



General Conference

37th Session, Paris, 2013

37 C

United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

Organisation
des Nations Unies
pour l'éducation,
la science et la culture

Organización
de las Naciones Unidas
para la Educación,
la Ciencia y la Cultura

Организация
Объединенных Наций по
вопросам образования,
науки и культуры

منظمة الأمم المتحدة
للتربية والعلم والثقافة

联合国教育、
科学及文化组织

Item 9.2 of the provisional agenda

37 C/27

30 October 2013

Original: English

CONSOLIDATED REPORT ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE 1974 RECOMMENDATION CONCERNING EDUCATION FOR INTERNATIONAL UNDERSTANDING, COOPERATION AND PEACE AND EDUCATION RELATING TO HUMAN RIGHTS AND FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOMS

OUTLINE

Background: In accordance with 34 C/Resolution 87, 177 EX/Decision 35 (I) and 184 EX/Decision 20, the Executive Board has monitored the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Cooperation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms. Pursuant to 192 EX/Decision 20 (III), the Director-General hereby submits the consolidated report on the implementation by Member States of the Recommendation.

Purpose: This document reports on the results of the Fifth Consultation on the Implementation of the Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Cooperation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (covering the period 2009-2012). The analysis was prepared on the basis of 55 national reports from Member States received by the Secretariat.

Decision required: Paragraph 6

BACKGROUND AND CONSOLIDATED REPORT

1. Adopted by UNESCO's General Conference in 1974, the Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Cooperation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (referred as to the "1974 Recommendation") provides a normative framework for promoting values and principles of human rights in and through education, by stipulating guiding principles and offering a basis for exchanges of experiences and lessons learned among Member States.

2. The Fifth Consultation on the Implementation of the 1974 Recommendation (covering the period 2009-2012) was conducted, in line with Article VIII of UNESCO's Constitution and Article 17 of the Rules of Procedure concerning recommendations to Member States and international conventions covered by the terms of Article IV, paragraph 4, of the Constitution, and pursuant to 34 C/Resolution 87, 177 EX/Decision 35 (I) and 184 EX/Decision 20. The consolidated report of the Consultation has been examined by the 192nd session of the Executive Board (document 192 EX/20 Part III) and is reproduced in Annex I of this document.

COMMENTS FROM THE EXECUTIVE BOARD

3. The consolidated report is made based on information from national reports as well as resources available in-house. As of 30 July 2013, the Secretariat received 55 reports from all the five regions of UNESCO (see Annex II for the list of countries). There was a significant increase in comparison with the previous Fourth Consultation (covering the period of 2005-2008) during which 37 countries submitted their respective reports. The Secretariat also acknowledged with appreciation the reports submitted by Bolivia (Plurinational State of) and Uruguay received after the deadline.

4. At the 192nd session of the Executive Board, the Secretariat presented the consolidated report, highlighting the key findings: there have been steady progresses in Member States' development of constitutional, legal, policy and/or administrative frameworks while there is a continuing gap between policy and practice; Member States are trying to translate the principal values of the 1974 Recommendation into specific competencies so as to emphasize the learner's development of the necessary attitudes and skills. In relation to this, Member States place a high importance on the need of assessing the impact of teaching and learning of human rights values; violence and bullying in educational settings are reported as the major concern of many Member States; and policy leadership remains to be a major challenge in promoting human rights values.

5. Through its 192 EX/Decision 20 (III) (see Annex III), the Executive Board invited the Director-General to transmit to the General Conference, at its 37th session, the consolidated report on the implementation by Member States of the 1974 Recommendation.

PROPOSED RESOLUTION

6. In light of the foregoing, the General Conference may wish to adopt the following resolution:

The General Conference,

1. Recalling 34 C/Resolution 87, 177 EX/Decision 35 (I), 184 EX/Decision 20, and 192 EX/Decision 20 (III),
2. Reaffirming the importance of the 1974 Recommendation and of its implementation by Member States in order to further promote values and principles of human rights in and through education,

