Beyond the Monuments
A Living Heritage
THE CHAINS OF DEPENDENCY

Alphonsou A. Yarjah
Librarian
St. Petersburg (Russia).

Dossier No. 75 deserves a special place in your archives for describing in graphic details the glaring advantages and disadvantages of the new information technologies. They are going to have on society while also suggesting means of curbing the polarizing effect of the presaged global village. Moma Aly Nidaye’s article on “The Race Against Marginalization” drew my attention the most. While this article is not devoid of useful suggestions, it deserves commenting. His argument that the political will to invest is “beginning to take shape” is at best hypocrical, and at worst misleading. While a few projects are worth mentioning, such isolated examples are not enough to advance the conclusion that many African countries are uncontestably ready for any meaningful change on the continent.

It is no secret that today most of Africa’s leaders are those who have mounted power through military take-overs. There are also those who have out-lived their usefulness but have nevertheless refused to hand over power, thus hampering the true transfer of democratic tenets to Africa. This also gives ground to justify the reason why Africa has been left behind in terms of development by most of Latin American and Asian countries, even though it was not so long ago that they were travelling in the same lorry of underdevelopment. The new technologies are making the spread of information almost uncontrollable even for the developed world, and at a speed which is quite unpalatable for most African leaders. Thus we can expect these leaders to give high priority to stemming the tide of expected criticism by muzzling those in favour of the transfer of such technologies or by keeping their citizens in the dark side of their rule by totally obliterating the common man’s consciousness and by adopting policies denying access to information.

I cannot help but ask myself if it is really “large sums of money” which need to be raised for Africa to build in terms of technology. Or are we just forgetting and ignoring what history should have taught us by now? While it is a fallacy that all politicians are corrupt, keen followers of events in Africa will quite agree with me in the valid generalization that more than half of the loans given by world donors and creditors have never reached the continent’s soil. If we seriously want to bridge the ever-widening gap between the North and South, Africans, of whom I consider myself to be a dedicated supporter, must learn to step up efforts in tackling their own problems instead of heavily relying on foreign bailouts. If not, Africa shall remain a poor cousin of the developed world.

We must also not forget that help is always slow in coming when Africa needs it most. There can be no better example to illustrate this than when Rwandans were abandoned to their fate while the European community and America worked to minimize the bloodshed in the former Yugoslavia. We now see the speed and ease at which billions of US dollars pour into the economies of the former Warsaw Pact countries, most of which are rife with civil wars. All of which vindicates the belief that Africa shall never be offered that political umbrella provided for former Cold War enemies.

On their part, donors and creditors should stop dishing out money directly to African governments. It is high time that the North tried working with indigenous or joint companies when carrying out development programmes in the South, provided that the identity, strategy and objectives of the companies involved are clearly spelt out and that they agree to a group continually monitoring their activities and also agree to sign a pact forbidding them from having accounts outside the country.

In conclusion, if any veritable programme is to succeed in Africa, political scientists should engage themselves in finding answers to the following age-old questions: why, when and how did Africa get itself beset with so many carking problems instead of only focusing on whose fault it is that the continent has almost found itself relegated to the dustbin of international interest. Africa must learn how to gradually cast off its chains of dependency. I will at this point leave you with Dostoevsky’s axiom: “Man holds the remedy in his own hands...”

Alphonsou A. Yarjah maintains that above all Africa’s underdevelopment ensues from the dictatorships imposed by its leaders. This position is somewhat doubtful with so many countries outside the continent experiencing extraordinary economic growth despite their authoritarian regimes.

Most importantly, Africa is now undergoing an accelerated process of democratization, signs of which, among others, are seen with the flourishing number of independent press and radio stations, which Sources regularly reports on. Ed.
WHAT WE MAKE THEM

Long before the UN World Conferences on Women, Human Rights or Population, the passions and tensions these subjects evoke ran high. True, the subject matter in each case touched on religious or cultural, and even political, taboos. By comparison, the opening of the “City-summit” in Istanbul raised barely a ripple. Should this be read as a sign of lassitude vis à vis these “grand masses”, the effects of which are rarely felt in the immediate aftermath? Is it an indication that cities are not a “hot” enough subject? Or can it be read as an admission of impotence in front of an urban explosion that renders illusory any attempt to manage the future?

In less than 10 years from now, more people will live in the cities than outside of them. Most of this growth will take place in the third world. By 2015, developing countries will be home to 27 of the world’s 33 “mega-cities” (more than eight million inhabitants). Bombay, Jakarta, Karachi, Lagos, Sao Paulo and Shanghai will each shelter more than 20 million people.

The objective is not to reverse the trend, but to prevent the city of tomorrow from becoming the home of all of society’s ills. How? The tools are already available, but, for the most part, only on paper. What is missing is the hand to guide them and the head to lead them.

The preparatory work for Habitat II emphasized that the solution lies in giving priority to the grass roots: the inhabitants and the organizations that directly represent them. Certainly, nothing can be achieved without them - in the urban environment more than anywhere else. But to make them carry the candle alone, to minimize state involvement or to avoid infringing upon the holier-than-thou laws of the market-place, would marginalize their actions, however beneficial they may be.

A sound urban policy is essential. And it will work provided it is conceived by all the actors concerned and applied from bottom to the top.

René LEFORT

CONTENTS

PAGE AND SCREEN ............ 4
PEOPLE .......................... 5

FOCUS

Pages 6 to 16
BEYOND THE MONUMENTS: 
A LIVING HERITAGE

PLANET:

• A QUESTION OF PRIORITIES ....... 18

Media
• FOR 365 DAYS OF FREEDOM .......... 20

Film
• OUT OF BREATH ......................... 22

Scientific cooperation
• THE GAIN AFTER THE DRAIN ....... 23

LOOKING AHEAD ............. 24

Editorial and Distribution Services: UNESCO SOURCES, 7 place de Fontenoy, 75352 Paris 07 SP. Tel. 33 1 45 68 16 73. Fax: 33 1 40 65 00 29.
This magazine is destined for use as an information source and is not an official UNESCO document. ISSN 1014-6989.

UNESCO SOURCES

All articles are free of copyright restrictions and can be reproduced, in which case the editors would appreciate a copy. Photos carrying no copyright mark © may be obtained by the media on demand.
TALENTED WOMEN

N alda, Aminata, Babriela, Ramrat and Mel - they come from different backgrounds in places as diverse as Mali, Colombia and Australia, yet all share one thing: they are craftswomen. By presenting their work, the book tells the stories of their lives and how they have achieved “fulfilment through traditional techniques which they have managed to adapt to the requirements of contemporary society .... by linking the past with the present, daily experience with that of dreams, the ordinary with the sublime and the useful with the artistic.”


CULTURAL DYNAMICS IN DEVELOPMENT PROCESSES

Based on papers submitted to the international conference of the same title, organized in the Netherlands in 1994, this book uncovers the “missing link” - the cultural dimension deemed essential if we are even to hope of attaining sustainable human development in reducing the widening gap between rich and poor while assuring natural resources for future generations. Cultural anthropologists, social scientists, environmental and health specialists point to the failure of “ready-made” imported development models - from the ecological disasters of misused pesticides to the harm resulting from the refusal to valorise women’s roles within family structures differing from the western nuclear family unit. While pointing to past mistakes, the articles try to come to terms with the giant question mark which culture represents - how can we incorporate this dimension when designing programmes and projects? The papers elucidate the complexities involved by thinking through conceptual problems and also focusing on the specific interactions between culture and agriculture, health and education. All of which provides the fodder needed for policymakers, researchers and students to further their discussions in finding alternative solutions.


WORLD GUIDE TO HIGHER EDUCATION

The third edition offers a myriad of essential details concerning the higher education systems of some 160 states. With succinct profiles describing each country’s institutional structure, teaching requirements, degrees and diplomas awarded as well as the requirements for entry at every level, the guide enables readers to evaluate the academic and professional qualifications awarded. The aim is to contribute to international mobility by making it easier to recognize “foreign” higher education qualifications.


TEACHER TRAINING AND MULTICULTURALISM: NATIONAL STUDIES

With the international market, AIDS and information superhighways spreading, we live in a world of heightening tensions and imbalances ready to explode with cultural differences placed centre-stage. It isn’t enough to just condemn the violence but anticipate and prevent it. Recognizing the teacher’s role in the socialization process, UNESCO’s IBE has launched a project to study and improve their training in multi- and intercultural education. This book presents the outcomes of the project’s initial teacher training programmes in eight countries at various development levels and in different regions. From Bolivia, the Czech Republic and Jordan to Senegal, the papers point to the difficulty in getting teachers and students to overcome simplistic thinking and ethnocentric attitudes when faced with complex problems concerning their natural, social, cultural and economic environments. By looking to the specific examples of these national studies, the book provides insight in dealing with the contradictory trends now dominating: the standardization of cultural patterns and the search for basic reference points for cultural identity.


