer. The interior too is visited but not settled. The attraction of sun and sand (1) is a decisive factor when it comes to a stay. Land problems are, therefore, more likely to arise in the plains situation in relation to the development of tourism.

Report II introduces the matter (2): "In order to give a clear picture of the matter of land rights in Bali, and especially to account for the existence of various kinds of customary rights, it is necessary to understand their foundation from a historical point of view.

"Briefly, the legal bond on land under the government of the princes rested with them. Whatever land lay within the area of influence of a princely ruler was in his power.

"Every individual or local community held their tenure in appanage and, therefore, owed the Prince a tribute in cash and kind and/or labour.

"With the abolition of the traditional regime, the notion of land rights residing with the princes disappeared only to be replaced by that of property, either individual or communal.

"It is actually under the Dutch administration that this principle obtained recognition. At the time, in cases of litigation over land, the administration constantly gave support to the legal dispositions of the smaller units of customary law, i.e. the desa village. They were thus to become the foundation of a jurisprudence which was set out in the laws and regulations of the Government where the Crown and the States General ruled that 'the indigenous legal dispositions of the Indies will serve as a basis in all dealings on land held in customary law.'

"In this respect, Bali already has, as part of its life and society, legal arrangements regarding the ownership of land. Whether it be individual or communal rights over land, they were known as druwe or dure, to designate possession of land by individual persons or by groups such as the desa village or the pura temple communities.

"There are a few more traditional land rights which are still in living practice although they are not recognized in our land laws. They are the following:
"1. Temple-owned land. This is the land which can be termed in common parlance as temple property. All its products are intended for the needs of the temple.

"2. Village-owned land. This is the land on which the village community has sole rights. It is primarily meant for the village communal buildings and for allotment to the village members for their own use. The holders of such land owe the community a contribution in labour as required. This is actually the case of the village site itself. It is dry land, not primarily meant for cultivation, so it is not irrigated.

"3. There is another kind of village-owned land. It includes both non-irrigated and irrigated cultivable land. Its allocation also entails for the holder an obligation of service to the community.

"4. Token land. This is public land, formerly the Prince's. It is bestowed upon an individual office-bearer in acknowledgement of public services as a source of revenue to supplement the man's wages".

But in fact, as regards token land in particular, it seems that in many more cases, it was the Prince who actually relinquished Crown rights on particular pieces of land in favour of vassals, precisely in order to reinforce the bond of vassalage. The effect thereby sought was a proportional slackening of the bond of allegiance of the individual towards his desa of origin. Since Independence, the category of public land has expanded from such sources as confiscation and nationalization of foreign-owned land for instance. It is directly or indirectly managed under the present circumstances by the agricultural services.

The Report also shows that the same categories now still apply in broad terms with the same limitations and the same liberties. Temple land is inalienable as is public land, only the products of the latter are to be shared between the State and the tiller. Village land is still largely under the authority of the desa council which allocates it to desa members. The same council also decide who should be a desa member or not according to individual willingness and merits as a member. Under the traditional pre-war system of government, the size of the category
of individually-owned land as compared with the others, grew in direct proportion to the authority of the Prince. The reason for this is understandable, though little is said of the origins of the princes' landed property to be disposed of in this way. A fair guess is force. But how individually-owned land should still be expanding at present can scarcely even be surmised. A case is, however, reported in the desa of Kuta, on the southwest coast of the district of Badung.

[1]"Desa-owned land here is already shrinking because much of it has been converted into individually-owned land.

"Desa-owned land — which there still is at present — cannot be sold". (3)

But a few lines above, the Report reads:

[2]"There are individual property rights over irrigated and unirrigated lands. The unirrigated lands include both village site land and rainfed fields. Such lands can be the object of transactions either by sale, pawnning or rent".

One is induced to believe that the inalienable land under [1] can be alienated under [2] after one stage of transformation which is not described. The tendency, however, has to be reported as a fact whose importance is indubitable. It would surely be better to quantify the tendency, but unfortunately figures are indicated in only one case out of the eight cited, that of Bualu. The figures there are given in connection with the administrative decision to freeze land transactions. In Bualu, next to Kuta, the distribution of frozen land is as follows.

Table X. FROZEN LAND IN BUALU

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Individually-owned</td>
<td>374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State land</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temple land</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Village land</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>420</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The only inference which one can probably draw from the above figures is the proportion of land of the four categories in the territory of this particular desa. 90 percent is individually
owned land, 9 percent state land and 1 percent is village site and temple land. As will be seen in detail below, all are alienable in some way, either under lease to estate broker or as assigned to development in pursuance of the major objective of the Plan, tourism.

In the face of growing demand for land from both the private and the public sector, Report II examines the various legal and customary modes of alienation of land rights:

1. Renting land on short or long-term contract, privately or under legal warrant. This is said to be rather rare.

2. Mortgaging land is all the rarer than the mutual help mechanisms are at work in a given local community so that this extreme way of obtaining cash comes as a last expedient.

3. Exchange of land is only mentioned as an exception. In addition, it is a procedure which does not seem to be the cause of any difficulty so long as the exchanging partners agree to it.

4. Sales of land are the most common case of transfer of land rights. As has already been said, land must be individually owned. There are two procedures, one is the traditional procedure whereby the transaction is performed in the presence of the village headman and an unspecified number of witnesses. The other is performed in front of the camat (sub-district officer) under the guarantee of land laws. The seller must secure the authorization of the agricultural services and the transaction is certified by the office of land registration which require the village headman to vouch for the good faith of the parties and the authenticity of their respective claims. Genealogies have to be produced.

5. Finally, a rather frequent case occurs under the term of 'surrender of land rights'. This involves extensive areas for use directly connected with tourism such as hotels, bars, restaurants, art galleries and roads and, to some extent, it provides an indication of the ambiguity of the position of the administration. This procedure of surrender of land rights is new and it is not clearly set out in the existing legislation. That which in particular concerns expropriation is of a different
nature. From later in the same Report (4), it seems to have been put into effect in only three places: Kesiman, Kuta and Bualu. The main steps of its implementation are the following:

"By a decision of the Governor, an embargo is placed on a piece of land which has been declared as suitable or required for development.

"The prospective buyer or the owner who offers land for sale has to obtain an authorization from the Government.

"Once the authorization is granted a meeting of the vendor and the purchaser is arranged with the mediation of the agricultural services and a Land Valuation Committee together with the sub-district officer (camat) and the village headman. The value of the land under consideration is then fixed, after due bargaining. Furthermore, the agreement is made in writing and finally it takes the form of a decision by the Governor by which the land owner is indemnified for the loss of his property. By the same token, this land is transferred to the State.

"As sole owner the State now leases the said land to the so-called buyer for whatever use as may have been agreed upon", [i.e. none other than for the purposes of tourist development].

Although this is analogous to a land sale, the concern of the authors of this part of the Report lies with the use of the concept of indemnification for loss of land, instead of that of a payment of the price of land, as well as with the fact that there is no jurisprudence on this procedure yet.

One case, known as the 'Bualu case' is, therefore, cited on p. 58 ff of the Report. It shows landowners disputing a decision of the Provincial Government.

"The disagreement arose from the sum fixed as an indemnity for the surrender of land rights. As a first step, the Governor placed the embargo on an area of 168 ha for which the Land Valuation Committee had fixed the maximum value at 4,000 Rp per are for land in the 2nd and 3rd grades and 10,000 Rp per are for 1st grade land. As a second step, the freezing of another 165 ha was decided and compensation
was valued at 17,750 per are. From the point of view of the landowners the land was worth 75,000 per are.

"A Committee of Land Owners was then formed to introduce a claim for a fair price with the Government at the level of the Ministry of Communication [i.e. the Ministry in charge of the Directorate General of Tourism]. In the owner's view, the compensation paid so far could only be considered as an advance payment. The landowners committee further requested that lands earmarked for development be chosen (1) outside the fertile areas and (2) outside the territory of the village proper, and (3) that the products of the trees be left to the former owners of the land on which they grown until whatever work due to be carried out actually begins, and when it does, that the wood be returned to their owners".

At the date of completion of Report II (30 May 1973), these last points had been won by the villagers of Bualm. At the date of the completion of Report III (26 September 1974), they were still awaiting a decision to be taken by the central Government as to the price of their land.

Unfortunately, the reported cases of land dispute are too few for a system to appear clearly. Nonetheless, the involvement of the Provincial Government in matters of land transactions is interesting. There are two conflicting points of view. The administration of the province as representative of the interests of the people, promotes regional laws. For instance, the Governor's Office for Hindu and Buddhist Affairs makes it compulsory, at least for hotel builders and since February 1972, to fulfill a number of conditions in order to safeguard the ritual purity of the places of worship lying in the vicinity of the proposed buildings. In addition, the provincial administration also executes national laws to control the alienation of lands away from the peasants and to prevent excessive transfers, which would weaken the foundations of the society and endanger the environment.

But at the same time, acting as an instrument of the central Government, the provincial administration has to give precedence to national rather than particular, local interests.
In such cases, it has to minimize the latter to facilitate the implementation of the provisions of the Five-Year Plan and it endeavours to overcome obstacles of local importance. This ambiguity is probably what lies behind the Provincial Governor's declaration of 12 January 1970, whereby an obligation was made to submit to prior authorization all development projects in the areas of Bedugul, Kintamani-Penelokan, Ubud and Bukit Kecamatan Kuta, especially in view of its revision by another law dated 17 June 1971 to the effect that Ubud was withdrawn from the list, thus presumably leaving the rest of the country including Ubud open for land speculation by private concerns. The same law applies to a zone of 200 m in width from the upper limit of State coast land, eight years after work began on the Bali Beach Hotel at Sanur. This hotel is particularly conspicuous for its walled-up perimeter which blocks off a fair stretch of beach. The land on which most of its building stands was formerly the village burial ground, a typical case of inalienable land. For this reason, the village elders accepted a mere token price for it. Obviously, the situation has now changed and this is not going to occur again, for laws have been enacted to prevent such gross abuses. But in what ways do the village elders now have the chance to preserve their burial grounds or their free access to the beaches of the west coast as necessary for scattering ashes and for other religious purposes? What are they made to accept, and to what ends?

One of the recommendations of the authors of the land rights part of Report II states that "it should be made quite clear to the local community that the development of tourism is a necessity for all of us. Its purpose, it should well be emphasized, is to increase the national income, that of the region, the village community and the individual" (p.60).

The ambiguity thus also rests with the legal expert who, like almost everyone in Bali, seems to be unable to really take sides in the conflict between local and national interests. Matters of allegiance, apparently, are still crucial issues in Bali. The timid wording of one recommendation further indicates the difficulty of choice:

"From the cases examined, the problems of land which,
at the present time, require most attention are those concerning the surrender of rights and the transfer of rights over village lands and village site. Besides, the intervention of the Government in matters of transfer of land rights for the necessity of development, especially the development of tourism, is not yet felt in a positive way" (p.61).

The old village republican spirit urges that "the official village leaders like the Perbekel, Bendesa and other customary heads be recommended to prevent efficiently all practices which might weaken or confuse the village community rights on land or worse, invalidate their rights on the village site proper. According to us indeed, the land of the village and more precisely the land of its very site constitute one of the most important elements of cohesion of the village custom community" (p.61).

Which practices are meant here is not stated, but it may safely be assumed that they are the modern trends. It is true though that such conflicts of interest are well-nigh universal and summed in the phrase 'modernization versus traditionalism'. Western countries offer countless examples of this kind of dilemma which is the more visible when the traditionalists, or better the conservationists, organize themselves and usually have considerable access to public opinion through the media. Adoption of such ways and means is not advocated here as it is neither the purpose of the paper nor the intention of its author to do so. Nonetheless, the conflict has to be brought to the fore because the ultimate right and even duty of the State on Balinese land to develop it in fulfilment of the aims of the Plan, necessarily ends up by encroaching on the rights of the land-owning community, the desa village, the very foundation of Balinese society. The points of view are not only conflicting, they are mutually destructive. The situation sadly calls to mind the story of the goose and the golden egg.

The case of the burial ground of Sanur purchased for a token price calls for comment. Firstly, and it bear mention once again in passing, the huge hotel built upon it is a monstrous mass of concrete which, apparently out of sheer contempt for the
inhabitants and generally all those outside, blocks the view and access to the sea and prevents the local inhabitants from walking along the beach. Building concrete bunkers on beaches for beachlovers is a world-wide aberration and, consequently, there is little need to insist on this any further.

Secondly, it shows the incompatibility between the villagers' sense of land ownership and that of the hotel builders. Suffice it to say that the basic grounds of the former standpoint belong to the field of religious beliefs. "Who would possibly build a house for the living on a burial and cremation ground?" No Balinese of course. There was no mercantile value set on such land for rent or sale at the time, hence the people's surprise when confronted with such a proposition and the low price which they allegedly asked for it. It was only a token to mark the transfer of right, not the amount of money equivalent to the value of the land. Whether true of not the story is well known and it serves as an example and a precedent. At Bualu, the villagers seem to be decided not to give up before they obtain a fair price in terms of market economy where, so they have learnt, land is a commodity, which is relatively valuable according to their own estimate at 76,000 RP per are (5) roughly equivalent to 7,500 U.S. dollars per acre or 20 cents per sq. foot. Their claim is thus most probably prompted by a newly-introduced spirit of bargaining and profit-making, as is general in Bali in times when everything sells well for or because of tourism. The gap between this new conception of business in land, that of the Land Valuation Committee and of the Government, whose criteria originate evidently from outside Bali, and that of the old traditional view, is also apparent in the desa people's insistence on retaining the use and ownership of their fruit-trees, a request which was the most easily granted of all. Fruit-trees, products of past labour, are indeed very valuable in the Balinese land rights system as is so often the case elsewhere in Indonesia (6). In addition, tree ownership is generally kept well apart from land ownership, and transmitted along different lines of succession.

These considerations have a bearing on the matter of tourism for the development of tourism draws attention to these systems of land rights and rights to the produce of the land, where
the imported legal and administrative ways interlock only with
difficulty.

There are not enough data in the Reports on the
building boom which is so noticeable all along the roads be-
tween the towns of Ubud and Mas, in and out of Celuk, etc., and
on miles of coast on both sides of Sanur on the east coast and
of Kuta on the west coast of the district of Badung. Yet there
are sufficient indications that where the construction of houses,
hotels and art galleries occurs on cultivated and, particularly,
irrigated land, there is a great likelihood of disputes over
values, terms and length of contract. This is the case along the
roads, whereas on the coast the building of individual bungalows
or of bungalow-type hotels and inns, which are scattered among
orchards and pastures, raise less problems so long as this type
of settlement leaves free access for grazing in the gaps, free
access to coconut and other palm trees for their owners, and free
access to the sea for the fishermen and other inland villagers.

Now, though little may have been said about the village
sites and temple grounds with reference to transfers of ownership,
gleaning here and there through the Reports, makes it appear
that these lands are most unlikely to be alienated. At Bualu, it
was this category of land which was withdrawn from the embargo
ordinance, together with the cultivable lands. The ultimate reason
as to why they are not to be bargained for or given up is that
they are lands of life, lands with which the living become closely
involved, the others are lands of death, or they are lands of neither.

Finally, and to use the last point in this hypothesis,
the choice of the site of Nusa Dua on the South Peninsula for the
great tourist development projects of the next few years is surely
determined by several factors and criteria which have been worked
out by earnest and dedicated consultants. There is, however, one
further factor which may be of importance. The peninsula is a dry,
barren, chalky land where the population is sparsely settled and
agriculture practically non-existent but which seems fit for palm
trees, cattle and sorghum and maize cultivation in the shallower
river beds where a few dry stonework terraces retain moisture. True,
under such conditions, the peninsula has little economic value, but
it seems also to be typically comparable on the island scale to the
case of the 'land of neither' which the desa villagers make use of but where they neither live nor die. Such is also the probable reason why there is no stir, no move, no concern even, either in Balinese public opinion — as far as I could ascertain — or in the Reports about this huge tourist-satellite project.

It is difficult to comment upon the sequences of the maps at a 1/20,000 scale of the four villages of the sample of Report IV. Yet they make it obvious that between 1965 and 1974 the place gets crammed with new constructions. In the sea-side resorts bungalows are thickly built in the coconut groves of the beaches. In the inland places art and souvenir shops line the roads in and out of the village built areas. Some kind of measurement of this growth is made possible from the raw material provided in Tables 1 to 4 (one for each village). They show that the most spectacular growth is that of the artshops of Kuta. There were none in 1969, and there are 50 in 1974, followed by Batubulan with 17 new artshops in the same time span, and Sanur where their number was multiplied by 9 between 1965 and 1974. During the same period the number of hotel rooms grew only five times at Sanur, while it grew by nearly 13 times at Kuta. Next most remarkable is the growth of classrooms at Mas with a coefficient nearing 5 over the same period.