3. Having examined 37 C/27 containing the report on the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Cooperation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms,
4. Endorses 192 EX/Decision 20 (III), in particular its request to the Director-General to make the national reports available online through the newly-established global database on the right to education;
5. Notes with appreciation that 57 Member States submitted their reports under the Fifth Consultation (as of 16 October 2013) and commends the efforts made by Member States to give increasing importance to education for peace and human rights;
6. Invites all Member States to strengthen their efforts to ensure the full and comprehensive implementation of the 1974 Recommendation;
7. Encourages the Director-General, in close collaboration with other institutions and agencies specialized in peace, human rights and democratic citizenship education, to support Member States in putting into practice the values of the 1974 Recommendation;
8. Requests the Director-General to take appropriate follow-up action to the Fifth Consultation and to initiate the sixth Consultation of Member States;
9. Invites the Director-General to transmit to it, at its 39th session, the next consolidated report on the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation, and decides to include an item on this matter on the agenda of its 39th session.

ANNEX I

IMPLEMENTATION OF THE 1974 RECOMMENDATION CONCERNING EDUCATION FOR INTERNATIONAL UNDERSTANDING, COOPERATION AND PEACE AND EDUCATION RELATING TO HUMAN RIGHTS AND FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOMS

Introduction

1. Adopted by UNESCO's General Conference in 1974, the Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Cooperation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms provides a normative framework for promoting values and principles of human rights in and through education, by stipulating guiding principles and offering a basis for exchanges of experiences and lessons learned among Member States.
2. The values promoted by the 1974 Recommendation have been integrated in more recent international and regional instruments and frameworks, such as the World Programme for Human Rights Education (2005-ongoing) adopted in 2004 by the United Nations General Assembly and the UN Declaration for Human Rights Education and Training (2011). UNESCO is member of the International Contact Group for Citizenship and Human Rights Education composed of major intergovernmental organizations to better coordinate actions at the international level, create synergy in their support given to Member States and improve information sharing.
3. The Fifth Consultation was conducted, in line with Article VIII of UNESCO's Constitution and Article 17 of the Rules of Procedure concerning recommendations to Member States and international conventions covered by the terms of Article IV, paragraph 4, of the Constitution, and pursuant to 34 C/Resolution 87, 177 EX/Decision 35 (I) and 184 EX/Decision 20. In August 2012, the Director-General addressed a Circular Letter (ref: CL/3997) to Ministers responsible for relations with UNESCO, enclosing a questionnaire, to request periodic reports on the measures taken at national level for the implementation of the Recommendation. As of 30 July 2013, UNESCO received 55 reports (see Annex for the list of countries). The present report synthesizes the information provided by Member States in response to the questionnaire as well as resources available in-house.

Application of the Recommendation and national legal framework

4. Member States were requested to report on the general legal framework established at the country level for the implementation of the Recommendation. The reports indicate the increasingly important place given to education for peace and human rights. National constitutional and legislative frameworks have been developed and reinforced to facilitate the implementation of the provisions contained in the Recommendation.
5. General indications on the ways in which the administrative and policy frameworks comply with the commitments under the Recommendation have been provided by almost all reporting Member States. Various measures, such as national plans and programmes, policies and other administrative measures are described as important ways to disseminate the rights and values set forth in the Recommendation.
6. Constitutional and legislative frameworks are clearly mentioned by almost all reporting Member States as ways to protect the rights set forth in the 1974 Recommendation. For example, Guatemala's Constitution stipulates that one of the main goals of education is to acquire the knowledge of the universal values and underlines its national interest in the systematic teaching of human rights.

7. Various reports describe their respective legal norms showing that the legislative provisions have been introduced to implement the Recommendation. Many Member States such as Austria, Bangladesh, Belgium, Peru and Slovenia have adopted a legislative framework that incorporates the provisions of the Recommendation. As reported by some Member States, notably Mali and Uzbekistan, setting up administrative frameworks at the State level is an effective means to promote education for a culture of peace and human rights.

8. Curriculum is frequently mentioned as an important instrument to put in practice the Recommendation. Moreover, the implementation of the Recommendation in Member States has been supported especially through National Commissions for UNESCO and in cooperation with UNESCO Chairs and Associated Schools Project network (ASPnet). Furthermore, many reports indicated as a way of raising awareness on the Recommendation, the commemoration of the international and/or national days for peace, human rights and other relevant issues.