COMPACT DISCS

VIET NAM - COURT THEATRE MUSIC: HAT BÔI

Hat bôi, the traditional Vietnamese court theatre music first codified in the beginning of the 14th century, has risen in popularity since the 19th century with performing troupes travelling from village to village. More vocal than instrumental, the performance centres on declamations, with rants, moans, sighs and wailing expressing sorrow, vengeance, serenity and suffering. The poetry and song recitations are accompanied by battle and rice drums, bronze gongs and lutes in recounting the woful tales of lovers separated by battle, vixens and royal intrigue.


PERIODICALS

THE UNESCO COURIER

Societies have always been confronted with the plague known as corruption. The June issue seeks to uncover its roots in analyzing the motivations involved and its various forms. The articles also focus on corruption’s latest phase linked to the market’s globalization and the formation of transnational mafias. But above all, this issue asks about the dangers unleashed against democracy and enumerates the means to effectively fight this “virus of power” which could completely throw off the world’s economic equilibrium and countries’ cherished political freedoms.

The Organization’s publications and periodicals are on sale at the UNESCO Bookshop as well as in specialized bookstores in more than 130 countries. In each Member State, books and periodicals can be consulted in subscribing libraries.

For more information: UNESCO Editions, 7 Place de Fontenoy, 75352 Paris 07 SP. Tel: (33 1) 45 68 49 73, Fax: (33 1) 42 73 30 07, Internet: HTTP://WWW.UNESCO.ORG
JEAN CLOTTES: A CULTIVATED CAVE MAN

Jean Clottes is convinced that he will live to be one hundred.

“I’ve already warned my children and my seven grandkids. You know, prehistory is a preservative - I’m constantly learning and keeping myself in shape.” The healthy optimism of this French prehistorian, who looks a good ten years younger than his age of 63, lives on more than that: the chance he has had - or that he has made happen - throughout his life.

At 20, Clottes almost missed his calling. Initiated as a child to the mysteries of grottoes with a father impassioned by speleology who made him “crawl into holes where adults couldn’t fit”, this activity was nothing more than a hobby. “One day, my father found a sepulchral grotto with the remains of human skeletons. This is the kind of thing that really gets a man interested.”

He started his new career at a good time, with several big discoveries leading him to specialize in cave drawings of which he is now an expert known worldwide. Another “surprise” came in 1991 when he was elected president of the International Council on Monuments and Sites. Becoming a close mate of UNESCO, he is consulted every time a country proposes inscribing a prehistoric site on the World Heritage List. In December 1994, it was Clottes whom the Organization turned to in dealing with the thorny dossier of the Foz Coa site in Portugal (see Sources No. 68). Based on his report, UNESCO’s last General Conference decided to turn priority attention to the protection of the world’s cave drawings.

“The gigantic museum which exists in nature is exposed to enormous damage. Actually, if you look at things from an archaeological point of view, everything ends up disappearing. What will remain of our own civilization in a 1,000 years?” Perhaps a few bones from a century-old prehistorian found in a cavern in the Foix region...

Sophie BOUKHARI

I told myself that it would be better to organize the trip. It took me a year: I read an enormous amount and took Chinese classes. “Why China? It was far, unknown and certainly dangerous. It wasn’t really China that attracted me and even less the tea - I prefer coffee. I thought of leaving right away, but after sleeping on the idea, I know - he earned a transfer to the Ministry of Culture.”

For me, the kind of thing that really gets a man interested - he applied for the job of prehistoric antiquities director for the Midi-Pyrenees region without expecting much... And he got the job! Four years later - almost no time at all as anyone familiar with the French administration knows - he earned a transfer to the Ministry of Culture. “For me, this was an extraordinary success. You’ve got to realize that for 15 years I had been an English professor.”

It all began ten years ago, “the day I decided to go for tea at a Chinese friend’s house. I met him by chance on a sidewalk in Munich waiting for a taxi.” At 23, he stopped his studies in physical therapy. “I thought of leaving right away, but after sleeping on the idea, I know - he earned a transfer to the Ministry of Culture.”

Since his return in 1990, Jamel has fallen into his old ways - but the route,” declared Leah Rabin, 1 May, during the inauguration of the garden created at UNESCO in homage to her husband, Yitzhak Rabin, who was assassinated on 4 November 1995. Designed by Israeli artist Dani Karavan, the square “recalls the path of peace, with its shadows and light,” said Director-General Federico Mayor, in underlining that “tolerance is neither docility, concession nor indulgence, but rather the averter to the other.”

JAMEL BALHI: REFUSING ALL LABELS

Jamel Balhi began his life the day he decided to jog around the world. “I love to read, write, take photos, long walks, jog and meet people - to feel free. I’ve managed to combine all of these activities in one thing: the voyage.” But his kind of traveling is the tour guide’s worst nightmare: entirely by foot, in stretches of 60 to 80 km. “I go straight into the heart of the country, where no tourist agency can take me.”

It all began ten years ago, “the day I decided to go for tea at a Chinese friend’s house. I met him by chance on a sidewalk in Munich waiting for a taxi.” At 23, he stopped his studies in physical therapy. “I thought of leaving right away, but after sleeping on the idea, I know - he earned a transfer to the Ministry of Culture.”

Since his return in 1990, Jamel has fallen into his old ways - but the route,” declared Leah Rabin, 1 May, during the inauguration of the garden created at UNESCO in homage to her husband, Yitzhak Rabin, who was assassinated on 4 November 1995. Designed by Israeli artist Dani Karavan, the square “recalls the path of peace, with its shadows and light,” said Director-General Federico Mayor, in underlining that “tolerance is neither docility, concession nor indulgence, but rather the averter to the other.”
The Fes Medina - an urban historic centre par excellence - was inscribed on the World Heritage List in 1981 (Photo © Patrimoine 2 001/ Fondation La Caixa, Éric Bonnier).
BEYOND THE MONUMENTS: A LIVING HERITAGE

To liberate the notion of “heritage” from its predominantly western vision and an overly structured approach. Such is the new philosophy guiding the “global strategy”, which aims to open up the World Heritage List (see below).

This idea breaks with an essentially “monumental” conception that has its origins in Europe (p.8), and is the fruit of years of reflection and debate, led by people such as Niger’s Lambert Messan (p.10).

Its application opens the way for recognition of far more complex sites, such as Abomey (p.15) that incorporate the belief systems and traditional knowledge of living cultures. It also reconnects the artificially separated categories of “natural” and “cultural” heritage by introducing the new classification of “cultural landscapes” (pp. 9 and 12-13). These fundamental changes are accompanied by a much more dynamic approach to conservation, based on the active participation of a wider range of actors, from local populations - as in the French town of Vezelay (p.16) - to international consortiums as in the case of Vilnius in Lithuania (pp.11 and 14).

The happiest days of our lives? Or the worst? Twenty years, in any case, is a good time to take stock. The Convention of 1972 concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage is a case in point. Four years after launching the process of reflection which shook certain of its fundamental ideas, this text, ratified to date by 146 States, appears to have found a second wind, animated by a more balanced notion of heritage.

The convention was adopted by UNESCO’s General Conference at a time when decolonization, nearly accomplished, was opening the way for recognition of the planet’s cultural diversity. It was nonetheless the outcome of concepts born at the beginning of the century, when the concert of nations, dominated by European powers, left little place for other voices to be heard. This is the paradox of the convention and the “guidelines” which ruled its application, and notably inscription of properties on the World Heritage List.

When, in 1992, the hour came to re-examine the Convention’s achievements, its anomalies also came clearly into focus. The text appeared as favouring a “monumental” vision of heritage, corresponding to western aesthetic canons. A close examination of the List revealed, for example, many disparities both in geographical distribution and with regard to the properties themselves: a preponderance of European and North American sites (over half); of historic cities and religious edifices; of Christianity (72% of religious sites) and of defunct civilizations, to the detriment of living cultures. This analysis also shed light on the disproportion of cultural (78%) and natural (22%) properties and the necessity to break down the divisions between the two categories.

HUMANIZING

This analysis led, in 1994, to a revision of criteria in line with a new “global strategy”. Born of the recognition that the World Heritage List, out of step with progress made over 20 years in the human sciences, risked losing its credibility by privileging the monuments of a few isolated cultural basins, this new approach aimed first of all, at progressive elimination of the notion of the artistic masterpiece, linked with the old “Seven Wonders of the World” logic. There is no question, of course, of tearing down the notion of heritage - Mont-Saint-Michel or the Taj Mahal will always have their place on the List. Rather, the aim is to humanize in order to universalize.

