The impact of HIV/AIDS on education

Report of an IIEP seminar

Dramane Oulai
Roy Carr-Hill

Paris
8-10 December 1993

UNESCO: International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP)
in co-operation with
The Education Sector of UNESCO
Swedish International Development Authority (SIDA)
International Development Research Centre (IDRC)
The impact of HIV/AIDS on education
The impact of HIV/AIDS on education

Report of an IIEP seminar
Paris, 8-10 December 1993

Dramane Oulai and Roy Carr-Hill

UNESCO: International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP)

in co-operation with

The Education Sector of UNESCO
Swedish International Development Authority (SIDA)
International Development Research Centre (IDRC)
The views and opinions expressed in this document are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent the views of UNESCO or of the IIIEP. The designations employed and the presentation of material throughout this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of UNESCO or IIIEP concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or its authorities, or concerning its frontiers or boundaries.

The publication costs of this report have been covered through a grant-in-aid offered by UNESCO and by voluntary contributions made by several Member States of UNESCO, the list of which will be found on the last page of this document.
PREFACE

During the last decade, the HIV/AIDS epidemic has cast a heavy shadow on the lives of infected families both in countries of the North and of the South. The need for educational programmes for the prevention of AIDS is widely recognized and many international organizations and government agencies are emphasizing the role of educational activities as part of the global fight against AIDS.

However, very little has been written about the effects of HIV/AIDS on the educational system. This is why the IIEP took the initiative of organizing, in co-operation with the International Development Research Center (IDRC), the Swedish International Development Authority (SIDA) and the UNESCO Education Sector, an international seminar on the Impact of HIV/AIDS on education. This includes the more immediate and visible effects on the size of the system and on the nature of what schools and classrooms look like (how teaching and learning takes place, what roles teachers and pupils play) and the longer term and more profound effects on the system’s objectives and functions (what is taught and how planning, financing and management processes are affected).

The main focus of the seminar was on countries of the South and, throughout the discussions, the necessity of a global approach to the problem was pointed out: the impact of AIDS should not be considered in isolation, but full consideration should be given to its relationship with poverty, the labour market, other development sectors and the socio-cultural context. Given the critical state of education in many countries, there is a tendency to consider AIDS as just another pressing problem, when it is likely that the impact of AIDS is quite different, quantitatively and qualitatively, from that caused by other factors.

I take the opportunity to express my sincere thanks to Mr. Sheldon Shaeffer, a former Resident Fellow at the IIEP, who spared no efforts to ensure the success of the seminar. The background paper that he prepared for the discussions and which is included in this report, is a pioneering document which illustrates his deep concern about the AIDS problem and his rich experience as an education researcher.

My thanks are also due to IDRC, SIDA and the UNESCO Education Sector for their support in the financing and organization of this seminar.

Jacques Hallak
Director
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I. Introduction</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I.1 The international context</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.2 Background paper</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>II. Contributions on policy and research issues in selected countries</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>II.1 Research on the impact of HIV/AIDS on education in Kenya, Uganda, Zambia</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.2 Research on the impact of HIV/AIDS on education in India, Mexico and Thailand</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>III. Analysis of HIV/AIDS on education at the micro level</th>
<th>13</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>III.1 Impact of HIV/AIDS on education at the micro level in East Africa</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.2 Impact of HIV/AIDS on schools in Northwest Tanzania: some preliminary evidence</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| IV. Agency presentations | 20 |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>V. Workshop discussions and conclusion</th>
<th>22</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>V.1 Workshop discussions</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.2 Concluding remarks, follow-up and recommended guidelines for the education sector</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Annexes:**
- Annex 2: Agenda | 74 |
- Annex 3: List of participants | 76 |
Introduction

This document is a synthesis report on a workshop on the impact of HIV/AIDS on education that was held at the IIEP in December 1993. This chapter, the introductory part of the report, gives a brief description of the international context and summarizes an overview of the possible impact of HIV/AIDS on education. Chapter II presents the findings of the research on policy responses to the impact on education in a number of selected developing countries, and Chapter III, the findings of the studies at the micro level in Eastern Africa. A brief resume of the presentations on current research and speculation is given in Chapter IV, and summaries of the discussions in the plenary sessions and in the working groups, as well as recommendations to the international community, are included in Chapter V. The background paper to the seminar is presented in Annex 1, and a full programme and list of participants are attached as Annexes 2 and 3.

The Institute would like to thank the sponsors of the seminar — SIDA, IDRC and UNESCO — for their support, and the participants for their participation.

1.1

The international context

This was one of the first workshops of its kind. There have been many meetings about the potential contribution of health education or health promotion in preventing the spread of AIDS; many meetings and programmes aiming to introduce appropriate education into the school curriculum; and a few studies on the impact of AIDS on other sectors, including education. But there has been no attempt at the international level to study systematically the impact of AIDS on the education sector.

There are, of course, many questions about the role parents should play in increasing awareness of HIV/AIDS among students; and about the problems of introducing (effective) sex or AIDS education in schools. Whilst these are very important issues, they were not the central focus of the seminar which was the impact of HIV/AIDS on the education system and on its management and operations. It is, however, not enough to simply claim that this seminar is the first to invert the usual problem of the impact on education on HIV transmission to the impact of HIV/AIDS on education. There has to be a good reason to bring together 30 participants from around the world for three days in Paris. Simply put, the reason was that the potential implications of AIDS upon a country’s education system are enormous, even if AIDS is not yet as widespread as in some of the well-known countries.

Thus, despite the rhetoric of the World Conference on Education for All held in Jomtien, Thailand, in 1990, in many developing countries enrolments in first level education...
are stagnating or, in a few cases, declining. Whilst this is nearly always due to factors other than AIDS, the pandemic is an extra burden. At the other end of the educational ladder, because of the specific pattern of initial spread of the disease, there are fears both that the heavy investment in university education will be wasted in several cases, and that there will be difficulties in providing enough teachers for the schools. Whilst there is scattered evidence on all these points, it is important to bring them together in a systematic fashion, so that educational and other planners can make more realistic provision for the possible quantitative and qualitative impacts of the pandemic.

The participants were selected to represent both the international and bi-lateral organisations involved in the combat against AIDS; and a cross-section of planners, policy-makers and researchers from the developing countries. In the end, 15 agencies and eight representatives from Africa, Latin America, and Asia participated in the seminar.

I.2

Background paper

The author of the background paper started with an overview of the impact of AIDS on socio-economic development. These impacts are:

- potentially widespread (across several regions and sectors), profound (at both the macro- and micro-level), and complex (because of the ‘differentness’ of HIV); and

- exacerbated by recession (affecting many countries in the South), natural disaster (drought, etc.), and conflict (with the number of ‘small’ wars greater than ever before).

Impacts which have been mentioned at one time or another in the literature include impact on:

- population growth: there are various estimates suggesting that the rates of growth of some populations will be lower than otherwise anticipated;

- health care costs: these will escalate as death from AIDS is predated by several quite severe illnesses — always assuming, of course, that those with AIDS-related diseases will be treated;

- maternal and infant mortality: pregnant mothers weakened by HIV/AIDS are likely to die in childbirth, and new-borns who receive HIV have a short life expectancy (indeed, there are estimates for some countries suggesting that the gains of the last

1 The background paper was presented by Dr. Sheldon Shaeffer, a former IIEP Resident Fellow and a current Education Adviser of the UNICEF Regional Office in Bangkok - see Annex 1 for the full paper.
couple of decades in terms of lower mortality rates will be lost);  

- life expectancy: projections of life expectancy are being lowered in several countries as a result of the epidemic;  

- labour, productivity, income and economic growth: given that the most likely route of transmission in most countries is sexual activity, deaths will peak among the 30-44 years old, i.e. at the most productive period of many people’s lives, with effects on household and national income and economic growth;  

- social cohesion and traditional support mechanisms: many have demonstrated the resilience and co-operativeness of poor rural populations in the face of various disasters, but there are some doubts that this will be the case in this pandemic, given the ‘differentness’ of AIDS; and  

- political stability and national security: a decline in social cohesion might lead to political instability, and there is also the problem of the spread of HIV/AIDS among military personnel.

The differentness of HIV

HIV is ‘different’ from other diseases and epidemics, partly because it is ‘new’ and no cure has yet been found, but also because it is unusual in terms of which groups — young adults — are at greatest risk. Because it tends to associate death with sexual relations, it invokes fear and suspicion.

HIV, like other epidemics, has a differential impact by region; but it also has a differential impact according to the sector of the society considered, apparently affecting most severely both particularly mobile population groups (traders, miners, truck drivers, professionals) and the very poor.

The education system and the impact of HIV/AIDS

The education system will be increasingly burdened by the impact of HIV/AIDS on several issues:

- the demand for education;
- the supply of education;
- the teaching-learning process;
- the quality of education.

Consequently, the system will be faced with accepting greater responsibilities:

- to ensure the efficient delivery of effective messages about HIV/AIDS;
- to assess accurately the impact of HIV/AIDS on education;
to adapt its objectives, programmes, content, and planning and management strategies to respond to such impact.

Delivering messages about AIDS

The education system must work out how to encourage:

- more, and more open, discussion on: reproductive biology; sexuality and sex education; STDs, contraception, and condoms; the status of girls and women; issues of discrimination and human rights;

- a message more integrated into the several aspects of school life, rather than just being another curriculum item;

- more effective delivery of the message: to a variety of target groups and to a wider age range; in languages appropriate to those target groups; by a greater variety of ‘teachers’ such as peers and popular role models; in a more experiential and interactive fashion; in a greater variety of settings inside and outside the schools; and

- the participation of communities and target audiences in the development of messages about HIV/AIDS.

All of this has to happen at the same time as there will be pressures from within the school system (due to intolerance, fear and ostracism; discrimination and human rights abuses; and suspicion among parents, pupils and teachers) acting in the opposite direction.

Assessing impact on demand, supply and process

The demand for education will be affected first because fewer children than expected will be born. There will therefore be relatively fewer children than had been anticipated in the school-age pool and, in some areas, perhaps fewer children in school than in previous years. Among children of school age, many of their parents may not be able to afford education, and may not see the point of education even if they can afford it. Among those from AIDS-affected families who actually go to school, relatively fewer may be able to complete the cycle because of demands for their labour, lack of resources for school expenses, ostracism at school, lack of encouragement from guardians, etc.

The supply of education may be affected by:

- a loss of teachers and other personnel;
- fewer resources to maintain, expand and improve the system because of greater community poverty and a reduction in national wealth and because other affected sectors (such as health and defense) may place greater demands on the national budget.
These together may lead to a decrease in the actual and planned number of available classes and schools.

The process of education may be affected by:

- the increasing *randomness* of teaching and learning in the sense that either the child or the teacher or both may be absent more frequently, or the child may have several different teachers;
- intolerance, fear and ostracism in the school and classroom which may lead to a *less open* context for teaching and learning;
- discrimination and human rights abuses in the system, including extra bullying and more exclusions from the school;
- relations between teachers and students, and especially between female students and male teachers, which may have involved sexual relations, and which may harm relations between schools and their communities.

**Responses from the education system**

In response to the more visible impact of HIV/AIDS, the education system will need to:

- accept that AIDS is a problem it must deal with; entire responsibility for dealing with it should not be waived to the Ministry of Health;
- broaden its longer-term objectives, so as to include consideration of more 'special' clients and their needs (not only those with HIV, but also those children in an AIDS-affected or AIDS-afflicted household) and new roles for the schools as the most widespread agent of social welfare;
- operate in more flexible and non-formal ways, without reproducing the current randomness, so as to provide a structure to the educational experience whilst recognizing the difficulty that some children will have in regular attendance;
- alter the content and methods of teaching, so as to include: knowledge about sexuality and the transmission and prevention of the disease; skills to cope with its impact on the school, family and community; and attitudes related to the open discussion of sexual behaviour, human rights, and the status of girls and women;
- develop appropriate data collection and planning methods, both more anticipatory so as to be able to forecast where problems of discrimination, shortages, etc. are likely to arise, and methods which are more participatory in nature in order to overcome the suspicion of communities and gain greater community support;
- develop different strategies for managing educational personnel and finance; and
develop programmes for special needs (e.g. counselling of those with HIV or those in AIDS-affected or AIDS-affected households, and orphans in general) and for staff who will themselves need counselling skills.

**Implications**

There are several layers of implications for all actors in the educational systems. At the most basic, there not only has to be detailed consideration about the best ways of delivering messages about AIDS; but there are also implications for training, research and donor programming:

**Training**

It will be important to train planners and managers in the knowledge, skills and values which are required in order to anticipate the potential impact of HIV/AIDS and develop the appropriate programmes at school level.

**Research**

There are several new issues for research at both the micro- and macro-levels; and there will have to be training in appropriate research methods.

**Donor programming**

The impact of HIV/AIDS will have implications for the internal policies of donors; for the questions that donors should be asking Ministries of Education in the recipient countries; for the level of resources which should be allocated by donors for the education sector; and for special assistance for special problems. Also important is the possible impact of both donor projects on the transmission of HIV and the treatment of AIDS and of HIV/AIDS on the implementation and success of donor projects.
II

Contributions on policy and research issues in selected countries

Introduction

Policy responses vary between countries according not only to the prevalence rates of HIV/AIDS but also to social and cultural factors. The focus of this seminar is on the South, where cultural readiness to discuss issues of HIV/AIDS and sexuality is low, and where the levels of prevalence are varied. The summaries which follow are grouped in two; the first summary concerns those countries in the South where prevalence is still relatively low (India, Mexico and Thailand) and the second those where the opposite is true (Kenya, Uganda and Zambia).

II.1

Panel presentation:
research on the impact of HIV/AIDS on education
in India, Mexico, Thailand

by

S. Chowdury, B. Rico & V. Kasama

A common characteristic in each of these three countries is the reluctance on the part of the National Ministries of Education to see the HIV/AIDS pandemic as their particular problem. No serious study has been made in any of these countries to analyze the implication of HIV/AIDS for the education systems.

While Mexico and India are considered countries with a less affected population, Thailand is one of the most affected countries in Asia, where the epidemic is growing rapidly among the population age-group 15-39 years — both homosexual and heterosexual — with the predominance of reported cases among men.

In all three countries, strong traditional societies and/or religious groups are opposed to any education programme which would include sex education in schools. Given that the only effective policy to limit the spread of HIV/AIDS infection is through awareness

2 Mr Shankar Chowdury, AIDS Cell, All India Institute of Medical Sciences, India; Ms B. Rico, Director of Documentation & Communication, CONASIDA, Mexico; and Ms Kasama Varavarn, Inspector General, Ministry of Education, Thailand.
campaigns and sex and AIDS education, a programme designed by other sectors, such as Ministries of Health, cannot be easily adopted for the education sector.

In India, sex education is not given in schools. Instead, 'adult education' is offered which deals with sexuality through the media of biology and social sciences, and AIDS education, if at all available, will be provided through population education materials. It was suggested that the Ministry of Education itself should be encouraged to undertake a study of youth sexual behaviour in order to understand better the kinds of AIDS education needed in schools.

It was indicated that, given the high level of unemployment and the current excess of educated unemployed persons, the potential problem of replacing education personnel who will have been infected by HIV/AIDS is not a major concern for the education administrators and decision-makers.

In Mexico, where the population is predominantly catholic, the Ministry of Education only recently expressed its willingness to introduce sex education into the school curricula, following three years of efforts by CONASIDA to have the Ministry of Education recognize its responsibility to deal with HIV/AIDS. The Ministry of Education has not yet taken a decision on the issue.

In Thailand, despite the importance of the National AIDS Programme and broad-based AIDS education efforts, the Ministry of Education does not yet recognize the clear indications of potentially alarming consequences (impact on demand and supply) for the education system.

According the report by the Ministry of Public Health, all the 72 provinces of the country have AIDS cases, with the greater numbers in big cities and some Northern provinces. Data from military conscripts found a steady increase of HIV-positive levels from 0.6 per cent in 1989 to 4 per cent in May 1993. Due to the lowering of birth rates and the projection of higher infant mortality rates, the number of students at lower grades may be reduced. But the difficulty in providing appropriate services will be even greater. For example, there will be a much greater number of orphans, estimated at over 50,000 children, compared to 5,000 accommodated by the present system.

The Thai National AIDS Programme, which was launched in 1989, has established a National AIDS Prevention and Control Plan with the following objectives:

- to reduce HIV transmission as much as possible, down to a manageable level;
- to promote understanding among the population and to provide assistance to HIV-infected persons so that they may live normally in society without aversion and discrimination;
- to mobilize resources and personnel from governmental, non-governmental, and international agencies to co-operate in the prevention and control of AIDS.

The achievements of the National AIDS Programme include:

- Multi-sectoral participation from national level to local communities, with the Prime Minister as the Chairman of the Programme;
• Extensive AIDS prevention campaigns using different forms of media, resulting in nationwide awareness of dangers from AIDS;
• Nationwide AIDS education programmes;
• Massive condom promotion campaigns in all provinces with the aim of achieving 100 per cent condom promotion;
• Nationwide counselling programmes, etc.

The national situations and policy responses described above imply that the grave implications of AIDS for education need to be recognized and taken into consideration in planning future education policies and programmes. National education ministries must be willing to be more involved in searching for ways to reduce the impact of HIV/AIDS on education rather than be mere disseminators of knowledge about the AIDS epidemic.