Noteworthy are the zero growth figures with zero hotel rooms at Mas and Batubulan, and zero growth in milage of metalled roads at Mas and Batubulan, a fact that the populations are reported to deplore (see p. 48 above) and a negligible double at Sanur and Kuta (from 5 to 10 km and from 2.5 to 5 km). In the following table, the proportions have been calculated for the periods from 1965 to 1969 and from 1969 to 1974 as well as for the whole period in order to make it appear more clearly that, although some items of growth are obviously directly connected to the development of tourism, at least one activity, schooling, may not be. It has grown steadily over the years in Sanur and Kuta, but in Mas less in the second period than in the first period. Batubulan only has seen the number of its classrooms grow 1.2 times
in the period from 1969 to 1974, but, statistically, this is insignificant.

Table XI  A SELECTION OF GROWTH RATES (1965 - 1974)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>N°</th>
<th>Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotel rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>385</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>424</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>1900</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art shops</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>28</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roads</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>N°</th>
<th>Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotel rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>1304</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art shops</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>22</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>1.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>35</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roads</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>28</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>N°</th>
<th>Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotel rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art shops</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roads</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>N°</th>
<th>Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotel rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art shops</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roads</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>N°</th>
<th>Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotel rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art shops</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roads</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>N°</th>
<th>Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotel rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art shops</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roads</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>N°</th>
<th>Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotel rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art shops</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roads</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>N°</th>
<th>Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotel rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art shops</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roads</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>N°</th>
<th>Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotel rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art shops</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roads</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>N°</th>
<th>Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotel rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art shops</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class rooms</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roads</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Culture

It is not certain that the growth of modern buildings affects the Balinese as much as it affects the culture-minded tourist. The package-tourists might object to lamp-posts which spoil a perspective, this is most likely to be the tourist of the same class who would object to poor electric street lighting. The culture-minded tourist, on the other hand, is filled with dismay at the sight of an altar used as a lamp-post at the main crossroads in the venerable town of Klungkung. He should come early enough on the morning of almost any major festival to see the young girls who bring their offerings of flowers, coloured rice and holy water, kneeling at the foot of the 'lamp-post' and uttering a few words of prayer. They do not see the neon tubes. Similarly, they may not even see the concrete bunker standing across the beach at Sanur for the beach has no positive value and its scenic value is largely imported (8).

Bali never attempted to resist foreign influence in the way Tibet did or still more recently, Burma. The great asset of the Balinese culture is that it has succeeded in assimilating the foreign elements. Sometimes it has done so rather successfully, even in recent times, as is evident in the famous North Balinese temple reliefs, particularly in the Pura Meduwe Karang at Kubutambahan which depict colonial officers, their bicycles and cars. It does so again at present by just accepting the foreign intrusions, "street lighting is a good thing" or with indifference, "after all it is their concern if the foreigners do not mind bathing among the floating debris of the burnt towers and the ash-filled coconuts from past cremations".

What the Balinese do not seem to accept is the use that is made of their religion by the tourist industry, and the desecration of some of its most beautiful cult instruments as decorative gimmicks if not merely as tourist snares. That is the main theme of Report I. It is summed up in Report III:

"There is a growing tendency to use religious attributes/symbols for the sake of tourism, for instance the use of 'umbul-umbul' [pennants], 'tedung agong' [long hafted umbrellas], 'penjor' [bamboo poles], 'lamak' [strips of decorated palm leaves], etc." (p.34)
"Besides there is also a tendency to copy sacred buildings to be used for decorations in hotels, for instance, they build 'gedung taksu' [lantern] which is a sacred thing, and they use it for a place of light or as a lamp post". (p.34)

This amounts to a profanation (pp.36, 42, 44, 46).

"In the villages where the tourists to their shopping and see performances, we can also see sacred places (temples) used for the background of performances intended for the tourists (for instance in Batubulan and Celuk)" (p.36).

"Very often the solemnity of religious ceremonies is felt to be affected" (p.49, but also on pp.44, 46, etc.)

The merits of Report I, which does not spare the reader its repetitions either, lie in the details of the experiences which are felt by the Balinese to be most offensive to their religion.

"As has been said already, it is the Hindu-Balinese religion in its uniqueness which constitutes the strongest attraction for tourists, within the framework of the development of cultural tourism. This is a fact which is well established from the results of an enquiry which shows that the majority of tourists (54.54 percent in 1972) (7) are attracted to Bali by its culture in its manifold aspects and a way of life enlightened by the Hindu religion. This situation is increasing every year. The flow of tourists to Bali has an influence which brings positive as well as negative effects on the way of life of the Balinese society.

"Since Bali has been declared the centre of development of tourism in Middle Indonesia, this island is wide open to the outside world. Consequently, it is obvious that the mutual influence of Bali and the outside world is felt through the medium of tourism.

"The objectives of the tourists in Bali are nearly always related to items of religion, such as the temples and other holy places, and the Hindu-Balinese religious ceremonies. The speed of development of tourism is the cause of drastic changes in the way of life of Balinese society. The changes which occur have positive and negative motives. They are examined here and they will be evalu-
Table XII

"WHAT IS THE OBJECT OF YOUR VISIT"

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Nº of respondents</th>
<th>percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The culture complex</td>
<td>24 (a)</td>
<td>24 (b)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The natural beauty</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The pleasant character of the inhabitants</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(a) After Report I, table p.125 : results of an enquiry conducted in November 1972

(b) After the same Report, Table III, p.48, December 1972

"WHAT HAS MOST IMPRESSED YOU"

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Nº of respondents</th>
<th>percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Culture</td>
<td>25 (c)</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scenery</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospitality</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All three</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture and Scenery</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture and Hospitality</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any two but culture</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(c) After Report I, table I, p.26, results of an enquiry conducted in January 1973
uated in the following sections.

"In relation to the examination of this problem we must pay attention to the following two factors:

"1. Bali as a centre of tourism, is in a position of constantly receiving a continuous flow of tourists where the various nationalities follow one another with all sorts of cultural habits and attitudes to life, in addition to their own reasons for visiting Bali which vary accordingly.

"2. International travellers come to Bali for a relatively short stay of about four days. This illustrates the fact that they learn little about the Balinese culture and way of life, with the exception of those who come here for a definite reason, research for instance.

"These two factors mentioned above point to the amount of mutual influence which can be expected to occur between Bali and the international tourists one the other hand. One can estimate here that Bali will be receiving much more influence from tourism than the reverse.

"In fulfilment of our duty in this field of research, here the question of the influence of tourism is raised, as it is felt in the following facts which belong to the field of the Hindu-Balinese religion.

"1. It is difficult to preserve the sanctity of the temples and the holy places. As objectives of primary interest, these places are much visited and it is difficult to keep them in carub condition as it is said in Balinese. In this way the sacred atmosphere of the temples and the holy places will decrease in intensity and, in the long run, they will be considered as just ordinary places and their magico-religious content will completely fade away. True, there are already some temples among those which are most often visited by foreign tourists where signboards have been placed to indicate that entry is particularly forbidden to women in their menses. But this measure does not guarantee that the injunction will be obeyed by the tourists concerned, such is the difference in outlook between them and ourselves.

"2. These temples and holy places have functions in relation to the sacred but to the tourists they are too
often considered as mere places of recreation, as is the case in the visits of Prambanan and Borobudur, where they may take photographs inside as much as outside, and even inscribe graffiti, but this is mostly done by domestic tourists.

"3. Many sacred objects, such as statues, inscriptions, manuscripts and ritual instruments, have been stolen. Thefts in the temples are the result of the following:

"a. In general, the manuscripts, statues and other sacralia are antique objects which have artistic value.

"b. There are tourists who need these objects for a collection and also for some research in the scientific fields related to Bali.

"c. These valuables are sold for high prices to the tourists, so that people are stimulated to look for them, even urged to steal them only to sell through receivers and various intermediaries.

"d. Consequently, the motive for stealing, the temptation of the high value they fetch, overrides their sacred value.

"4. There are many villages round Tegalalang in Gianyar where temples are watched by the population who take turns at night because they fear that the valuable objects which constitute the ritual equipment of their temples would be stolen. Their concern is motivated by the fact that in many other temples and holy places thefts have already occurred, not only thefts of valuable objects like those mentioned above but also of parts of the buildings themselves: sculpted, engraved and gilt pieces of woodwork, chapters, doors, postbases, etc.

"5. Temples are used as a permanent background for stages which are built for performances and shows in front of them, as for instance, at Bedulu, Pura Samuantiqa, at Tegas in Gianyar, Pura Dalem and to the west of Taman Ayun Mengwi. Besides, there are temples which are integrated with the stage although the intention is only to use the decor of the front gate for outdoor dances from time to time or also regularly, for tourists. This happens in Tegaltamu, at Bone, Sumerta and elsewhere.
Table XIII

NUMBER OF THEFTS IN HINDO-BALINESE TEMPLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kabupaten-district</th>
<th>Number of temples in the K-districts</th>
<th>Number of thefts on record</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1971</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Badung</td>
<td>1014</td>
<td>5 (5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buleleng</td>
<td>1711</td>
<td>4 (4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tabanan</td>
<td>1070</td>
<td>3 (3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gianyar</td>
<td>792</td>
<td>5 (5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Klungkung</td>
<td>347</td>
<td>5 (5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangli</td>
<td>800</td>
<td>5 (5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karangasem</td>
<td>532</td>
<td>3 (4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jembrana</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>1 (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(After Report I, table I p.47 and table V p.50)</td>
<td>Figures above with an opening bracket belong to table p.124 (Same Report)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

OTHER DATA SUGGESTED AS A POSSIBLE BASIS FOR COMPARISON

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Population (Census 1971)</th>
<th>% of unemployed</th>
<th>Members of other religions</th>
<th>No of Hotels</th>
<th>Rooms Shops</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(a)</td>
<td>(f)</td>
<td>($)</td>
<td>($)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Badung 398 000</td>
<td>24.1 (b)</td>
<td>6708</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>2891</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buleleng 403 000</td>
<td>27.2 (c)</td>
<td>668</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>381</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tabanan 329 500</td>
<td>10.9 (d)</td>
<td>557</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gianyar 272 000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>975</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Klungkung 139 000</td>
<td>39.7 (e)</td>
<td>562</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangli 138 000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>526</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karang'm 266 500</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jembrana 171 000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>257</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(a) Strategi Pembagunan, Sekt. D, table 2:6, p.118
(b) in the sub-district of Denpasar
(c) in the sub-district of Banjar and Seririt (mean)
(d) in the sub-district of Kediri
(e) in the sub-district of Klungkung
(f) Strategi Pembangunan, Sekt. H, table I p.199. These data concern Buddhists and Confucianists only, which makes the attempt completely meaningless; the total numbers of Muslims (22, 420, not including the districts of Badung, Buleleng and Karangasem), Protestants (12,644) and Roman Catholics (10,000) are not broken down into districts, and, therefore, cannot be tabulated here.

(g) Report III, pp.75-80
(h) Report III, pp.89-94. There are 37 Travel Bureaux on record, but they are all situated in the Badung district, which includes Denpasar, Sanur and Kuta.
"6. The temples and holy places also happen to be turned into sources of revenue by hiring scarves to visitors who want to enter or by presenting shows to the tourists in the area in front of the temple.

"7. There are many ceremonial instruments which are used as decorations for hotels, art-shops and restaurants. They are used in these instances only as advertisements to attract the tourist so are completely separated from their sacred function. This is mostly the case of the high umbrellas, staffs, spears, pennants. These abuses go as far as placing chalices on tables of every room in one hotel, to be used as flower vases.

"8. Sacred dances such as the dragon dance at Tegaltumu in Batubulan, is profaned by continuous performance for tourists. Besides there is a most sacred dance meant to welcome the high priests which is commonly performed to meet tourists in large parties.

"9. There is a feeling of dissatisfaction in performing such ceremonies as a funeral procession on a road filled with people who do not share the religious feeling of the ceremony.

"10. The Hinduist community of Bali feels the atmosphere of ceremonies is disturbed when tourists come and ask all sorts of questions about the ceremony while it is going on.

"11. As for the persons who are involved in the tourist industry, in hotels, travel bureaux, taxis, restaurants, etc., they have almost no time left for the performance of ceremonies and rites, which is also the case of many of those who are employed in activities other than tourism. Besides, these people have hardly any chance to render customary services to the community. Circumstances such as these bring about a tendency towards individualist attitudes.

"12. Because of the increase in frequenting the temples, those responsible for their maintenance have felt the necessity of keeping the place up to a good standard of hygiene, so that some of them are seen to have been fitted with lavatories outside their precincts.

"13. A sincere desire appears among the caretakers of the temples and other holy places to learn about their
ins and outs, their history, the names of the host deities, their service and cult, etc. in order to be able to give satisfactory answers to the tourists whenever they ask questions.

"I4. A strong desire also appears in the population for an awareness of Hinduism and to learn about the religion, not only for their own benefit, but also because they are often confronted with tourists who ask questions relating to problems of the Hindu-Balinese religion.

"I5. Even among those who are not followers of the Hindu religion one now meets people who are keen on reading about the religion in order to be able to give satisfactory explanations to the tourists whom they happen to meet while engaged in their trade or activities, such as guides, in travel bureaux, hotels and art-shops.

"Such are the effects of tourism on the Hindu-Balinese religion as they have been gathered as a result of an enquiry among the population of Bali and in conformity with the situation at the time of this writing. The symptoms are going to be more and more serious in the years to come, and this as much in a positive direction as in a negative one (pp. 43-46)."

There is no need to follow the next steps of the demonstration in this section of Report I: 'The Influence of Tourism on the Balinese Culture', for these simply consist of classifying the above data into the positive and the negative regarding the proper traditional religious practice. It is noteworthy that only two aspects are noted as positive: the improved hygiene and the increasing willingness of some Balinese for better and fuller information about the dominant religion of the island.

The other elements which generally count as part of culture in the eyes of such outsiders as the cultural tourists, are the plastic arts and the performing arts. To their eyes, the artistic productions can be considered as authentic only as long as they are somehow integrated into the Hindu-Balinese religion and philosophy, and only in so far as they have a purpose and a function within this framework. But this apparently restrictive definition should (and does in fact) exclude a large number of ritual activities which are designed
and performed in strict accordance with traditional patterns. This is the instance of the inauguration of the new family house of a university don. Ceremonies such as this are perfectly authentic, even though the house is modern both in its architectural concept and the building materials used. It must be out of sheer egoism that the cultural tourist rejects adaptations of this type, true examples of a sound acculturation.

In their introductory sections, the authors seem to share with the cultural tourists, the generally-accepted view that the Balinese have developed an extraordinary aesthetic sense, as taste for art for art's sake which, therefore, would not necessarily be functional. The most likely reason for applying a restrictive sequence of arguments, would have to be looked for in the personalities of the authors of the reports themselves. They can hardly avoid showing the universalist broadmindedness which is expected from them as academics. But, in the course of examining the facts, and while approaching their conclusions, as Balinese scholars themselves they cannot fail to perceive, with a greater lucidity of mind than most other Balinese, that the vein of art initiated by foreign artists in the period between the first and second World Wars has, in fact, been detached from their milieu, and from themselves. They have lost some of their essential quality of being Balinese, and if the word were not so ugly, it may be said that they are but hybrids. The Ida Bagus Gelodog, Ida Bagus Muku, I Gusti Nyoman Lempad, Ida Bagus Putu Mas, to name but a few of the best known painters and sculptors, have attained international fame and fortune. They deserve both, but have they not lost their 'Baliness'? No temple community would order hangings from them for the altar canopies and awnings. They are no longer geared in to the Hindu-Balinese religion. They are, as is only too often noted, 'born artists', but this is a transient period. They are such only as long as they are not too far from Bali, either in time or space. The more they continue to use foreign techniques of expression and to rely on foreign custom for a living in terms of cash income, and the less time they spend at temple functions and working at sekehe functions, the further they remove themselves from their
source, or still better, their sources. To the foreigner, the non Hindu-Balinese believer, the famous artists, their pupils and many of their followers and imitators are producing typical Balinese works of art. But how long will the miracle last? There are fears that it is going to fade away quite fast, as fast as the flow of tourists is growing with the improvement of jet transport, or quantitatively as much as mass tourism is replacing cultural tourism. There is no danger mark in the production of Balinese art whereby the level of quality could be maintained in safe balance with that of quantity. With quality as the only measurable variable, the 'born artists' are exhausting their inborn stock of indigenous talent as rapidly as they turn their attention to the growing demand for exotic art. The bronzed light-alloy replica of Rodin's The Thinker on the mantle piece of the mass tourist's home is being replaced by the fisherman with a conical hat.