Secondly, the new vision is more clearly historical and anthropological, based to a greater extent on the social, cultural and spiritual significance of a site, rather than on its form. In Africa, Oceania or in the Caribbean in particular, what is transmitted from generation to generation is a set of rules for the organization of space than a tangible property.

The ideas developed by the World Heritage Centre on cultural landscapes, sacred places or trade routes thus allow for recognition of the specific cultural heritage of hitherto marginalized regions. At the same time, this process has produced a third result: the recognition of the interactions between cultural and natural sites.

In recent years, the List has been enriched by several “non constructed” sites, such as Uluru-Kata Tjuta National Park (Australia), inscribed in 1994, which the Aborigines endow with strong spiritual power and whose landscape they have modified accordingly; the sacred Maori volcanoes of New Zealand; and the terraced rice fields of the Philippines. With their tangible and intangible dimensions, natural and cultural, these sites testify to ancient civilizations, often still alive, but almost always threatened.

Sophie BOUKHARI
THE DESIRE TO PROTECT AND PRESERVE

Human societies have always tried to preserve the sacred and the beautiful. A brief history of an essentially human characteristic.

Nobody can deny that the wanton destruction of temples, statues and other sacred things is pure folly,” said Greek historian Polybius back in the second century before the Christian Era.

Was he not expressing the same sort of thinking that lays behind today’s efforts to protect “cultural heritage”?

Throughout the ages, evidence can be found of the desire to protect the places and objects held sacred to society; those things that identified a people or a culture and tied them to a particular location or way of life.

In Europe, up until the Renaissance, the Church was the main defender of the sacred. In 1425, Pope Martin V ordered the demolition of new buildings which were liable to cause damage to ancient monuments in Rome and in 1462, Pope Pius II pronounced the Bull “Cum alman nostram urbem” to protect the city’s ancient monuments. In 1534, Pope Paul III established an antiquities commission with broad powers for the protection of ancient structures.

A CERTAIN AMBIVALENCE

These measures were largely restricted to religious edifices, were enforced with a certain ambivalence and did not extend to the sacred sites and objects held sacred to others: the Reformation in England used the monasteries and abbots of the outlawed Roman Catholic orders as quarries, while the Spanish simply melted down ancient gold and silver objects seized from the peoples of the colonized Americas.

Significant change came in 1666 when the Swedish monarch declared that all relics from antiquity, including archaeological sites, were the property of the crown. “For the first time the intrinsic importance of the remains of the past was acknowledged in a national legal code,” writes British archaeologist Henry Cleere in “Archaeological Heritage Management in the Modern World”. Over the next two centuries several other monarchies followed suit.

At the same time, Europe’s jurists were raising the idea that protection should be extended to works of art. Jiri Toman in his commentary on the Hague Convention “The Protection of Cultural Goods in Armed Conflict”, cites Polish jurist Jacques Przyluski as having advanced in 1553 “that all belligerents should respect works of art, but not only because of their religious character”. Swiss jurist Emer de Vattel wrote early in the 18th century that “depriving a people of that which makes their hearts glad, their monuments and arts ... is to act as an enemy of the human species”.

According to Cleere, the renewal of historical studies over this period, and the emergence of a linear view of history in which societies were seen as having cultural links extending back over time also reinforced the idea of a national or cultural heritage. “Relics of earlier phases were seen to be important documents in recording that continuity, and as such they became worthy of care and preservation.”

After the Peace of Westphalia in 1648, treaties began regularly to include clauses stipulating the restitution to their place of origin of archives and works of art seized in warfare. In 1815, writes Toman, the allies decreed the restitution of art works taken to France by Napoleon on the grounds, set down in a circular letter written by Lord Castlereagh, that their theft “was contrary to all principles of justice and the practices of modern warfare”. By the end of the 19th century most of Europe’s monuments were protected by legislation and a concerted effort was being made to establish an agreement between the nations of Europe to protect cultural heritage in times of war.

NATIONAL TO UNIVERSAL

However, while each of these developments added momentum to the idea of protection, cultural heritage remained essentially an affair of the state. This began to change with the establishment of the League of Nations after World War I. The League sought lasting peace through universalism and intellectual cooperation, based on the recognition of different cultures. Cultural heritage was a major vehicle for working towards this ideal. The world’s outstanding monuments, archaeological finds and classical works of art were the heritage of the whole of humanity. These works stood as testimony, not only to the genius of a particular people, but to human beings everywhere.

This idea underpinned UNESCO’s thinking when it took over the League’s activities in this domain after World War II. However, defining exactly what constituted a heritage of “outstanding universal value” proved extremely difficult and the vision that prevailed was clearly eurocentric and monumentalist. Those cultures that did not build in stone or leave massive edifices had difficulty getting their “heritage” recognized.

A major turning point came in 1972 with the UN Conference on the Human Environment in Stockholm. For the first time, debates on preservation began to include the environment. Culture and nature, if not seen as interactive, were at least linked. As a result, later that year, UNESCO’s General Conference adopted the Convention Concerning the Protection of World Cultural and Natural Heritage.

With 146 states parties, it has become the Organization’s most “popular” convention. Now, at the close of the century, it is also broadening its vision, in an attempt go beyond the narrow categories of culture and nature and to truly fulfil its mission of protecting heritage that belongs to all of humanity.

Sue WILLIAMS
BEYOND THE MONUMENTS

Cultural landscapes represent a new vision that reconnects culture and nature, and opens the World Heritage List to a non-monumental heritage not previously acknowledged.

The Uluru Kata-Tjuta National Park in the Western Desert of Central Australia is one of the continent’s best known landmarks. Its geological and landform features, including the vast sandstone monolith of Uluru and the nearby rock domes of Kata Tjuta, are unique, and it is home to rare and scientifically important plant and animal species.

Uluru is also a sacred place for the Aboriginal Anangu community. According to Australian archaeologist and heritage conservationist, Sarah Titchen, “many of its striking rock features are the transformed bodies or imprints of the creative heroes of Anangu religion. The conservation and management of the Uluru-Kata Tjuta National Park are guided by Anangu law and tradition, known as Tjukurpa (the Dreamtime or Time of Law or Epic Time) and involves, for example, the spacing of groups of people evenly across the landscape ensuring that over exploitation of particular wild foods does not occur.”

Is Uluru then a “cultural” or “natural” site? The answer, obviously, is that it is not only a combination of both, but that both the natural and the cultural aspects of the site are inextricably linked.

“EVERYTHING IS CULTURE”

The shortcomings of the separate definitions of “culture” and “nature” have become increasingly apparent as more becomes known about how people interact with their environment and as rightful recognition of cultural differences and values becomes more widespread. It is now acknowledged, for example, that Aboriginal and Torres Strait Island peoples have played an important role in shaping the Australian continent, or that the world’s so-called “virgin forests” have, in fact, been managed to a greater or lesser extent by indigenous peoples. If such is the case, asks Peter Bridgewater, Executive Director of the Australian Nature Conservation Agency, “what is this naturalness?”, that outstanding “natural” sites require for inscription on the World Heritage List?

“Everything is culture” affirms Bernd von Droste, Director of UNESCO’s World Heritage Centre. “Everything depends on people or has been influenced by people.” To encompass this still emerging and more anthropological vision of the world, and to change the World Heritage List from a simple catalogue of monuments to an overview of the great diversity of the different cultures that make up humanity, the World Heritage Committee, in 1992, adopted the category of “cultural landscapes”.

“These are places that have been created, shaped and maintained by the links and interactions between people and their environment,” explains Titchen, who along with Mechtild Rossler of the World Heritage Centre has worked on explaining the concept. “Their successful conservation depends on the maintenance of these links.” There are now four “cultural landscapes” on the List, including Uluru-Kata Tjuta National Park in Australia and Tongariro National Park in New Zealand, which had been previously inscribed as natural sites, the Rice Terraces of the Philippine Cordilleras and Sintra in Portugal (see pp. 12-13).

While maintaining the essential criteria that nominations for the List must be of “outstanding universal value“, the Committee has settled on three types of cultural landscapes: the clearly defined landscape designed and created intentionally by people, embracing gardens or parklands constructed for aesthetic reasons and often associated with religious or other monumental buildings and ensembles (such as Versailles in France and Potsdam inscribed as cultural sites); or continuing landscapes that retain an active social role in contemporary society closely associated with a traditional way of life (the rice terraces of the Philippine Cordilleras); and the associative cultural landscape, marked by powerful religious, artistic or cultural associations of the natural element rather than material cultural evidence (Uluru Kata-Tjuta and Tongariro National Parks).