II.2

Panel presentation:
research on the impact of HIV/AIDS on education
in Kenya, Uganda, Zambia

by

M. Aoko, E. Mburugu, C. Oloong-Atwoki, M. Nkamba

The reports on Kenya analyze the impact of HIV/AIDS on both higher education and the other levels of education, with the emphasis on the former level. The reports on the other two countries focus more on the impact on basic education. The following observations are drawn from these presentations:

Prevalence

In Kenya, prevalence rates among those tested in urban areas are high. For a long time, malaria was one of major causes of mortality in the country (with a rate constant at approximately 4 per cent over the years). AIDS has not only overtaken malaria; it also threatens to be responsible for nearly 50 per cent of mortality by the year 2000. One must, however, be cautious about extrapolating from the general adult population to staff and students of tertiary education institutions who are selectively drawn from various socio-economic groups.

HIV/AIDS is predominant among sexually active adults aged 20-45 years, thus

3 Mrs Monica Aoko, Senior Economist, Long Range Planning Division, Ministry of Planning and Development, Kenya; Mr Edward Mburugu, Department of Sociology, University of Nairobi, Kenya; Mr Charles Oloong-Atwoki, Assistant Commissioner of Education/Planning, Ministry of Education & Sports, Uganda; Mr Mannasseh Nkamba, Planning Division, Ministry of Education, Zambia
including nearly the entire population of students and most of the staff in tertiary institutions.

There is no accurate knowledge of how many school children are infected, but it is believed that a larger proportion of the growing number of street children may be AIDS-death orphans. The National Aids Control Programme (NACP) estimates that by the year 2000, Kenya will have one million AIDS orphans.

AIDS is the number one killer for adults and sixth for children in Uganda. Estimated prevalence is 6-10 per cent. Based on a presumed rate of increase of AIDS at 1 per cent per annum, the estimated impact on school cohort size is that by 1996 there will be 45,000 fewer children than expected in primary school (out of a school-age 7-14 years old cohort of 4.5 million) and 3,000 fewer in secondary school (out of a school-age 15-19 years old cohort of 340,000).

In Zambia, while in 1985 only three cases were reported, 27,000 cases were reported in 1992 (this being an obvious underestimate as the figures reflect only hospital cases). Based on these figures, the prevalence of HIV positivity among special groups of population was very high (new-borns 32 per cent in 1989; patients with tuberculosis 24 per cent, 37 per cent, 56 per cent respectively in 1987, 1991 and 1992).

Impact on staff and staff development

In higher education in Kenya, there is already a continuing brain drain of faculty members to other countries. Illness of remaining faculty members will lead to less effective teaching; death will lead to an increased turnover of teaching staff and higher training costs; overall, there may be a substantial decline in efficiency and lower research productivity. It is estimated that 4 per cent of the teachers are infected at other levels of education.

Faculty and students have typically been sent abroad for advanced training in order to strengthen capacity at home institutions. In Kenya, 90 per cent of those with PhDs acquired them abroad. There may be several impacts due to the AIDS epidemic. Student and faculty applicants usually undergo medical examinations before leaving; those HIV-infected are unlikely to be accepted for study by the receiving nation or the funding agency, and the university is unlikely to want to invest in them. At the same time, HIV-infected and ill staff members will be blocking established positions making it impossible to recruit and train others who will eventually have to replace them. Teaching and research will suffer both now and in the future.

There will also be an impact on teachers in Uganda. Assuming the same rate of HIV infection as in the general population, between now and 1996, 2,200 teachers will be suffering from AIDS or have died. If the pupil-teacher ratio remains at 40:1 in primary schools, these teachers will have to be replaced unless classes are closed or combined. Training 2,200 teachers for 2 years each would cost 1.1 billion Uganda shillings in current costs alone.

Moreover, experienced teachers will be replaced by less qualified teachers who will need more in-service support (better teachers' guides, refresher courses, etc).
Impact on students

Currently, there is high demand for university places in Kenya with only a small fraction of applicants being admitted. However, an increasing number of parents may not be able to pay for their children; and both parents and potential students will begin to question the value of committing family resources in support of higher education when the returns are much more uncertain (both because of the labour market situation and possible AIDS death).

An increasing number of children are left orphans due to HIV/AIDS in Zambia and so far no official cushion has been put in place to alleviate their plight. As a consequence, children face a loss of future possibilities as they are often denied the opportunity to continue their schooling.

Health education and costs

Costs of health care in universities are certain to rise rapidly, partly because of increased demand and partly because alternative health care systems will themselves be under pressure. In general, over the years, 3 per cent of Kenya’s GDP has been spent on health. AIDS alone will require an allocation of 15 per cent of the country’s GDP by the year 2000, if all those affected are to be treated.

Costs of health that result from HIV/AIDS illness and deaths will be also very high for education systems in Uganda and Zambia. In Uganda, for example, the overall investment in a student who completes both primary and secondary education is 117,500 Uganda shillings (and 3.5 million on a university student). The loss of such an investment in the event of an AIDS death is a loss neither a family nor the country can easily afford.

Sexual behaviour

AIDS awareness is high in campuses. Interviews with selected students in Kenyan universities indicated that all knew or had heard of students who had died of AIDS. They mentioned reducing numbers of sexual partners and quite extensive condom use; but also that current economic hardship discourages an active social life.

Faculty members personally knew of colleagues who had died of AIDS. Unlike students, they were keenly aware of the long incubation period. Many had stopped sexual contact with more than one partner. Women, far more than men, were persistent in this.

Policy responses

Governments in the three countries have undertaken various initiatives to cope with the HIV/AIDS epidemic, with more or less involvement from education ministries. In all three countries, the interventions of Ministries of Education focus more on preventive actions,
including sex and HIV/AIDS education, and dissemination of information about the epidemic. They address mostly issues pertaining to curbing the spread of HIV/AIDS among school-going age groups.

For example, despite the lack of an explicit HIV/AIDS-related health policy in Kenyan institutions of higher education, the Government has started, through the National AIDS Control Programme established in 1987 and now implementing its Second Medium-Term Plan, to give HIV/AIDS more importance by organising national seminars and workshops. It has been decided to include a chapter on HIV/AIDS in the National Development Plan and in each of the District Development Plans.

Plans are underway in the Ministries of Education in Kenya, Zambia and Uganda to develop and extend a new curriculum for both primary and secondary schools which will include HIV/AIDS and sex education. The curriculum will be introduced also to inspectors and tutors of Teacher Training Colleges for both primary and secondary schools.

Whereas these Ministries recognize to a certain degree the seriousness of the impact of HIV/AIDS on education, their current research and planning efforts to respond to educational supply and demand in the context of the HIV/AIDS epidemic are being undertaken at a time when they have no systematic recording of AIDS cases (accurate number of HIV-infected staff or students). Many of the discussions tend to be dominated by normative statements or forecasts based on extrapolations from general population to students and education personnel. Thus, planners and policy-makers lack an empirical data base that could help them develop strategies to maximise the benefits of their actions.

The rigidity of the education administration and the lack of precise information at the central level of the nature and degree of the impact at the school level in communities affected by the HIV/AIDS epidemic seriously hamper decision-making processes with regard to the crisis. There is also the problem of sustainability. When initiatives are taken, whether with the assistance of donor agencies or not, the issue of sustainability in terms of personnel becomes a crucial criterion for assessing the continuation of existing, or the development of new, academic programmes. In terms of effective design of preventive education programmes, two more factors are operating as barriers: the uneasy availability of condoms for students and opposition from religious groups to sex education.
III

Analysis of the impact of HIV/AIDS on education at the micro level

Introduction

Two research projects conducted in East Africa and presented at the seminar focus on the implication of HIV/AIDS on education at the micro level. They more closely examine the way schooling is affected in communities heavily infected by the epidemic. The case studies analyze the structure and functioning of the school and the relationships between the school and its social, cultural, and economic environment in a period of HIV/AIDS crisis. The first of these projects included three case studies carried out in Tanzania, Uganda and Zimbabwe, and was presented by K. Kinyanjui and J.K. Katabaro. The second project presented by M. Ainsworth was a case study of orphanhood and schooling in one district of Northwest Tanzania.

III.1

The impact of HIV/AIDS on education at the micro level in East Africa

presented by

K. Kinyanjui, J.K. Katabaro

Findings were reported from three case studies in East African communities (Tanzania, Uganda and Zimbabwe) funded and co-ordinated by CIDA and IDRC and executed by a team of local researchers. The objectives of the case studies were:

- to assess and describe the impact of HIV/AIDS at the micro level (including the impact on the structure of demand, the learning process, the reaction of the community, family structure and the household production function) and on the response of the school and the education system;
- to identify methodologies for measuring the impact of AIDS as distinct from the impact of economic crisis/recession/structural adjustment;
- to generate research and policy interest in the field.

4 Mr Kabiru Kinyanjui, International Development Research Centre (IDRC), Nairobi, Kenya; Mr J.K. Katabaro, Department of Educational Psychology, University of Dar es Salaam, Tanzania.
The sites of the case studies were:

Tanzania: Kagera region, Bukoba district, Bujunangoma ward (population 18,000, three primary schools and one secondary school; carried out June-September 1993)

Uganda: Rakai district, Lyantonde sub-county (population 16,250, three primary schools and one secondary school; carried out August-November 1993)

Zimbabwe: Mutare rural district, Munyoro village, population 4,700; two primary schools and one secondary.

Parents, pupils and teachers, together with key informants such as village leaders and NGO leaders, were interviewed at each site.

Kinyanjui highlighted three features common to each of the areas studied:

- All three were subject to armed conflict: the Bukoba district was the staging point for the invasion of Uganda to overthrow Amin; the Ugandan district suffered both under the Amin government and because of the campaign of the opposition National Resistance Movement; and the Zimbabwean district was a base for the independence struggle and also received multiple visitations from RENAMO because of its proximity to Mozambique;

- All three districts had experienced a high level of migration (the Ugandan district from Burundi; the Zimbabwean district to and from Mozambique; the Tanzanian district from Uganda);

- Equally, all three sites are on the routes for long distance traffic and cross border trade.

On the basis of the case study reports received to date, Kinyanjui gave an assessment of the impact, as follows:

_Pupil level_

There have been declines in enrolment, increases in dropouts, and gradual increases in absenteeism; a high proportion of children in school (25-30 per cent) are orphans; and students who had lost both parents were less well-dressed and less well-fed. Researchers also reported some stigmatization of those from families having experienced an AIDS death and lower levels of interaction between students and between students and teachers.

_Teacher level_

The proportion of untrained teachers was increasing; when teachers fell ill, they tended to move away. There was also reluctance of teachers to be transferred to, or remain in, heavily affected districts. In one school, the head teacher said that only one teacher should go to a funeral when a colleague died so as to cut down the
amount of school time spent on attending funerals. But, unsurprisingly, the researchers reported some reluctance on the part of the head teachers to discuss the health status of their staff.

Curriculum level

There had been some attempts to include HIV/AIDS education in the curriculum. In Uganda, this has been successful, but opposition from PTAs in Tanzania and Zimbabwe, and from religious organizations, was experienced (recall that many of the primary and most of the secondary schools in East Africa were founded by missionaries); there was also reluctance among teachers. Practical topics have been introduced in Uganda to provide skills and training needed for survival in the community.

School level

Strain and stress were reported within school systems because of the increasing number of orphans. Supplementary support from PTAs was dropping so that buildings were deteriorating and the supply of textbooks and educational materials was decreasing. Schools in Uganda are losing teachers as salary supplements are not possible due to a decrease in the parental contributions which financed them. NGOs are stepping in to provide financial support. It is not clear how viable this is in the long term.

Ministry of Education level

There was limited awareness of the consequences and impact of AIDS on education at district and national level. Hence, there is limited response to what is happening in schools.

Community level

Once someone has died (of anything), there is a tendency to withdraw children from school. When orphaned, children are moved to stay with relatives. There is a tendency for children to go to grandparents rather than other relatives who already have many children; children tend to drop out because of bureaucratic problems of school transfer. There is a progressive lack of interest in school emerging as a result of increasing unemployment among graduates and lack of higher education opportunities. This is a critical problem in Tanzania.

AIDS has been known to exist for 10 years now, but AIDS education through the mass media does not easily reach villages, and parents are resisting. Whilst most people are aware of AIDS, its symptoms and modes of transmission, there is cultural resistance to discuss AIDS openly — partly on religious grounds and partly for cultural reasons — which hinders the emergence of accurate data. Moreover, the intervention of NGOs may be inappropriate in some cultural circumstances.

The presenters discussed the complexity of assessing attribution — whether effects observed at school and community level are due to AIDS or to the general
impact of socio-economic crisis/structural adjustment — and urged refinements in methodologies to deal with such a problem.

III.2

Impact of HIV/AIDS on schools in Northwest Tanzania: some preliminary evidence

Presented by
M. Ainsworth, World Bank

The paper, co-authored by Martha Ainsworth and Godlike Koda, presents the preliminary results of the World Bank/University of Dar-es-Salaam’s study on adult death and child schooling in the Kagera Region of Northwestern Tanzania. The overall sample size was 1,897 children aged 7-19 years. Both enrolment and attendance in school were analyzed.

Two indicators for adult mortality were considered: orphanhood, and the recent death of adults in the household. The focus of the study was on the impact of adult death (due to all causes) on child schooling. About half of the adult deaths were thought to have been caused by AIDS, according to respondents.

Findings

Measures of child schooling

Enrolment in the previous 12 months

On average, 57 per cent of children aged 7-19 years were enrolled in school in the previous 12 months (60 per cent boys and 54 per cent girls). Fewer than 40 per cent of the children aged 7-10 years were enrolled in school in the previous 12 months. Among children aged 11-14 years, the figure is 80 per cent, while among older children aged 15-19 years only half were enrolled in the past 12 months. These figures are much lower than expected for Tanzania, where at one time gross primary enrolment ratios had been almost 100 per cent. There is no comparable national child-based survey of this kind, and the figures cannot be compared with the gross enrolment ratio. It was suggested that:

• parents in the study area only send children to school when they are more mature (9-11 years old);
• the other areas do not place too much interest in education, and this is more so given the historically limited access to secondary level education in Tanzania.
Hours of attendance in the 7 days before the survey

Among the 964 children enrolled at the time of the survey, the mean hours of attendance in the 7 days before the interview was estimated at 25.3 with, respectively, 19.2 for children aged 7-10 years, 25.4 for children aged 11-14 years, and 30.8 for those aged 15-19 years.

Among the 317 children reporting unusual hours of attendance in the last week, vacation (38 per cent), holiday (16 per cent) and other (24 per cent) were the major reasons for their absenteeism. A significant number of children said that they missed school for causes such as their own illness (14 per cent), work at home (3 per cent), caring for ill relatives (3 per cent) and mourning (3 per cent).

The impact of adult mortality

Using the indicator of orphanhood

Controlling for the child's age, no significant difference was found in hours of school attendance in the 7 days before the survey between children with both parents living and children with one or both parents deceased. Orphanhood did have, however, a relation with enrolment in the previous 12 months, when the father or both parents were deceased.

The death of an adult in the household in the past 12 months

The death of a male adult in a household in the past 12 months did not appear to have an effect on either measure of schooling. On the other hand, the death of a female adult in the past 12 months was associated with lower school enrolment in the previous 12 months, especially for the age-group 7-10 and 15-19 years, and fewer school hours of attendance in the last 7 days.

Assistance provided to households

A large proportion of children were living in households receiving assistance from outside organizations. Almost a quarter (24 per cent) of enrolled children with two living parents received assistance from an organization, while 57 per cent of enrolled children with both parents deceased did.

Among children in households not receiving assistance, enrolment of orphaned children was substantially lower than enrolment among non-orphaned children (among all age groups), and particularly for paternal and two-parent orphans. However, even in households receiving assistance, enrolment rates were low, regardless of orphan status — 50 per cent of children aged 7-10 years, 90 per cent of those aged 11-14 years and 60 per cent of those aged 15-19 years. Clearly, there are other factors than orphanhood and the availability of financial resources responsible for low enrolments.
It is not that clear whether orphans are any poorer than other children or require specific targeting. It is important to know whether being orphaned is an indicator of poverty. Many children are raised by grandparents or other relatives, even when both parents are living. Moreover, the major reason for non-enrolment may not be financial, but rather the importance of child labour and the perceived poor returns from schooling. Orphans and other children in foster families may be particularly disadvantaged in this respect.

*Hours spent on chores during the last 7 days*

Children were asked how much time they spent in various household duties during the last 7 days. Housework was most often cited, and orphans whose mothers were deceased spent the highest amount of time on housework compared to other categories of children. The next most frequent activities were fetching water and firewood and caring for the sick.

Children in households where a female or male death occurred in the previous 12 months spent on average more than 7 hours doing housework in the last 7 days, compared to 5.15 hours in households without an adult death. In addition, where cases of female death occurred, they spent 5 hours fetching water and 3.2 hours more collecting firewood, compared to 3.3 and 2.6 hours for water and firewood in households without a female death. Children spent more time caring for the sick where both female and male deaths occurred in the household.

The survey of primary schools (sample of 62 schools)

The most important reason for absenteeism reported by school officials was truancy (50 per cent of schools), followed by work at home (19 per cent) and own illness (16 per cent). Financial reasons came last (2 per cent). The second most important reason reported for absenteeism was work at home (27 per cent), followed by own illness (26 per cent). The inability to pay was reported only by 3 per cent.

Schools in Bukoba urban district had the highest proportion of enrolled students who were two-parent orphans (12 per cent); this was followed by Bukoba rural district (8 per cent). Karagwe and Ngora districts showed the lowest proportion (2 per cent).

It appears that the overall enrolment rates in the previous twelve months were highest in urban areas, which also showed the highest proportion of enrolled students who were orphans. This is due to the fact that higher income families live generally in urban areas. These areas are also the most infected by HIV/AIDS, which may explain the higher degree of orphanhood among students enrolled in primary schools in these areas.