This situation adds emphasis to the doubts of our authors as to the future of Balinese art. "... There are still many traditional artists who are active and who are able to maintain their Balinese style, but they feel the pressure from the younger and foreign artists who follow the tendencies of modern art styles which are developing at present" [...]. "The older artists are not selling their works which they prize so highly to tourists" (Report : 28), for the latter "in general prefer buying paintings and sculptures which are light and small for easy transport and cheap". Such customers bring in business for "these souvenir-makers who are... handworkers, craftsmen and found in particular among the peasants. Their ability for this production provides them with subsidiary revenue" (p.29). The orders placed in large quantities by the art galleries "tend to lower the quality for the sake of quantity"... and it has been shown in the chapter on the economic aspects of tourism that this activity is not a respectable proposition at an average monthly income of 5,000 Rp. It takes a lot of faith for the authors of Kesempatan bekerja to support the idea of art as a source of revenue and say, in commenting on the figures shown in Table 12, p.66: "It is clear therefore that the tourist industry contributes to the development
of handicraft industries and, as a direct consequence, broadens the employment field" (10).

The situation, consequently, is all the sadder since the degradation is not even profitable, neither in artistic, cultural nor economic terms.

... ... ...

The more recent views of Report IV on the economics of the deterioration of the handicrafts trade have been reviewed on p.46. I need only recall the basic reasons for this state of things in quoting the Report.

"The art-shop owner very rarely was an artist himself. Thus both artists and artisans were at the mercy of these shopkeepers. Usually in these shops paintings were valued mainly by their size and not by their artistic merit. It was therefore the need for money and not creativity nor inspiration that motivated the artists to paint on canvas as large as possible" (p.17).

The application of such canons cannot but lead to incompatibility with the necessity for the "mass tourists" to travel light (compare with the previous page) and eventually it will end with glutting the market.

McKeon (1974 : 20-24) argues for an optimistic view of the current developments of Balinese art. He Balinese "institutions continue to demand high quality craftsmanship as appropriate offerings for the 'divine world' [...]. From the Balinese point of view, it would be silly and short-sighted to offer inferior gifts to the divine powers, incurring their displeasure". On the other hand, the thriving souvenir industry despite its unavoidable chain product character has the advantage of "heightening self-identity and self-value, as the work encourages appreciation of indigenous craft and creativity". Yet, while on the whole I agree with this author's views, I fear I have to invite a reversal of the viewpoint and ask what kind of 'superior' offerings are the "divine powers"
supposed to want? Is it the best to the mind of the Balinese or to the anthropologist's? My experience in the field being terribly limited compared to that of McKeon, I can cite only these two facts. One, during a small temple festival which I chanced to witness no gong orchestra accompanied the many stages of the ritual, commercially-recorded musicassettes were played instead. Two, some of the state temples at the sides of the great temple of Besakih had, in June 1974, several shrines fitted with brand new glittering tin roofs.

In addition, attention should be called to the aesthetic norms of the mass tourist. When — and if — the tourist industry succeeds in bringing in 3,000 tourists a day, they will have to take very far and very deep for custom, and the souvenir buyers will presumably become less and less particular about quality. Plastic will probably do — the Balinese and their craftsmanship will not be the ones to blame, then.

But then how to reconcile the modernists and the traditionalists? How to preserve; what to conserve? What code should be referred to in order to keep the Balinese from using the building materials of this century? No suggestion is offered in the reports; and no one would dare suggest that family houses should be allowed to have tin roofs while temples should not. The famous harmony of Balinese culture would rapidly disappear with the introduction of measures aimed at an authoritarian discrimination between the profane and the sacred where it is particularly irrelevant and dangerous.

People

Yet the incentive of money is there, however base, and there is enough of it to spoil the mental attitudes of the people as the numerous examples listed in Report I tend to show. In matters of religion, it was already found deplorable that temple attendants should accept money from foreign visitors either as simple entrance fees or as rent for sashes. In matters
of social life, it has also been mentioned that one of the harmful effects of tourism was the gradual loss of concern for mutual aid activities within the framework of the village or the ward, in favour of paying jobs outside it. In the latter case, the authors are seen to admit that there were also other jobs which were responsible for the poor attendance at local religious functions (11). Some recognition was thereby given to the difficulty sometimes encountered in sorting out influences assignable to tourism in particular, from the general condition of 'modern times'.

It seems here that in matters of mental attitude the distinction is incomparably more difficult to assess.

"There are changes listed here which are not to be related to the influence of tourism as so many changes are determined by progress in other fields such as education communication and the various technical fields. These changes are motivated by a desire to achieve concrete modernization. This is the reason why it is rather difficult to determine which changes are the consequences of tourism, and those which are the results of other influences. Nevertheless, it can be stated as a conclusion that the influences which obtain, do result to some extent in the influences which concentrate on Bali as a tourist objective" (Report I : 60).

If a comparison between the time before the arrival of the first tourists, the opening of the first hotels, the landing of the first jet transport at Ngurah Rai airport and now were objectively possible, we would surely be able. the report goes on, to distinguish between the good and the bad effects of tourism.

In essence, the report claims that Balinese moral principles are that one should be a devout believer, one should work in a spirit of mutual endeavour, one should live in harmony and agreement and one should live collectively. Until the recent past, these principles were scrupulously obeyed, but they are no longer the principles of their lives. What are the changes, the authors ask? Here are a few of the examples they cite. The majority of them have negative effects, yet among the changes
with positive effects, one hardly meets features which are accepted as wholly satisfactory by the traditional Balinese. Again they consist mainly in improvements of the hygienic conditions of life in the house much the same as outside the temple yard and the expanded experience of the people who come to know about foreign countries and people, just as the latter do when they come to Bali. Because of tourism, we are told, the Balinese are made to realize that their submissive attitudes towards Europeans are a thing of the past. It gives them reason to be proud of their native and indigenous condition. They are given opportunities for learning foreign language and etiquette.

In addition to a certain coolness to seeing these positive changes as good, they are shown to have immediately negative counterparts. Tourists have been found defecating in a temple yard, into a well; besides stealing idols in their locked tabernacles, intruding in a religious meeting, assaulting the officiants and resisting arrest, some have left their quarters without paying. They wear dirty and ragged clothes and all in all they show a bad example to Balinese youth who, out of insolence rather than pride, keep their hands on their hips or in their pockets when addressing people and sit with one leg folded over the other. For youth, learning foreign languages implies losing the knowledge and the practice of the Balinese written and spoken language, losing furthermore the willingness to use the Balinese language "out of fear of being mistaken for a backward peasant" (p.63).

Even if "thank you" is now commonly said, being courteous is no longer an ideal, the greed for money is already there to spoil human relations at all levels. The word for 'guest' is no longer as pure and noble in meaning and content as it used to be. The homestay owners have paying guests. An element of profit-making in terms of money is present everywhere. It generates desecrations in chains which are outright negative, bad and deleterious elements of change. Maids and waitresses in hotels and restaurants are frequently seen to wear sashes, a ritual piece of garment normally donned only on specific occasions. Patrons are thereby made to believe that they are
honoured. They are, in fact, being lured into tipping generously. There is an endless variety of means of obtaining money from the tourists. Guides and taxidrivers are repeatedly charged throughout the reports with profiting with commissions, a habit which is offered both as the cause of the poor income of artists and of the complaints of the tourists who feel cheated as a result of the increased prices.

It is not easy to discriminate and say which, in the minds of the authors, is the worse of the evils, money or relaxed morals. A combination of both is seen in the increase of prostitution; a contention which is hardly to be disputed so long as it is not blamed too directly on the tourists, as Report IV (English version) now does (see below p. 97).

"In this respect, the way the young foreign tourists are seen to mix freely, has been quickly imitated by our youth. It is especially the situation at Kuta beach with its varied modes of mingling which influences them most. It is hard to tell who among these couples are really married, the more so that they are found to rent single rooms which they use as a couple".

"At first one could see that in such romantic affairs our Balinese young people were looking for isolated places, and the couples were trying to sit apart in near seclusion, but now they have been seen to get more and more daring in their affairs. This concerns the point that the standard of decency is getting very low among our youth. They are not the only ones to bear the blame for it is also their parents among the category of the elite, who are seen to get into the habit of going for a dance as a weekly regular outing at a few places at Sanur" (Report 1: 64).

If at Sanur, the underlying reasoning goes, it must necessarily bear some connexion with tourism. Proximity though, is not causality. Also one may now ask, where else can people whether foreigners or not, go for a dance? The answer is: not in the desa assembly halls, although some of them can already be seen fitted with complete P.A. systems the usefulness of which is most probably questionable in any case.
It may be not useless to repeat here the view expressed in Chapter I that there are many fewer young Balinese who come to stare at a few relaxed couples sunbathing freely on miles of empty beaches, than there are young people and their elders who watch the revolting films shown in the four or five theatres of Denpasar, with their lurid posters and banners. In any case is it the onlookers themselves rather than the cinemagoers who will imitate the foreigners' The fact is noted and strongly reproached by the authors of one chapter on the effects of tourism on architecture (Report I, p.195). Here as well the objections are excessive and certainly wade of the mark in decrying tourism indiscriminately as the sole cause of the rapid changes which Bali is undergoing in the late twentieth century.

Report IV has a whole chapter on "The Impact of Tourism on the Attitudes in general", the arguments of which runs like this: The development of Tourism and activities relating to and supporting tourism ranks second as a priority in the Five-Year Plan. "The success or failure of this economic development does not only depend on economic factors such as capital, material goods, equipment, etc.; but also on non-economic ones like social structure, ideologies, and so forth" (p.30). Then, quoting Schumpeter, the authors emphasize that no economic development will be possible if the society has not enough enterprising individuals and if there is not a socio-cultural climate suitable for the entrepreneurs to work in. In other words, what is needed here is a positive attitude towards tourism (p.31). "Such an attitude does not just exist or does not grow by itself without being hitched to factors within the scope of culture" (p.32).

I. Therefore, the enquiry was conducted to bear on the specifically Balinese social groups in which these factors are integrated: family, sekehe (12), banjar, traditional and administrative villages, all in a sample of four villages: Sanur and Kuta where tourists stay and Mas and Batubulan which they only visit on shopping tours.

a) In a quantitative stage, five members of each five groups in the four villages of the sample were asked questions bearing on the matters of their particular concern as regards tourism:
- communication with the tourists
- value of the performances of artistic sekehe
- income of hamlet organizations
- law and order in traditional villages
- benefit to the community in administrative village districts.
b) In a qualitative stage, a supplement of information was sought through observation and interview. There appeared that (1) "all families were favourably inclined towards tourism, especially the heads of families who were indirectly involved in tourism [...], tourism having created many job opportunities in various sectors of life [...]. By and large, every one was eager to promote his business, be it related to culture, home industry or communication" (p.33). (2) Those sekehe who had taken a positive view towards tourism were eager to improve the quality of their performance. "Such a view was mainly the result of the handsome fee they were paid by hotels for whom they performed [...]." (p.34). However "two associations [... of Baturbulan] were rather passive". Etc. (3) "In Sanur, all the five banjar heads took quite a passive stand; in contrast, Kuta's attitude was positive, especially with regard to fund raising [...], the area that was [only briefly] visited by tourists was not at all involved and stayed rather aloof from the tourist development". (4 & 5) The village communities show a passive attitude in Sanur, Nas and Baturbulan towards fund raising, "Whereas in Kuta and three other desa adat only one shows activity, namely Legian [...] (p.35). On the other hand, "Sanur [as an administrative unit] shows quite aggressive business approach in its fund raising, the proceeds of which were spent on desa development in general" (p.36).

II. As a second step, the argument proceeds to evaluate the above results of the enquiries as l. positive ("It was manifest [with families] especially in improved hygienic conditions besides a desire to avail themselves of better education opportunities with a view to participation in the tourist industry". (p.37) — The quality of dance and drama performances improved — "Although in general the traditional villages remained aloof in the matter of fund raising, some of them showed positive aspects [...]." (p.37) — The administrative village districts also responded positively, etc. 2. negative ("Undesirable side-effects of tourism were mainly noticeable in villages like Sanur and Kuta where tourists stayed for longer periods" (p.38) — Prostitutes, thefts [said to be 'concomitant to tourism' in the English version only, p.48], and absence of active measures to counter them in the traditional village — passivity of the visited villages — absence of initiative or creativity in some arts associations and decline out of routine).

In their conclusion, the authors declare that the presence of tourists is "received by the people with a positive response which is conducive to development in general".

Finally, in order to develop tourism further, in conformity with the priorities, the authors recommend that 1. "Information should be disseminated in a sustained manner especially in the areas frequented by tourists while explaining the importance of the tourist industry as a significant part of ways and means to increase the people's income.

2. Awareness should be fostered among desa, adat and banjar members regarding the fact that social disturbances in the wake of tourism development were also the responsibility of the community concerned; a responsibility which required the community to take steps in order to restore
the harmony of the village.

3. A close cooperation among the various segments of the community as well as a clearer concept of the respective responsibilities are required to enable the functioning of a more efficient and effective social control, which would be conducive to solving socio-cultural problems caused by tourist development.

4. To overcome the regarding tendency usually attending any routine activity as was evident in the development of the arts, associations, innovation should be encouraged in every way, e.g., closer cooperation should be established between the government agencies connected with the problem concerned and the community's art associations involved in cultural expression". (Quoted from Report IV, English version, pp.49-50).

One important set of fresh data is found in Report IV, Chapter 3.1 The Impact of Tourism on Education.

For decades, education has been one of the main concern of the Government of the Republic with the only limits being physical and financial ones.

"Due to an intense desire for education among the rural community, there was a considerable increase in school attendance during the years 1960-1970. This was evident from the fact that large numbers of children of school age would not be admitted into the first grade of primary schools due to limited space and other teaching facilities" (p.18). And further "however, after the introduction of the contribution for the improvement of education requiring a financial participation from parents which was applicable to all schools including primary schools, there was a noticeable drop in this enthusiasm for education... For even the little money they had to pay as a school fee was a heavy burden for them... Fortunately, in recent years the Government did its utmost to have more primary schools built as well as more teachers appointed thanks to a Presidential Instruction" (p.19).

Yet the proportions of drop-outs and lock-outs (for want of seats) are important : 60,50 per cent. The questions therefore which the Udayana University research team had to ask were : "Will tourism increase the motivation for village
children to attend school or will it rather tend to encourage drop-outs? Will tourism stimulate a curriculum that stresses artistic expression and certain skills in school?" (Report IV, translation: 27). The answers of the school teachers allowed to conclude that "generally speaking tourism has stimulated the development of curriculum, particularly subjects relating to the arts and skills". To answer the first question, the authors had to resort to a close scrutiny of school statistics. The results of their calculations showed that "in both areas — where tourists stay and where they just pass through — tourism was an incentive for children to go to school. Yet the urge to leave school was still rather high in the area where tourists stay, the cause being probably that the desire to go to school is defeated by that of getting a job as there are more job opportunities here than in the area where tourists just pass through" (p.25).

On the basis of the figures of Tables II, I2 and I3 to which a formula is applied, the authors find that there are as many as 47 per cent drop-outs in the area where tourists stay and 56 per cent in the other area (pp.25-26 of the original version of Report IV), which is in contradiction with the comments.

Now, the calculation is not quite rigorous enough. To begin with the figure 47 per cent should be only 36 per cent. In addition, the formula, as it stands, is a little confusing. Moreover, it is inapplicable since some of its main factors are not to be found among the data provided in the tables. The formula is the following:

$$D^k \ast \frac{k}{t} + 1 = S^k \frac{t}{t} - (B^k \ast \frac{1}{t} + M^k \frac{1}{t} + 1)$$

where $D$ is the number of drop-outs

$S$ is the number of pupils registered for a given grade or level

$B$ is the number of pupils in a given grade or level

$M$ is the number of repeaters

$k$ is the grade or level

$t$ is the year.

But $S$ and $B$ are not given in the tables, which only indicate
(by school, year and grade) the number of new pupils and the number of repeaters, and Table I3 gives the total of drop-outs from 1st grade to leavers level (per area and grade) over three years. It is the total of drop-outs (from grade I to leavers) for one area divided by the total of pupils of grade I which gives a ratio of 76 in the residential area and 56 in the visited area. Yet, among other conclusions, Report IV declares that "tourism has adversely affected the case of drop-outs, their numbers having increased in the survey areas" (on p.38 of the English translation while the original reads p.29: "Tourism has a negative influence in that the number of drop-outs has increased in the areas where tourists stay"). Surprisingly, they recommend that:

1. "It is desirable to spread tourist resorts more evenly over the whole island of Bali in order to have a fairer distribution of income resulting from the sale of handicraft beside spreading the positive effects of tourism on the general education of the community.