“These new categories ensure a more holistic approach to heritage conservation, and prevent pre-eminence being given to one set of values over another,” says Titchen. “Most importantly, they accommodate the past and living traditions of indigenous peoples.”

Using a concept, described by anthropologist Howard Morphy as “in between, that is free of fixed positions, whose meaning is elusive, yet whose potential range is all encompassing” also allows the World Heritage List a new flexibility to reflect human thought and perceptions and evolve along with future archaeological and scientific discoveries; to develop a dynamic and truly universal approach to heritage and its conservation.

S. W.
Niger’s diplomat Lambert Messan’s battle for heritage preservation goes beyond stilted monuments and standard parks. In Africa, nature, culture and daily life are indivisible.

If UNESCO had to draw up a list of its human treasures, Lambert Messan, Niger’s Ambassador to the Organization, would surely be on it.

A keen economist and expert in the educational science, Messan isn’t someone content just to open flower shows. His latest job has added a cultural string to his bow and he is now considered a sort of unofficial “Mr African Heritage” at UNESCO.

He arrived at this by an odd route. “I was all set to teach mathematics, which is still my hobby, but I was diverted by events,” he explains. Paralysed after a car accident when he was 25, he had to undergo lengthy treatment in Paris, where he began his diplomatic career. At the age of 37, he received his first ambassadorship.

“My physical handicap was something which I had to deal with in such a way that I could lead a ‘normal’ life,” he says. With a brilliant career taking him to Belgium and Canada, he was then named ambassador to UNESCO “after the death of President Seyni Kountché”.

A LONG BATTLE

“When I got here in 1988, I was astonished to see that Niger wasn’t represented on the World Heritage List,” he says. In fact, Niger had never suggested any site for inclusion on the List, a situation which Messan soon corrected. “I asked for an expert to be sent to look at possible sites and this was agreed to,” he says. As a result, in December 1991, the natural reserves of Air and Tenere were inscribed on the List.

For Messan, it was just the start of a long battle which he extended to the whole continent. “As I was chairman of the African group, I asked the tough question: if heritage sites belong to all the world’s peoples, why are some regions seen as more ‘universal’ heritage-wise than others?”

Sub-Saharan Africa has only 42 listed sites (25 natural, 16 cultural and one mixed) - less than 10% of the whole List. Also, only two-thirds of the region’s 45 countries have ratified the 1972 World Heritage Convention.

There are several reasons which might explain this modest share. To begin with, few African states have the technical resources to “draw up a list of all the different sites and undertake the work in preparing the dossiers which must be presented.”

They also concentrate more on modernizing society than on preserving traditional heritage. In addition, not all of the countries’ laws provide for protection and conservation and such legislation has long been a prerequisite for a site’s inscription on the List. “Yet in Niger, where there’s a living heritage, conservation is often integrated in people’s daily lives,” Messan says.

But beyond these somewhat technical difficulties, there lies a broader problem involving conceptions. “Most of our countries can’t meet the conditions required” to earn a place on the List, explains Messan in pointing to an inadequacy between the criteria for inscription, as defined by the World Heritage Convention (which concern only very specific kinds of cultural property and ignore immaterial heritage) and aspects of African culture and spirituality, which are often hard for outsiders to spot, and defy simple classification.

“In the West, the cultural and the natural represent two distinct domains. In Africa, they form a whole,” he says. “Our perception is global: the religious, social, economic and the environmental functions are all knitted together.” In many cases, so-called natural sites have only been preserved because of their social and cultural importance. This is notably the case for Africa’s sacred groves. Protected by tradition, they usually contain an extraordinary biodiversity at the same time as having a religious and social purpose. Seen as a kind of source or womb with the power to regenerate humans, they are accessible to only a few privileged people. They have never been included in inventories nor have they been the subject of in-depth studies which would enable us to appreciate their “special universal” value so that the most representative of them might be inscribed on the List.

FOSSILS

Messen is working closely with UNESCO in its efforts to draw up the most representative list possible of the world’s cultural diversity. He is pleased about the adoption of the concept of cultural landscapes (see page 9) and about the definitions of several new kinds of properties, such as cultural itineraries and trade routes which enable inclusion of nomadic civilizations.

“In Niger, we are very interested in this change,” he says. “We have on our territo- 

routes for the salt trade, for gold, and roads heading to Mecca...”

He himself is getting ready to hit the road to Addis Ababa at the end of July for the next of a series of sub-regional conferences. “We have to make African leaders aware of the new approach, which is still poorly understood. When I proposed the listing of Air and Tenere, the first reaction of officials in Niger - who were concerned that the region might end up as a museum piece - was to say: ‘Are they trying to turn us into a fossil?’”

S.B.
A COMBINED EFFORT

A new range of partners are entering into the protection, preservation and restoration of world heritage. Why have they decided to get involved and what do they expect from UNESCO?

Yves Dauge is Mayor of the French city of Chinon, which has offered its know-how and financial help to the Lao-tian city of Luang Prabang, inscribed on the World Heritage List last December.

“Chinon is one of those cities of the world with a rich heritage that stretches back into history, which gives it an importance that goes beyond local or national borders. As such we consider it our duty to share our experience with other cities. Classifying a monument is easy, but classifying a city is much more complex. Tourists arrive, new money is injected, investors speculate....

“So many questions are raised: can we continue to develop commercial businesses, or build low-cost housing? How do we ensure that the tourism industry benefits the local population? What legal structure needs to be put into place? It’s not enough to just send in experts. Their intervention needs to be part of a logical chain of action. This is what we aim at with decentralized cooperation, which is what we are developing with Luang Prabang.

“More specifically, we are working together on a plan to safeguard and restore the city. This entails the preparation of an inventory of the city and the elaboration of a judicial framework. Restoration work will be spread over three years and the cost, estimated at three million French francs, will be shared between Luang Prabang and the region of Chinon, French ministries, international funding agencies and private sponsors.

“The following phase will concentrate on providing advice and direction for private investment. Issues such as garbage disposal must be dealt with, along with the development of the electrical grid and the protection of surrounding wetlands. We are also planning to open a ‘heritage house’, which will serve as a permanent workshop for the local people to continue.

“All of this is being done under the aegis of UNESCO which, in a sense, legitimates our involvement. Without this, I don’t believe that decentralized cooperation could work. UNESCO is often criticized as having no money, but it has something better: an authority to delegate.”

Ismail Serageldin is Vice-President of Environmentally Sustainable Development at the World Bank which is working with UNESCO on the restoration and preservation of six historic cities.

“The rapidly urbanizing developing world faces many social and economic challenges, from population growth and the influx of rural migrants to an evolving economic base. Crumbling infrastructure, poor and over-stretched social services, rampant real-estate speculation and weak governments all contribute to putting tremendous pressure on central cities, often the loci of invaluable architectural and urbanistic heritage. We have a number of actions to propose to decision-makers for these problems, but the inner historic cores require special attention. They are an essential part of how we define ourselves. Their conservation helps maintain the very fabric of society.

“Thus, a case for the Bank’s additional effort to deal with historic cities can be made in terms of its traditional mandate of poverty reduction and economic development - with the added attention to the uniqueness of the site. It is here that the nature of the partnerships required becomes obvious. The Bank has traditionally had a strong link with policy issues and a long experience with projects dealing with infrastructure, housing, municipal finance and urban transport. UNESCO has a long experience in the design of sensitive treatments for historic areas, others have expertise in restoration, while foundations such as the Aga Khan Trust for Culture have effective links at the grassroots and long experience in conservation and revitalization. UNESCO already has a large number of studies about many of these cities completed or on the books.

“Looking at the various cities with a strong historic significance where the Bank was likely to finance important developments in the next few years, it was deemed wise to try to collaborate up front, drawing on the available or planned UNESCO studies. The cities where the intersection of UNESCO plans and those of the Bank made it most promising to focus were St. Petersburg, Fes, Samarkand, Hue, Sana’a and Vilnius. We are planning to pursue these although there is already a broad interest in many others.

“We are a long way from a clear formula on how best to engage all the interested parties, or even how to consolidate the central relationship between UNESCO and the Bank. But we are determined to keep it unbureaucratic and pragmatic, results focused and forward looking. We will let our experience guide us in the best modes of collaboration, between UNESCO and the Bank and with the other partners, whose participation is essential for ultimate success, not least the communities concerned.”

André De Marco is Director of Communication for pharmaceuticals giant, Rhône-Poulenc, which is working with UNESCO on two world heritage fronts: restoration and education.