The ways in which socio-economic factors affect enrolment in Tanzania need to be better understood so that this study focusing on adult death may be put into a broad policy framework. Future work will focus on the effect of both illness and deaths in the household on poverty, including school enrolments.
It would be useful to know more about the structure of the households and what roles are played by the male before he dies. For example: (i) security and (ii) authority (telling the children to go to school). It would be useful to know who the poor are and who the new poor will be.

The issue is whether orphans have greater needs than other children, and whether the reasons for dropping out are the same. It is not clear whether dropping out of school because of a HIV-infected parent is different from dropping out for other reasons. It is important to avoid designing a policy targeting a special group that may be seen as the most affected part of society, as this may stigmatize the targeted groups. Moreover, it is more ethical to target schools.

It is not clear whether lower enrolments and attendance among children in households with a female adult death is a temporary or permanent phenomenon. In the long term, the situation may change. Lower enrolment among paternal orphans in the long run may be explained by other male adults in the household not seeing children in the same manner as a father would.
IV

Agency presentations

Current research and new speculations

by

E. Reid, V. Barnes, I. Eriksson, S. Bahri, G. Goodale, P. Aggleton

Much of the content of the presentations was devoted to delineation of programmes carried out by these agencies in respect of sex education or HIV/AIDS education programmes. They are not detailed here as the focus of the workshop was on the impact of HIV/AIDS on the education system. These programmes focus on the following main points:

• The importance of personnel policies with reference to those with HIV (in terms of ethical and legal issues, human rights and discrimination) as an entry point to developing effective HIV/AIDS programmes (UNDP, ILO). The same concern has led USAID to develop private sector personnel policies and training packages for small and medium-sized businesses.

• Introduction of partnership programmes to strengthen national capacity to collect, analyze and use psychological, sociological and economic data on the causes of the spread of the HIV pandemic. UNDP, UNESCO and ILO have ongoing projects focusing on this issue.

• Concentration on information, education and communication; sexually transmitted disease (STD) case management, condom procurement and supply. These include USAID’s programmes in 15 countries of which seven are in Africa; SIDA’s multiple efforts in respect to sex and HIV/AIDS education using cartoon magazines; ILO’s projects to use the world of work as vehicle for promoting public awareness about HIV/AIDS and UNESCO’s recently developed AIDS education video. The WHO’s work on curriculum to include discussion of sex and sexuality in less sensitive matters by providing a range of options on how to replace an all-or-nothing scenario is another example.

• The development of curriculum to include young people and teachers in a participatory fashion after a review of sex education which shows that it does not encourage sexual activity among those already sexually active, does not encourage earlier sexual activity and does enhance risk reduction behaviour.

Mrs. Elizabeth Reid, UNDP, New York, USA; Mr Victor Barnes, USAID, Washington, USA, Mrs Izabella Eriksson, SIDA, Stockholm, Sweden; Mrs. Sonia Bahri, UNESCO, Paris; Mrs Gretchen Goodale, ILO, Geneva, Switzerland; Peter Aggleton, WHO, Geneva, Switzerland.
• Research focusing on developing interventions related to changing adolescent behaviour (USAID's women and AIDS research programme in place in a number of countries).

• Research on the impact of HIV/AIDS on the households: for example, the WHO has a general research protocol developed for use in Africa, South and Central Latin America, and South and Southeast Asia. These studies will focus on AIDS-infected and AIDS-affected households. They will look for effects on formal education and informal education systems. USAID has developed a Programme of Socio-economic and Demographic Modelling that looks at where the epidemic is and where it is going, and projects the numbers of orphans in countries.

• The importance of sensitizing programme officers in the agencies to the actual and potential impact of HIV/AIDS on education.
V

Workshop discussions and conclusion

V.1

Workshop discussions

Two working groups were held towards the end of the workshop: one looking at methodology, research and training issues; the other at current national activities. Their deliberations were discussed in a final plenary session: given the multiple overlaps, the following summarises the lessons from both the workshops and the concluding plenary.

Data collection

There was considerable discussion over the importance of collecting accurate data on the prevalence of HIV/AIDS in order to better assess impact. As soon as possible, such data collection should be made more systematic and become more institutionalized.

The problem was the practicality of introducing widespread testing programmes, both because of cost and sensitivity. In the interim, all agreed that in order to assess the quality of the data, it is important to provide sufficient background information about the nature and size of the sample and the circumstances and context of the testing.

Whilst realising the shaky nature of some of the estimates, participants stressed the importance of early warning systems in regard to social-economic impact because of the long incubation period of the disease. This could only feasibly be organised with the co-operation of community-based organizations in collecting data about early evidence of such impact.

Research: appropriate methodology

Distinctions were made between research providing information which could be useful for planners and policy-makers, and research on the policy-making process itself.

In the latter category, the following were identified:

• research on the optimum way of raising awareness amongst planners and policy-makers; and
research on why specific policies exist in their current form, how they were formulated and how they are being implemented.

In the former category, whilst research directly on impact was very important, it was recognized to be very difficult to isolate the impact of AIDS as distinct from other factors affecting education systems. (Some questioned whether it really mattered: this itself is an empirical question.)

Important lessons about the approach to research have been learnt within the Global Programme on AIDS. Given the sensitivity of the issues both among policy-makers as well as among the likely subjects of any research, it was seen as even more important that the priorities for research should depend on the policy-making concerns in each country. It cannot be assumed that falling enrolment and problems of teacher deployment are at the top of the policy agenda in every country.

There was a consensus that quantitative methods were inadequate by themselves; and that a judicious combination of qualitative and quantitative approaches was required. The experience of research within the GPA has shown the importance of sensitive approaches to research in this area.

The question was raised whether the appropriate entry point for research is the epidemic (e.g. what are the impacts of AIDS deaths on schooling in a community?) or the education system itself (e.g. what are the causes of declining or stagnating enrolment?). Intuitively, it seems likely that, depending on the entry point, the approaches, the methods employed, and the findings may well be different.

AIDS is an educational issue

The existence of HIV/AIDS and its actual and potential impact on education systems requires changes in Ministries of Education — technical, attitudinal, programmatic.

Technically, planners and managers need to undertake more rapid and timely analysis in order to be able to assess the current situation and carry out projections of the impact of AIDS and AIDS-related conditions. Micro-planning exercises need to incorporate consideration of the potential effects on demand, and forecasting tools have to be developed which can use the very shaky data which are likely to be the best available for some time to come.

Attitudes of staff should change. Newly trained teachers and other educational personnel should be sensitized to these issues. Attitudes towards staff should change especially in respect of postings and deployment; indeed there are implications for employment rights. More generally, there has to be a willingness to share experiences both with other ministries and among the district and regional officials within the education sector; and a readiness to involve other actors: NGOs, unions, communities, religious groups, etc. The emphasis must be on consensus building — not on passing the problem back to the Ministry of Health.
The organisation of the education system also needs to be more flexible: for example, traditional views about the viability of single-teacher or multi-grade schools may have to change; despite the well-known difficulties of collaborating at a distance there may be an even greater need for regional centres of excellence in African higher education rather than attempting to duplicate academic programmes in what might be increasingly poor and understaffed national universities.

In sum, Ministries should take ownership of this problem rather than having an agenda thrust upon them by an international agency. There needs to be a National Action Plan. This is especially important as the spread of the epidemic, the nature of the impact and the design of appropriate prevention programmes all depend on very country-specific contexts.

The orphan syndrome

In all the papers discussed, a crucial indicator was the increasing number of 'orphans'. Ainsworth used death of one or both parents as a classifier for her analysis. It was, however, agreed that whilst the death of a parent could — at least in principle — be unambiguously recorded, the use of orphanhood as an indicator was both complex and dangerous. Complex: partly because the term has sometimes been used in this context to denote those orphaned because of AIDS, partly because it would not always be known whether an absent father was dead or not, and partly because the nature of extended families in many cultures renders the concept problematic in the first place. Dangerous: partly because there was a tendency for fostering homes to believe that NGOs should permanently support these children, partly because, if used as an indicator for targeting funds, it might 'stigmatize' the families receiving funds, or even lead to a perverse incentive for parents. It is also dangerous because it forces us to focus on low enrolments among one special group of children, when enrolments are in fact constrained among all children due to systemic failures which need urgent attention.

V.2

Concluding remarks, follow-up and recommended guidelines for the education system

The original background paper set out a range of possible impacts upon education and more were mentioned at the workshop; evidence of the reality of some of these was also presented. Exactly how much extra a problem AIDS is, how different are its effects — on demand/enrolment, teacher recruitment/placement, and appropriate curricula — compared with those due to poverty and other causes remains an unanswered question, and therefore what weight should be placed upon the many different issues raised during the workshop will vary between and within countries according to the incidence of the epidemic, socio-cultural factors, etc.
Throughout, it was emphasized that discussions should not be confined to the formal education system; the scope should be broadened to include other sectors. However, it was recognized that collaboration is always difficult (remember the fad for integrated rural development programmes), and that it might be better to focus, if only at first, on more narrowly-defined educational problems before creating cross-sectoral partnerships and analyses.

Equally, the role of non-formal education and the various extension services in meeting the daily living needs of people was emphasized, and although these are difficult to implement, they may be the best route for meeting the educational needs of children not in school or who drop out of school as a result of HIV/AIDS or for other reasons.

Others broadened the focus yet further to emphasize the overall problems in human resource development and how to find a way of replacing a significant loss of labour force when many countries are not able to provide basic skills: in what area should investments be prioritized and to what extent?

The necessity of a global approach to the problems considered in this workshop is clear: the impact of AIDS should not be considered in isolation but rather at the same time as consideration of poverty, the labour market, other sectors and the socio-cultural context. It is also important to remember that education systems are in a state of crisis in many countries, and, in some senses, AIDS is just another pressing problem. But it is also likely that some problems related to AIDS are quite different, qualitatively and quantitatively, from those caused by other factors.

For some participants, there had initially been an enthusiasm to develop a consensus statement (along the lines of that developed at the World Consultation of Teachers' Organizations in 1991). Given the lack of knowledge about impact, this seemed premature; indeed, one of the purposes of the seminar was to identify the range of possible impacts (and the current reality) and to assess which among these are the most likely and the most important. However, a variety of possible follow-up activities were suggested; and there appeared to be a consensus emerging over a set of guidelines.

Follow up

Participants proposed five different kinds of follow up:

- The participants of this seminar should themselves sensitize their colleagues at home to the issues that were discussed, possibly by raising the issue of implications for internal staffing policies.

- The general issue of the impact of HIV/AIDS on the education system should be brought up in other appropriate fora — e.g. conferences on women in development, educational conferences and AIDS conferences.

- At forthcoming UNESCO regional conferences on AIDS and Education in Asia and Africa, at meetings on the socio-economic impact of AIDS where the issue is already
potentially on the agenda, and at the 1995 DAC meeting on AIDS and development, the specific issues raised at this meeting should be discussed.

- A forum is needed at the international level so as to provide a network for exchanges among researchers, policy-makers and planners both of up-to-date findings and of policy innovations and practical successes.

- Guidelines for appropriate responses to the epidemic from the education system need to be developed, possibly under the aegis of a lead agency.

Towards guidelines?

There are three levels at which guidelines are needed:

- On a minimum negative level, it is urgent that all education systems, regardless of the presumed incidence of HIV/AIDS, ensure that schools, colleges, etc. are not a source of dissemination of AIDS. For example, we know that some teachers are spreading the epidemic both by demanding sexual favours of their students and because of their (sometimes forced) mobility. Ministries must give urgent consideration to what can be done to avoid these forms of propagation, and what structures are required to implement such proposals.

- In situations where planners and policy-makers are already sensitized to the problem, and within an overall programme to improve the quality of schooling, the focus should be on creating a favourable climate in the school for those afflicted by HIV/AIDS. For example, provision needs to be made for orphans, and attitudes have to be changed so as to avoid discrimination. Both of these require a more flexible approach to the organization of schooling (including non-formal approaches) and the involvement of the community.

- On a more positive note, consideration needs to be given to how best the education system can help prevent the spread of HIV/AIDS in the future — through more effective AIDS education within the formal school system, AIDS clubs, drama, etc.
ANNEXES
Annex 1

THE IMPACT OF HIV/AIDS ON EDUCATION:
A REVIEW OF LITERATURE AND EXPERIENCE

by

Sheldon Shaeffer

This document, supported by UNESCO with funding from the Swedish International Development Authority (SIDA), will be published by UNESCO in English and French.
I

Introduction

"... the AIDS pandemic confronts us with a full range of development issues... issues of poverty, entitlement and access to food, medical care and income, the relationships between men and women, the relative abilities of states to provide security and services for their people, the relations between the rich and the poor within society and between rich and poor societies, the viability of different forms of rural production, the survival strategies of different types of household and community, all impinge upon a consideration of the ways in which an epidemic such as this affects societies and economies" (Barnett and Blaikie, 1992:5).

"Across Africa, evidence for the seriousness of... downstream effects is accumulating rapidly; given the nature of the disease and the shape of the epidemic curve..., now is the time to take action to mitigate the worst effects in the next two decades. Because this is a long wave disaster,... the effects we are seeing now in Uganda and elsewhere are the result of events (personal, communal, regional, national, and international) that occurred a decade or more ago. Action taken now cannot change the present, nor can it change the immediate future. It can change the way the situation will look in the years after 2010" (Barnett and Blaikie, 1992:167).

A. AIDS and social-economic development

The statistics are impressive: 40 million (or perhaps 100 million, 2 per cent of the world’s population) infected with HIV by the end of the decade; seropositivity rates of 10 per cent - 20 per cent - even 30 per cent among certain population groups (by age, place of residence, nationality, or gender); increasing AIDS-related mortality rates; perhaps 2/3 of those infected living in sub-Saharan Africa, with one million (perhaps many more) already infected in India and hundreds of thousands more in Southeast Asia. The problem is that as long as these issues are discussed largely in terms of statistics, they remain issues in the abstract. This is especially true (and dangerous) when the numbers remain relatively small in the developed world (particularly when compared to some earlier predictions), thus lulling it into a false sense of security and leading to the debate over the ‘myth of AIDS’.

The need, therefore, is to go beyond the mere numbers and percentages of the infected, ill and dead to the impact that such numbers will have on individuals, families, communities and nations. Perhaps it is only with clearer evidence of such impact — anecdotal and descriptive, as well as statistical — that the magnitude of HIV and AIDS will become apparent and that all nations of the world and all sectors of society — even those not now visibly affected — will realize that the epidemic is their concern and not someone else’s.
And such evidence concerning the impact of HIV infection and AIDS on the development both of communities and of nations is beginning to appear. The impact in many regions of the world is already widespread, profound, and complex — and promises to be even more so in the future. The subsequent scenarios being written for the future of heavily affected regions of the world — and for some only now beginning to be affected — are quite devastating. And they come at a time when many societies, because of recession, debt, war and natural disaster, are simply unable to cope with the ‘routine’ demands of development let alone assess the impact of AIDS and respond effectively to it. (See Cohen, n.d.; Miller and Rockwell, 1988; Nabarro and McConnell, 1989; Armstrong and Bos, 1992; African Development Bank Group, 1993; NORAD, 1991; Reid, 1992; Panos Institute, 1992; World Bank and the University of Dar es Salaam, 1993).

The gravity of the situation is often reinforced by the feeding of one crisis by another. Thus, economic recession, drought and conflict “aggravate the transmission, spread and control of HIV infection... in two major ways: directly by increasing the population at risk through increased urban migration, poverty, women’s powerlessness and prostitution and indirectly through a decrease in health care provision” (Sanders and Sambo, 1992:32). The impact then grows exponentially, from one sector to another, one level of society to another, one nation and region to another.

One aspect of this is the sheer impact on population. Although one estimate for an aggregate of 15 relatively heavily affected countries in sub-Saharan Africa showed that population will still double between 1980 and 2005, the projected increase will be 4 per cent less than what would be expected in the absence of AIDS. Another estimate claims that the population of an average sub-Saharan Africa nation will be 3.2 per cent smaller in 2020 than would have been the case in the absence of AIDS (African Development Bank Group, 1993b: 16). In some countries the expected population size may be reduced by considerably more — in Zambia by 12 per cent and in Uganda by 8 per cent (Population Newsletter 1992).

The impact on the individuals, families and communities which lie behind these numbers, at the micro-level of society, can also be immense. People fall ill, cannot work and lose income. Their families spend money on care and treatment and lose further income in taking time to care for them. People die; specialized workers, skilled artisans and educated officials disappear and replacements are difficult to find; businesses close and farms lie fallow; current earnings are lost and future earnings foregone; and time and money are spent on funerals and mourning. Thus, for example, in Zaire, “a single hospitalization for a child with AIDS costs four times an average worker’s monthly income; and funeral expenses 11 times a month’s pay” (F. Davachi et al, Panos Institute, 1989:vii).

Women, too, fall ill and die, usually at an age considerably younger than men. Given their productive role in the home, in agriculture and in the informal sector of the economy, their loss is a critical one. Widows and orphans lose their land, shelter and inheritance; are forced to depend on relatives or migrate to cities; and may join an urban underclass of commercial sex workers and street children. Traditional support systems are stretched and then broken and families and communities lose their economic, social and cultural viability and gain a sense of fear, fatalism and helplessness. As one researcher put it:
"In any culture, people can assume to have a hierarchy of expectations which may be subjected to change in the face of crisis. The highest expectations include self-respect, a sense of worth and the giving and receiving of affection. Other expectations may be an acceptable standard of living now and in the future. But all of these expectations of life are acutely threatened by AIDS. Expectations about relationships with children and grandchildren have all been profoundly disturbed" (Katahoire, 1993:19).