2. In the survey area implementation of the 'compulsory schooling' regulation should be activated in order to lower the number of drop-outs besides improving educational facilities" (p.38 of translation).

Despite the inadequacy of the figures provided — an inadequacy which is admitted by the authors themselves and said to call for further research (p.26 orig./p.38 trans.) — I have attempted to revise the findings which are so strikingly contradicted by the comments.

Tables 11 and 12 are built as follows; but we are using Table 11 as the example:

Table XIV

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Year of Pupils</th>
<th>1966</th>
<th>1967</th>
<th>1968</th>
<th>1973</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>N°</td>
<td>No.</td>
<td>1966</td>
<td>1967</td>
<td>1968</td>
<td>1973</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>total</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>42</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>new</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>38</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>repeaters</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>total</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>34</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>new</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>repeaters</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In these tables, the only classes which constitute complete series are those for grade I of 1966, 1967 and 1968 which finished grade VI in 1971, 1972 and 1973 respectively. I have, therefore, rebuilt the tables using only the figures along the diagonals (the broken lines above) as they are representative of the annual call up of three single groups while they proceed over the years from one grade to the next:

Table XV. Rate of secondary school drop-out.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>area</th>
<th>cycle</th>
<th>grade</th>
<th>1966/71</th>
<th>1967/72</th>
<th>1968/73</th>
<th>t</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SMF</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>138</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>102</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAS</td>
<td>III</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>73</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and</td>
<td>t</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>313</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BATU-BULAN</td>
<td>VI</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>66</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(&quot;visited&quot;)</td>
<td>V</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>t</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>198</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMF</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>192</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>671</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>236</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>607</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KUTA</td>
<td>III</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>216</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>559</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and</td>
<td>t</td>
<td>529</td>
<td>708</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>1837</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SANUR</td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>507</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(&quot;residential&quot;)</td>
<td>V</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>448</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>VI</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>421</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>t</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>497</td>
<td>487</td>
<td>1376</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N: 1. SMF, elementary cycle of secondary schools
2. SMA, higher cycle of secondary schools.

This is certainly not the orthodox way of calculating the drop-out rate in a school system, but still it does show that there are considerably less drop-outs in the area where tourists stay than in the area where they simply go for shopping. The present processing of the available data now confirms the findings of the authors and show that their own comments are in contradiction with their own findings. There is not a direct (negative) influence of tourism on the rate of drop-outs in the respective areas. On the contrary, areas where tourists stay — and have more prolonged contacts with the population in general and the school age population in particular — are much less prone to truancy than the areas of passage for shopping only.
The very important fact that these two areas are also distinguished into urban and rural has to be seriously taken into account. Data to this effect have to be (1) completed and improved, (2) collected from rural areas where tourists neither visit nor stay. As long as this is not done, it is better not to give any serious consideration to the relation drop-outs/tourism — as 'not proven'.

...
Notes:

(1) See Laurent 1967.

(2) Report II : 45-7.

(3) Same : 47.

(4) Same : 55-6.

(5) One are is one hundred square metres, or one hundredth of a hectare, or 1076 sq. feet.

(6) Ter Haar 1962 : 97,181.

(7) This is from an enquiry made in December 1972 among 44 tourists. Another enquiry was conducted in January 1973.

(8) Compare Lengyel 1975 : 807 (or p.754 of the English original) :

"Much is made in the report of a multi-storey hotel at Sanur which is indeed a dismaying in a landscape where, on the whole, buildings are set discreetly amongst the lush vegetation. Yet this construction smack more of the sort of cliché-thinking characteristic of multi-national corporations than of sound economic sense. In a country where light construction, directly derived from traditional styles and easily put up by local labour, is perfectly adequate all year round and generally delights visitors, it indeed seems far-fetched to erect a highly capital-intensive and complex building with foreign labour and overwhelmingly imported materials. That lesson seems to have been learnt, for the more recent annex to the same hotel is already much closer to the traditional style".

The lesson may have been learnt in the case of this particular beach hotel corporation but not by a couple of others along the bay between Sanur and Benoa where their white parallelepipeds are seen to soar above the coconut fronds. Fortunately, they are far away from everything. In a way, they are counting on the, apparently doomed, Nusa Dua project.

(9) The case of the barong of Batubulan is raised once again in Report IV. In Chapter 2.3 dealing with The Impact of Tourism on the Economic Sector, the authors show how the four villages make the best of their accessory occupations to increase their revenues. In the case of Batubulan and Mas these are wood-carving, soft stone sculpture, painting, etc. "With regard to dance and drama, Batubulan in particular could boast of two barongs and a 'cak' group, both of which gave a daily performance for tourists starting at 9.00 [...]. It should be mentioned that the barong used in these performances is a replica, not the sacred one. The proceeds"... etc. (p.21 of the translation).

Then in Chapter 3.3 dealing with Religion "the research shows [among] the following specific influences of tourism on the Hindu religion of Bali [that]. It is difficult to keep the purity of the temples [...], 5. The ceremonial dance such as Barong-Ket in Batubulan is profaned and performed continuously for the tourists" (p.56 of the translation).
Following the common practice, the various elements are classified into negative and positive categories. Among the positive: "... for the needs of the tourist industry they make replicas which have no sacred function any longer" (p. 45); but among the negative elements "the profanation of the sacred dance such as Barong-Ket in Batubulan" is noted (p. 57 of the translation).

Either this is only aimed at one of the two Barong dances of Batubulan, one of them being a replica and, therefore, admissible, or there is a blatant contradiction within a couple of pages. In either instance, the reader is left with a feeling of unsatisfaction at the way the case is prepared. Yet, whichever is applicable, the general feeling which one gains from the four reports as well as from personal conversations with the individual authors is that replica or not, the use of dances, masks, ritual objects of various description for tourist purpose is misuse and should be banned. This is a position which is perfectly understandable and which I would support if only it could be soundly substantiated, and more explicitly phrased (recourse to the original text is of no avail).

(10) After conversion into U.S. dollars at the August 1974 rate of exchange, the table of value of exports of sculptures can be read as follows:

Table XVI

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total Value (U.S. $)</th>
<th>Value per Unit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1969</td>
<td>28,367.80</td>
<td>1.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>19,157.00</td>
<td>0.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971</td>
<td>27,947.00</td>
<td>0.98</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(11) Report 1:46, §11 states: "As for those who work in the sector of tourism, for instance, in hotels, travel bureaux, taxis, restaurants and the like, there is hardly any time left for them to perform the religious ceremonies as is the case also with those who work in sectors other than tourism. Besides they have much less time left to perform their social duties towards the community and this leads towards an attitude of individualism".

(12) See note 13 p. 57.
III. TOURISM IN THE BALINESE FUTURE

How will the rest of the twentieth century turn out for Bali and the Balinese? No more of an answer can be given for Bali than anywhere else. However, there are forces at work on Bali which combine with each other, and others which, being opposed either to one another or to the first, have hardly any chance of succeeding.

The main drives come from the overall development of tourism and from the Central Government to channel Indonesia’s visitors towards Bali and eventually to reap the benefits for the country as a whole. These drives are not to be resisted. Even if at present and presumably for some time to come there is a lull in the flow of tourists, as a result of the present world-wide economic recession, the factors are largely extraneous to the tourism phenomenon, which has such a momentum that it has to continue.

Even if at some stage the government decides to order a set of studies by the ablest body of scientists and research workers available on the spot, this is not to say that the recommendations and suggestions, which would be welcome and given due consideration, would be followed. Nor would the whole tourist process be slowed down were the report to be couched in conservationist terms which is likely. It is probably true that the culture of the Orang Lom and the Orang Sekah settled respectively on Banka and Biliton, the tin islands, were not worth one hundredth of that of the Balinese, but it must be asked, by what standards of reference; the price of tin? And if so, is the sacrifice of the Lom and Sekah really a boon to the nation? Their loss was slight, that of
the Balinese would be incomparably heavier on our consciences if Bali's wealth of culture were to be tapped to the point of exhaustion. Obviously, the delicate balance of this unique culture has to be preserved at all costs. It is worth more than gold and there is no dross.

The authors of our reports have brought their efforts to bear, firstly, on a review of all the changes which are currently taking place in the Balinese way of life and by a toilsome and unwieldy process assessing which may be assigned to tourism; secondly, on a large stock of recommendations for a respite and for prevention of infringements on Balinese culture by foreign influences. The recommendations are mostly to be found in Report I, and suffer from a common defect. They consist of point-by-point measures. None is a general measure, a scheme encompassing the whole problem.

On the whole, the proposed measures have, however, a value each in its own right. They fall broadly into the categories of the possible and the impossible. Most of them offer means of protection of Balinese culture, and one recognizes at once among these, the measures inspired by the preservationist spirit of the early Dutch and other foreign scholars who toiled to this end. They initiated an inventory of archaeological and historical treasures and they created a museum, a library of manuscripts and inscriptions. From the start, this was undertaken within the limitations imposed by budgetary resources. At present, the effort is gallantly carried on by devoted and talented scholars for the means engaged in the task appear hardly sufficient. It is absolutely necessary though, to keep in Bali for the Balinese and their admirers what belongs there. No money should be able to buy these heirlooms. Yet they slip out of the island every day in unsuspected quantities at prices which are only fair and decent at the point of sale, in the West, as well as in the East — or the Far East to be more precise. An archaeological inventory and a repertory of privately-owned palm-leaf manuscripts are in progress. A compulsory registration of all works of art both sacred and profane should be undertaken forthwith — as is now done in the Philippines under the patronage of the National Museum. Here,
the purchase and export of antiques have been placed under the control of the Department of Antiquities which has achieved some significant results thanks to close cooperation with the Customs Department. But unless an exhaustive inventory is completed, whatever is done is necessarily superficial, partial and vain.

The recommendations concerning the Balinese language and literature are also inspired by the same preservationist spirit and I say this with regret if the phrase appears derogatory. Obviously, this is so because it is the opposite of progressive, a word which is so overrated in political parlance and in sociology where normative and scientific points of view are so easily mixed as to cast a shadow of implied backwardness over all the rest. More of the school syllabus should be devoted to the study of the Balinese language and literature. Judging from short-term experience in and about the University at Denpasar, it is doubtful whether there are more scholars competent to read and understand any given palm-leaf manuscript in Bali, than in the rest of the world. Such a state of affairs is to be regretted as it has a certain, though not immediate relationship with the unwillingness of the young people to use their mother tongue at all, let alone use it properly. The temptation is apparently strong for those responsible for education in a developing country, to expand the share of scientific and modern languages in the curricula at the expense of the mother tongue, especially, of course, when it is different from the national language, in this case Bahasa Indonesia.

In matters of religion, the reports recommend that much the same care be given to early education within the framework of the existing school system and religious institutions. Favourable movements seem to be at work in this direction. They are represented in the main by the Dharma Hindu described by Dr. Ngurah Bagus (1). Even so, data on the subject are scanty and do not allow for a satisfactory assessment of the question. One retains, however, the strong impression that the religious basis of the Balinese culture is not really in great danger of disruption. Faith is well shared and deep, the priesthood thrives and the rites are celebrated. Islam no longer tries
to encroach upon the Hindu folk, and the Christian sects, in choosing the Arabic word for God, have probably made a mistake in becoming associated to some degree with the concurrent monotheist dogma. Therefore, they are not making any significant progress either. Nevertheless, it is very reasonable for responsible Balinese to support every move towards a reinforcement of religious principles which underlie the peculiar culture of this island. There are, as can be easily imagined and as is well described in the reports, so many onslaughts and temptations from the outside world pouring through the gaps of Ngurah Rai airport and Gilimanuk that, all told, prevention is the wisest measure. This is not to support the view that the Hindu-Balinese religion is the best ideology for a people to achieve happiness and equal chances of prosperity for all, but it is without the slightest shadow of doubt the only ideology that is able to sustain the Balinese socio-cultural complex. And in this perspective, there is also no doubt that both the enlightened teams of scholars and scientists who have conducted the research, and the Government who has directed them to do it are agreed, though not for the same intrinsic motives, that the culture of Bali has to be preserved and perpetuated in its traditional garb.

A degree of defiance has been noted here and there in the text of the reports, regarding some of the discernible motivations of the Government.

In one example quoted earlier, that of the village of Bualu which was threatened with a partial eviction most probably amounting to an eventual disruption of its basic local organization, the desa community was drawn over and above into an alien field — the financial contest over the value of their land. While fundamentally, what they were fighting for was their traditional set up, the conflict was taking place in mercantile terms.

Conversely, the overt objective of the Government was to offer greater facilities to the tourists who were to come and admire the living culture of traditional village communities while, ultimately, it was mainly meant to create more favourable conditions for the inflow of foreign currency. The issue of
this conflict at the time of the enquiries was firmly kept under control by the peasants who were talking culture in a money idiom to the Government which, for its part, was doing exactly the contrary. Now what is necessarily going to follow is that the Bualu peasants — like all peasants in the world — will be holding to their land all the more strongly when they have become fully aware of its market value.

But there is another kind of conflict where some amount of ambiguity is at play in the official attitude towards Bali and the Balinese. This is by no means peculiar to the case of Bali. It is also universal and, in the final analysis, has to do with the conflict between central power and regional particularism. Provincialism to the point of separatism, was overplayed by the colonial power until the eve of the transfer of sovereignty. It was, therefore, indispensable on the part of the Government of the Republic to build its new-found power on the ruins of the former political set up. So, to that end, huge momentous campaigns were launched from the capital and, millions of Indonesians scattered over thousands of islands would muster around striking catchwords and mottoes and forget their differences... This is past. With due respect and consideration for the present objectives of the Indonesian Government, there is no longer any great urgent need for such patriotic appeals to unity. Needless to say, a return of the former colonial power is not to be feared. But new threats are there, and they are very potent. Tourism is a symptom, it is a premonitory phenomenon and an accelerator of the many and often undetermined elements which are bound to have disruptive effects on the traditions of a long established way of life. There is no longer any need to minimize or even fight particularism and regionalism. Bung Karno's victories have now been well consolidated by Bung Harto. Every one in Bali knows very well that Indonesia means one people, one nation and one language. But to press the doctrine of Pancasila (2) any further and deeper in the minds of the Balinese people and youth will only be done at this stage at the expense of Pancayadnya (3). It is not advocated here that a teaching of the latter should now supplant that of the former in civics
classes, but certainly, for the sake of the survival of Bali as an original and distinctive whole, the teaching of the traditional principles should be given substantial precedence in the basic school curricula, if only for the simple reason that while away at school, children are not learning what their parents would otherwise teach them both formally and informally.

Evidently, the measures proposed for the improvement of the quality of the arts and crafts are worth the effort. They are in the process of being implemented. Art academies of various descriptions are offering courses and diplomas. They will probably not be able to ensure much more than a continuity of the popular models of souvenirs for the airport shops and guarantee reliable quality standards for a good management of the trade and the satisfaction of the art dealers and impresari. But the associative fibre in Balinese bodies has already made many artists and craftsmen to form co-operative unions, and they are likely to complement in a useful way the action of the Government. This is a logical step to take in a situation of open competition, the role of the Government being gradually confined to specific interventions in these bodies, mainly to prevent such and such association from monopolizing the trade.

It seems certain that setting up schools and a body of government-employed teachers or supervisors should be beneficial up to a certain point to the handicrafts. But no one can say the same for the dance and music associations. One main reason for this being that these functions as self-contained groups which one could hardly see swarming into schools together with similar groups, or separately. Besides why should they want to? Another reason is that the dance and music groups have always bred their own teachers, being a most excellent model of self-reproduction. Finally, the idea of imposing performance norms is completely adverse to the creative spirit of these groups. They create individually and collectively, new fashions sweep through the country and die out, groups compete in the playing to perfection of traditional performances (4). Playing the gong orchestra and dancing is still what appears to be a spontaneous activity; more, it is still closely associated
with the needs of the local and religious community. As regards these associations, the best thing to do is most certainly to leave them alone, although a few simple measures are suggested in the reports to prevent or, at least, reduce the undesirable effects of routine which the groups tend to develop when they are tied by contract to a given tourist concern like a travel agent or hotel and reduce also any negative effects of improved gains, though the profits have been shown to amount to anything but prosperity for most of them (5).