“Rhône-Poulenc considers that beyond its economic goals, the enterprise has civic responsibilities towards the community. One of the forms of this citizenship is patronage. The Rhône-Poulenc Foundation is developing a programme of patronage whose main direction is the protection of cultural, artistic and natural world heritage. We believe very much in the idea that ‘we don’t inherit the world of our ancestors, we are borrowing it from our children’.

“Rhône-Poulenc is working on two programmes with UNESCO, including the restoration - in collaboration with the Vietnamese government - of two of the pavilions in the imperial city of Hué and two of King Tu-Duc’s tombs. Our scientific teams have provided help to protect the new timber used to build the pavilions from termite damage. We are also contributing to a project aimed at educating young people on the protection of the world’s cultural and natural heritage.”
THE FOUR NEW “CULTURAL LANDSCAPES”

Since the World Heritage Committee adopted the category of “cultural landscapes” in 1992, it has accepted four such inscriptions onto the World Heritage List.

ULURU-KATA TJUTA NATIONAL PARK (AUSTRALIA)

The rock domes of Uluru-Kata Tjuta National Park are located on the traditional lands of the Anangu people. According to Anangu legend, the surface of the Earth was once featureless. Places like Uluru and Kata Tjuta did not exist until Anangu ancestral beings (in the forms of people, plants and animals) started to journey across the land. These ancestral beings formed or moulded the landscape as they passed through it. Their travels and activities linked places throughout the country by iwara (paths or tracks) of which Uluru and Kata Tjuta represent meeting points in a vast network. Park conservation and management is today guided by Anangu law and tradition known as the Tjukurpa. “Tjukurpa is real” says Yami Lester, Chair of the Uluru-Kata Tjuta Board of Management, “it’s our law, our language, our land and family together.”

TONGARIRO NATIONAL PARK (NEW ZEALAND)

“The breath of the mountain is my heart” is how the Ngati Tuharetoa people of the Mount Tongariro National Park in New Zealand express their affection and great reverence for this active volcanic landscape, which is linked by mythology to the arrival of the first Maori from Hawaiki some 700 to 1400 years ago. The mountains represent the god-like ancestors, the tupuna. They are also a source of mana (prestige), cultural and tribal identity, and spirituality. In September 1887, the paramount chief of the Ngati Tuharetoa, formally presented the summits of Tongariro, Ngauruhoe and part of Ruapehu to the New Zealand government, leading to the establishment of the country’s first national park, and at that time, only the fourth one in the world.
MOUNTAIN RICE TERRACES (PHILIPPINES)

The rice terraces of the Cordillera Mountain Range in the Philippines are located at between 700 and 1500 metre above sea-level on slopes of up to 70 degrees. They have functioned for about 2,000 years. The 3000 history of the rice terraces of the Cordillera Mountain Range in the Philippines is intertwined with that of its people, their culture, customary activities and their traditional practices of environmental management and rice production. The steepness of the slopes means that all tilling and maintenance is done manually. A complex system of dams, sluices, canals and bamboo pipes transfer water from the highest terrace to the lowest, finally draining into a river or stream at the base of the valley. Each of the four clusters of terraces inscribed on the World Heritage List is composed of a buffer ring of private forests (muyong) the terraces themselves, a hamlet and a sacred grove where holy men (mumbaki) perform traditional rites and sacrifices relating to rice production.

The city of Sintra (PORTUGAL)

Sintra owes its development to its cool summers and mild sunny winters, fertile soils and proximity to the Tage River. The city has been conquered, destroyed and rebuilt many times over by Romans, Arabs, Moors and the Portuguese. In mediaeval times the Royal Court settled there, building sumptuous villas and country homes, parks and gardens. The site’s isolation also attracted monks who established monasteries there... Growth peaked with the artist-King, Ferdinand II (1836-1885), who transformed one of these monasteries (Pena) into a ‘Romantic’ castle, complete with a park of rare and exotic plants, decorated with fountains, streams, cottages and chapels. Sintra is seen as the prototype of European romanticism: a perfect communion between nature and ancient monuments that are the stuff of architectural fantasy.
REVITALIZING VILNIUS

Going it alone has not worked in the Lithuanian capital, where a new joint approach is now being tried to breathe new life into the city.

According to legend, the Grand Duke Gediminas was hunting in the area that is now the city of Vilnius - where the rivers Neris and Vilnia flow together - and dreamed of a wolf who howled with the power of 100 wolves. A wizard explained that the dream was a message from the Gods that they wished to found a city on the site - a city whose fame would spread as far as the wolf’s howl could be heard. Gediminas Castle was built upon the Grand Duke’s orders on the top of the highest hill. Today, residents take their guests there to give them what is undoubtedly the best view of the city that for centuries has been the political, religious, scientific and cultural heart of Lithuania.

The old city today covers almost 360 hectares and is home to 31,000 residents. Over the course of its long history, which has seen at least seven major fires and many wars, it has been rebuilt several times. However, it is this rebuilding that has given the town its special character, reflecting the architectural styles of the Gothic, Renaissance, Baroque and Classical periods, which saw its inscription on UNESCO’s World Heritage List in December, 1994. Some of the buildings are badly in need of repair, but overall the city is in fair shape considering its turbulent history.

“Of the 1500 buildings in the historic centre, about 119 are actually caving in” says Augis Gucas, Manager of the municipality’s Monuments Protection Department. But rebuilding and restoration are only one aspect of the city’s much needed “revitalization”.

“Many of the buildings are empty because the inhabitants were moved out more than five years ago so that renovations could be carried out under a restoration programme (the fifth such plan attempted since the 1940s). But work has not even started on many of them, and has had to be interrupted on the others because of a lack of fund.” reports Lithuanian journalist Rusnė Marcénaitė. “The municipality allocated a meagre $700,000 dollars from its budget - enough to paint a few frontages or to reconstruct a small buildings. The church also owns a big chunk of the city, but it doesn’t have any money either.”

The municipality attempted to rent buildings by auction, but this failed to attract investors, who would rather have a title deed than a lease. “And then,” said Marcénaitė, “life in the business world here is very tough, and bankruptcies are rife. Few business-people were ready to add huge building costs to their overheads. Those who took the risk found themselves confronted with mindboggling administration, which they often simply ignored.

“The result is that much work was carried out without any consultation or coordination with the heritage protection authorities. The new inhabitants claim these authorities are too strict, and that if they complied with the requirements they would have to draw water from a well, cook and heat the building with a stove and place the toilets outside.

“Effectively, before any work can be undertaken, occupants are supposed to get approval from some 29 different heritage authorities. Consequently the main activity of architectural firms is not designing but collecting signatures. They argue that ‘outsiders’ would not be able to collect these signatures by themselves, and remind their clients that permission costs... Another apparent anomaly is that new owners are not required to carry out any repairs or maintenance.”

WORKING TOGETHER

The confusion that has reigned in the past - largely brought about by the huge social and economic changes that accompanied the fall of communism - made Vilnius a perfect candidate to test a new approach to restoration of old city centres, based on a consortium comprising private foundations, local and national government and international organizations, including UNESCO and the World Bank. This consortium is charged with raising the funds and finding the expert help to get the job done. In the case of Vilnius, which is one of six old city centres being tackled in this way, Denmark and Scotland are helping out with advice based on their own experience.

The initial aim is to draw up a list of priority infrastructure investments, as well as a heritage management plan. This is being worked on at the moment. Ways of stimulating private and public investments will also be studied, as well as ways of keeping the city’s residential character rather than turning it into a shopping mall or rows of offices. An institution will be created to manage the old town’s affairs. UNESCO’s World Heritage Centre has also opened an office there, on premises offered by the Lithuanian government.

The vision is to preserve Vilnius’ special character, and at the same time make it a city ready to face the 21st century. Although planning and strategy-making take time, and perhaps create the impression that little is being done, the ball is rolling, and gathering momentum. The World Bank has committed $190,000 to some of this essential preliminary work, and although this is only a drop in the bucket, the various partners involved are all confident the necessary millions will be there when needed, and that Vilnius will eventually resume its place as one of the great capitals of Europe.

S.W.
THE DOUBLE LIFE OF ABOMEY

Abomey’s value goes beyond its palaces, which are modest at best, and lies rather in its secular mix of religious and social powers forming a centre of gravity.