All of this micro-level impact adds up, at the macro-level, to a significant reduction of national productivity and output. The direct costs of health care increase dramatically, but even these are exceeded by the indirect costs to the economy due to foregone output (Cohen, n.d.). This derives partly from the aggregate of losses in labour and earnings due to individual illness, disability, absenteeism and death and partly from the collective impact on the productivity of individual firms and farms. Less labour-intensive crops, for example, are substituted for commodities traditionally sold as exports and where (as in Laos) a large percentage of state income derives from trade and service enterprises, the impact of AIDS on industry, construction and transport may affect tax revenues and government budgets (UNDP, 1992).

There are also other causes of economic loss, in regard to:

1. **savings and investments.** "There are many reasons to believe that the effects of HIV will be to reduce total savings and in so far as these decline there will be less investment, less productive employment, lower incomes, a slower rate of GNP growth and possibly a lower level of GNP" (Cohen, n.d.:7). As an observer in the Rakai District of Uganda explained, "young people had been discouraged from making long-term investments; they kept whatever resources they had available for when they become ill" (Katahoire, 1993:93).

2. **remittances.** Restrictions on international migrant labour reduce the level of remittances returned to the sending country. "Malawi... recently reported a loss of R70 million (approximately US$27.3 million) a year after Malawian miners were prevented from going to South Africa because of the threat of their being tested for AIDS" (Sanders and Sambo, 1992:32).

3. **personnel replacement and retraining.** Illness and death lead to high job turnover and high costs of recruitment and training and, in a context of increasingly scarce trained human resources, to higher salaries — thus a reduction in "both the quantity and quality of the labour available to produce output" (Cohen, n.d.:3). One projection in Uganda indicates that, in order to have one person surviving to the age of 50 from the current cohort receiving education and training, 17 will need to be trained (quoted in Barnett and Blaikie, 1992:126).

As a result, "under the most plausible assumptions, simulations predict that AIDS will reduce the rate of growth in GDP per capita relative to a no-AIDS scenario... In many countries [in Africa], negative growth rates in GDP/capita will be lowered even more as a result of the AIDS epidemic" (African Development Bank Group, 1993b:18-19). One estimate, for example, claims that the loss of many skilled workers in the prime of their
productivity could make Tanzania's gross domestic product fall 14-24 per cent from normal levels by the year 2010 (World Bank, 1992:xix) and a related survey by the Standard Chartered Bank in Zimbabwe suggests that the net economic effect of HIV/AIDS was likely to be a 1 per cent annual slow-down in economic growth in the country during the first 20 years of the next century (quoted in Chakaza, 1993:3).

One of the most pernicious aspects of AIDS is how it may reverse some of the progress in development made over the last decade or two and make unachieviable the various social targets (in regard to child survival, basic education, etc.) set by national governments and international agencies for the future.

"HIV can impede and, more significantly, reverse the gains in economic and human development reached over the last few decades by affecting programmes geared to reduce poverty and improve the general health of the population. In some places, AIDS has already had a serious impact on programmes affecting nutrition, STDs [sexually transmitted diseases], diarrhoea, TB prevention, immunization, childhood mortality reduction and the lengthening of life expectancy" (McGrath, 1993).

Thus, the increasing rates of infant infection, illness and death due to AIDS may eliminate the improvement in infant survival achieved over the last 20 years (Preble, 1990). "... In developing countries, where maternal HIV seroprevalence reaches 20-40 per cent, serious erosion, and even complete reversal, of the hard-fought gains in infant and child mortality achieved since 1960 may occur" (Vermund and Sheon, 1992:49). "UNICEF projects that in the absence of AIDS, mortality rates of children under 5 years of age in Central and East Africa would have dropped to 132/1000 [in 2015-2020]. However, because of the AIDS epidemic under-5 mortality will probably rise to 159-189/1000" (African Development Bank Group, 1993b:14). This will probably be even higher due to the impoverishment and neglect of otherwise healthy AIDS orphans. And the Ministry of Health of Uganda in 1992, as reported by Katahoire, anticipates that pregnancy-related deaths attributable to AIDS will push up the maternal mortality rate from 4 per 1000 to 13 per 1000 (1993:8).

There may also be a reverse in the gains made in life expectancy. For the 15 country aggregate mentioned above, a life expectancy at birth of 50 years in 1985-1990 should have climbed to 56 years by 1995-2000; instead it may remain unchanged — with perhaps 1/2 of the crude death rate in Africa by 2020 being attributable to AIDS (Armstrong and Bos, 1992:205). Another estimate speaks of life expectancy in sub-Saharan Africa falling to 47 years rather than the 62 years expected in the absence of AIDS (WHO quoted in Panos Institute, 1992:21). One report indicates that the average age of death of insured workers in Zambia and South Africa is now 37 years (Whiteside, 1993). Another, in Zambia, reports almost a ten-fold increase in the crude mortality rate among 21 local enterprises from 1987 to 1993 (personal communication).

As a result of such impact — on families, communities and societies; on population growth, social cohesion and economic productivity; on health status and mortality — a host of other effects may appear. Here we find speculation, but little experience or evidence, concerning the possible longer-term impact on political stability and national security as the weakening of a governing elite or a defense establishment, or the increasing marginalization of regions or population groups, leads to inter- and intra-group conflict. Thus:
"Several factors make the global pandemic a significant international security issue. One such factor involves the socioeconomic disintegration and political destabilization caused by a loss of trained and experienced military and civilian personnel... When the military is weakened, so, too, is the security of the country it is intended to defend... In complex ways, the epidemic effects national and regional development and will play a role in regional power struggles and in the maneuverings of special interests. Whether military units are able to carry out their missions and maintain national security will ultimately be determined by readiness in the ranks and stability of leadership" (Yeager and Miller, 1993:3).

This will especially be a problem where, as in some African countries, infection rates in military services are reported to approach 65 per cent and where between eight and nine candidates must be screened in order to discover one who is seronegative (Yeager and Miller, 1993:15).

B. The differential impact of HIV

"AIDS is a quintessential social disease. It neither occurs nor propagates in a social vacuum. The way in which it spreads and the impact it will have is greatly affected by the prevailing social norms, the level of development and the role of government. Countless other variables affect the course and impact of the epidemic but the central message is clear. Whilst there may be some commonalities across societies, there should be no presumption that what works in India will work in Indonesia and vice versa. Therefore, the challenge that confronts all of us is to provide insights for the design of policies and projects which explicitly take into account social, cultural and economic conditions and differences and which are correspondingly likely to be most effective as a result" (Thomson, 1993:2).

The other very important aspect of AIDS and development relates to its 'differences' — both its differences with other diseases and epidemics and its differential impact across societies and within a particular society. As a disease, it is different in various ways. Being largely sexually transmitted, it is difficult both to talk about and to control. It appears to be expanding more rapidly than many other epidemics and is particularly dangerous because of the long incubation period between infection and evident illness. It is thought to lead inevitably to death. Its highest rates of incidence are among young, economically productive adults rather than among the particularly weak, the very young, or the very old. Because it is likely to kill spouses (and children) in the same family, its impact clusters in ways which tax even the strongest of traditional coping mechanisms. And unlike most diseases which are either inversely associated with SES (i.e. greater incidence among the poor) or not significantly associated with it, HIV (at least at first) affected primarily the urban technical and professional elites, with higher education, income and skill levels (Bertozzi, 1991; Panos Institute, 1992).
One result of this is that higher-level officials in both public and private sectors, many of whom have received higher education locally or abroad, may be particularly affected by the epidemic. One Ugandan study found an annual mortality rate of 2.5 per cent among staff of government institutions who had studied abroad between 1986 and 1988 (Olowo-Freers et al, n.d.:5) — with perhaps 2.1 per cent due to AIDS.

Now, however, there is evidence that:

"both the rich and poor are likely to have higher infection rates. The rich, like the powerful, are more mobile, less constrained by community norms and can afford the lifestyles they choose, which often place them at risk of infection. The poor and the powerless alike are less able to make choices about their life circumstances, more often forced into work away from home and family, or commercial sex work. Their health and nutritional levels are low and they cannot afford to use health services" (Reid, 1992:5).

Thus, in general and perhaps increasingly:

"the disease affects severely those groups that may be least able to resist it, due to ignorance, prevalence of injecting drug use and limited access to higher quality goods and services. The greater impact on these groups, many of which are on the fringe of survival, will come through reduced labour remittances, reduced availability of labour especially at peak seasons and ultimately less food security and income. The poverty of some social groups will, therefore, intensify as a result of the epidemic" (World Bank, 1991a:8).

A particularly important differential impact relates to women. "In Africa... women generally contract HIV and die of AIDS at ages five to ten years younger than men... The ability of all women to protect themselves from HIV is constrained by their status in society” (African Development Bank Group, 1993a:3). This relates to the greater incidence of STDs among women, their greater frequency of intercourse, an age differential at intercourse between younger women and older men, lower levels of nutrition and a variety of other physiological and ‘situational’ factors including cultural beliefs and large differentials in power between men and women (UNDP, n.d.b). These factors put women both at a special disadvantage — with less opportunity for schooling and employment, less ownership of land and greater insecurity over land title, less profitable self-employment (especially at a time of recession and structural adjustment) and thus with lower incomes — and at a special risk, gaining access to income through sexual relationships with men. “Women say that... now more than ever they need to find ‘a spare tire’... that is, men to whom they offer sexual services when they need ready cash to obtain health care for a sick child or to meet social obligations” (Schoepf et al, 1988:269).

HIV infection and AIDS also have differential impacts by region and sector. Particular areas of a country, because of extensive poverty, cultural practices of the local population and/or proximity to routes of transmission, may be more heavily affected than others. Also,

"many sectors of the economy may be threatened by the sudden depletion of the workforce: mining, agriculture, transport and construction, for example. The sectors most vulnerable are those which depend on highly trained
personnel or upon occupational groups which may have high rates of HIV infection, such as truck drivers, construction workers, teachers, etc.” (UNDP, n.d.a; see also Gillespie, 1989).

Particularly mobile populations such as army personnel, senior civil servants and parliamentarians and migrant workers are also affected and case studies of firms in ‘high-risk’ sectors in Uganda (transportation and construction) showed much higher than usual levels of mortality than expected (World Bank, 1991:39). The result may be especially severe for industries which rely “on a pool of highly-trained workers drawn from a pipeline through which small numbers of persons move... If the pipeline for replacement of these educated workers is seriously deficient, killing people at the same rate within a small elite as within the general population would have a hollowing-out effect” (Rockwell, n.d.:3,4).

As a result of such differential impact and “because of the way that infection is clustered in families, occupations and geographical areas, the impact of multiple illness and death is much greater than the accumulated individual losses” (UNDP, n.d.a). The whole, in other words, is much greater than the sum of its parts.

But there should be little comfort in thinking that such impact will necessarily be restricted to such limited clusters. Sooner or later, in many countries of the world, HIV infection and AIDS will have a serious effect on the quantity and nature of available human resources, on productivity and thus on development. Perhaps up to 1/4 of the most productive, most able-bodied and often most educated middle generation of some societies — both leaders (planners, managers, teachers, entrepreneurs and other professionals) and producers (farmers, factory workers, miners, merchants) — will be seriously affected. They will see their mortality rates increased (perhaps doubled or tripled) and their life expectancy lowered; will be taken out of the work force and thus out of the economic life of their families, communities and nations; and will be replaced, if at all, by people younger (perhaps two years younger on the average, by 2010, in one African scenario) and less educated, with different and perhaps less needed skills and experience (World Bank, 1992). The result, already visible in some areas, will be that whole communities will be “turned into big ‘orphanages’, with limited resources, weakened structures, poor organisation and diminishing motivation” (Ddombo, 1991:8).

C. The role of education

As a major actor in the development of human resources — through the teaching of literacy and numeracy, the transmission of basic knowledge and skills for survival and the delivery of vocational, tertiary and professional training — the education system bears both a special burden in terms of being affected by AIDS and special responsibilities for responding to its impact. How education systems are currently being affected (or will likely be affected), how they respond to this impact (e.g. denying it and doing nothing or anticipating it and adapting themselves accordingly) and the extent to which schools and other education programmes continue to be a part of the essential infrastructure of societies and communities under siege will be important determinants in how societies recover from the impact of HIV and AIDS on their economic, social and political development.
There are three issues in this regard:

1. the ways the education system must change in order effectively to deliver messages about the epidemic;
2. the impact of HIV/AIDS on the demand, supply, process and quality of education; and
3. the longer-term response of the education system to such impact.

In the long run, the impact of HIV/AIDS on development should not be seen purely on a sectoral basis; i.e. a particular impact on health, on education, on transportation, etc. A more cross-sectoral analysis of impact must be done and more integrated responses developed. But for now and for several reasons, a focus on education as a sector is useful:

1. Ministries of Education will likely be willing to develop appropriate and effective preventive AIDS education programmes to the extent that they see that HIV/AIDS is not merely a health problem but rather a problem that may affect their daily, routine operations. This requires more awareness and understanding of the potential impact of HIV/AIDS on education.

2. Many education systems of the world, especially in those countries now seriously affected by AIDS, already face a host of challenges brought about by recession and debt, natural disaster and conflict and a growing lack of public confidence in the quality and utility of schooling. The presence of HIV/AIDS will likely add to the challenge. Several questions should be raised in this regard. Are the educational problems related to AIDS different from problems caused by other factors? Are they different merely in quantity or degree (e.g. more drop-outs, fewer teachers)? Or, because of the nature of the epidemic and of the risk groups concerned, are they also different in quality or kind (e.g. different causes and processes of dropping out, leading to different consequences and requiring different solutions)? These are important issues for educational planners and managers and the donor agencies which support them. They are also issues which require considerably more investigation and analysis.

3. Different regions of the world, even different parts of a country, will likely experience different models of impact depending on a host of contextual factors: the pre-AIDS social, economic and political context; the nature and rapidity of HIV transmission; cultural and religious beliefs and practices; the resilience of affected families and communities; the nature of the most feasible prevention methods. Before such models can be more clearly defined and predicted, however, the possible range of impact on education needs to be explored. Unfortunately, there has been relatively little research on the actual impact of HIV/AIDS on education and even only limited speculation on the potential range of impact. There is little known about what aspects of education, through what processes and mechanisms, might be affected by HIV/AIDS. Without such a ‘map’ of possible kinds of impact, it will be difficult to determine which aspects of education, in a given society, are likely to be most (and most quickly) affected by HIV/AIDS. Once such a determina-
tion is made, it can be meshed with similar information from other sectors in order to gain a clearer picture of the social and economic impact of the epidemic; it can also be matched to the pressing educational concerns — AIDS-related or not — of planners and managers in order better to develop programmes to maintain, expand and improve the system.

This paper — a mix of literature review, speculation and recommendation — attempts to provide a beginning to such a map of possible impact. It is, for the moment, based largely on examples from sub-Saharan Africa. An important question for the future concerns whether the evidence being uncovered in this region of the world will be replicated as the epidemic expands elsewhere.
II

Impact on the effectiveness of education: the delivery of messages about AIDS

"Activities implemented now that focus on behaviour change and that are based on a realistic understanding of the changes required to reduce the spread of infection will generate enormous benefits in terms of avoidance of future costs... Low prevalence countries are in a position to act now with effective policies to prevent the spread of HIV and thus to avoid its economic, social and psychological costs... it is crucial to act now and not to wait until a point where these costs become unavoidable. The returns from effective HIV prevention activities in all countries, with high or low seroprevalence, will in most cases substantially exceed those from other investments" (Cohen, n.d.:12,27).

It is a truism that in the absence of vaccines, treatments and cures, education leading to knowledge about the epidemic and to behaviour change is the only way to inhibit transmission of HIV. Even if bio-medical solutions to AIDS are found, it is further true that, given the political economy of the world today, they will likely not be available for many years to the most affected populations of the world. But education systems — especially formal school systems, which remain, for good or bad, the primary inculcators of 'modern' knowledge and attitudes — are very often unwilling and unable to address the issues, package and target the messages and adopt the approaches needed to deliver effectively what needs to be known about AIDS. Thus, one necessary impact of HIV/AIDS on education systems will be pressures and attempts to make these systems: (1) more 'open' in the topics they talk about and (2) more able to discuss such topics in a more integrated fashion to more precisely-targeted groups through more flexible methods.

A. A more open system

"Behaviour change is a process which must essentially involve changes in community and sexual norms and values, the availability of voluntary and confidential counselling and testing services and the creation of an environment which creates the possibility of open and honest discussion of sexuality and dying" (Reid, 1992:2).

Unfortunately, although education systems, public and private, formal and non-formal, play an important role in influencing community norms and values — including sexual norms and values — they are notoriously unable (and perhaps even afraid) to support the discussion of topics such as drug abuse, sexuality and sex education, STDs and condoms, the role and status of women, or even the scientific facts of reproductive biology. This is usually true at the central level of the system, in such areas as the development of personnel policies, curricula, textbooks and teacher training programmes. It is even truer at the school level. In
decentralized education systems, schools and their teachers are often formally governed by the communities which surround them. Even in more centralized systems, they are informally influenced by these communities. In both cases, they are often reluctant to go against local norms, mores and values, especially as these relate to sex and sexuality.

One impact of HIV/AIDS, therefore, is to push the education system, at all levels, into more open and frank discussion of these topics in the school and community in the system itself and in society at large. Among other things, this requires schools to have greater cultural sensitivity to, and intimacy with, the community.

B. A more integrated message in a more flexible system

This leads to the second change required of the system — that once it becomes more able and willing to deliver the message it needs to deliver, it also becomes more systematic in deciding what this message says and more flexible in deciding where, when, how and by whom the message is delivered. In a world fraught with AIDS and with an enhanced risk of HIV infection, the education system can no longer deliver a strictly health-based message about AIDS in traditional ways — the secondary school biology teacher lecturing on the ‘science’ of HIV.