Finally, proposals for the setting up of Government Guide Schools are approved by the authors of Report I. There are already several private schools which tend to produce guides in excess of demand, such is the glory of this occupation in the eyes of school-leavers who have taken a popular foreign language (6). Doubts are also expressed that the curricula might not be wholly satisfactory either for tourism and the tourist or from the point of view of the Balinese. The complaints of the villagers that tourists are a nuisance in private palaces and in sacred enclosures during ceremonies and rituals have been expressed to the author and the onus often placed on the guides rather than on the tourist, who happen to be urged by the unscrupulous guide to take close-ups of priest officiating or to act in some unseemly way like this for the sake of a good tip. Report III observes: "whether the curricula of these courses meet the requirements of the tourist industry remains to be seen, but that is not our concern" (p.23).

1400 students were enrolled in tourist guide schools in 1974. Presumably, sooner or later they are to become qualified unemployed guides. Information on this matter is not abundant in this and previous reports, but at a possible rate of 700 diploma holders per year, the future of tourism could rapidly be marred by an unemployment problem of some considerable size, right in the shop window so to speak.

The very near future will bring visitors in formidable numbers, 3000 a day by 1982, according to the forecasts of the provincial tourist office. Will it be necessary to control or even restrict this flow? Are there any plans to cope with it?
Or is it a target on the contrary, with plans to meet it?

From the most emotional chapters of the reports, one is made to believe that there is one major kind of tourists — the long-haired, low-spending ones in rags — and that tourism, if it be made up of them alone, has overwhelmingly negative effects. This is certainly so to a greater extent than the relatively small number of such tourists might lead one to believe. Theirs is such an unBalinese way of life that they stand out dramatically against the background of the multitude of inoffensive 'package tourists', and still more offensively compared with the high-spending patrons of international hotel chains. Yet it is the latter who appears in force in the June 1974 sample of 100 respondents. One reason has already been offered why this should be so: their quick turnover is more likely to be noticed at the airport than that of the lowspending, long-staying 'home-stayers' who in addition find it more economical to enter and leave by road. Yet the international hotel class of tourists is hardly mentioned at all in those commentaries. Indeed, they are not very visible. They go about the island's places of interest in their air-conditioned coaches with grey tinted window panes and systems which pipe in Balinese music. They are hardly noticed and unnoticeable. They shop at their doorsteps. On their way back from a tour of Kintamani-Bedugul, they watch the dancers and musicians who are brought to them by the management for a brief performance or two. In a way this state of things is surely to be regretted. What have they seen of Bali? Not much, probably. But the question has to be asked: "Do they want more?"

Definitely no.

Under the circumstances, the Government has taken the most reasonable attitude. The feasibility studies ordered from a couple of firms of international reputation and their voluminous reports to the I.B.R.D. have prompted the decision to develop Nusa Dua on the peninsula. But does not this amount to segregating the tourists? It surely does, but not significantly more so than they are at present in their international class hotels. Moreover, Bali is overpopulated. The island is rapidly reaching congestion point. Some beaches are already lined with rows of
individual bungalows run both by hotels and privately. Towns are spreading into the priceless rice-fields, suburbs are appearing. Art galleries, petrol stations, rubbish tips fill both sides of the link roads. The ratio of town to country is, in the "visited" areas at least, unbalanced.

Under these circumstances, one understands the alarm of the authors of Report I, p.11 : in 1982, there will be 8000 rooms and 3000 visitors a day! And in 1985, 9500 rooms (p.186). By then it is made clear also that 6950 of these rooms will be built at Nusa Dua tourist city. The remaining 2550 rooms, it is said, will be shared between Denpasar, Sanur and Kuta (one hesitates to believe — as there are at present 2890 rooms in the same area — that this means that 340 rooms will close). This number is more likely to be about to double, a growth which, though unreasonable, is less than could be feared. Even so, there is the risk that the chaotic spread of bungalows will continue and that anyone and everyone will still be able to declare this private dwelling a 'homestay'. Uncontrolled building and catering will thus carry on meeting the demand of equally uncontrolled tourism.

This is indeed where some form of control has to occur. At first sight, it seems illiberal to suggest the undesirable kind of tourist be more strictly controlled, for the choice of fair and objective criteria would raise difficulties. The criterion of hair length was ridiculous as the example of Singapore aptly illustrates, and that of a quota of tourist visas as Burma had in the first few months following the re-opening of her borders was incompatible with any development plan for tourism. So too was the current Chinese procedure which required the tourists to submit a fully-documented application with reasons for a visa one year in advance. But was it not already almost the case in Bali for scientists wishing to conduct their research in the field? LIPI (the Indonesian Institute for Scientific Research) requires such a procedure and it is reckoned to last six months. Without Lipi's authorization, it is illegal to stay more than 48 hours in any one place where there is not a hotel, or some other registered accommodation available to the public. Kuta, Sanur and Denpasar are plagued with visitors
of an undesirable sort. When the principle of limitation is already admitted for scientists who must offer serious guarantees and references, it will seem all the more justifiable, in the face of the difficulties on record, to require the same from individuals who insist on staying more than say one week 'with the people' and yet beach comb at Sanur — a privilege of the princes till the middle of the last century (7).

This proposal entails as a corollary, completely free access to the tourist zone of Nusa Dua with unlimited lengths of stay. Surely this is equivalent to discrimination on a financial basis which holds unpleasant overtones. Students and blue or white collar workers do have a right to a place in the sun, and the idea of introducing money as a discriminating factor might immediately be rejected as immoral. Forthwith a similar question must be posed whether it is moral to board for one dollar a day and live for next to nothing at a place where this 'nothing' represents the entire daily mean per capita income of the hosts...

What is more, Nusa Dua is probably going to be open to all classes and grades of tourists from the luxury hotels at the top, down to the self-service camping grounds, through all the shades of social tourism with motel style accommodation and every type that can be imagined. Nusa Dua is so out of the way that while the Department of Tourism will have to bus in all the island's dance and music groups in turn to the visited visitors more comfortably seated in some auditorium than squatting in a temple yard with its brand new toilets, no Balinese will run the risk of encounters and company which are so often said to be unpleasant.

Segregation is both a nast word and reality, but the Balinese have to make a choice. It seems from chance information received while there that this choice has already been made, as seems evident from the decision to launch the Nusa Dua tourist development project (8). It remains to be seen whether extending a regime derived from the LIPI model will also apply to the tourists who pride themselves on 'culture'. But surely this has to be classified as one of the protective measures that are impossible.
Notes:

(1) See Bibliography under I Gusti Ngurah Bagus, n.d.

(2) *Panca: ila*, the five basic principles of the Republic: belief in God, nationality, humanity, democracy, and social justice. "One people, one nation, one language" was the Oath of the Youth, *Sumpah Pemuda*, in 1928.

(3) *Pancayadnya*, the five orders: divine order, the ancestors, the leaders, humanity and the universal order.

(4) These mechanisms are admirably illustrated in McPhee's *House in Bali*. The writer was glad to obtain confirmation that such was still the situation through direct interviews in September 1974 at Kuta with Lotring, the composer, and at Ubud with Sampeh the dancer, who had been close collaborators of McPhee.

(5) It is rather sad to see Bali adopt the institution of colleges of dance and music (KOKAR for Konservatory Karawitan Jurusan Bali [Report IV: 19]) following the example of the western nations at a time when they themselves are at pains getting rid of theirs — dismal remnants of nineteenth century authoritarianism more prone to standardize styles and sterilize variants than to foster talents and promote the art.

(6) See also Report III, pp.23–24.

(7) *Tawan karang* (looting the reefs) is the wrecking right which the Regents of Badung surrendered on 28 November 1842 in an additive to the treaty of submission to the Government of the Dutch Indies (26 July 1841). It had to be reiterated in a consolidated treaty on 13 July 1949, and again in a joint declaration of September 1861, and again in September 1864. Much the same procedures were applied all along the second half of the nineteenth century to the other states (Anon 1964). See also, in this connexion, V. Baum's *A tale of Bali*.

(8) A Director, the former Head of the Provinical Department of Tourism, was appointed from 1 September 1974.

[In his rejoinder to the first version of the present work, P. Lengyel states that the "large tourist complex, planned in an isolated location has, for the time being at least, been put in abeyance and one can but hope that the project will not be revived, even if tourist traffic picks up again" (1975:807)].
CONCLUSION

In the introduction, the view was expressed that tourism is marginal for the Balinese, and that whatever good there was to it would eventually be assimilated. This view may now be reviewed and at the same time, it may seem less idealistic. A storm of change has hit Bali, but with the concentration of facilities for tourism development at Nusa Dua on the south peninsula the storm is going to be localized, kept away and apart from where it could do harm. The prediction that in the coming decades the phenomenon of mass tourism will reflect on the Balinese, might not come true. After all, there is the precedent of another stormy force, Islam, which swept across most of the Archipelago, but round Bali and part of Lombok. It was resisted by the recalcitrant princes from East Java taking refuge in Bali and the Balinese did not become involved in it.

Thus, it seems that tourism is on the way to evolving as a genuinely marginal activity in the peninsula as a peripheral tourist complex. It is also likely to be marginal in that the money earned by Bali from tourism does not reach the Balinese as fast and in such quantities as could be expected, hence the latent discontent which is sometimes discernible that so much is spent by the foreigners and so little is gained by the common Balinese folk. Indeed, it appears most clearly from an objective reading of the reports that tourism is the business of a small, indeed a very small part of the population. An even and smooth redistribution of the manna can only be visualized by drawing on artificial summing of the data, lumping together maxima and minima into averages. Unfortunately, this is almost the only method available, with the exception
of the intensive investigations which anthropologists could achieve and which alone would show the micro-economics of spin-off from tourism. The amounts involved are undoubtedly small and their distribution occurs with some considerable time lag, as has been shown.

The questions then arise: is not the general rise in social and economic standards a benefit to all Balinese and would not a more substantial increase in cash income become a factor disturbing the traditional order? The twofold problem is put most aptly in a short quotation from Professor Rosemary Firth's Housekeeping among Malay Peasants (1966): "Reformers have tended to conceive the improvement of standards of living too much in monetary terms and the command over a more varied range of goods. But if these goods are not intelligently used, if increased money income breaks up traditional mechanisms for social services and the pooling of resources, such an increase in the financial level of income may have the reverse effect".

The first question is easily answered in the affirmative. The improvements in standards of living and the modernization of traditional structures are generally an effect of recent trends observable in most countries of the Third World, particularly in those which are more richly endowed with natural resources. These improvements are also observed in countries like Indonesia which have attained a sufficient level of political stability as a condition of efficient administration. It is obvious that development proceeds at a faster pace in areas affected by tourism than elsewhere in the Republic. There is here the difficulty of choosing which elements are comparable and assessing the differences. For an estimate of the effects of tourism, a comparison of the rates of growth of the regional product should be made by pairs of provinces. Bali should be paired with Lombok and the validity of the comparison should be checked by comparing it with the difference obtained between the rates of growth in the region of Yogyakarta-Solo and the Sundanese region. As it is assumed that Pasundan and Lombok enjoy similar physical conditions as Yogy-Solo and Bali, the difference would appear in crude terms
as due to those elements in Yogyakarta and Bali which attract tourists. It is pleasant to assign to Borobudur and Pura Besakih the role of economic accelerators which Keynes assigned to the pyramids of Egypt. And it is also sad to see that places devoid of interest for tourists are those which are able to preserve their traditional culture that much more easily, because development and modernization are introduced at a pace slow enough to enable painless assimilation. Fast, massive and disruptive modernization is the lot of the more attractive living cultures. Fast, massive inflow of tourist money bringing about disruptive modernization is the answer most commonly given to the second question.

Rates of growth are no more than effects. A much deeper understanding would be obtained from internal studies of the micro-economics of the basic Balinese social units, the associations and the local groups. This is where the money is earned by performance and production for example, and where it is spent. This is where one fears that increased cash income may break up the traditional associations and groups. These fears are very real when one refers to the conflict between the administration and the village of Bualu. The villagers were offered 4,000 Rp per are, while they themselves estimated their land to be worth 75,000 Rp per are. One imagines the problems which might arise in a peasant community with the sudden influx of cash in such large amounts. In desa and banjar councils the rules of open discussion and common consent would suffer, corporate tenure of land would break up into individual-titled ownership; competition between individuals would replace that between associations until peasants are bought both body and soul, out of agriculture.

Somewhat indirectly these are the great dangers brought about by tourism and, fortunately, there are indications that the limits of the territorial expansion of hotel building are now set, both by the concentration at Nusa Dua and by the restrictions on land transactions on the coast and at Bedugul, Kintamani/Penelokan and Bukit Kecamatan Kuta.

A greater danger now exists with the development of
cultural tourism as such. Mass tourism is not the only form of tourism to blame, and if it is responsible for some of the ills, the greater number of these are visible enough at least for the parties concerned to be able to assess them and take such measures as are necessary. The dangers have been reviewed in this paper. On the other hand, cultural tourism, as seen by the scholars and researchers of the Universitas Udayana, is endowed with the positive aspects of tourism and is consistently presented as preferable and preferred to mass tourism. Contrasting the two kinds of tourism and choosing the cultural is natural enough for academics, but it is to be feared that they are deluded by the greater understanding that the educated tourists show in their choice of objectives when visiting Bali, misled by their surer taste in buying objets d'art, and deceived by their discrimination in the search of authentic antiques. The cultural tourists are also more inquisitive in their questions about the purposes and types of ritual. They are more overt in a home by their wish to participate in its true life than the casual 'homestayer' for whom stereotype smile communication is enough.

Although the attitude of the cultural tourist fits the academics' own standards better, it consists not of contacts but of penetrations, encroachments and interactions which must, in every way, have more effects than the four-day visit of the average tourist with his guided tours and planned shopping and dance shows. The cultural tourist inserts himself deeper into the core of his object of interest, thus disturbing it much more than would the superficial observer.

What is to be done against the insidious dangers of cultural tourism depicted here? Any measure taken would require more effort and imagination than those proposed so far. This is not to say that the latter are not useful. Conservation and preservation are indeed indispensable. It is, for instance, urgent that an inventory of antiquities be completed listing monuments and sculptures and antiques like 'kris', jewels, manuscripts and so on. It is important that existing laws be strictly enforced to prevent valuable cult instruments and cultural artefacts from slipping out of the country in exchange
for a few hundredths or, more often, thousandths of their resale value on the western antique market. But this is far from enough. Besides conservation, there must be other sets of measures to ensure that creativity is kept alive. Academies and art classes will not suffice, the mood of Pitha Maha did not survive the second World War. The reasons for the absence of such artistic revivals at present must, therefore, be investigated as well. The recent commercial success of mass-produced Balinese art only partially answers the question. It is an external factor only. As for the changes noticed in Balinese society and culture, their external causes are known but the internal motivations towards the acceptance of some aspects of change and the rejection of some others are not.

Balinese arts and culture have to be protected from within, by being kept alive. To that end, the factors determining the value systems on which they rest have to be well known. The weak links in the systems have to be tightened, and their strong points reinforced, once they have been identified. Such a task warrants further intensive study in the field, possibly at the banjar level and in that case by the qualified anthropologists of Udayana University or elsewhere.

It is inevitable that a comparison and a synthesis of the three reports should emphasize loopholes such as the need for further basic research, while some aspects were given a disproportionate importance such as art manufacture and trade, and land transactions. It was, however, the purpose of this paper to cast this kind of light on the material. It appears from the overall picture thus obtained that, in the general improvement of living standards and rise in income, whether in the public or the private sector, in whatever class or category, Bali and the Balinese have secured the best share. While the dangers of such fast expansion as result from tourism are very real, Bali is best prepared to cope with them. Upheld by a well-tried heritage and braced by a stiff politico-religious backbone, Bali has more chance of a successful survival than most other exotic cultures suddenly exposed to change.
At the time I was compiling this synthesis of Reports I to III, I was not fully aware of the work which had just been completed by McKeen and only one short piece of his writings on Bali (1971) had come to my notice. This is certainly to be regretted in one sense, but, on the other hand, I am glad that his general opinion and main conclusions — again judging from two brief communications and not from his main contribution, a substantial Ph. D. thesis — should coincide so much with mine, despite the mutual ignorance of our concurrent endeavours. That was accidental — and unfortunate since our science, these days, should not leave so much to chance — but it is not accidental that we should agree, in the broad lines, on the question of the impact of tourism on Bali. The fact has to be emphasized for I have often felt that if I had shaped an opinion of my own, it was likely going to stay that way for a long time to come. Indeed, I mostly met with resistance from some of the members of Udayana University, caustic objections from economists, ridicule from the tourist industry specialists, etc... Yet reading Geertz was sometimes comforting: his global view of the society, impartial and devoid of trivialities, also in conformity with mine, made it quite clear that it was no wishful thinking to maintain that the Balinese culture and society were alive, strong and able to adapt to changing circumstances. For instance, the case of the Tabanan princes turned manufacturers [Geertz 1963 (b)], was one more encouragement in expressing hope for a balanced development of Bali under the momentous pressure of tourism, 'Mass' or otherwise.