They come, they see... and they leave sometimes disappointed, at least perplexed. “It doesn’t look authentic,” is a frequent comment from the 10,000 visitors who, each year, visit Benin’s royal places of Abomey, inscribed on UNESCO’s World Heritage List since 1985. Indeed the very word “palace” implies ancient, luxurious materials and majestic forms. And yet the buildings are small with the biggest being a simple rectangle 35 metres long. The walls are of rammed earth, the corrugated iron roofs form an overhang supported by simple wooden, sometimes concrete, pillars, masking the 130 polychrome bas-reliefs. Of the nine royal ensembles built by a dynasty of a dozen kings reigning from the beginning of the 16th century to the end of the 19th century, many ruins are now lost in the bush, with only traces remaining of the impressive surrounding wall and the moat. Just a few modest buildings still stand, so fragile that they have been constantly rebuilt, usually with whatever materials were available at the spur of the moment.

INCARNATING THE KINGS

The wealth of the Abomey palaces is invisible. To fully appreciate them, one must look to the site’s geography and link the values of the full and empty spaces, or, in other words, the modest palaces and vast courtyards. The former’s importance consisted essentially in the fact that they were inaccessible to common people; whereas the very size of the latter makes it easy to imagine the immense crowds gathering there to render homage to their king and measure the extent of his power.

Abomey reveals its riches only on the condition that time is taken to discover its primary function: it was a centre of gravity, a symbol of religious and social powers binding together the Fon ethnic group, primary function: it was a centre of gravity.

The frequency and splendour of these ceremonies depend entirely on the Administrative Council of the Royal Families of Abomey, which is also responsible for the site’s upkeep, with the exception of the museum section. In “civil society”, these families often have a modest statute, thus limited financial means. It is, therefore, the site’s sanctity, it becomes a living place. Each person lives a double life: from the peasant or craftsperson, at once a citizen of Benin, a cog in the machinery of a modern economy, as well as a “subject” of the “king”, right down to the princes, endowed with exceptional powers while yet working as ordinary civil servants.

These relationships and their very measurable economic compensation are freely consented to. They are the results of a strong will to maintain the historical identity incarnated by the kings, manifested in a succession of rites and ceremonies, and materialized in the palaces which one young man, interviewed by Antongini, described as the “dossier of the people”.

This function necessitates a profound review of the traditional idea of conservation. It calls for an anthropological approach, resting at least as much on preservation of the intangible heritage as on the maintenance - in this case impossible - of the monuments. After all, compared with their symbolic force, just how important is their appearance or of the materials used for their endless restoration?

There is, however, a red line which must never be crossed: the degradation of monuments should not be allowed to reach a point which prevents cultural and religious practices from taking place. As the Fon like to say, “wouldn’t you be ashamed to hold a ceremony in your father’s house if it had been destroyed?”

René LEFORT
THE UNIVERSAL’S PASSION

At Vézelay, “it’s like ten men who love the same woman”. Trying to avoid this imbroglio, a local group turns to UNESCO in promoting the site as humanity’s shared heritage.

Vézelay has been attracting people throughout the millennia - with droves of Druids flocking to the healing forces of a pocket of seawater encrusted in the hillside to the scores of pilgrims and crusaders descending upon the basilica supposedly housing some of the divine remains of Mary Magdalen.

Today Vézelay’s allure remains intact. Inscribed on the World Heritage List in 1979, the village’s cobbled streets of galleries and cafés have been spared the neon light of fast food joints and hotel chains afflicting so many tourist destinations of France’s Bourgogne region. In search of both culture and charm, some 800,000 tourists come each year. And yet, “the average visit only lasts 20 minutes,” laments Agnès Millot of the local tourism office. “People rush through the village to quickly visit the basilica and then leave. The monks see more tourists than the waiters,” she says, which is disappointing for most of the town’s 500 residents, whose livelihoods are linked to tourism.

But after two years of active work, the association remains a mystery. “Bénédicte, she’s sweet but I don’t know what her group is about,” says a woman in a café who prefers not to give her name. The woman behind the counter also respects Verne but highlights “Vézelay’s general rule: what we don’t know, we don’t like.”

For Verne, this “porcupine-like situation” is “like ten men who love the same woman”. But she sees a possible alternative by working with another of Vézelay’s admirers - the World Heritage Centre, “UNESCO is a way of avoiding noisy local interests,” says Verne, by getting people to see it as a unique site among others on the World Heritage List. The Centre and the association began recently collaborating with a video on the site produced under the Organization’s auspices and a soiree held in March bringing local residents and goods to Headquarters. The association is finishing a “centre for cultural meditation” thanks in part to a cash prize awarded by the Ford Foundation upon the Centre’s recommendation. It’s the perfect location to promote the World Heritage List and “get residents and visitors to see Vézelay as humanity’s shared heritage”.

A QUEST FOR CULTURE

History now seems to weigh against Vézelay, with residents unusually protective of their beloved basilica, recalling lessons learned in the religious wars of the Middle Ages pitting villagers against church authorities. The tension still simmers. About two years ago, monks of the La Fraternité Monastique de Jérusalem rolled into town to oversee the spiritual and day-to-day running of the basilica with a vehemence that offended most of the community, prompting the bishop’s request for public pardon on their behalf. While the storm subsided, the basilica remains a source of contention, with suspicion awaiting anyone tied to it.

One such target has been Presence at Vézelay, a non-profit cultural association whose members love to show visitors the sites. “We have so many people coming here on a quest for culture, but they’re not finding any response,” explains the director Bénédicte Guillon Verne. “So we’re trying to create the tools to reveal Vézelay’s beauty and unique identity.” Last year, the group led some 46,000 tourists, most of whom were referrals from Millot’s office, on 194 tours of the basilica and the village, in which they tried to get others involved, by visiting workshops and cafés. They also organized “heritage classes” with presentations of Celtic, Roman and Gothic art and local crafts. Aside from a couple of poorly paid staff members, the association relies on its volunteers.

M O C K “P I L G R I M S ” A T T H E B A S I L I C A ’ S D O O R S ( P h o t o U N E S C O / A m y O T C H E T )
SUBSCRIPTION FORM

Subscription forms and payment (cheques to the order of Jean De Lannoy) should be sent to UNESCO Publishing’s subscription agent:

Jean De Lannoy
Services abonnements
Avenue du Roi, 202
B-1190 Brussels (Belgium)
Tel: (32-2)538 51 08, Fax: (32-2)538 08 41.

Family name .................................. First name ..................................

Address ..........................................................

Postal code ........................ City ........................ Country ........................

Payment enclosed:
☑ Cheque (except Eurocheques) ☑ Visa
☑ Mastercard ☑ Eurocard
☑ American Express ☑ Diners

Card No.: .................................. Expiration date: ......................

Date and signature ..........................................

1 year 140 FF/£18/US$28 plus airmail charges:
European Union countries: 64 FF/£8.15/US$13
Other European countries: 72 FF/£9.15/US$14.65
Other countries: 96 FF/£12.20/US$19.55

2 years 250 FF/£32/US$51 plus airmail charges:
European Union countries: 128 FF/£16.30/US$26
Other European countries: 144 FF/£18.30/US$29.30
A QUESTION OF PRIORITIES

Latin America’s education authorities want to concentrate on “what we really want, what we are doing, and what we can do.”

When speaking of Latin America and the Caribbean it is easy to be fooled by apparent similarities in the way countries have progressed: their conquests and their disparities.

However, in Kingston, Jamaica, which hosted the last meeting of the 33 ministers of education from this region (13-17 May), the same evils can be found as elsewhere: the contrast between rich and poor, fear of violence arising from exclusion, glaring inequalities, a propensity for discussing democracy in all its forms, and a strong desire to be heard by the First World.

President of LITHUANIA, Algirdas Brazauskas, and UNESCO’s Director-General, Federico Mayor, signed a cooperation agreement on 22 May in Vilnius. It notably calls for the creation of an international centre for distance education in the capital city, assistance in developing a restoration and related funding plan for Vilnius’ Old City and support for research institutes and professional media centres.

A new agreement between UNESCO and the Kingdom of SAUDI ARABIA calls for increased cooperation and the Organization’s assistance for several projects involving, for example, the King Abdul Aziz City for Science and Technology, the conservation of the country’s monuments and archaeological sites as well as earthquake reduction and solar energy. The agreement was signed on 26 May by the Director-General and the Kingdom’s Minister of Education, Mohamed Bin Ahmed Al Rasheed in Riyadh. Saudi Arabia has provided the Organization with substantial contributions for activities notably in the West Bank and Bosnia and Herzegovina.

Globalization, free markets, modernity, civil society, democracy, representation and participation, peace and solidarity are all terms commonly heard at international meetings. According to the experts, these concepts and “world” declarations foster a greater awareness and stronger commitment from Member States.

At the Jamaica meeting, UNESCO relied on a few basic documents crammed with the “right” international jargon - Education For All (Jomtien 1990), Changing Production Patterns with Social Equity (Cepal-UNESCO 1992) and Lifelong Education (Delors report, 1996) - and tried to link the results obtained in education and the commitments made for it to the five Hispanic presidential summits held between 1991 and 1995 and the seven United Nations world summits held since 1990.