Rather, as implied above, the message itself must be broader than this, embedded in an integrated message concerning healthy children and healthy schools and covering issues (depending on what is feasible in a given society) ranging from reproductive health, sexuality, sex education, STDs and condoms to discrimination and human rights, respect for women and the information and life skills particularly needed by girls in the context of AIDS.

Such a message must be delivered to a wider range of targets — e.g. a wider age range of pupils, starting considerably earlier than usual within the school cycle. It must be delivered both in a language appropriate to the targeted audience and in a greater variety of places — both outside of school (in the media, through clubs) and in school, in subjects such as health education, family life education, population education, social studies and life skills education. It must be taught more frankly and more creatively, in more interactive and experiential fashion (e.g. with simulations and games), accompanied by extra-curricular and community-based activities such as art and song contests, AIDS-free clubs and popular theatre and school plays such as those now being encouraged in Uganda (Katahoire, 1993; Olong-Atwoki, 1993). It must be communicated by appropriate teachers and by a greater variety of ‘teachers’ — not only by those in the classroom but also by peers; by role models such as movie stars, singers and athletes; and by respected members of the community (UNICEF, 1993). The message must be developed by involving local religious and community leaders, parents and teacher organizations, other sectors. And the target audience itself in the design and implementation of the programme; for example, through materials writing workshops where members of the target groups help to write material appropriate to their peers (Hausermann, 1990).

The system, in other words, must be willing to become more an advocate rather than a mere disseminator of knowledge, ‘selling’ an appropriate message about AIDS more explicitly, more flexibly and more effectively, especially to those (such as youth and young girls) at particular risk. Such an advocacy role cannot be developed overnight and such a
message cannot be implemented by fiat – even if supported by a carefully designed programme of preventive AIDS education. Ministries of Education, in other words, will likely need to change in quite fundamental ways in order to deliver a genuinely effective message about the epidemic.
III

Impact of HIV/AIDS on demand, supply and process

"HIV is a direct threat to children... Generally, a child's vulnerability to HIV infection increases as the family’s socioeconomic status decreases. Children not infected perinatally face the possibility of subsequent infection through breast milk if their mothers have HIV... All children are at risk of HIV through contaminated blood transfusions, unsterile skill-piercing instruments and/or sexual activities — whether coercive or consensual. Few children, if any, have the control over their lives to avoid these risks" (Bailey, 1992:668)

The most immediate and visible impact of HIV/AIDS has appeared already in many education systems of the world. Children infected at birth have not lived to enrol in school; some of the children enrolled have dropped out of school in order to earn money for their families and for the care of ill relatives; teachers have fallen ill and have died; and because of the presence of HIV in the classroom and the school, the process of teaching and learning itself has become more complicated and more difficult — and its quality has deteriorated. In some societies this impact is still barely noticeable, hidden by the normal processes of change and subsumed by the more obvious and immediately visible problems of poverty, drought, war and other illnesses. In others, however, the impact is already quite clear and identifiable — an impact on the demand for education, on its supply and on the nature and quality of teaching and learning.

A. Demand

A study in Rakai District in Uganda selected 20 pupils in the upper grades of three primary schools — 10 girls and 10 boys, 10 orphans and 10 not, randomly selected within these parameters. To quote from the results:

"... half of the homes were headed by guardians, three... had fathers still alive and the other seven were headed by widows... the AIDS epidemic was having a serious impact on the pupils. Nineteen of the pupils reported having been absent from school for periods ranging from five weeks to one and a half terms during the past one year. The most common responses given for absenteeism were lack of school fees and helping with the nursing of AIDS patients at home... all other household members including themselves were reallocated to caring for the patient or patients... It was reported by 15 of the pupils that their school life had been affected by the death of their parents or guardians. In addition to lack of school fees, pupils explained that they had to miss school sometimes because of no uniforms, books, pens, etc... they often stayed at home for several days at a time to attend funerals of their relatives... due to the increasing number of AIDS patients, pupils (especially girls) were required to take turns at home nursing the sick and helping out on the farm, especially with the decrease in farm labour in the homes. Most pupils
indicated that they had to work on the farms in order to raise money for fees and to grow food to eat" (Katahoire, 1993:6-68).

In Rakai District, as in other heavily affected regions of Africa, there are relatively fewer children than anticipated needing, wanting, able to afford, or able to complete their education. This is at least partly the result of HIV and AIDS. Fewer children will be born in a society where AIDS is present than if it were not; most children infected perinatally will develop AIDS and die before reaching school age; and many children may not enrol in school or may leave school because of the direct and indirect effects of AIDS. Thus, the demand by children for places in school and by adults for opportunities for further education, is reduced.

In most cases, this reduction is relative to what it would be in the absence of AIDS; in other words, there will still be an increase, but a slower one, in school enrolment. Recent research in Zimbabwe, for example, has shown that other trends — younger children in the school-going cohort, the end of the drought, better learning environments and school management, school feeding schemes — were helping to increase attendance figures despite the presence of AIDS (Chakaza, 1993). In some cases, however, depending on the prevailing rates of population and enrolment growth for the school-age cohort, the reduction in demand may be absolute, with decreasing numbers of children in school.

Such a decrease in demand is already evident in some areas. In the Rakai district of Uganda, total enrolment in three primary schools studied went from 1534 in 1989 to 950 in 1993. The primary school drop-out rate for the district in 1993 was 27 per cent, considerably higher than the national rate of 15 per cent per year (Katahoire 1993:25). In one secondary school in the district, enrolment decreased by almost 56 per cent from 1989-1993 and in the district as a whole enrolment had decreased 12.7 per cent. Drop-out rates at that level were 17.4 per cent compared to the national figure of 10.1 per cent (Katahoire, 1993:80). It is clear that such a decline in enrolment and such an increase in drop-out rates in a district such as Rakai — affected, as it is, by many other problems of poverty, ill-health and insecurity — cannot be entirely assigned to the presence of HIV/AIDS. But research in that district and elsewhere has been able to attribute some of these changes in demand to AIDS, through several different possible mechanisms:

1. The first and perhaps most chilling, aspect of demand is that as a result of HIV and AIDS, there will be relatively fewer children needing education. First, fewer children will be born because of the early death of one or both parents (though there is some speculation that mothers may bear more children at an earlier age in anticipation of an early death from AIDS). A World Bank study in Tanzania estimates that in 2020, in the worst case scenario — because the school cohort will be relatively smaller when AIDS is present than when it is not — there will be 22 per cent fewer children than anticipated enrolled in primary school and 14 per cent fewer in secondary school (World Bank, 1992:68). In addition, those children infected perinatally or from breast milk will die before the age of entry into school (though there is now some evidence that up to 50 per cent of them may reach school age — personal communication). This lessening of demand due to smaller numbers of children available for primary school will eventually be reflected at all levels of the system.
2. There may also be relatively fewer children wanting education — or fewer parents wanting their children to be educated. This will be partly due to a reluctance of parents to make the considerable investment which an education requires — estimated in Tanzania, for example, to be 26 million Tanzanian shillings for eight years of primary school, four years of secondary education and three years of university education (World Bank, 1992:70). "A death after age 18 wastes not only future production but also past education investment", leading to a kind of 'secondary poverty' if the educated child needed for work and for the old-age security of parents dies (Bertozzi, 1991:S48). The higher chance of the death of an educated child leads to a lower return of investment in education and therefore, perhaps, less willingness on the part of the family to sacrifice for such an education. As a result, "the uncertainties due to AIDS, the weak family economic base and the limited number of primary and secondary education graduates finding way to further education and subsequently to formal employment have reduced the parents'... beliefs that there was much to gain from school" (Katabaro, 1993:92).

Another aspect of this disinterest in school might derive from the increased randomness of the education provided. Especially in systems already affected by recession, debt, poverty and natural or man-made disasters, the added absenteeism of both teachers and pupils due to the presence of HIV and AIDS (their own illness or that of their families, funerals, etc.) will only make the education provided more sporadic and unsystematic. As one study put it, pupils lose "the subjects' sequence at school as his/her attendance is affected" (Katabaro, 1993:3). Parents and children who realize this may see little point in continuing to pay for such an education.

A further aspect concerns the desire of parents to keep daughters out of what is perceived as the pernicious influence of Western-style education — an influence seen as increasing due to the presence both of AIDS in the school and of sex education in the curriculum. In Rakai district, some "parents reported that due to an increase in defilement and pregnancy among school girls, they were forced to withdraw their children from school completely since the schools had become a centre for spoiling young children" (Katahoire, 1993:89-90).

3. A further major impact on demand results from fewer children and their families able to afford an education. As Ainsworth and Koda say:

"The factors affecting parents’ demand for child schooling will include measures of the costs and benefits of schooling in both the current and future periods, as well as measures of the household’s own budget constraints. Specifically, these include:

- The intrinsic value that parents place on an ‘education’
- The expected long-run benefits of schooling...
- The current value of the child’s time in productive activities inside and outside the home..."
• The other costs of schooling, including school fees, the costs of other schooling inputs and the availability of schools...
• The quality of schooling available...
• The household’s current income and its ability to borrow for school expenses against future earnings” (1993:2).

Some of these factors relate to the discussion above on wanting an education; the desire for schooling may be low given a pessimistic view of the possible long-run benefits of education to children less likely to survive into productive adulthood. But most of these factors relate directly to the ability to pay for education. This includes a number of issues:

a. the direct loss of family income due to AIDS, from:

• the illness and death of productive members of the family

“Another pupil reported that her mother was having trouble paying for her to go to school because her mother’s only source of income was through the sale of pawpaws from their garden. The money was used to buy soap, paraffin, salt and so on. She mentioned that when she needed a pen or a book to take to school, it sometimes took her mother two to three days to buy it and during that time, she had to stay at home... So, with the kind of situation prevailing in the families in Lyantonde, most families seemed to have decided to postpone education not by choice but because of the prevailing circumstances. It is a choice between education and satisfying basic needs like food, clothes, etc.” (Katahoire, 1993:94,96).

Considerable anecdotal information (see UNICEF, 1991; Mukoyogo, et al) describes how one- or two-parent orphans often are forced to leave school because of a loss of ability to pay fees and other costs (books, uniforms, etc.). Research in Uganda described how orphans came to “school in dirty and unironed school uniforms. The response given by most pupils when asked why they were dirty was that they were only allowed to wash their uniforms once a week because there was not enough soap to wash [them more often]” (Katahoire, 1993:97). Although recent research in Tanzania indicates little relationship between orphanhood status and enrolment, perhaps due to the effective targeting of orphans by a myriad of public and private agencies, there is also evidence that orphans not receiving such assistance did have low enrolment rates (Ainsworth and Koda, 1993; World Bank and the University of Dar es Salaam, 1993);

• the loss of income due to expenditures on treatment, care and funeral costs

One World Bank study showed that affected households in 1991 spent roughly $60 per year (equivalent to rural per capita GDP) on such costs (World Bank, 1993:20);
b. **the expansion of extended families**, with many more children of school age in a family often led by less productive adults (grandparents) or teenage children. In such families, there may not be enough money to cover fees and other schooling costs of all the children; and

c. **the loss of the traditional economic safety net** of extended family and community, a net stretched even further in many places because of migration, population pressure, infestation, drought and war.

4. A further impact of AIDS on demand may be that **fewer children are able to complete their education**. As discussed above, much of this may be because of financial constraints, but there are several other factors which are also important in this regard. They include:

a. **illness in school**. Even if some HIV-infected children and those ill with AIDS live to enter primary school, the increasingly debilitating episodes of HIV-related illness (perhaps up to 6 episodes prior to death) (World Bank, 1992:xxvii) will likely make it difficult for them to complete schooling. Even otherwise healthy children in an AIDS-affected family may pay a price in terms of ill-health. "The household’s attempt to cope with the death or ill-health of an adult may shift household labour away from health maintaining activities such as cleaning, collecting water, hygienic food preparation and breastfeeding" (Feachem, 1991; Panos Institute, 1992:56).

Illness may also affect enrolment at higher levels of the system. Some of those students already sexually active at these levels (late primary school, secondary school and tertiary education) will become infected and be unable to continue their education. One very preliminary study indicates that at least 25 per cent of university students in Kenya may be HIV positive with perhaps even higher rates (up to 50 per cent) in several other African countries (Mburugu, 1993); these rates will eventually result in student illness, disability, absenteeism and the abandonment of school;

b. **the need for children to work and to care for ill adults**, to substitute their labour for others in the family who are ill or have died — a mechanism of the household to cope with a major impact of the presence of AIDS. Such activities lead to absenteeism which may be regular (every market day) or seasonal (to help with planting, weeding and harvesting). Preliminary results of a study in Tanzania showed that the death of an adult female in the previous 12 months is associated with lower enrolment possibilities for both girls and boys, probably because of their substituting for female labour such as fetching firewood and collecting water (Ainsworth and Koda, 1993);

c. **trauma related to the illness and death of family members**, leading to difficulty in concentrating in class and in acquiring the skills and knowledge offered in school;
d. **the ostracism, discrimination and stigma** suffered by children in schools and classrooms due to infection or to membership in a family with HIV infection and AIDS deaths. As one ward officer in Rakai District said, “people look at AIDS victims with a negative eye. They treat them as promiscuous people and prostitutes. And these attitudes transcend to school pupils who use them to tease their fellow orphans” (Katabaro, 1993:65). A Rakai primary 5 pupil “explained that some of her friends no longer played with her and instead pointed fingers at her saying that she might also have AIDS because her father died of AIDS. She said she felt bad and sometimes she cried. She could not share anything with other pupils and she no longer had money to buy her own snacks as before and her fellow pupils gave her nothing” (Katahoire, 1993:69);

e. **the lower motivation provided by an extended family**, perhaps caused both by the lower level of education possessed by guardian grandparents (or their lower level of awareness as to the possible usefulness of education) and by the relative lack of attention, affection and guidance provided by heads of households to orphans in such families. A 1989 study quoted by Katahoire showed that 43 per cent of the guardians of orphans in Rakai District in Uganda were over 50 years old and 25 per cent were over 60 years (1993:3). Further anecdotal information in Uganda indicates that “since orphans from grandparent families are not disciplined enough to accept and respect school authority, they were more likely to drop out of school” (Barnett and Blaikie, 1992:120). And research in Tanzania has shown that the odds of enrolment in school for children of the head of the household are almost twice as high as for other children in the household (Ainsworth and Koda, 1993:11). It may also be that, as in one region of Uganda, orphans not only appear to die earlier and have higher mortality rates than other children but also “may be overworked by relatives or other guardians who consciously or unconsciously view them as a burden. Lack of supervision, proper caretaking and school or vocational activities leads to poor socialization, alienation from guardians and the community and possible delinquency. Guardians predict reduced opportunities for orphans, who remain uneducated, untrained and unemployable...” (Hunter, 1990:686);

f. **the uprooting of people from family and community**, either because of the migration (often forced) of widows and their children to other parts of the country or because of complete orphanhood, which might lead to status as abandoned, exploited and largely unschooled ‘street children’; and

g. **the earlier marriage of girls** and therefore their dropping out of school. This can occur for several reasons: because they are pushed out (or seek to escape) from overcrowded extended families; because men seek younger and presumably uninfected, wives (Barnett and Blaikie, 1992:45; African Development Bank Group, 1993b); and
because parents seek to preserve their daughters by arranging an early marriage to a ‘reliable’ partner (van de Walle, 1990).

This issue raises a crucial point: that the aggregated impact of HIV and AIDS on educational demand will likely affect the education of girls more than boys, thus affecting in turn the gains made in female education over the last decade. Girls will likely be taken out of school sooner than boys when fees cannot be paid, when ill or orphaned siblings and relatives need to be cared for, perhaps also when many kinds of productive labour must be done and when the prospect of early marriage becomes possible.

5. There are two other areas where the presence of HIV/AIDS may have an impact on educational demand: early childhood education and higher education.

a. In the first case, the demand for early childhood care and education may increase. As more and more extended families are formed and as more and more traditional child-minders (older girls, grandparents) are needed for more productive labour, the need for some kind of care of young infants will grow. If the demand is not met, the care and health of these younger children may suffer.

b. In addition, the presence of HIV/AIDS may have a special impact on higher education, beyond the issues discussed above relating to the illness of university students, the lower rate of return to higher education, the increasing inability of students to pay for such education and the need for university students to provide income for affected families. There may also be a lowering of demand for overseas study and fewer qualified candidates to fill the available slots. In the area of higher education for the military, for example, in “one central African country, 35 per cent of officers applying for US military training are HIV-seropositive and in several countries commanders are finding it difficult to identify uninfected trainees” (Yeager and Miller, 1993:15).

There is also an increasing rejection of HIV-infected applicants by sponsoring agencies and host countries, from both fear of HIV transmission and concern for the costs of care in the receiving country. This may be accompanied by reluctance of the sending country to ‘waste’ investment on infected students. One major provider of overseas fellowships has already noticed an increasing number of candidates from heavily affected countries rejected by its immigration office ‘for medical reasons’ (presumably seropositivity), is making plans for encouraging longer lists of alternate candidates and is concerned over how much funding can be provided in the country of study for medical treatment and/or the repatriation of students with AIDS (personal communication). Another has recommended that all students selected for study abroad be tested for HIV as part of the selection process and that those who test positive should not be allowed to begin their study (personal communication).
B. The supply of education

It is ironic at least — and gruesome as well — that the likely lowering of demand for education in areas heavily affected by HIV/AIDS may well be matched by a lessening of supply; fewer pupils in school, in other words, may not result in gross unemployment of teachers because the cadre of teachers may also be severely affected by HIV and AIDS. This is one of many ways in which supply may be affected, ranging from the obvious (the death of teachers, the closing of schools) to the less so (a reduction of budget for the education system as a whole and for individual schools).