Anthropologists commonly appear to be biased and to take sides for "their people". This is certainly so in most cases, but the reasons why it is so are not always stated. An anthropologist dealing with the impact of tourism on the Balinese culture is necessarily looking at tourism from the cultural standpoint. His first concern is to find out as much as possible about the Balinese culture and to judge tourism (or whatever the business of the day happens to be) within the framework of the culture as a whole. This is obviously not the way things are done by the representatives of the other professions, economists, tour operators, etc. for whom the Balinese culture
is a placer, a play-ground and, at best, a field for experiments. This is not the way things are done either by the academics of Udayana University even though they themselves are Balinese. Direct involvement does not afford a sound ground for objectivity and, surely the double involvement in which their role as the flower of the civil service places them does not either. However, the question of the consequences of this ambivalence of position in the four reports of Udayana University and the motivations behind it may safely be set aside for further investigation if needed. As a matter of fact, the initiative of this self-criticism rests with the authors themselves. This is certainly the way I have tried to approach the problem, taking into account all the data that had been put at my disposal and all the data which I could collect myself during a brief stay in Bali. And this is, of course, the way McKean too has dealt with the question.

Now, while the approach of McKean is admittedly more thoroughly anthropological than mine (due to a much longer stay in the field), there is one objection which has to be raised, namely that he has not taken fully into account the available data provided by the other disciplines. To McKean, Balinese culture and society are fully alive and highly resistant and, therefore, are able of adaptation, as I have already noted. There are a number of reasons for this — a widely-shared religious system, a social organization with a small number of basic principles and a huge number of local variants, etc. Another reason is that, in the face of the tremendous development of tourism, the Balinese are better equipped than most people in comparable circumstances because the financial returns are "considerable". In his 1973 communication to the ICAES, McKean quotes figures which are indeed impressive. He does not seem — at least in that paper — to have submitted them to the necessary criticism. I have shown, on the basis of the available data, that the direct returns are on the contrary rather scant. Despite the luxury of their performances, the Balinese are not rich. They are not rich because they sell their precious culture but because they are industrious. Whether they work their rice fields on irrigated terraces, their duck ponds,
their salt marshes and soft stone quarries or perform their music
and dance, the Balinese do it with all their energy and much
astuteness geared towards maximal profit (spiritual and/or
worldly). This is the distinctive feature of their culture
personality, and maybe all that is needed, at least for the
time being, to explain their survival as a culture in this time
of intense contacts and relentless pressure.

I should add, in favour of McKean’s argument, that
possibly in spite of the extremely narrow benefits which they
obtain from tourism the people are thus sufficiently stimulated
to carry on “doing what they enjoy doing traditionally—performing
their culture [...] the funds, as well as the increased
skills and equipment available, have enriched the possibility
that the indigenous performances will be done with more elegance,
in effect conserving culture” (1973: 11).

* * *

*
APPENDIX I

Background information on Bali

As it is felt that there is a need for some background information on Bali, it is offered here in these brief notes for easy reference as well as to avoid unduly weighting the text with data which are so well known to many a reader as to appear superfluous. Necessarily, within the limitations of this report, these facts are treated in somewhat broader terms than will be found elsewhere, as may be seen in the bibliography.

Geography

Bali is a small mountainous island of 5,600 km$^2$ lying in the same arc as the other islands of the Sunda archipelago. It is situated between the eastern end of Java and the island of Lombok. By sea, communications are possible with Java by the Gilimanuk ferry at Bali's western tip, where 60 per cent of the passenger traffic and 40 per cent of the goods are handled; with Lombok via the small natural port of Padangbaai; with the rest of Indonesia at Buleleng on the north coast, which is so shallow that boats have to find moorings two to three cable's lengths out to sea, and with the rest of the world through the artificial port of Benoa on the south coast. By air, Bali's main transport node is the modern international airport at Tuban on the stem of the southern peninsula. It was built between 1963 and 1969 under the First Five-Year Plan programme of development. It accommodates all the traffic of the three domestic and the six international airlines flying into Bali.

The island lies in the equatorial zone with the 8th parallel south running along its longer diameter. This position means day length and the annual temperature mean of about 23°C do not vary greatly, but it does affect the climate by an alternation of dry and rainy seasons. The westerly monsoon blows from October to April and this is the overall wet season. The easterly monsoon is dry, save for the south coast which keeps receiving some rain between July and November (see Table II), when the districts of Buleleng on the north coast and Karangasem
to the east endure dry seasons which last up to the whole of the austral winter.

Conversely, both rainfall and temperature vary a great deal with altitude. Denpasar at 4m receives only 1,400mm of rain on 60 days a year with a mean temperature of 26.06°C, and Buleleng at 10m receives 1,225mm over 70 days with a mean temperature of 25°C, while Candikuning in the middle of Bali on the central divide at 1,250m over sea level, receives nearly 2,900mm on 140 days with a mean temperature of 17.5°C. Along the mountainous east-west spine of Bali the lakes (3,280 ha) and the forests (81,000 ha or just about 16 per cent of the territory) are to be found.

This ridge, an alpine fold, divides Bali into a narrow northern zone and a wider southern zone. On average, the ridge is not much more than 1,000m high but several more recent volcanoes, two of which are still active, Mt Batur (1,717m) and Mt Agung (3,274m) rise well above the ridge. On the whole, this results in a rather infertile base of limestone visible as dry and barren chalk spread around the island on the north-west, the east and the south coasts with, specially in the south, the Bukit peninsula and the island of Penida off the coast of Klungkung. This base has experienced uplift and fracturing in the centre and, from the quaternary volcanoes, ash and other clastic material has been deposited in deep layers of tuff over most of the south. The best land is found in the intermediate zone where ample rainfall and fluvial activity have brought the volcanic material as sediments, as is the case on the northern inland sections of the districts of Tabanan, Badung, and Gianyar, with their typically dense stream network oriented from north to south. The worst land lies around and south of Mt Agung in Karangasem where recent lava and ash render the area useless. The eruption of 1963 is vividly remembered.

It will be understood then that the overall density of 337 inhabitants per sq.km (1) cannot depict the reality of the population density of Bali, unless it is compared with that of only ten years ago — 318, or with the density of Indonesia — 63 (2).
The least densely populated of Bali's eight districts, Jembrana has just over 200 persons/km². Another, Gianyar has nearly 700, and Badung which includes the subdistrict of Denpasar with its 3,172 /km², has over 800 /km² for its other five subdistricts which occupy 470 out of its 500 km². Emigration to other Indonesian islands, whether spontaneous or with Government assistance, has only removed a small fraction of the population (2,000 men and women in 1971) and family-planning is still only in the early stages of implementation. Yet Bali with 6.3 acceptors per 1,000 is well ahead of Java with only 2.9 per 1,000 in 1971 (3).

Economy

Under such conditions, one understands the necessity for an intensive agriculture requiring the full energies of the Balinese peasant as well as his ingenuity or rather, one should say engineering, as irrigation of terraced rice fields, a well-known southeast Asian technique (4), is outstandingly well developed in Bali. One also understands the absence of rice or any other staple in the list of items exported either on the domestic or the foreign markets. Rice production is increasing though, at an incredible annual rate of 53.13 per cent over the years 1968 to 1971 (5) which keeps it well ahead of the population growth estimated as a result of the 1971 census at only 2.5 per cent. Maize has been slowly decreasing in importance and various kinds of tubers and beans are increasing. But it has to be said that an estimation of output of these staples is made particularly difficult by the fact that only a very small amount of these products appear on the market while great attention is officially paid to every stage in the production and distribution of rice. Coffee is the main export and Bali ranks as the third province within Indonesia for this item, which between 1969 and 1973 accounted for over 70 per cent of the total value of Balinese exports. Rubber is far behind with only about 10 per cent, while cattle varies at around 20 per cent of the total value. In fact, it is estimated that in 1971 20,000 head of cattle were exported, while 25,000 were consumed locally (6). As for pigs, the
numbers were 60,000 and 30,000 respectively. This gives a rough idea of the dietary habits of the Balinese. These habits must also be seen in different perspectives. Firstly, the ratio between items containing protein and those based on vegetables is not easily computed from the movement of goods in the market as so much is produced and consumed domestically, maize, beans and tubers, on the one hand, and fish and ducks, on the other. Secondly, according to the region it may or may not be possible to grow rice in irrigated fields. But, cutting across these distinctions, there is another distinction to be introduced. All along the central mountain ridge running from west to east and down to its continuation and on the island of Penida off Klungkung dwell a category of Balinese who are generally considered as the original inhabitants. It is widely held that they represent an earlier, aboriginal population, though this is not a wholly satisfactory theory. These people of the watershed, the Bali age (pron.: AG as in AGora and E almost as the French eu or the German ö, only somewhat more to the back of the palate) differ tremendously and in many respects from the lowland Balinese. One of the many sets of differences is that they eat maize, tubers and beans rather than white rice. In addition, the Penida islanders steam their food instead of boiling it. These contrasts are not just a question of environmental differences. Indeed where maize grows, dry rice cultivation is equally possible.

Industry is not very significantly developed. Goods produced locally are those which it would cost more to import like carbonated beverages, soap and cigarettes, or to process elsewhere such as canning and printing. One important local industry is the production of handicrafts. Undoubtedly however, it is the tourist industry which attracts most attention from the Indonesian national and provincial authorities as well as from the outside world. Being the subject matter of this report it will not be developed in annex.

Culture and Society

It is the Balinese of the lowlands who have gained
universal recognition as the bearers of an extraordinary culture with which no comparison may be made. Yielding to external pressure, especially during modern times, the Balinese have been deprived of a number of features which they had inherited from their forefathers. Fortunately, the latter had themselves, over the early centuries of recorded history, absorbed and assimilated many features of the great civilizations and religions brought to them via Java. In particular, they had been able during long periods of isolation to integrate these foreign cultural elements into their own so well that it all appears towards the end of the twentieth century as the island of the Gods, the Last Paradise on earth or whatever other favourable epithet may have been applied. Indeed so fascinating is it, that the huge interest of international tourism has been awakened.

What is Balinese culture and society? This is a question which is only partially answered by a description necessarily rather scant. The society appears at first as characterized by its proneness towards all types of association, ritual, profane and many others besides. In contrast, there also exists an eagerness for seclusion and isolation. This is seen in the way family compounds, villages and temples are enclosed within their four walls, and also in the preference for marriage of patrilateral parallel cousins (i. e. with the father's brother's daughter) (7). This is not to say that such is the rule, even if it is formulated as one, but it does point to a tendency towards excluding strangers and as a consequence to maintaining the purity of the patrilineage and the integrity of the estate. Marriage, however, is much more often by mutual consent of the individuals concerned to simply cohabit or to elope together if the situation requires it. Legitimation, both religious and profane is usually performed within forty-two days by the appropriate rituals and exchanges of property as bridewealth. It is, or was, also sometimes decided by members of two local groups who wish to inaugurate or reinforce ties, to marry their children, even if they are not yet of marriageable age. This is said to have become rare since the 1950s (8), but years before Covarrubias (9) had already reported this
type of marriage often being undercut by staged abductions or
dependent arrangements are that marriage occurs in the open
field of chance meetings and falling in love within the limits
of locality, class and caste, the three being thus and to varying
degrees, de facto and de jure, endogamic. Polygamy exists among
those who can afford it and it is a one way means of breaking
the rule of caste and class endogamy. A man of high caste can
marry a commoner's daughter, as second or further wife, whereas
a low caste man cannot envisage legal connubium with a high caste
woman. Banishment or death used to be the sanction. Needless
to say, this is no longer so under the Republic.

There are no longer princes ruling over any of the
present-day districts with their modern administrative apparatus,
but there is still a nobility. Its members retain titles, the
status which most probably preexisted the imported Hindu caste
system. As for their functions, they were lost in two stages:
firstly, after the Dutch conquest and secondly, since independence.
The caste system survives and is apparently still strong (lo).
Brahmana, Satria and Wesia are the "twice born". The Wesia in
Bali were also considered nobility and had access to rule and
military functions. The Brahma priest, of superior status
by all accounts, sometimes had more difficulties obtaining
recognition from the rulers than they now do from commoner
district officers and other high-ranking civil servants. The
fourth caste is that of the Sudra, the peasants, who are the
servants of the first three castes, 'outside' yet still 95 per
cent of the population. Authors disagree as to the existence
of true outcast groups. Uncleanliness is a danger which
appropriate rituals ward off, but in some cases like that of
the blacksmiths it reaches such a degree as to become a virtue
akin to sacredness. Blacksmiths have to be addressed in 'high
language' normally used by inferiors to superiors, even by the
priests. No outsider would nowadays be able to distinguish
one caste from another unless he knew high from low languages
and their subtleties and unless he were familiar with the
seating etiquette of levels and orientations, for example.
The so-called aboriginal Balinese of the central watershed recognize no castes, and recognized no rulers. They did not hold their land from them. Authority was equally shared out amongst the members of what Korn named "De Dorps-republik", the Village Republic of Tenganan, an exceptional case in many ways. Without referring to these extremes, this basically very Indonesian way of making decisions through discussion and consent is not exclusive to the Bali age. It is indeed one of the great characteristics of Balinese society. Voluntary based associations cut across family bonds, local groups such as villages and even districts as in their dealings with a river basin for the purpose of irrigation up and down stream as well as on both banks of the valley they may overlap political boundaries. These voluntary associations, Sekehe (11), which are many and varied, fall into at least five categories: agricultural (hoeing fields, plucking rice-ears, collecting coconuts, chasing rats, etc.); social and economic (masons, hunters, weeders of temple yards, etc.); sex and age groups (virgins and young boys); others, such as the famous palm beer drinking clubs.

The purposes seem clear enough; the reasons are less so. If any, they probably constitute a response of Balinese society to another organizational grid in which they have found themselves. The territorial organization of the desa indeed imposes on its inhabitants similar strict patterns of conduct, both towards their fellow humans and towards the spirits and the Gods. It has been known since L. H. Morgan's work on "Houses and houselife of the American Aborigines" (1881), that the ground plan of a village and its houses can be read as charts of social organization. This can be done in the case of Balinese traditional architecture and native urbanism whereby the villages and houses are oriented according to those directions of space which have religious values and significance.

The Hindu Trinity is necessarily represented in every village in its well-known manifestations: Vishnu at Pura Puseh, the temple of origin at the head of the village
in the north-eastern quarter: Brahma at Pura Desa, the temple of the middle; and Shiva at Pura Dalem, at the end of the village with the burial ground in the south-western quarter. The local lord's palace, the Puri, is west of the central place usually occupied by a Ficus tree and a few boulders or slabstones. Across the road to the east is the village temple with the main assembly hall and the belfry with its kul kul to call the villagers. Bordering the main road on both sides are the individual compounds. These have an internal arrangement of the various functional parts which is comparable to that of the village. In their north-eastern corner are the altars and more to the head of the compound, the parents' sleeping quarters. Opposite the spirits is the kitchen and opposite the parents is the granary with the seeds. Round the empty centre where the 'owners of the soil' are honoured by offerings laid on the bare ground, are open structures with various purposes public 'external' affairs to the west, family 'internal' affairs to the east. These are only the most basic associations and oppositions whence many more can be and are elaborated.

Although equality of the village members is made real by the roughly equal partition of compound lands, some ranking occurs both according to the distance from the centre and by location relative to the head or the end of the village and the burial ground. The earliest members of the community, whose compounds border the main road and those immigrating or branching off from the first, have settled farther away from the market place on parallel lanes. The latter is one of the processes by which subdivisions of the desa become as many banjar, hamlets, wards, themselves divided again into smaller units (dadia, tempek, kliran, kuren, etc.). Such a mechanical process introduces a more profound distinction than size between desa and banjar. The desa has mostly religious functions, if only according to the kahyangan (tripartition of pu-ra puseh, desa and dalem), while the banjar is rather concerned with the profane affairs of its human population, dealt with on the principle of cooperation in the fields of production, social control and group cohesion. For instance, the banjar councils, whose chairman is unanimously accepted, discuss those affairs
which concern them, decide by common consent, settle disputes by frank discussion and total knowledge of the issues. In contrast, the desa assembly involves the lord or his representative and the priests. Cases lodged with or by the lord, are submitted to divination or ordeal and oaths involving supernatural sanctions are taken.