At all of these meetings education was seen as a top priority: the key to solving important national, regional and global problems and opening the way forward a new millenium with hope. The Delors Commission, for example, stressed that one of the pillars of the future will be the ability of people to “learn to live together” and not, as could have been supposed, reliance on scientific and technological progress.

However in Jamaica, the education ministers were quick to voice their discontent. As the Chilean minister put it, the preliminary documents left too little room to express “what we really want, what we are doing and what we can do. That might not be the best thing, but it is what concerns us.”

Behind the grandiose schemes and abstract generalizations there is a high level of uncertainty concerning Latin America’s educational future. Over the 16 years of the Major Project in the Field of Education the emphasis was put on education for all - which has been achieved - on belief in public schools and teachers, and innovation through local adaptation. Now, it is argued,
the effort to universalize education is not enough. In a liberal society that demands efficiency above all, teachers must be rewarded according to their performance and attention focused on management of education systems. The open-slather competition of the global market place does not allow for less.

The Kingston meeting pinpointed the difficulty for education ministers to increase expenditure in this domain to the 6.5% of GNP that UNESCO has recommended. Indeed, the final recommendation avoided the issue. As is well known, in most countries of the region, economic and social programmes must follow the recommendations of the International Monetary Fund (IMF), and it is usually finance ministers only who can increase education budgets.

REASONABLE

Nevertheless, for UNESCO’s Director-General Federico Mayor, “the target of 6.5% for the year 2000 is reasonable”. He argued that increased education spending would be offset by the decrease in population growth.

From the start of the meeting, three main themes emerged. Firstly, that governments felt that international organizations should cooperate with them rather than direct them; secondly, the problems of financing education; and thirdly, the role to be played by teachers in the 21st century school.

On the first issue, the ministers decided to draft their own document, different from the one suggested by UNESCO’s regional office in Santiago de Chile. The emphasis was put not so much on specific aspects (1,000 class hours per annum, changing “frontal education”, endowing school libraries, improving pedagogical tools) as on the values to be transmitted through education. Religious values, for example, were debated at length. Peace, democracy and development are the key tools for the region’s future. Thus, “the school is an ideal place in which to give girls, boys and young people a grounding in the exercise of their rights”. This implies that new “humanism” based on a genuine citizenship, as well as complete mastery of the codes of modernity and the development of an “ethical and moral attitude of respect towards oneself and others”.

On the second question, the ministers strongly defended the state’s commitment to guarantee free education. During the opening ceremony, Jamaica’s Prime Minister, P. J. Patterson was roundly applauded when he declared that material prosperity alone could not create an ideal society. “What we want and what we strive for is a market economy, not a market society” he said.

TEACHER STATUS

The ministers considered that the commitment to universal and efficient education should be a “policy of state” protected from the instability of governmental programmes and combining all social and economic forces. On top of this, free and compulsory school must be considered as a commitment of the state to the society, to ensure that everyone is able to reach the level of skills seen as indispensable.

Concerning the teaching profession, the ministers recommended that “consistent measures” be taken “to improve teachers’ work situation” in a bid to enhance their status and to keep them in the job. Appropriate agreements “will be encouraged to permit relations between governments, administrators and the teachers themselves and their representative organizations so that all parties are given a voice and a two-way communication is set-up between the teacher and society”.

Is it possible to speak of a “spirit of Jamaica”? Probably not. For governments, this is not the best moment as far as education is concerned. The educational picture of the region is subject to stabilization policies, budget restrictions and the -sometimes imperative - introduction of free market policies.

However, at least it is now obvious that rather than launching huge plans for reform, it is better to be cautious and to focus on three or four priorities. One issue came to the forefront: international cooperation has to change its course and start concentrating on national emergencies, which are once again becoming more threatening than international trends. This is also the challenge of the Delors report, changing the course set down in Edgar Faure’s “Learning to Be”, which was influenced by the strong, universalist current of humanism that followed May 1968. Today neoliberalism has the wind in its sails, not a world movement in favour of education.

Raúl VARGAS VEGA, Kingston

What is a BIOSPHERE RESERVE? How does it work and who does it benefit? What criteria are used in setting up a reserve? What are the objectives of the global network of biosphere reserves set up under UNESCO’s Man and the Biosphere Programme? A recently released and carefully illustrated brochure answers all of these questions and includes a map showing the reserves’ locations in relation to the planet’s principal types of ecosystems.

There are currently 337 reserves in 85 countries, comprising a total area of more than 218 million hectares.

The Noma Concours for CHILDREN’S BOOK ILLUSTRATIONS, organized by the Asia/Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU), aims at encouraging illustrators from developing countries while improving the quality of children’s literature in general.

Applicants exclusively from UNESCO’s member states in Asia, the Pacific, Latin America and the Caribbean, Africa and Arab States are invited to send their entries by 15 November. An international jury will select the recipients of the various prizes and awards in December while an exhibition of the winning works is scheduled to take place in Tokyo in 1997.
FOR 365 DAYS OF FREEDOM

Faced with growing demands for press freedom everywhere, governments are devising new methods to muzzle the media.

In 1995, 49 journalists were killed because of their opinions or in the course of their work. The deaths of another 25 are under investigation. Six more reporters went missing on the job and 102 ended the year in prison because the powers that be did not appreciate what they were writing, investigating or even thinking.

World Press Freedom Day (3 May) rendered homage to these men and women, and served as a reminder that, despite improvements, press freedom is still a long way from becoming a reality in many parts of the world. According to data gathered by the French non-governmental organization Reporters Sans Frontières (RSF), in more than half of the world’s countries bans, confiscation and censorship of publications are everyday occurrences. And yet many of these governments have signed declarations, and even passed legislation concerning press freedom.

The gap between announced intentions and the actions that follow was clearly confirmed by journalists and newspaper publishers from around the world, who attended a series of round-tables at UNESCO to mark May 3, which was also the fifth anniversary of the Windhoek Declaration* for a free and pluralistic media and the launch of a major UNESCO campaign to promote this ideal.

THE PRICE OF FREEDOM

“In Russia, fear is the main method used to control the media,” said Vsevolod Bogdanov of the Journalist’s Union of Russia. “We know that highly organized professional gangs are responsible, but there has not been a single arrest made for any of these killings.”

Paradoxically, the “immense problems” facing the media in Russia and the rest of Eastern Europe are also signs of positive change there, said CBS correspondent in Moscow, Tom Fenton, who qualifies the press as “one of the success stories of the transition”. “We have broken free” agreed Ernest Skalski, Deputy Editor-in-Chief of Poland’s largest daily, “Gazeta Wyborcza”.

“Twenty years ago in Poland, there was no opposition press, and so there was nothing to confiscate. The journalists were party hacks. Today we have media pluralism and independence and the journalists pose a real threat to those in power.”

However, Latin America apart, the same cannot be said in many other parts of the world. In Algeria, where 22 journalists were killed last year, “the profession has been seriously weakened and discouragement is now gaining ground,” reported Houida Bouchaib, a member of the International Federation of Journalists’ Executive Committee. “What can you do when even your own family condemns you to death?”

Neither is the situation elsewhere on the African continent particularly encouraging. “Governments are using new methods to muzzle the media,” signalled Pius Njawe, publisher of “Le Messager” in Cameroun, and head of the national press freedom organization, OCALIP. Njawe has been to jail “more times than I can count”, and is presently fighting eight cases, including charges of defamation and acting against the interest of the state. “What’s happening today is worse than censorship. We publish because there is supposedly no more censorship, but then the police hit us like a ton bricks for ‘abusing’ press freedom.”

Hiding behind the judiciary is one of the “particularly worrying” new tactics used worldwide, reports RSF. Defamation, for example, is treated as a criminal offence in many Asian countries, said Cushrow Irani, Editor-in-Chief and Managing Director of “The Statesman” in India, and former president of the International Press Institute (IPI). “Pluralism in the media means pluralism of opinion, not just of ownership, but in Asia diversity of opinion is not really welcome,” he added. On January 1 this year, 36 journalists were languishing in Asian jails, at least 20 of them in Chinese prisons.

In the Balkan states as well, legal argument has replaced the bullets as the main threat against the media. “The authorities in Serbia, Croatia and Bosnia and Herzegovina are taking the media back under their control, using the argument that it was ‘improperly privatized’ during the
conflict," said Kati Marton of the Committee to Protect Journalists (CPJ). "Studio B in Belgrade, for example, was taken over in January using the privatization laws, which means that there is no longer any independent television there. Although the Dayton peace agreement allowed for the free movement of reporters, the international community will have to be particularly vigilant and maintain the pressure for a free press in the region."