1. Though little evidence is now available concerning this issue, it seems likely that an absolute or relative decrease in the number of pupils — either through lower initial enrolment or through higher drop-out or non-continuation rates — will lead to a similar decrease in the number of classes and schools. Fewer students in the system and lower demand for places in education programmes, in other words, may lead to a smaller supply of facilities and places. Schools that have enrolments below a certain minimum may therefore be closed and their remaining pupils moved to other schools; more complex solutions, such as the introduction of multi-grade teaching, might tax both the finances and flexibility of affected school systems.

2. Even if facilities continue to be available, there may be a lack of teachers and other personnel (principals, supervisors and inspectors, higher level managers) to maintain previous levels of service, in terms of either quantity or quality. Among such people absenteeism from work will result from illness, attending funerals and caring for the ill. A study about the impact of HIV/AIDS on African universities, for example, has very preliminary estimates that 14 percent of the members of the academic staff of Kenyan universities may be infected, with perhaps twice that percentage in other countries in the region (Mburugu, 1993). This, along with the estimate that, on the average, adults suffer approximately 17 HIV-related illnesses prior to death (World Bank, 1992:xxvii), may seriously affect attendance and the regularity of teaching.

Teachers and other personnel who are infected may try to transfer to another area or, once visibly ill, ‘abscond’ and disappear (Katahoire, 1993). Others may also want to transfer out of heavily affected areas or refuse to be posted to them, thereby decreasing considerably the supply of education available. This apparently has been the case with health workers in at least one heavily affected district of Tanzania (World Bank and the University of
Dar es Salaam, 1993) but does not seem to be the case yet with teachers in the same district (World Bank, 1992:69). In Uganda it has been reported that female teachers are reluctant to go to the Rakai District because once a potential husband finds that she has worked in that area, her chances of getting married would be reduced (Katahoire, 1993:75). In areas where general poverty and AIDS have led to lower community contributions to school (and thus to the supplementing of teacher salaries), teachers may also move to seek higher income elsewhere.

And teachers, perhaps especially because of their somewhat elite and mobile status, will die. One primary school studied in Uganda reported 10 AIDS-related deaths in the last several years (Katahoire, 1993:71). The World Bank study in Tanzania estimates that some 14,460 teachers will die by the year 2010 and 27,000 by 2020; the approximate cost of training replacement teachers will be US$ 37.8 million (World Bank, 1992:69) — an amount the Tanzanian government can ill afford. An estimate in Uganda speaks of 2200 teachers suffering or dying from AIDS between 1993 and 1996, with a cost of replacement of 1.1 billion Uganda shillings or US$ 1 million (Along-Atwoki, 1993).

At the level of managers and planners in the system, another kind of impact may occur. Assuming that the current generation of such individuals is fairly-well trained (better at least than the generation before), their illness, absenteeism and death, the resulting turnover of personnel will signal a loss of considerable competence and erode the system's capacity to plan, manage and implement educational policies and programmes, both routine and innovative, that are meant to maintain and even increase the supply and quality of education. The impact will likely be especially significant in resource-poor environments.

3. As mentioned above, the supply of education will also be affected by issues of finance. Enrolment will be less but so will be the number of financial supporters of the system whose contributions are essential for such things as chalk, books, school maintenance and supplementary allowances for teachers. Also, because the population as a whole will grow more slowly and will get younger, there may be less money available to maintain current levels of investment. Thus, the absolute investment in education may be less than anticipated. While the per capita investment may remain the same, there will likely not be any further qualitative improvement of the system (World Bank, 1992:68). One reason is simply the amount of money that may need to be spent on health-related costs of personnel: treatment and care, insurance, death benefits, etc. Other costs, for training and then paying the replacements for affected personnel (some of whom may also still be on the payroll), may also be considerable as may be the expense of implementing an effective AIDS education programme.

Another financial problem is that the Ministry of Education itself may be provided an ever smaller piece of the national budget. As demand increases for funds to sectors more clearly associated with the epidemic or more visibly
affected by sit (the Ministry of Health) or able to argue more strongly about potential impact (such as the Ministry of Defense), the Ministry of Education’s slice of the total pie, which may already be reduced in size due to lower national productivity and product, may grow smaller.

C. The process of education

The ‘numbers’ of education will clearly change as a result of HIV and AIDS. And its ‘tone’ will also change. The social interactions and educational processes which make it work will inevitably be coloured in some way by the epidemic.

Those in class who are infected or ill, or even members of affected families — both teachers and pupils — may face discrimination, ostracism and isolation. Teachers may face the suspension of social and health benefits and/or dismissal from the system. Pupils may face formal suspension by the system or be pressured to leave school ‘voluntarily’. The supposedly free and open nature of school and classroom relationships may end up being governed by suspicion and fear. In itself, this will necessarily affect the teaching-learning process, an impact exacerbated by the greater randomness of teaching and learning due to higher rates of absenteeism of both teachers and pupils.

An added complication to the process of education is the frequency in some societies of sexual relations, voluntary or otherwise, among students and between teachers and students (see Caldwell et al, 1989). One study of primary pupils in Uganda reported that 11 per cent of the female respondents said that they had been forced into having sex (Bagarukayo et al, n.d.:23). “Some male secondary teachers stated that sex is one of the fringe benefits of a poorly paid profession” (Schoepf, 1988; Panos Institute, 1992:16). Rape and the sexual abuse of girl students by male students and teachers is not uncommon; the latter is often in exchange for fees or various academic rewards (UNDP, n.d.b).

“A young girl who is forced to have a sugar daddy in order to go to school does not have any chance to decide when she wants safe sex. She has no control over the risks. In Kampala’s slums, sixteen years old have prostituted themselves to get the money for school fees... [In Mozambique] girls write to the newspapers’ letters pages on what it costs in sex with the teacher or school head to get a good certificate in different subjects... a girl cannot be a virgin and at the same time get a good certificate in school” (Berman and Asbrink, 1992).

Thus, while schools should be considered ‘sanctuaries’, they are often instead the site of non-consensual sexual activities and HIV infection. This can lead to difficult relationships between the school and the community. “An example was given in one of the schools that male teachers from that school were being accused by members of the surrounding community of spoiling their girls and spreading AIDS amongst school girls to cause a conflict between the school teachers and parents. As a result, two of the teachers and the head teacher of the school were dismissed... This created a climate of mistrust between the community and the school” (Katahoire, 1993:93).
In some areas this has led to more stringent laws against sexual abuse and school regulations that prohibit or discourage out-of-school contact between teachers and students. Once such rules are put in place, as has occurred in schools studied in both Uganda and Zimbabwe, a more formal, but also a stronger relationship within schools and between the school and the community may be created. As one report from Zimbabwe indicates, “teachers now visit the community freely without fear of being mugged. Both teachers and household heads attributed this improved relationship to the HIV/AIDS pandemic. In fact, one headmaster noted that the disease has brought the community and school closer as they now had a common enemy: HIV/AIDS” (Chakaza, 1993:72).

D. The quality and quantity of education

In summary, the net result of these various kinds of impact on the demand, supply and process of education may be a loss both of financial and human resources (and thus the quantity of education) and of efficiency and effectiveness (and thus the quality of education). Relatively fewer pupils, students and adult learners may seek an education; those that do, may be faced with fewer available places, a more ‘random’ sequence of teaching and learning and fewer teachers. And those teachers that remain in the system may be less experienced and less well-trained and supervised by fewer inspectors. A study of one secondary school in Rakai District of Uganda showed that while in 1989 81 per cent of its teachers (out of 22) were qualified with Grade II teaching certificates, by 1993 the figure was 36 per cent (out of 11). A much larger percent were also temporary rather than permanent employees and whereas in 1989 16 out of 22 had six years or more of experience, in 1993 only 1 out of 11 had such experience (Katahoire, 1993:75-6). The ‘work place’ of the school itself may also be affected by the psychological effects of having infection, illness and death in its midst. In general, individual schools, especially in heavily affected areas and the system as a whole may have fewer resources from families, communities and government to maintain, improve and expand their services.
IV

Impact on the education system: how it responds to HIV/AIDS

"Pressure is... building on educational services. Schools are competing for dwindling public funds, while HIV is slowly eroding their private financial base. As increasing numbers of families have their structure undermined by the impact of HIV, more and more children will leave school — either because their parent or guardian can no longer afford the fees or because they must stay at home to work. Girls are the most likely to leave school first. What money is spent is likely to go to educate male children. Once a family begins to rely on a child’s labour, it is highly unlikely he or she will ever return to school" (Bailey, 1992:670).

More generally and over the longer-term, the education system itself will necessarily be affected as it tries to respond to and cope with, the more immediate, more micro-level pressures of HIV/AIDS on educational demand, supply, processes and quality. This will include the system’s need to broaden its educational and social objectives, make more flexible its operations and strategies, alter the kinds of knowledge and skills it transmits and develop more systematic plans, flexible mechanisms and farsighted personnel for managing and financing the system. Such a response should be framed with whatever national AIDS prevention and control programme exists but should lead to a sectoral/ministerial action plan which includes clear internal personnel policies in regard to HIV/AIDS, strategies for the prevention of further HIV transmission within and through the education sector and systematic school health policies, curriculum guidelines and teacher training programmes.

A. The clients and roles of the system

1. ‘Special’ clients and needs

A “Ugandan study which traced 460 5-15 years old, children of 150 people who had died of AIDS, found high levels of deprivation. Seventy per cent had neither mother nor father. More than one in three had been abandoned or were in institutions; almost two in three had left school as a result of lack of fees; more than two in three were ‘virtually’ naked and malnourished; one in 30 had been sexually abused; and two in five showed signs of psychological disorder” (Panos Institute, 1992:58).

As the profile of the education system’s clients and their needs changes due to the presence of HIV/AIDS, so, too, must its objectives. The special clients — not necessarily completely new in nature, but in larger numbers — are several (and not mutually exclusive). They include:
a. non-enrollees — children who have never entered school, some because of infection and illness, others for economic reasons;
b. frequently absent students — children whose education is even more random than usual;
c. drop-outs — children who have left school before attaining at least some minimum of literacy, numeracy and ‘life skills’;
d. working children and street children — those not in school, some working full-time and many living outside of any home environment;
e. orphans — of one or both parents, living either in an extended or adopted family, in an orphanage, or in the streets and likely facing special problems of ill-health, psychological trauma and social stigma; and
f. girls — who likely make up more than their proper percentage of the above categories, with particular needs in terms of knowledge and skills.

2. New roles and programmes for the school

In addition to facing a different set of clients, the school and its personnel may also need to take on new roles. Some of these will appear within the school itself. Even at the primary level, as more and more of its pupils drop out of school or are unable to continue to a higher level, schools may need to pay greater attention, earlier in the curriculum or outside of class hours, to work-related technical and vocational training, including home economics, agriculture, art and crafts and woodwork — changes already appearing in primary schools recently studied in the Rakai District of Uganda (Katahoire, 1993). This may include school projects more directly focused on income generation both for the school itself, more and more strapped for funds and for the community.

School staff may also find themselves devoting much more time and energy to counselling — a skill few teachers, especially at the primary level, now possess. Part of counselling relates to the psychological trauma arising from the disease. Another part involves advising school children about how to stay in school. In one Ugandan project focusing on school girls, the advice is simple: “We tell them they should look after themselves as individuals and important people. They should not look at boys as their future. They should stick to their education and forget about sex” (Barnett and Blaikie, 1992:164).

One particularly interesting peer programme in this area is the Anti-AIDS Clubs found in various countries, most notably in Zambia. Such clubs, established largely in secondary schools, encourage youth to sign pledges to avoid sex before marriage, to spread information about AIDS to peers and family members and to accept and actively care for those affected (Panos, 1989). Such concerns may extend to the school trying consciously to become a sanctuary, a safe haven, both from the fear and stigma associated with AIDS and from the risk of HIV transmission.

As the social service institution which, in most countries, penetrates farthest down the system and farthest out to the periphery, the school may also find itself with an expanded role as a multi-purpose development and welfare agency. Its responsibil-
ties may go beyond the usual educational ones to include, for example, the enumeration of widows and orphans, the management of welfare (food, shelter, health care) for them and for guardians of orphans, even the delivery of whatever medicines and treatment might be available. The school may also need to become more an advocate of sex education, through PTAs and local leaders, trying to convince the community (e.g. with information about mortality rates and pregnancy rates) about its usefulness.

The issue of orphans is a particularly complex one. A variety of programmes for orphans in heavily affected parts of the world have now been introduced. Though they vary in detail, they generally provide funding either to the foster families or relatives who have adopted orphans or directly to the orphans — for example, for school fees and uniforms. These programmes can also include income-generating projects and organised day-care centres or nurseries so that older orphans need not spend all of their time caring for younger relatives. One review of survivor assistance programmes in the Kagera region of Tanzania described 11 different activities operating in this region (World Bank and the University of Dar es Salaam, 1993).

Such programmes, seemingly so useful and necessary in the face of AIDS, are, in fact, quite controversial (World Bank, 1992; Bailey, 1992; Ainsworth and Rwegerulira, 1992). This arises from several factors:

- ethical issues, because of the focusing of so much attention and resources on a population which may not, in fact, be the neediest in a given area, either economically or in terms of low enrolment rates in school;

- stigmatization, because of the association of selected individuals with HIV infection, illness and death;

- dependency, because of how families and communities with many orphans may learn to wait for outside assistance rather than attempting to handle the problem themselves; and

- ineffectiveness, because of the inability of school fees and uniforms to make much difference if the needs of orphans and their guardians are desperate.

What appears important in these kinds of programmes is to have both a clear targeting strategy, preferably focused not only on AIDS survivors but also on needy families generally and on the schools which serve them and a clearer method to assess programme effectiveness. Also important is to work through local organizations and attempt to involve the entire community in the resulting programmes (including income generation for both affected families and the community as a whole, assistance to guardians, vocational training, family counselling) rather than to develop isolated institutions or discrete packages focused on small parts of the population. The role of the school in such programmes is obviously critical.
B. Operations of the system

The problem is that school systems, especially in quite heavily affected areas, may have a lack of financial and human resources — and energy and creativity — to develop the innovative programmes needed to address the new clients and their needs and the new roles of the school which the presence of AIDS may require. Large bureaucracies such as ministries of education (and perhaps especially ministries of education) often find it difficult to innovate in the best of times due to the sheer size of the education system, logistical problems and the nature of bureaucratic culture; innovating at a time of financial crisis and in the context of a challenge as complex as HIV/AIDS will be even more difficult. Management of the education system at such a time will require particular flexibility and imagination in order to develop and operate programmes designed to cope with the impact of the epidemic.

Thus, in order to enable schools to respond efficiently and effectively to different clients and their needs and to assume new roles, the education system itself must change. It must learn to operate in different ways, to develop specific strategies for the new challenges it faces and, in general, to become more non-formal and flexible in nature. Such ‘non-formalizing’ of the formal system requires an ability to adapt usually uniform, standard aspects of the system to a great variety of contexts and needs. These aspects include:

1. school and classroom size — how to adapt to relatively smaller intakes and lower enrolment of pupils and still maintain viable schools and classrooms, especially at a time when teachers may also be in short supply. Multi-grade classrooms and alternate-year intakes of new pupils may help in this regard;

2. entry age of pupils — how to provide education for children with a greater range of age, perhaps sitting in the same classroom;

3. school calendars and timetables — how to adjust these to the particular needs of local families and communities affected by HIV/AIDS so that pupils may, for example, take time off in order to care for ill relatives or assist their families in economic activities (e.g. one day off a week to take part in local markets), or so that the frequency of funerals does not disrupt the school schedule by assigning one teacher to represent the school at local funerals;

4. venue of schooling — how to provide education, especially at the secondary level, closer to where children must be. “Special strategies are needed for children who never attend school and are, thus, even more at risk. They can be approached through youth groups, in the streets, or in the fields or factories where they work — anywhere where contact is possible and trust can be established” (Bailey, 1992:674); and

5. closer links between the formal and non-formal systems — so that children can more easily move out of school and into more flexible education programmes and then back to school as conditions permit.
C. Content and methods of education

In more concrete ways, the education system must also adapt to the impact of HIV and AIDS by altering the content — knowledge, skills and values — of what it teaches and the methods it uses for teaching.

As described earlier in this paper, an education system in a society affected by AIDS must be able to teach knowledge of quite a different kind from that traditionally taught in most countries of the world. This includes information concerning:

1. the body and its functions. “HIV prevention requires that children learn about their bodies before puberty begins. Girls, especially, need to understand the relationship between sex and power, to see what forces drive adult behaviour, to strengthen self-esteem and to be assured of their right to make sexual decisions” (Bailey, 1992:674);
2. reproductive health and sexually transmitted diseases;
3. the transmission of HIV, the prevention of infection and the nature of the disease — in other words, how to stay HIV-negative;
4. the care and treatment of people with AIDS; and
5. human rights issues related to HIV and AIDS.

Also, for medical students higher up in the system — doctors, dentists, nurses and other health care workers — more information concerning AIDS (its epidemiology, transmission, care and treatment) and the social and cultural aspects of health must also be provided.