Here again this rather strictly elaborated organization of profane and sacred, of overlapping realms of life is best viewed as the main condition for the flowering of the arts in a compensating role. Is it necessary to push the argument any further? Is it not enough to suggest in this brief essay that such exuberance in the arts must be seen as the effect of so much restraint elsewhere?

History

A synchronic view of the development of Balinese civilization may afford some facts to temper, if not contradict the views just expressed. But it must be seen that historical events of more or less the same nature, in more or less the same sequence, have occurred elsewhere in the archipelago. Yet they have not produced the same effects as here. Indeed, the closest products obtained are those resulting from comparable conditions and circumstances amongst the immediate neighbours of Bali, East Java and West Lombok, a consideration which invites the postulate of the existence of a common substratum, a basic consanguinity of the three regions.

The historical sequence, listed with minimal comment or development, is as follows.

Prehistory is represented by a few palaeolithic and neolithic artefacts whose dating has been left to guesswork. Early bronze drums and the like have been assigned to a Dongsonian culture, and stone cists, probably sarcophagi, to a megalithic culture.

History begins with the years 882 to 942 AD, the dates of the reign of King Sri Ugra Sena who is said to have settled his capital at Singha Mandawa and to have been succeeded by
the Wangsa Warmadewa dynasty. At the end of the tenth century came the reign of King Dharma Udayana, who married a princess from East Java called Mahendra. She introduced Sivaism which combined, or rather was admitted into a political coexistence with the king's Buddhism. Indeed, Siva Buddha as a distinct blending of religions is hardly conceivable. King Airlangga, their son, reigned over Java, while his youngest brother Anak Wungsu succeeded King Udayana.

At the beginning of the eleventh century, during the reign of Anak Wungsu who died in 1079 AD, Empu Kuturan a wise monk from Java came to Bali as an envoy of Airlangga to integrate the trinitary concept of Hinduism. Accordingly, he is said to have organized the village temples into three elements and, to suit the new faith, to have rebuilt the seven main hierophantic points of the island, Mount Agung, Ulu Watu and so on. His brother Empu Bharadah, as a second envoy of Airlangga, requested the payment of tribute to Java. The request was rejected, Empu Kuturan had already taken sides for Bali.

Towards the end of the twelfth century, King Jaya Pangus reigned over the seven kingdoms of Bali. He is credited for the impulse given to the organization of irrigation associations, but not, as has been maintained, as the inventor of irrigation, which was probably known since the seventh century or thereabouts (12). He also left proclamations on sanctions for murder and the institution of blood-money, the ritual status of some desa and their tax exemptions. Between 1260 and 1324, there are no edicts or royal proclamations to be found in Bali, but this is roughly the time of the reign of Kertanegara at Singasari of East Java. It is known from Javanese sources (13) that a Balinese rebel was killed in 1280 and that Bali was attacked in 1284. The king of Bali then submitted and a Javanese minister Kebo Parud was put in charge.

The religious practices of Kertanegara and his minister, akin to Tantrism, appeared as magic and sorcery to the Sivaist priests of Bali and the faithful, who therefore, rebelled. But the end of the kingdom of Singasari when King Kertanegara was overthrown and killed in 1292, marked the
beginning of the famous Empire of Majapahit. In Bali, nothing is heard of the minister Kebo Parud after 1300 and, from 1324 onwards, power seems to have returned to King Betara Guru, a descendant of the Warmadewa dynasty, thus King Udayana.

In the first half of the fourteenth century, King Asta Sura Ratna Bumi Banten was in power. One decree of his is dated 1338 AD. Is he to be identified with Dalem Bedahulu, the legendary pig-headed king? He was the one who was attacked by Majapahit the new power of East Java, and who surrendered in 1343. This is from evidence of the Javanese Empu Prapanca who only says in his Negarakertagama annals that "at the time of the arrival of Hayam Wuruk (the Emperor) at Singasari, he (the annalist) stopped over at the house of a Buddhist priest who knew about Bali. The latter said that in 1343 AD an army entered Bali and destroyed everything, the King was so afraid that he fled far away with his followers". This scanty evidence allows some Balinese authors (14) to deny that there ever was any great clash of armies on the island and that Gajah Mada, the famous minister of Emperor Hayam Wuruk, ever set foot on Bali. Gajah Mada's actions, either directly or indirectly, brought about the ruin of Asta Sura Ratna Bumi Banten and the installation of Sri Krisna Kepakisan, a prince from Majapahit, at Samprangan in Gianyar. Thence dates the introduction of Javanese Hinduism into a syncretism with the original Balinese culture and the isolation of the Bali Age in the hills because they supposedly rejected the new religious and social rules. The dynasty of Sri Krisna Kepakisan flourished in the following centuries. The capital was moved from Gianyar to Swecapura in Gelgel where King Dalem Watu Renggong extended his hegemony to the eastern islands of Lombok and Sumbawa and westwards to the eastern part of Java.

If the political sway of Bali was so moderate as to subsist in one part of Lombok only, the spirit of Majapahit, however, survived down to modern times. It was strong enough to resist Islamization when the new religion swept through the archipelago, a move which started in the early thirteenth century to culminate in the second half of the sixteenth century with the setting up of the Moslem state of Demak in
East Java, thus replacing Majapahit. Moslems are extremely rare in Bali, less than 1 per cent, yet they predominate in the Balinese colonies of Jakarta. The reason is simple; these are the descendants of the tens of thousands enslaved labourers purchased from the Balinese princes in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries by the Government of Batavia for their plantations. Extracted from their traditional environment, they were unable to preserve their own religion and so were easily Islamized.

In 1633, the capital was moved again to Smarapura in Klungkung. The high title of Dewa Agung (Supreme Deity) was then assumed and it was retained until modern times, although the territory of Klungkung is the smallest of the eight princedoms which resulted from the splitting up of the unitary kingdom. Their names are the same as the present-day eight districts. The change was only possible with the help of the Dutch as the Dewa Agung alone was a descendant of Kepakisan, the other vassal princes being the successors of minor nobles who had fled Islam after the collapse of Majapahit in 1515.

The reputation of being the first Dutchman to set foot in Indonesia belongs to Cornelis de Houtman who visited Bali in 1597. This did not inaugurate any lasting kind of relationship and it is only in the second half of the eighteenth century that Bali appears on the records of the United East Indies Company as providing 43,000 slaves for the year 1778.

From 1826 onwards the Dutch required the princes to sign separate agreements, some of which bore on the customary wrecking rights of the Balinese. These agreements represented the first attempts to encroach upon native rule and they were bound to be disregarded if not infringed sooner or later.

In 1846, the Dutch sent a military expedition against the northern princedom of Buleleng where they met with stiff resistance. In 1848, a second military expedition was equally unsuccessful.

In April 1849, the third expedition was better prepared and equipped. Under the command of General Michels,
the Dutch forces succeeded in overrunning the fort of Jagaraga after a fight to the end by the Buleleng garrison led by Minister Jelantik. Northern Bali was then virtually submitted to colonial rule.

In May 1849, General Michels attacked the southern kingdom of Klungkung, but he met with strong opposition on the beach of Kusamba and was killed. It was not until 1904 that the occasion arose for the Dutch to renew their attempts against the southern princedoms. Opinion at home had been well prepared by the bloody affair of the Lombok war in which the Balinese princes had opposed intervention by the Dutch in their internal affairs in 1894 and successfully resisted them, at least in the early stages.

Upon the refusal of the Badung Prince to yield to the demands of the Dutch Resident of Singaraja on the north coast, and prompted by a futile pretext (15), the Dutch disembarked 5,000 men at Sanur in September 1906. Gradually overcoming the resistance of the Badung troops from one village to the next, they reached the palace of "Daing Pasar". Further resistance being vain and submission out of the question the Prince resolved to 'Puputan' or fight to the death. On 20 September 1906 at 12 noon, he stood against the advancing forces, surrounded by his kinfolk and followers. Moments later the whole of the Denpasar nobility, 1,400 men and women of all ages, were gunned down in their white ceremonial clothes and ritual ornaments. Pamecutan, the palace of the other ruler of Badung, was still resisting a few hundreds yards away across the river. By the evening of the same day, another 2,200 members of the Prince of Pamecutan's retinue lay dead. A few weeks later, the Prince of Tabanan also preferred this form of capitulation to submission, and on 28 April 1908, the last of the south coast princes, the Raja of Klungkung with all his power as Dewa Agung, also chose puputan as the form of capitulation that would be most embarrassing to the conqueror. The Dutch Administration had thus been taking over gradually from the Princes, but they never resolved to apply a direct rule. There were only Controllers, Assistant Residents in Denpasar and one Resident at Singaraja, the capital of Buleleng on the north
coast. This policy was eventually confirmed through time and experience gained in other parts of Indonesia. By 1938, several princes or their descendants, were partly restored to power as Zelfbestuurders, self-rulers with some latitude of action in the internal administration of their territory and in matters of custom and religion. The Second World War made it impossible to increase this return to native rule which would have otherwise been carried out as part of "a policy of turning Bali into a living museum, an example of a pure traditional culture" (16). It seems true that most efforts by the colonial administration were concerned with the conservation of adat or customary law, religion and arts and the preservation of archaeological treasures; much less, it is reported, with education.

The Japanese landed at Sanur in February 1942 and they took over without much fighting. At first, they were well received by the population, much as elsewhere in Southeast Asia, as promoters of a three-pronged ideal of "Protecting Asia, Leading Asia and Caring for Asia", but less so when voluntary contributions became compulsory. As Japanese fortunes waned, their requests for goods and labour grew to unbearable proportions.

Independence was proclaimed on 17 August 1945, but the news spread only slowly. I Gusti Ketut Padja was appointed Governor for the Lesser Sunda Islands and shortly after his arrival in Bali his administration made a start. Since August 1945, various more or less armed nationalist groups had come into existence. A number of them originated from Japanese-organized youth movements. Mustered into the People's Defence Army under the leadership of I Gusti Ngurah Rai (17), the Balinese attacked the Japanese on 13 December 1945. But this was premature and met with failure. Rai went to Java for the necessary assistance and on his return he prepared to oppose both the fading Japanese and the returning Dutch army and administration. His troops rejoined East Bali in May 1946 and won an important tactical battle at Tanah Aron pass in the district of Karangasem on 9 July 1946. The organization of this armed resistance was increasingly successful when the Dutch launched
a massive attack on Rai's headquarters at Marga near Tabanan. On 2o November 1946, Rai and 1,371 of his men fought unto death in a battle now known as Puputan Marga.

The Dutch with over a hundred well-situated outposts, could now hold the country in strength as negotiations were under way for the establishment of East Indonesia as a political entity of its own. The Conference of Denpasar (18-24 December 1946) decided on a federation of 13 eastern states with 55 representatives in a diet at Makasar, the new capital. Under the federation, the constituent states retained their particular political systems. Bali was returned to its traditional kingship. There was to be collegial rule of the eight princes with their ministers, deputies, district and village chiefs, with their traditional titles, duties and privileges.

In the meantime, armed resistance grew apace and profited from cooperation with East Java where large-scale military actions took place in July 1947 and December 1948, the latter only to reinforce the spirit which, in turn, led to more active military resistance and more efficient political action to result eventually in the recognition of sovereignty, on 27 December 1949. The Federation was abolished and the unification of the Republic was proclaimed on 17 August 1950.

**Government and local administration**

Along with unification, there came some degree of uniformity in the exercise of public authority and with Independence, there also came democratization of political functions. The princes fell, this time together with the colonial administration. District officers, Bupati, were appointed as heads of eight districts, or kabupaten, which were coterminous with former princedoms. At their head, a Governor of the Province of Bali had his headquarters at Denpasar.

Each district or kabupaten is divided into a number of subdistricts called kecamatan, from four in the districts of Jembrana, Bangli and Klungkung to nine in that of Buleleng. The kabupaten district of Badung has six kecamatan subdistricts including that of Denpasar which, as would be expected, is the most populated of the island with nearly 100,000 people. The
average subdistrict usually numbers between 25,000 and 50,000 inhabitants.

It is interesting to note that there are only a few references made in the documents, whether in the reports on tourism or in the Strategi Pembangunan sources, concerning the political and administrative organization at these higher levels. This is understandable as one considers their position relative to the traditional structure of power. They are not just differentiated according to their own place in their own hierarchy, in which case they would only be differentiated according to the degree of power which they hold from the National Government. There is no need to expand too much, but it may still be worth saying just this. The Governor or Head of the Province is the government and authority. He is equated with the central government and, therefore, somewhat external. The Balinese have no more say about his person or his function than about the President. Both are just there at the top. By contrast, the Bupati or Heads of Districts are very much Balinese in the Balinese society. They stand in the place of the princes, without being felt as usurpers, and, for their part, without feeling like princes. In contrast, the camat subdistrict officers are the least recognized links in the chain. They are also the least recognizable as they hardly correspond to the traditional punggawa who, as representatives of the princes, had indeed the responsibility for an area but mostly in order to levy taxes and labour. They represented the less-acceptable aspects of the princely power. In the eyes of the Balinese, the subdistrict officers, who have none of these unpleasant duties to carry out at present, are not considered however as much more than mere intermediaries in the transmission of orders downwards and requests upwards between the Bupati, the higher authority of the major socio-political and territorial unit, on the one hand, and the minor units, the desa, on the other.

The social and ritual structures of the desa village, have been briefly described above. It has to be emphasized merely that the Balinese, and in particular the authors of the various reports themselves, stress the importance of the desa.
"This feature must be given all its importance as these organizations (desa, banjar, etc.) have been in existence for so long and as they are the concrete representation of all the activities of the social and cultural life of the province" (18).

"There are in Bali two kinds of desa, the traditional desa adat relating to customary law and the administrative desa. The two kinds differ very much in form, composition and duties as well as in several other activities. In its form the traditional desa is oriented towards the Tri Hita Krama principle which recognises the relationship between mankind and God, mankind and nature, and mankind with mankind itself...".

The administrative desa has been set up by Law n°19 of 1965 "with a view towards the execution of administrative duties at the lower levels and the execution of the orders from the authorities down to the people".

"The desa adat is made up of several banjar, which are, therefore, parts of the one desa adat. But if we consider it from the point of view of its activities we see that sometimes the banjar has precedence over the desa adat. This is observed mostly in the wider desa which have many banjar. But in the case where one desa adat covers a smaller area and is made up of only a few banjar, then the role of the desa adat is seen to have precedence over that of the banjar".

"The composition of an administrative desa on the other hand is not as clearly definable as that of the desa adat. Sometimes an administrative desa includes several desa adat which by themselves include a number of banjar as parts of themselves. On other occasions there is to be found an administrative desa which includes only a part of the territory of a desa adat. This is how we happen to meet desa adat which are made up of several administrative desa ...".

"On setting up an administrative desa, the Government shows more concern for considerations of area than for the moral links or for the relations which are for their members, of a religious nature" (19). In the whole province there are 560 administrative desa and 1106 desa adat (20). But the rough figures do not portray the real problem which is, as has been
seen above, much more complex. This dual organization of administrative and traditional desa is felt to be a serious difficulty which hampers considerably the administration of internal affairs. It is also felt to be the cause of the proliferation of co-ordinating committees and working groups on all the major issues and concerns, such as the improvement of communications, the modernization of agricultural methods and the like. Consciously or not, the authors of the Strategi Pembangunan Reports (21) in their evaluations of the social situation, go as far as listing together the adverse effects of this dualism with those of prostitution and gambling at cock-fights. They recommend that the desa adat be made into administrative desa with an elected headman endowed with duties, power and privileges similar to those of the present heads of administrative desa (22). By the same token the latter should be abolished.

The difficulties encountered in local administration show once again the most prominent feature of Balinese society, which is its ability to integrate land, people and religion. The traditional political structure has been maintained at the top with the Bupati as substitutes for the princes. But at the lowest level, the imposition of a local administrative grid which is non-indigenous, on to the traditional desa/banjar system raises difficulties. They are only mentioned here because of their value as an index. They make it possible to evaluate the resistance to change of the basic social units which have been shown to be the fundamental framework of the Balinese culture.
Notes:

(1) From the preliminary results of the 1971 Census. Other counts produce 339, 378, 385, 434...
   As for population numbers, just compare the following figures:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Numbers</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1868</td>
<td>452,000</td>
<td>De Hollander, 1898, Vol. II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1873</td>
<td>862,000</td>
<td>De Hollander, 1898, Vol. II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1920</td>
<td>947,000</td>
<td>Bali: Studies..., 1960 Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1930</td>
<td>1,103,000</td>
<td>Bali: Studies..., 1960 Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1930</td>
<td>1,148,000</td>
<td>Covarrubias, 1937, ch. II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1954</td>
<td>1,520,000</td>
<td>Bali: Studies..., 1960 Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1961</td>
<td>1,782,000</td>
<td>Census, Strategi Pembangunan, Vol. I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971</td>
<td>2,117,000</td>
<td>Census, Strategi Pembangunan, Vol. I</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(2) Less Irian Jaya, the easternmost territory of the Republic.