Whilst above all a matter of political will, press freedom is also reliant on economic means. If Poland’s "Gazeta Wyborca" has maintained its outspoken stand, it is because "we have become rich enough, strong enough to resist", said Ernest Skalski. In Russia though, few people can afford to buy a newspaper. And in Slovakia, said Skalski, heavy taxes on newsprint are pushing young, independent newspapers to the wall.

In Africa, said Pius Njawe, along with the lack of money and equipment there is also a severe shortage of trained professionals, not only journalists, but also technical and administrative personnel.

UNESCO addresses all of these problems in its efforts to encourage the development of pluralistic and independent media. The campaign launched in Windhoek has worked not only to raise consciousness about the importance of a free press, but, through its operational arm - the International Programme for the Development of Communication - has equipped newspapers and fostered various twinning arrangements between them, launched community radio stations, helped reform news agencies and trained journalists, managers, marketing professionals. It also offers governments advice on media legislation and encourages the transformation of public broadcasting sectors into editorially independent public services. UNESCO also helped establish watchdog networks such as IFEX and MISANET that investigate, double-check, alert and protest, and undertakes diplomatic mediation between relevant authorities and these media networks.

"Press freedom remains vulnerable in 1996," said UNESCO's Assistant Director-General for Communication, Information and Informatics, Henrikas Yushkiavitshus. On the one hand it faces economic constraints which favour the concentration of media and threaten pluralism, as is the case in Western Europe and North America. On the other hand, journalists are faced with increasingly serious and repeated attacks, including imprisonment and censorship in all forms. In some countries, the press has become the target of choice for acts of extreme violence.

"Press freedom requires perpetual vigilance and steady resolute action," concludes Yushkiavitshus. "This is the responsibility of not only journalists but all citizens and their representatives. Every day of the year."

S. W.

On 2 May, the Director-General appointed Russian artist ZURAB Tsereteli as a Goodwill Ambassador. Federico Mayor described him as "a volcano of creativity and imagination, a force of nature" who is "in the avant-garde of those who defend the ideals of peace and tolerance against violence."
OUT OF BREATH

In a pinch without a regional market, the African film industry needs protection and help in enlarging its prospects.

"Is there a future for the African film industry? Given the difficulties African film directors have in getting films out and the scant public resources made available to them by states, it is a question we may well ask," explained Serge Adda, Director-General of Canal Horizon, the "African subsidiary" of the French television station Canal Plus. Adda was one of 15 African film professionals who attended a UNESCO-organized round-table on 10 April to discuss production and distribution problems.

According to Ferid Boughedir, the Tunisian director of Halfaouine, the African film business is a victim of the cultural imperialism lurking behind the internationalization of trade in audiovisual products. "The distribution market has been colonized by the suppliers of foreign films and their local outlets" he claimed. "Yet, our cinema-going public wants to see itself on screen. Halfaouine beat Rocky, Rambo and all the others in Tunisia; and Wend Kuuni, too, was a winner in Burkina Faso."

In Serge Adda's opinion, it is a matter of getting the African public's taste to evolve. "There is a lot of self-applause about our own genius, and yet, whether we like it or not, our public prefers American films." He went on to report that in July 1995, out of 28 full-length films broadcast by Canal Horizon in several countries, Rue Princesse only came fifth in its country of origin, Côte d'Ivoire, with a 46% audience rating behind four American films, all of which had a 75% rating. It came in 14th in Senegal and 26th in Tunisia, all of which clearly illustrates the lack of an inter-African market.

What can be done to ensure that what money there is goes into boosting local production? In the participants' view, television must become the African film industry's second chance. By commissioning films TV can make them known to a wider public. They also stressed the need to protect the film industry, taking inspiration from the "French model", a semi-liberal system based both on market forces and on political commitment associated with protectionist legislation (10% of cinema takings reinvested in French productions, and quotas for the televised broadcasting of European productions).

But this model "is not necessarily reproducible," cautioned Dominique Wallon, a European Commission expert. European films have a real market base - 130 million tickets sold per year. Africa's domestic markets are too small - 3.6 million tickets sold a year in Burkina Faso, for example.

In Adda's view, the immediate future of the African film business therefore depends on the European market, provided that France helps it to get a firm foothold there. "Our film industry will be saved the day this country, as part of its action to promote the French language, takes the necessary steps to have it incorporated into European broadcasting quotas," he maintains.

For the time being, we must continue making pictures, concluded the Burkina Faso film-maker Idrissa Ouedraogo. "It will be through quantity that quality films will emerge that can be seen the world over."

Sophie BOUKHARI
THE GAIN AFTER THE DRAIN

A new electronic network aims to help Latin America and the Caribbean recuperate and retain their scientists’ knowledge.

“For years, Latin America and the Caribbean have been trying to recuperate their most precious resource lost: their scientists. Unsuccessful in the past, now they might have a second chance.” The light at the end of the tunnel for Colombia’s Ambassador to UNESCO, S.E. Pablo Gabriel Obregón is a blip on a screen indicating a new electronic network - the focus of a round-table held on 21 May at Headquarters intended to find ways of stemming the region’s brain drain.

But before going into the technical details, participants pointed out that “brain drain”, while a catchy-term, is out-of-date. First used in the 60s to refer to the situation in which scientists, mostly from the developing world, left home to work in industrialized countries, the term has given way to new jargon, explains Jacques Gaillard of the French research organization ORSTOM. The “brains” that previously drained now “overflow” and take to “transit” either “internally” (by moving from public to private labs) or “externally” by leaving the country. The real excitement comes with “brain gain” whereby “researchers return with scientific and socio-professional values which they might not have had when they left”, explains Gaillard.

Seeking to maximize these gains, a new electronic network has been created by the Association of Latin American Scientists and that of Researchers for Scientific and Technological Advancement in Colombia (ACASTC) with other partners. The goal is to help the region’s scientists keep abreast of progress made abroad and enable expatriates to contribute to their countries’ development. UNESCO financially helped identify and list 2,300 researchers and technical professionals, working in and outside the region on an Internet server. The next step lies in developing information exchanges in specific fields.

But it takes more than just an administrative decision or approved financing to create a functioning network: cooperation is the key which cannot be counted on. As many pointed out, researchers increasingly work in corporate labs whose owners consider their work to be top-secret.

Guillermo Lozano of ACASTC is hoping to side-step this resistance. For example, by linking up with organizations like UNESCO, the network takes on an international character which might whet the appetites of corporations looking to expand their markets.

This international dimension also fosters a form of cooperation difficult to find at the national level as local researchers are often competing for the same grants, explains Radolf Suarez, 31, who has just finished his thesis in France in robotics and plans on heading home to Colombia. He says that the trend of interdisciplinary and international research makes it easier to return, provided that he has access to such a network. “You can have the best equipped laboratory in the world, but you still need mass-criticism to work.”

Amy OTCHET
From 5 to 6 July, a meeting of experts will be held in Santiago de Cuba to define a programme of cultural tourism for the Caribbean region. The meeting will be held under the auspices of the UNESCO’s STUDY OF THE SLAVE ROUTE. SUMMER SCHOOL ON SOLAR ELECTRICITY takes place at Headquarters from 8 to 26 July with some 30 francophone participants attending workshops and seminars providing technical training on alternative energies for rural and remote areas. WORLD POPULATION DAY will be marked throughout the United Nations System on 11 July. At Headquarters from 29 July to 2 August, the CLIMATE AND MARINE RESOURCES IN THE NORTHWEST OF AFRICA will be the focus of an international workshop on space oceanography at which experts will discuss the possibilities of using satellites to manage and develop the region’s coastal zones. From 2 to 6 September in Bogota (Colombia), a committee of experts from Latin America, the Caribbean and Canada will examine the impact of COMMUNICATION AND COPYRIGHT IN THE INFORMATION SOCIETY on basic infrastructure, rights protection as well as social and cultural dynamics. INTERNATIONAL LITERACY DAY, marked throughout the United Nations System on 8 September, will be celebrated at Headquarters with a ceremony awarding the International Literacy Prizes on 9 September.

Coinciding with the World Solar Summit in Harare, Zimbabwe (September) will explore the potential of renewable energies through a series of analytical and field-based articles. Faced with the world’s increasing energy demands, it is imperative that we develop alternative modes of production and consumption. In this context, analytical articles will highlight the benefits of renewable energies while also examining the difficulties or obstacles in switching to them. The dossier then looks to the field with three projects involving different energy forms - solar, wind and biogas - in three regions.