New skills may also need to be taught. Very practical skills related to work and income generation are especially important as are life skills related to behavioural choices, resistance to harmful and negative behaviour and the negotiation of relations with others. These, too, are especially important to girls as those most often at a disadvantage in terms of personal security, economic independence and relations with those who have power over them. “If the prevention needs of women are ultimately to be met, efforts must be made to reduce their socio-economic vulnerability. Women need support to attain the necessary economic independence, through basic education, other training and the creation of employment opportunities without which they remain vulnerable to discrimination” (African Development Bank Group, 1993c:3). Greater access to information and more training in income generating skills may help redress some of this imbalance.

New attitudes and values related both to responsible, low-risk sexual behaviour and to human rights issues and tolerance need also to be taught. Attitudes concerning respect for girls and women and more equal partnerships between and moral standards for, men and women must also be encouraged. These can include issues related to the treatment of widows, land and inheritance rights of women and female circumcision. There is a need as well to develop both “creative ways to challenge stereotypes and education programmes which change expectations of the ways women and men, girls and boys, behave towards one another” (Hausermann, 1990:76).

Given the new issues that need to be dealt with in any discussion of HIV and AIDS and given the greater number of client types to be reached and the variety of their needs,
teachers and other personnel of the education system who are in the front line will need particularly effective pre-service and in-service training programmes. These will need to focus on necessary knowledge about the epidemic, skills in dealing with the new clients of the system and attitudes of tolerance and compassion.

Such knowledge, skills and attitudes cannot easily be taught using traditional methods of training. The teachers themselves, some of whom may be considerably younger and less experienced than the cadre of ill and dead teachers they are replacing, must be trained in these new issues. This includes first gaining the confidence and skills which might make it easier to talk about the often difficult topics relating to AIDS. One study in Uganda, for example, showed that in one district 69 per cent of primary school teachers felt little confidence in teaching about AIDS (Bagarukayo et al., n.d.:7). Relatively inexperienced teachers may be helped in this regard through better teacher guides, more in-service support and training and more senior and experienced ‘mentors’ (World Bank, 1992:69).

D. Planning and management of the system

“Even if all new transmissions were stopped tomorrow, there would still be a staggering number of AIDS cases, especially in Africa, with potentially profound implications for human resource development and economic growth. Thus, policy-makers must also concentrate on designing measures to mitigate the consequences of the epidemic, which will involve taking stock of the potential magnitude of the epidemic as it affects various economic sectors. Since AIDS is no longer solely a health issue, ministries across the board should be involved in both planning interventions to mitigate the consequences... and disseminating preventive messages... Local communities and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) must also be enlisted” (Armstrong, 1991:17).

“... assumptions about the continuity and stability of the decision environment rests on a bounded rationality and a view of the universe of crisis events which assumes that the general features of hazard impact are understood, coded and therefore manageable. However, in the case of the AIDS epidemic, the bounded rationality derived from past experience of drought, famine, war and social and economic disasters... does not provide adequate guidance for coping mechanisms either for people in small rural communities or for officials responsible for government policy. New processes of understanding and of responding to a new type of hazard are required” (Barnett and Blaikie, 1992:40).

Putting together the sector’s response to HIV/AIDS — ensuring that the needs of new clients are addressed, that schools are able to take on new and necessary roles, that the system can be adequately ‘non-formalized’ and that new content and methods can be internalized by the system and the teachers within it — will necessarily have an impact on the planning and management of the system as a whole. Two things are important in this regard:
1. that the Ministry of Education understands that AIDS is more than merely a health problem, to be solved through preventive education and that it is affecting, or will affect, its daily work; and

2. that the Ministry learns to plan with greater foresight, not for the routine but for the unexpected. “Policy decisions must be made which anticipate future needs that may not yet be visible” (UNDP, n.d.a). Thus, the Ministry of Education will need to develop its own particular AIDS policies and action plans related to preventing HIV transmission, to adapting the system to the impact of HIV and AIDS on the quantity and quality of education and to coping with the consequences of those within the system who are infected and ill. This should include decisions concerning both administrative and professional policies related to HIV/AIDS and the extent of resources directed to the epidemic, especially in its early stages.

A very sincere, high-level official of the Ministry of Education in one heavily affected country once expressed the Ministry’s great concern for “helping the Ministry of Health solve its AIDS problem” (personal communication, author’s emphasis). Assuming this statement is characteristic of many officials, the first change in regards to the managing of the education system in the context of AIDS will be for such officials to see HIV and AIDS as their problem as well, particularly as it relates to the planning, management and financing of the system.

1. System planning

We can assume: (1) that HIV/AIDS will have considerable impact on some education systems, (2) that such impact will likely be quite different across different areas of the country and may nowhere, at least early in the epidemic, be easily and clearly visible (especially from the perspective of the central ministry) and (3) that this impact may arise unexpectedly and in unexpected ways. Under such assumptions, the planning mechanisms of the Ministry of Education will need to be able not only to understand what kind of impact is occurring in the system but also to anticipate and, perhaps more rapidly than usual, plan the responses required to such impact. This may affect several different planning operations:

a. data collection. Ministry officials interviewed in affected countries in Eastern Africa often had a vague idea of the presence of some of the above problems, but little understanding of their magnitude. “All of the officials interviewed (in one country) indicated that they were not aware of any changes in interactions among teachers, among pupils and between pupils and teachers. Neither were they aware of any discrimination in regard to teachers and pupils affected by AIDS. They pointed out that the district offices had not kept them informed as to whether these changes were there or not” (Katahoire, 1993:108). In order to overcome such a lack of awareness, Ministry management information systems will need to identify what kinds of data are required in order to take stock of, understand and plan for the impact of HIV/AIDS. This might include data on AIDS survivors, especially orphans (by age, grade level and gender); the absenteeism of both pupils and teachers (and the reasons for such absences); the transfer of teachers; classroom or
school closures; and community contributions to schools. Ministries will then need to collect these data if they are not already available, either through routine and regular questionnaires or through special surveys.

Planners should also understand more clearly the kinds of coping mechanisms already put in place by affected schools and communities. In education, as it has been said in relation to agriculture, the “people's resourcefulness in the fact of a disaster such as AIDS has probably been underestimated. Without empirical data on how households actually cope in the circumstances, it is difficult to know what the outcome... will be. Governments and most of the planning information on which they rely, tend to overestimate the resources of poor rural producers but to underestimate their resourcefulness” (Barnett and Blaikie, 1992:131).

b. data analysis and projections. The data, once collected, will need to be analyzed in different ways (e.g. disaggregated to lower levels of the system, if this is not already done) in order to catch variations in impact across different parts of the country. They will also need to be analyzed more rapidly than usual. In many countries, routine statistics and the projections from them are analyzed and published only after considerable delay. Some of the impact of AIDS, however — such as an increase in drop-out rates and in requests for teacher transfers — may require more rapid action and therefore more rapid analysis in order to determine, for example, when and where to close classrooms and schools (or where to try to keep them open, or what to replace them with), when and how to replace academic streams with technical and vocational courses and which areas of the country are suffering the most from teacher shortages.

c. human resources planning. A particularly important task of educational planners, often shared with other ministries (such as labour), regards human resource planning — the assessment of how many people trained to various levels of education for various kinds of jobs will be required in a particular firm, sector, or country. Such planning was once considered a rather exact science but now is questioned because of the frequent difficulty of predicting developments in sectors and economies buffeted by the unexpected. But it still has a role to play in the gross determination of human resource needs.

The impact of HIV/AIDS will affect this determination in several ways. First, it will mean that individual firms, especially those whose employees represent particularly high-risk groups (e.g. in trucking, construction, mining and urban elite service sectors such as banking), will need to be better able to predict absences, illnesses and deaths in order to retrain remaining staff and recruit and train new staff.

Secondly, the planners of different sectors (health, agriculture, transport, defense) will need to be able to predict the human resource losses within those sectors. Education must be included here because it, too, will need to assess both: (1) how many teachers, principals and higher-level managers — at what levels of training and in what regions of the country — will likely need to be replaced and (2) what kind of
new or additional pre-service and/or in-service training programmes, in which training institutions, will need to be put in place.

But education as a sector may be doubly affected in terms of human resource planning, both because of the need to ensure an adequate complement of personnel in its own system and because of the role it often plays in training for other sectors. To the extent that the education system supports various kinds of technical and vocational training institutions — which often provide graduates both for more specialised industries and firms and for the semi-skilled informal labour market — it will need to be able to adapt the quantity and nature of such training to the impact of AIDS on other sectors.

In all of these various areas of planning, two issues are of particular importance. First, because “AIDS can be described as a long wave disaster... that is a long time in the making and in which the major effects have already begun to occur long before the magnitude of the crisis is recognized and any response is possible” (Barnett and Blaikie, 1992:56), there is the need for more anticipatory planning — the ability to look in data not only for the likely but also for the merely possible and even the unexpected — in order to see what is in the process of happening or what might happen.

Second, based on the assumptions that there will be considerable differences in the magnitude and type of AIDS impact in different parts of a country and that people closer to the reality of such impact will understand it better, there is a need for more participatory planning — the ability (and willingness) of Ministry personnel to encourage the involvement of more ‘partners’ in planning and to provide greater autonomy to lower levels of the system and to other actors in regard to the development of AIDS action programmes. This can be done through the greater decentralisation and devolution of planning processes down to lower levels of the system (the district, sub-district, school, teachers) and out to other actors (NGOs, parent groups, community associations). As a major world consultation of teachers’ international organizations concluded, “active involvement of teachers through their representative organizations in the development, implementation and evaluation of AIDS-related educational policies and activities will ensure appropriate programme conception and intervention” (IFFTU et al., 1990a:6).

2. **System management**

Two areas of seemingly routine system management are especially important in relation to the likely impact of HIV and AIDS: the management of personnel and the management of finances.

a. **Personnel management**

“At the level of the firm, measures need to be taken to confront the consequence of those already infected. The costs of caring for sick employees and the negative impact they have on output must at least be monitored and appropriately planned for in terms of projected employee benefits and output. For larger firms, an explicit company
policy on HIV/AIDS will assist employers make such projections. Company policy can also help to reduce discrimination especially before employees develop full-blown AIDS. Many still have important contributions to make and can benefit from a supportive work environment" (World Bank, 1991b:41).

Given the likely impact of HIV/AIDS on the personnel of the education system (both its direct impact through infection, illness and death and its indirect impact through the intrusion of the epidemic into the act of teaching and learning) and the nature of the epidemic itself with its overtones of sexual behaviour, immorality, intolerance and fear, the management of personnel within ministries of education may become particularly difficult. This is probably more the case in education than in other sectors; truck drivers and construction workers do not generally have the links with the community, nor the responsibility for children, which teachers have.

There are four areas of personnel management which are especially important (see IFFTU et al, 1990a,b). The first relates to the management of human rights issues. At a major consultation of international teachers’ organizations:

"delegates took note of the persistent occurrences of discrimination and social exclusion of HIV infected persons. With respect to teachers, such discrimination in the school setting frequently leads to isolation by colleagues and authorities and often to dismissal and suspension of social and health benefits... [Such a scenario] should be considered totally unacceptable and counterproductive to progress in the domain of AIDS education and prevention" (IFFTU et al, 1990b:3).

Teacher organizations and international fora of various kinds have strongly supported policies against job discrimination and compulsory testing for HIV infection and for the confidentiality of all medical histories and treatment. Unless there are clear, well-publicized and fully-supported policies about these issues in a Ministry of Education, they may tend to get neglected and lead to human rights abuses.

The second relates to the management of teachers infected with HIV or ill with AIDS. Here there are questions concerning access to counselling, the right to transfer to areas where medical care is available, alternative working arrangements for personnel unable to work at their original job and reintegration into work following episodes of illness.

The third relates to the continued availability of social security and other benefits. "HIV-infected teachers and other school staff members should not be discriminated against; they should have access to standard social security benefits and occupationally related benefits" (IFFTU et al, 1990a:5).

The fourth relates to the management of the system for the prevention of HIV transmission, both to protect the ministry’s investment in its human resources and to make the system a sanctuary against the epidemic. This involves not only pre-service and in-service education for personnel about AIDS but also policies designed to discourage high-risk behaviour. The latter might include both stronger sanctions and
sexual abuse laws against personnel who force sex upon colleagues and students and policies to assign married teachers to posts where they may live with, or close to, their spouses.

b. **Financial management**

The management of budgets, raising of funds and expenditure of resources may also be considerably complicated by the presence of AIDS. This is true at all levels of the system, from the school to the central ministry.

At the **school and community level**, as extended families grow larger, less income is earned and ever fewer resources must be spent to support more people and to pay for expenses related to illness and death, less money will be contributed by the community to the school. At the **system level**, less money may be available to the education system both absolutely (due to a shrinkage of the national product and government budget) and relatively (due to stronger claims made on the budget from other sectors).

More and more of this smaller budget may be needed for AIDS-related costs such as health care for those infected, death benefits and the recruitment and training of their replacements — and, perhaps, as incentives to ensure teachers remain in heavily affected areas. At the same time, more money might be required for the various new clients and new roles which the education system may be pushed to adopt — scholarships for orphans, training of teachers in guidance and counselling, new curricula in family life education, new school-based programmes in income generation. And the unequal distribution of the impact of the epidemic may require the often difficult re-allocation of funds across regions. Thus, the management of finances in a context both of less money and of a proliferation of tasks and roles will take special attention (UNDP and African Development Bank, 1993).

c. **Participation in management**

"When Mugaga, an AIDS orphan, could no longer afford his school fees, a local carpenter hired him as an apprentice. Today, Mugaga runs the shop, makes wooden doors and has two older boys as apprentices. In nearby villages, other surviving adults have set up day-care centres for orphans, started tailoring and bee-keeping programmes to generate income for widows and helped them plant fruit and vegetable gardens to feed their children" (Stackhouse, 1993:A6).

"Access to education and skills training is considered of prime importance in giving the orphans a decent start. The Kyabakuza AIDS Orphans Care group has registered 188 orphans of different ages. For the youngest ones they run a nursery. The group has managed to raise enough money to hire a teacher, so some of the children can receive primary education free of charge... the Kabagabo Technical Skills Development Centre offers training in masonry, carpentry, tool making and tailoring. The aim is to provide the orphans with employable skills to secure their future well-being" (Soveri, 1993:7).
If there is any 'positive' impact of HIV and AIDS on development, it may lie in the increased importance which will likely need to be given to the process of decentralization and community participation in the planning and management of the response to the epidemic. In general, in a system in crisis, the inclusion of more partners in the management and implementation of the system and the strengthening of these partnerships, especially at the level of greatest impact, may help hold it together. In this case, the necessary additional partners are those affected by AIDS, their families, teachers and the community at large. Thus, for example:

"The active involvement of teachers through their representative organizations in planning, implementing and evaluating (in cooperation with health, communication and social science experts) school health promotion programmes to deal with issues of AIDS and other sexually transmitted diseases (STD) is a necessity if knowledge is to be increased and risk behaviours reduced among young people. In addition, their involvement is critical in initiatives to combat ignorance and to prevent discrimination against both their colleagues and students who are HIV-infected" (IFFTU et al, 1990a:1)

Likewise, in some communities, parents and community groups, often in the absence of government action, have taken the initiative in raising funds and developing programmes in response to AIDS. Such "initiative helps to achieve sustainability of programmes; to instill awareness of the problem at stake; to identify target groups of beneficiaries; and to translate felt needs" (World Bank and University of Dar es Salaam, 1993:69).

"A striking example of community care and coping is provided by nine small christian communities in Kanwokya, a low-income suburb of Kampala, Uganda. Community members provide the first link between people with AIDS and the community, informing mobile AIDS teams of patients too ill to move and accompanying mobile teams to provide emotional and spiritual support... Members help people with AIDS by cooking food, preparing fields for cultivation, fetching firewood or water, cleaning homes and washing soiled linen... Wherever possible, the community places orphans with relatives and provides whatever material support they can" (African Development Bank Group, 1993c:12).

3. Inter-ministerial relations

A final necessary response of the Ministry of Education concerns its relationship with other sectors and ministries, at different levels of the system. At both the macro- and micro-levels, one issue is particularly important: the need for greater collaboration among different sectors, especially with health, labour and social welfare. The expertise of the Ministry of Health may be needed, for example, in the design and delivery of educational materials about the disease, its transmission and its treatment. Closer links may be needed with the Ministry of Labour in the collection and analysis of data related to human resource needs and development. And collaboration with ministries concerned with social welfare programmes of various
types may be thrust upon the Ministry of Education if its schools need to take on a larger role as a community development agency.

At the macro-level, another issue concerns the likely arguments among ministries over budget allocations and the need for the Minister of Education to be able to convince cabinet colleagues, faced with immediate problems such as skyrocketing health care costs and increasing seropositivity rates of army recruits, that continued and even increased investment in longer-term human resource development is essential (World Bank, 1992:xxxviii).
V

Implications of the impact of HIV/AIDS for training, research and donor programming

A. Training

The planners and managers of education systems in societies seriously affected by HIV/AIDS cannot work in traditional ways. Even in countries relatively unaffected (yet) by the epidemic, or where the impact is largely restricted to particular areas or population groups, the language, concerns and tasks of educators must change. There are new messages to be taught, new clients to be served, new roles to play. This is even more the case in heavily affected nations of the world—which are unfortunately usually those whose education systems are already stretched to their financial, infrastructural and creative limits in simply trying to achieve their primary task of teaching basic knowledge and skills.