(3) ISEAS Trends in Indonesia, 1972, p.33.

(4) See Geertz, Agricultural Involution...


(6) Same, Vol. III.

(7) A male self's patrilateral parallel cousin is his father's brother's daughter. It is consistent, in this situation, that marriage with the patrilateral cross-cousin (Self's father's sister's daughter) is not approved.


(9) 1937 : 15o.

(10) "They do [have a caste system], in the sense that social status is patrilineally inherited, that marriage is fairly strictly regulated in terms of status, and that, save for a few unusual exceptions, mobility between levels within the prestige system is in theory impossible and in practice difficult. But they do not in the sense of possessing a ranked hierarchy of well-defined corporate groups, each with specific and exclusive occupational, social, and religious functions all supported by elaborate patterns of ceremonial avoidance and commensality and by a complex belief system justifying radical status inequality. Were the term 'caste' not so deeply ingrained in the literature on Bali, it might be less confusing to speak of the Balinese as having a 'title system'..." (Geertz 1959:996).
(11) On the pronunciation of Sekehe, see note 13, p. 57.


(14) Pandit Shastri 1963: 82.

(15) The loot of a stranded ship, see foot-note 6, chapter IV, p. 86 above.


(17) Ngurah Rai was acclaimed as such a hero that the International Airport is named after him.


(19) Same: 23.


APPENDIX II
Summaries


   Denpasar, Udayana University, March 1973, 219 p. Cyclostyled, 26 tables, 19 sketch plans, 4 appendices.

   (In Indonesian 'Laporan hasil penelitian pengaruh "Mass Tourism" terhadap tata kehidupan masyarakat Bali')

   This is by far the most complete and the best documented of the three reports submitted.

   In their introduction, the authors propose to show that tourism is the main factor of change affecting Balinese society. Anticipating their concluding remarks, they add that the changes are such already that there is a risk that the image of Bali will soon become so altered that it will lose its attraction to tourists.

   In part 1, a history of Bali is outlined from a point of view which emphasizes the syncretism of its development. Indeed, Balinese culture is a superbly successful blending of Proto-Indonesian, Hindu and Hindu-Javanese culture elements. The factors attracting more educated tourists are methodically listed and some of the reasons why they are attractive are examined. In a second part, the fundamental items of the Balinese culture are analysed: Religion, Ethics, Social institutions, the heritage of Antiquity, Literature, Architecture, Plastic and Performing Arts which are all affected and need protection. In conclusion, the authors emphasize that on the whole, mass tourism has a deleterious influence on the morals of the people and that it is the inflow of money which is the main cause. True, development and modernization are unavoidable and tourism appears to be merely an accelerator in the process, but mass tourism offers many undesirable aspects which would not be present in higher forms of tourism such as cultural tourism.
2. Report of the Development of Tourism in Bali
Denpasar, Udayana University, May 1973, 73 p. cyclostyled, 18 tables, 4 appendices.
(In Indonesian 'Laporan hasil penelitian pengembangan pariwisata di Bali')

This report consists of two parts: The Role of Art in the Development of Tourism in Bali and Problems of Land Tenure in the Development of Tourism in Bali. The purpose in the first part is to examine the contribution which the arts are likely to provide in the development of tourism. The research has been conducted by questionnaires and direct interviews with artists and tourist officials and agents. Plastic and visual arts, performing arts and literature are reviewed. Lists of individual artists and corporations are given. Most artists and forms of art show a great capacity for adaptation in view of changing conditions and pressing demands put on them. The subject matter is not pursued very far as the concluding remarks of Part I merely repeat the good intentions expressed in the introduction of this report and in passing in the previous report as well.

The second part is completely independent from the first. It examines a few cases of transactions involving individual and communal rights on land. The existing laws are shown to effectively protect the local communities against encroachments of real estate brokers. Although Presidential Instruction no. 9/1969, art.13 is noteworthy, as it expressly provides for a protection of culture and its development, this examination of some of the most pressing problems of land tenure shows that the principles of customary land rights are not clearly set out in existing agrarian laws. Consequently, a number of recent cases have to be recorded as precedents for an adapted jurisprudence.
APPENDIX II
Summaries

3. The Impact of Tourism on the Socio-Economic Development of Bali

Denpasar, Udayana University, August 1974, 97 p. typed, 23 tables, 5 appendices.
(In English)

Almost exclusively based on the results of an enquiry by questionnaire, this report has not attained its objectives, as is admitted in the introduction. The questions of (1) the contribution of the tourist industry to raising the income of the various economic units, (2) the creation of new opportunities for employment and (3) the changes brought about by the tourist industry, remain largely unanswered. However, the idea that these changes cannot be wholly attributed to tourism has made some progress compared with the opinions expressed as such, in the previous reports.

In the field of measurable data, the development is found to be beneficial on the whole, since it increases notably the foreign currency income. But on the other hand, data show that a very small proportion of the working population draws any significant benefit from it.

In the area of qualitative data, it is still felt that tourism brings more negative than positive effects. For example, the concept that 'time is money' gains gradual recognition and this is so much ground lost to the Balinese traditional values.
APPENDIX II
Summaries

4. The Impact of Tourism on the Village Community Development
Denpasar, Udayana University, June 1975, loop., cyclostyled, 26 tables, 12 maps, 1 appendix.
(in Indonesian 'Pengaruh Tourisme terhadap pembangunan masyarakat desa'. An English translation [1977, 108 p.] was made by the staff of this University with a Unesco grant)

The report is divided into two main parts (II. Physical Aspect and Economy, pp. 3-17; III. The Socio-Cultural and Governmental Aspect, pp. 18-83), but this division in fact covers another one into eleven parts which make up as many chapters. They, in turn, deal with the influence of tourism on the physical aspects of the villages, demography and employment, economy, education, attitudes in general, religion, art, custom and tradition, housing, health, administration. The change in the physical aspect of the four sample villages (Sanur, Kuta, Batubulan and Mas) is impressively demonstrated with sequences of three maps for each village in the years 1965, 1969 and 1974. The maps, at a 1/20,000 scale, are briefly commented upon in Chapter 2.1 Physical features of the sample villages. The raw results of a number of enquiries by questionnaires are given as helpful illustrations of the text of Chapters 3.1 The Impact of Tourism on Education and 3.7 The Impact of Tourism on Health. Apart these three chapters which introduce fresh material, there is not much more in this report than there was in the previous three, and the main contribution to the matter of tourism in Bali is still Report I.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Anon.  
**Surat-surat perdagangan antara kerajaan-kerajaan Bali/Lombok dengan pemerintah Hindia-Belanda, 1841 s/d 1938**  
1964  
Jakarta, Arsip Nasional  
[Agreements between the kingdoms of Bali and Lombok and the government of the Dutch Indies, from 1841 to 1939]

Anon.  
**Official guide to the island of Bali**  
1970  
Hotel Bali Beach Corporation, publishers

Anon.  
**Kumpulan peraturan-peraturan dibidang Kepariwisataan (kepariwisataan umum, penanaman modal, perhotelan, travel agency, hiburan, dll.)**  
1972  
Denpasar, N.V. Percetakan Bali  
(A compendium of laws and decrees on tourism: general tourism, investment, hotels, travel agencies, entertainment, etc.)

Anon.  
**Le tourisme en chiffres, 1973**  
1973-74  
Tunis, Office national du tourisme et du thermalisme

BAAL, J. van (Ed.)  
**Bali : Studies in life, thought and ritual**  
1960  
Selected studies on Indonesia, vol. 5  
The Hague, W. van Hoeve

BAAL, J. van (Ed.)  
**Bali : Further studies in life, thought and ritual**  
1969  
Selected studies on Indonesia, vol. 8  
The Hague, W. van Hoeve

Bali : Studies... 1960. See Baal, J. van (Ed.) above

Bali : Further studies... 1969. See Baal, J. van (Ed.) above

Bidang Seni, 1972. See I Gusti Putu Darsana (Ed.)

COURCY, Th. de  
**Etude d'opinion sur les touristes à Bali**  
n.d.  
Paris

COVARRUBIAS, M.  
**Island of Bali**  
1937  
New York, A.A. Knopf, Inc.

1972  
Kualu Lumpur, O.U.P. in Asia
DARSAKA  See I Gusti Putu Dorasana

FIRTH, R.
1943  House keeping among Malay peasants
1966  London, L.S.E. Monographs on social anthropology

GEERTZ, C.S.
1959  Form and variation in Balinese village structure
      American Anthropologist, 61:991-1011

GEERTZ, C.S.
1963 (a)  Agricultural involution: the processes of ecological change in Indonesia
      Berkeley, U. of California Press

GEERTZ, C.S.
1963 (b)  Paddlers and Princes, social change and economic modernization in two Indonesian towns
      Chicago, U. of Chicago Press

GEERTZ, C.S.
1966  "Person, time and conduct in Bali: an essay in cultural analysis"
      Southeast Asian Studies, Cultural Reports Series No.14, New Haven, Yale University

GEERTZ, C.S.
1972  Deep Play: Notes on the Balinese cockfight
      Daedalus [MSS Modular Publication reprint 1973:1-35]

GREENWOOD, D.J.
1972  "Tourism as an agent of change: a Spanish Basque case"
      Ethnology, II, p. 80-91

HEYDEN, A.I. van der
1924-25  "Het waterschapwezen in de voormalige Zuid-Balische rijkjes Badoeng, Mengwi, Bangli en Kloengkoeng"
      Koloniale Studien, 8, 2, p.266-75 & 9, 2, p.425-38

HOLLANDER, J.J. DE
1898  Handleiding bij de beoefening der land- en volkenkunde van Nederlandsche Oost-Indie
      Breda, Koninklijke Militaire Academie

HUNGER, F.W.F.
1937  "Adat desa's en Gouvernement desa's in Zuid-Bali"
      Koloniale Studien, 21, p.610-640

I GUSTI ANANDA KUSUMA
1956  Kamus Bali-Indonesia, vol. I
      Denpasar, Bali (Balinese-Indonesian dictionary)

I GUSTI DEE RAKA & IDA BAGUS DJAGRA
1972  "Pengaruh pariwisata terhadap kesempatan bekerja"
      Denpasar, UNUD, Fakultas Ekonomi
      (The influence of tourism on employment opportunities)
I GUSTI NGURAH BAGUS & I GUSTI PUTU DARSANA
Bahan diskusi mengenai pengembangan desa Sanur
Denpasar, UNUD, Jurusan antropologi
(Elements for a discussion on the development of the village of Sanur)

I GUSTI NGURAH BAGUS
A short note on the modern Hindu movements in Balinese society
n.d.
Denpasar, UNUD, Cultural Anthropology department

I GUSTI NGURAH BAGUS
Evaluasi proyek-proyek pegabdian masyarakat desa.
Denpasar, Museum Bali
(Evaluation of projects of local community service)

I GUSTI PUTU DARSANA (Ed.)
"Impact pariwisata dibidang seni pada beberapa desa di Bali" p.3-49
Denpasar, UNUD, Jurusan antropologi
(The impact of tourism in the field of arts in several villages in Bali)

ISAGA
See Pasqualini, R.

ISEAS
See Yong, M.Ch.

Kesempatan bekerja
See I Gusti Gde Raka and Ida Bagus Djagra

KORN, V.E.
Het Adatrecht van Bali
Den Haag

KORN, V.E.
De Dorpsrepubliek Tnganan Pagringsingan
Santoport
(partly translated in Bali Studies... 1960;301-68)

KUSUMA
See I Gusti Ananda Kusuma

LENGYEL, P.
Le troisième point de vue
Rev. intern. des Sc. soc. XXVII, 4 : 806-11

MCKEAN, P.F.
Pengaruh-pengaruh asing terhadap kebudayaan Bali :
Hubungan "hippies" dan "pemuda internasional"
dengan masyarakat Bali masa kini
Denpasar, UNUD, Jurusan antropologi
(Foreign influences on the Balinese culture : the relations between "hippies" and "international youth" and the Balinese society at present)

MCKEAN, P.F.
Tourism, culture change and culture conservation in Bali
IXth I.C.A.E.S., Chicago [symposium on "Changing Ethnic Groups in S.E. Asia"]
McKEAN, P.F.
Towards theoretical analyses of tourism: Economic dualism and cultural involution in Bali
73rd Annual Meeting, A.A. Association, Mexico City [Symposium on "Tourism and Culture Change"]
1974

McPHEE, C.
1947
A house in Bali
London, Victor Gollancz

MEAD, M.
The Arts in Bali
1940
The Yale Review XXX, 2 (1940) 335-47

MEAD, M.
Traditional Balinese Culture

NGURAH BAGUS
See I Gusti Ngurah Bagus

NORONHA, R.
Paradise reviewed: Tourism in Bali, a case study
Washington Joint UNESCO/IBRD Seminar on the social and cultural impacts of tourism
1976

SHASTRI, N.D. Pandit
Sejarah Bali Dwipa, vol. I
1963
Denpasar, Bhuvana Saraswati

SLAMET MULJONO
Menuju puncak kemegahan, Sejarah kerajaan Majapahit
1965
Jakarta, Balai Pustaka
(Towards the apex of glory, history of the Empire of Majapahit)

SLAMET MULJANA
Perundang-undangan Majapahit
1967
Jakarta, Bhuratara
(The laws of Majapahit)

Strategi Pembangunan
1972
See UNIVERSITAS UDAYANA, 1972

Subak
See UNIVERSITAS UDAYANA, 1973

TER HAAR, B.
Adat Law in Indonesia
1962
Jakarta, Bhuratara (Hoebel, E.A. and A.A. Schiller, Eds.)

TONDOK, Ir. Ny.C.
"Masalah-masalah cagar alam dan cagar margasarwa sebagai obyek wisata"
1973
Jakarta
(Problems of conservation of nature and wildlife as objectives for tourists)
TUNNARD, C. and POLLACCO, J.C.
Indonesia, the development of cultural tourism in
Central Java and Bali
1970-71
UNESCO, Paris

UNCTAD
"Directives pour l'établissement des statistiques
du tourisme"
1971
New York

UNCTAD
"Elements of tourism policy in developing countries"
1973
New York

UNESCO
"Effets du tourisme sur les valeurs socio-culturelles"
Paris. Rapport de la réunion des 26 et 27
Mars 1974

UNIVERSITAS UDAYANA
"Problems of farmland decline in Badung", proposal
for research project
1971
Denpasar, Faculty of Agriculture

UNIVERSITAS UDAYANA
"Development of animal protein in line with the
development of tourism", proposal for research
project
1971
Denpasar, Faculty of Veterinary and Husbandry

UNIVERSITAS UDAYANA
"Impact of tourism on employment in Bali", project
design
1971
Denpasar, Faculty of Economics

UNIVERSITAS UDAYANA
"Fitting education in special skill in the curriculum
of Basic (Primary) school in Bali in connection
with tourism in Bali", proposal for research
project
1971
Singaraja, Faculty of Science Teaching and
Education

UNIVERSITAS UDAYANA
"Laporan Penelitian tentang Strategi Pembangunan
Daerah untuk Propinsi Bali" Pelaksana Proyek
Perencanaan Regional Persiapan REPELITA II
untuk Bali
1972
Surabaya & Denpasar
(Report of research on a regional development strategy
for the province of Bali; Executive commission for
the project of regional planning in the preparation
of the Second Five-Year Plan for Bali)
Vol.I, Part I : Introductory (80p.)
Part II : Maps
Vol.II, Part I : Sectors A and B
Part II : Sectors C, D, E and F
Part III : Sectors G, H and I
Vol. III: Conclusions and recommendations (102p.)
(Pagination is continuous in vols. I and III only)

UNIVERSITAS UDAYANA (in collaboration with the National Institute of Agricultural Research)
Subak, organisasi pengairan pedesaan di Bali
Denpasar and Bogor
(Subak, Communal Organization of Irrigation in Bali)

YONG MUN CHEONG (Ed.)
Trends in Indonesia, proceedings and background papers
1972
Singapore, ISEAS