In most of these societies, the training of educational planners and managers must also change. The magnitude of the actual and potential impact of HIV/AIDS on educational demand, supply, processes and quality and the complexity of the ways in which such impact relates to larger social, economic, cultural and political issues mean that the usual training of planners and managers designed to prepare them for the routine and the expected will not suffice. Rather, new knowledge, skills and attitudes must be transmitted. These include:

1. greater knowledge about the delicate, difficult issues of sexual behaviour, reproductive health and HIV transmission and about how these can more frankly be discussed in the education system;
2. greater awareness about the importance of human rights issues relating to confidentiality, discrimination and gender equality;
3. a clearer understanding of how HIV and AIDS have affected, or will affect, important areas of education such as the education of girls and women, teacher management, finance, governance and higher education;
4. greater knowledge about the range of policy and programme options available to respond to the impact of HIV/AIDS on the system;
5. anticipatory planning skills — the ability to identify, collect, analyze and speculate from available data and trends to future conditions and policy priorities; and
6. participatory planning and management skills — the willingness and ability to collaborate with a larger number of partners, at various levels of the system, in order better to confront the challenges presented by the epidemic.
B. Research

The nature of this epidemic also has implications for research. More research on the impact of HIV and AIDS — both on the development process in general and specifically on the sector of education — will be needed. This is true both in heavily affected societies, to determine the nature and models of impact that already exist and the factors which led to such impact and in those societies not yet (apparently) seriously affected, to anticipate what might be the nature and magnitude of future impact.

1. At the micro-level, research must be done both on what this impact actually looks like — what actually happens in schools, communities and families affected by HIV and AIDS in terms of educational demand, supply, processes and quality — and on the ways in which affected parties react to and cope with, such impact. What different decisions about education are being made? What factors in a given family, school, or community lead either to its collapse or to its coping with the impact? What actual coping mechanisms have been developed to deal with such impact? What conditions are required in order to ensure that such mechanisms succeed? Both richer anecdotal descriptions of individual areas, institutions and programmes and more systematic research, both qualitative and quantitative, on affected communities must be done.

2. At the macro-level, further research must be done on likely future scenarios for education systems related to the projected demand for different levels and kinds of education; the supply and quality of teachers, facilities and materials; and the costs both of the epidemic to the system and of the system’s response to the impact of the epidemic.

C. Programming of donors

In the light of such impact, donors must also make their response. Most generally, donors must consider their own policies in regard to HIV and AIDS, both internal to their agencies and in relation to their contact with systems and individuals affected by the epidemic. In other words, what kinds of policies should be established in relation to AIDS in the donor workplace and in regard to such issues as the testing of candidates for donor-funded scholarships in the donor country?

But there are other issues as well:

1. What kinds of questions about the impact of the epidemic should be more systematically asked of a Ministry with which further funding is being negotiated; for example:

a. What is known about the extent of the epidemic and its impact on education and on development? How aware is the central Ministry of the effects in individual schools and communities?
b. What is currently being done within the Ministry itself to respond to this impact? Does the Ministry have its own AIDS action plan, its own prevention and control programmes, its own set of non-discriminatory employment policies?

c. To what extent have the needs of especially affected groups been identified by the Ministry and addressed in new policies and programmes?

d. To what extent is the Ministry attempting to promote planning and management processes both more anticipatory and participatory in nature?

2. How might future donor activities in a given country have an impact on HIV/AIDS? This involves two issues:

a. the possible impact of donor-funded programmes on HIV transmission and the care and treatment of those affected by AIDS. In other sectors, for example, such impact is quite clear: better roads speed (and localize) the transmission of the virus; structural adjustment programmes might reduce funding available for health care (or, alternatively, could increase funding for primary health care). In education, for example, might locally-based or distance teacher training programmes (where teachers remain in their communities) reduce transmission compared to programmes which take trainees away from their families to larger metropolitan centres?

b. the possible impact of HIV/AIDS on the process and success of donor programmes. How sustainable, for example, are large-scale training programmes in specialized areas such as science teaching or vocational education if (say) 30 per cent of those trained die within five years of their training? How effective are special efforts to encourage girls to continue to secondary school (e.g. more female teachers as role models) if a host of AIDS-related factors are pushing or pulling them out of school?

In other words, how (if at all) should donors and recipients undertake an ‘AIDS impact assessment’ in regard future donor funding?

3. How has the presence of the epidemic affected the extent of external resources required by the Ministry of Education? In theory, the loss of skilled human resources from illness and death associated with AIDS should lead to even greater investment by the nation in education and training. But, unfortunately, this is often likely not to be the case. If national resources available for education diminish due to a more slowly growing economy and an increase in the share of resources going to other sectors such as health and defense, the demands on donors for additional funding in education may increase. To what extent can such demands be met?
4. And do donors (or the NGOs they may be able to support) have a particular comparative advantage in funding and helping to organize special programmes in response to HIV and AIDS, such as counselling, survivor assistance and the training and re-training of replacement personnel?
References


70


UNDP. (n.d.a.). The Challenge of the HIV Epidemic.

UNDP. (n.d.b.). Young Women: Silence, Susceptibility and the HIV Epidemic.


Annex 2

INTERNATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR EDUCATIONAL PLANNING
(established by UNESCO)
7-9, rue Eugène Delacroix, 75116 Paris

in co-operation with the
UNESCO EDUCATION SECTOR,
SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY and
INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT RESEARCH CENTRE

Experts’ seminar on
THE IMPACT OF HIV/AIDS ON EDUCATION
IIEP, 8-10 December 1993

Agenda

Wednesday, December 8

14:00-14:30 Opening and introduction
G. Carron  IIEP
Statement by Colin Power, ADG/ED, UNESCO

14:30-15:30 Chair: Christine McNab, SIDA
The impact of HIV/AIDS on education
S. Shaeffer  IDRC

15:30-16:00 Coffee

16:00-17:00 Discussion

17:00-18:00 Impact of HIV/AIDS at the micro-level in East Africa
K. Kinyanjui  IDRC

18:00 Cocktail

.../contd.
Thursday, December 9

09:00-11:00 Chair: Andri Isaksson, UNESCO

Impact of HIV/AIDS on schools in Northwest Tanzania: some preliminary evidence

M. Ainsworth World Bank

11:00-11:30 Coffee

11:30-13:00 Current research and new speculation:

G. Goodale ILO
E. Reid UNDP
C. McNab SIDA
S. Bahri UNESCO
V. Barnes USAID
P. Aggleton WHO

13:00-14:30 Lunch

14:30-16:00 Chair: Sheldon Shaeffer, IDRC

Panel discussion: policy-making and planning in education in response to HIV/AIDS

C. Olong-Atwoki Uganda
M. Aoko Kenya
Kasama V. Thailand
M. Nkamba Zambia

16:00-16:30 Coffee

16:30-18:00 Panel discussion continued

Friday, December 10

09:30-11:00 Chair: Monica Aoko, Kenya

Panel presentations: research on the impact of HIV/AIDS on education

J.K. Katabaro Tanzania
E. Mburugu Kenya
S. Chowdury India
B. Rico Mexico

11:00-11:30 Coffee

11:30-13:00 Small group work

1. Research issues, priorities, training and activities
2. Implications for planning and programming in education

13:00-14:30 Lunch

14:30-16:00 Chair: Gabriel Carron, IIEP

Group reports

16:00-16:30 Conclusions and closing
INTERNATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR EDUCATIONAL PLANNING
(established by UNESCO)
7-9, rue Eugène Delacroix, 75116 Paris

in co-operation with the
UNESCO EDUCATION SECTOR,
SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY and
INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT RESEARCH CENTRE

Experts’ seminar on the
THE IMPACT OF HIV/AIDS ON EDUCATION
IIEP, 8-10 December 1993

Developing world participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position/Institution</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Phone/Ext</th>
<th>Fax</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>Shankar CHOWDURY</td>
<td>AIDS Cell</td>
<td>All India Institute of Medical Sciences</td>
<td>c/o UNESCO Delhi: 91 - 11 - 67 73 10</td>
<td>c/o UNESCO Delhi: 91 - 11 - 687 3351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Treasury Building, Room 710</td>
<td>254 - 2 - 502 357 (home)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P.O. Box 56445</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>NAIROBI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Edward MBURUGU</td>
<td>Department of Sociology</td>
<td>University of Nairobi</td>
<td>254 - 2 - 712 259</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P.O. Box 30197</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>NAIROBI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Blanca RICO</td>
<td>Director of Documentation and Communication</td>
<td>CONASIDA</td>
<td>52 - 5 - 554 9333 / 554 4996</td>
<td>52 - 5 - 554 4202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Comercio y Administracion #35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Col. Copilco Universidad</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>04360 MEXICO D.F.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Fax:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tanzania  J.K. KATABARO
Dept. of Educ. Psychology Faculty of Education
University of Dar es Salaam
P.O. Box 35048
DAR-ES-SALAAM
Tel:  255 - 51 - 43500 ext. 2305
Fax:  255 - 51 - 43023 or 43016 or 43132

Thailand  KASAMA Varavarn
Inspector General Ministry of Education
Rajdamnern Avenue
BANGKOK 3
Tel:  66 - 2 - 28 02 874
Fax:  66 - 2 - 28 28 6566

Uganda  Charles OLONG-ATWOKI
Assis. Commis. for Education Ministry of Education & Sports
Crested Tower
KAMPALA
Tel:  256 - 41 - 258 629 / 257 038
Fax:  256 - 41 - 244 394

Zambia  Mannasseh NKAMBA
Planning Division Ministry of Education
P.O. Box 50093
LUSAKA
Tel:  260 - 1 - 227 636
Fax:  260 - 1 - 222 396

Agency personnel

CIDA  Sylvia BARROW
Africa Branch 200, Promenade du Portage
HULL
Quebec K1A 0G4
Canada
Tel:  819 - 953 0732
Fax:  819 - 997 4762

Commonwealth Secretariat  Henry KALUBA
Education Department Human Resource Development Division
Marlborough House
Pall Mall
LONDON SW1Y 5HX
United Kingdom
Tel:  44 - 71 - 839 3411
Fax:  44 - 71 - 930 0827
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Phone</th>
<th>Fax</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DAE</td>
<td>Christopher SHAW</td>
<td>Executive Secretary</td>
<td>c/o IIEP/UNESCO</td>
<td>33-1-45 03 37 96</td>
<td>33-1-45 03 39 65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7-9, rue Eugène Delacroix</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>75116 PARIS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>France</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 33-1-45 03 37 96</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Fax: 33-1-45 03 39 65</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DANIDA</td>
<td>Inger BOESEN</td>
<td>Education Division</td>
<td>COPENHAGEN</td>
<td>45-33-92 00 00</td>
<td>45-31-54 05 33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Henrik TRYKKER</td>
<td>Medical Division</td>
<td>(as above)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDRC</td>
<td>Kabiru KINYANJUI</td>
<td>EARO</td>
<td>Box 62084</td>
<td>254-2-713 160/713 161</td>
<td>254-2-711 063</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sheldon SHAEFFER</td>
<td>Senior Scientist</td>
<td>Social Policy Program</td>
<td>1-613-236 6163, ext. 2016</td>
<td>1-613-567 7748</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Social Sciences Division</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Box 8500</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>OTTAWA K1G 3H9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 1-613-236 6163, ext. 2016</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Fax: 1-613-567 7748</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>Regional Education Adviser</td>
<td></td>
<td>19, Phra Atit Road</td>
<td>662-280-5931</td>
<td>662-280-3563</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Box 2-154</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10200 BANGKOK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 662-280-5931</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Fax: 662-280-3563</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IIEP</td>
<td>Gabriel CARRON</td>
<td>Senior Programme Coordinator</td>
<td>7-9, rue Eugène Delacroix</td>
<td>33-1-45 03 77 00</td>
<td>33-1-40 72 83 66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dramane OULAI</td>
<td>Research Fellow</td>
<td>(as above)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As of March 1, 1993:
ILO  Gretchen GOODALE  4, route des Morillons  
     SH-1121 GENEVA 22  
     Switzerland

NORAD  
Tor Erik GJERDE  
Senior Executive Officer  
Education Division  
Box 8142 Oslo Department  
0033 OSLO 1  
Norway  
Tel:  47 - 22 - 314 400  
Fax:  47 - 22 - 314 402

Einer HELLDAL  
Health Division  
(as above)  
Tel:  47 - 22 - 34 88 33  
Fax:  47 - 22 - 34 88 68

OECD  Elisabeth THIOLERON  
Administrator  
Aid Management Division  
2, rue André Pascal  
75775 PARIS  
France  
Tel:  33 - 1 - 4524 1979  
Fax:  33 - 1 - 4524 1623

SIDA  Christine McNAB  
Education Division  
Birger Jarlsgatan 61  
S-105 25 STOCKHOLM  
Sweden  
Tel:  46 - 8 - 728 5100  
Fax:  46 - 8 - 673 2141 / 612 4508

Izabella ERIKSSON  
Programme Officer  
(as above)

Inese ZALITAS  
AIDS Coordinator  
Division of Health  
(address as above)

UNDP  Elizabeth REID  
Director  
HIV & Development Programme  
304, East 45th Street  
FF - Room 986  
New York, NY 10017  
USA  
Tel:  1 - 212 - 906 6976  
Fax:  1 - 212 - 906 6336
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Tel</th>
<th>Fax</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>Andri ISAKSSON</td>
<td>Director, Division for the Renovation</td>
<td>Place de Fontenoy</td>
<td>33 - 1 - 4568 1165</td>
<td>33 - 1 - 4605 9405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Educational Curricula and Structures</td>
<td>75007 PARIS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Place de Fontenoy</td>
<td>33 - 1 - 4568 1622</td>
<td>33 - 1 - 4605 9405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>75007 PARIS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USAID</td>
<td>Victor BARNES</td>
<td>Deputy Chief</td>
<td>Institute of Education</td>
<td>44 - 71 - 580 1122</td>
<td>44 - 71 - 612 6632</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>HIV/AIDS Division</td>
<td>LONDON WC1H OAC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHO</td>
<td>Peter AGGLETON</td>
<td>Chief, Social and Behavioural Studies and</td>
<td>Office of Intervention, Development and</td>
<td>1 - 703 - 875 4636</td>
<td>1 - 703 - 875 4686</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Support Unit</td>
<td>Support GPA/World Health Organization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CH - 1211 GENEVA 27</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>41 - 22 - 791 2111</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>41 - 22 - 791 0746</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
World Bank  Martha AINSWORTH  
Economist Poverty & Human Resources Div.  

Policy Research Department  
1818 H Street, N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20433  
USA  
Tel:  1 - 202 - 473 4121  
Fax:  1 - 202 - 477 6391  

Observers  

Jean-François CARLE  
Aide et Action  
- 67, boulevard Soult  
75012 Paris  
Tel:  33 - 1 - 40 19 04 14  
Fax:  33 - 1 - 40 19 06 62  

Delphine FLOURY  
International Children’s Centre  
Château de Longchamp  
Bois de Boulogne  
75016 PARIS  
Tel:  33 - 1 - 4520 7992  
Fax:  33 - 1 - 4525 7367  

Norman MILLER  
Editor  
AIDS and Society  
4, West Wheelock Street  
Hanover, NH  
USA  
Tel:  1 - 802 - 649 5296  
Fax:  1 - 802 - 649 2331
More than 650 titles on all aspects of educational planning have been published by the International Institute for Educational Planning. A comprehensive catalogue, giving details of their availability, includes research reports, case studies, seminar documents, training materials, occasional papers and reference books in the following subject categories:

_Economics of education, costs and financing._

_Manpower and employment._

_Demographic studies._

_The location of schools (school map) and sub-national planning._

_Administration and management._

_Curriculum development and evaluation._

_Educational technology._

_Primary, secondary and higher education._

_Vocational and technical education._

_Non-formal, out-of-school, adult and rural education._

Copies of the catalogue may be obtained from the IIEP Publications Unit on request.
The International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP) is an international centre for advanced training and research in the field of educational planning. It was established by UNESCO in 1963 and is financed by UNESCO and by voluntary contributions from Member States. In recent years the following Member States have provided voluntary contributions to the Institute: Belgium, Canada, Denmark, Finland, Iceland, India, Ireland, Norway, Sweden, Switzerland and Venezuela.

The Institute's aim is to contribute to the development of education throughout the world, by expanding both knowledge and the supply of competent professionals in the field of educational planning. In this endeavour the Institute co-operates with interested training and research organizations in Member States. The Governing Board of the IIEP, which approves the Institute's programme and budget, consists of eight elected members and four members designated by the United Nations Organization and certain of its specialized agencies and institutes.

**Chairman:**
Victor L. Urquidi, (Mexico) Research Professor Emeritus, El Colegio de Mexico, Mexico.

**Designated Members:**
Arturo Núñez del Prado, Director, Latin American and the Caribbean Institute for Economic and Social Planning, Santiago.
Cristián Ossa, Director, Development Policy and Analysis Division, Department of Economic and Social Development, United Nations.
Visvanathan Rajagopalan, Vice-President and Special Adviser to the President, The World Bank.
Allan F. Salt, Director, Training Department, International Labour Office.

**Elected Members:**
Isao Amagi (Japan), Special Adviser to the Minister of Education, Science and Culture, Ministry of Education, Science and Culture, Tokyo.
Mohamed Dowidar (Egypt), Professor and President of the Department of Economics, Law Faculty, University of Alexandria, Alexandria.
Kabiru Kinyanjui (Kenya), Senior Programme Officer, Social Sciences Division, International Development Research Centre, Nairobi.
Tamas Kozma (Hungary), Director-General, Hungarian Institute for Educational Research, Budapest.
Yolanda M. Rojas (Costa Rica), Academic Vice-Rector, University of Costa Rica, San José.
Michel Vernières (France), Professor of Economic Sciences, University of Paris I Panthéon-Sorbonne, Paris.
Lennart Wohlgemuth (Sweden), Director, Scandinavian Institute of African Studies, Uppsala.

Inquiries about the Institute should be addressed to:
The Office of the Director, International Institute for Educational Planning, 7-9 rue Eugène-Delacroix, 75116 Paris, France.