Putting into practice the Recommendation: key findings and examples of action

9. Member States reported a wide range of themes and issues addressed in their respective educational plans: universal values such as tolerance and respect, solidarity, human dignity, a culture of peace, also in link with religious and traditional values of different societies; world culture, diversity, indigenous knowledge; child protection, international humanitarian laws, child, women's and human rights, freedoms, duties and responsibilities, citizenship, patriotism, social justice, rule of law, democracy, gender equality; peaceful resolution of conflicts, violence in schools, sustainable development, sexuality education, HIV and AIDS, health, substance abuse, security, media literacy; prevention of fascism, racism, discrimination, xenophobia, etc. These issues are integrated into the teaching subjects such as civic, moral, values educations, social science, languages, history, geography, religious studies, life skills, sciences, philosophy, literature and art.

10. Stand-alone and cross-cutting approaches are often mixed in education for peace and human rights. Most countries adopted a cross-cutting approach by integrating these components in major education policies, curriculum and teaching subjects. In Romania, a series of curricular recommendations made at the national level allow schools to include the themes of democracy and human rights as a subject and/or in a cross-curricular manner or in the form of educational projects.

11. All reporting Member States make efforts to go beyond a knowledge-based approach. In Andorra and Bahrain among many others, a competency-based approach has been put in place with the aim of developing attitudes, skills and knowledge related to learner's personal and civic life and professional activities. Such competencies include systems thinking, ability to show respect for cultural diversity and environment, critical thinking, analytical and communication skills. In this regard, many countries link education policy with other policies such as youth policy as a strategy for further engaging young people in concrete actions at the community level encouraging them to apply what they learn at school in real life situations. In Niger, through the National Youth Council, youth are engaged in the socio-economic development of the country. New Zealand has developed a youth-focused programme around natural disasters.

12. Member States reported on their efforts not only in formal education ranging from ECCE to higher education, but also in favour of parents, policy-makers, civil servants, police, the military, judges and prison guardians, media professional, religious leaders, social workers and private sector. The role of non-formal education was underlined in many reports. For example, Togo reported the adult literacy programmes deal with the issues related to human rights, citizenship and discrimination against women. Several Member States including Morocco mentioned UNESCO Clubs and peace clubs as effective non-formal means reaching out to young people.

13. States in post-conflict situation and democratic transition face numerous challenges in terms of increasing political will and interest of educational professionals in a culture of peace and human rights, managing continuous tensions, and educating new actors for peace by engaging them in

dialogue and action. Training is provided to the personnel of the army in Côte d'Ivoire, and in Rwanda, efforts are made to raise awareness in secondary schools and higher education institutions, rehabilitations centres, solidarity camps and camps for demobilized military staff. In the Democratic Republic of the Congo, research on the management of conflicts and their impact resulted in the integration of education for peace and human rights in school programmes.

14. Efforts have been made towards a more inclusive education. Burkina Faso underlined the importance of ensuring both access and quality for girls, learners with disabilities and minorities. Mexico has developed an indigenous bilingual model. Several Member States, including Albania, have specific policies for Roma. In many countries, inclusive education policies address indigenous peoples, people of African descent, lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender (LGBT), populations in rural areas, people with low levels of education and literacy skills, unemployed adults, the elderly and immigrants.

15. Member States have undertaken measures for improving the learning environment. For example, Bosnia and Herzegovina and Tunisia promote a healthy psycho-social environment and organizational settings of classrooms and other learning spaces conducive to values and principles of the Recommendation. Schools are considered as a place to experiment the concept of living together and can be better utilized for improving inter-ethnic relations and preventing violence. In Dominican Republic, criteria are set for facilitating a positive school environment conducive to learning such as an atmosphere of respect, security and cooperation in the classrooms, procedures for establishing sanctions. In Ethiopia, Mauritius and Zimbabwe, child parliaments, student governments and codes of conduct are put into place. Turkey's "Democratic Citizenship and Human Rights Education Project" addresses a democratic school culture being piloted involving all school employees, students and parents. Hungary's 'Educating Space' project promotes participative planning involving users in shaping inclusive and sustainable environments.

16. Almost all reporting states mentioned violence and bullying, including gender-based violence, as a major concern. In Philippines, secondary schools advocate for a child-friendly school system where bullying and corporal punishment are not accepted, involving students and the community. Poland's "Safe and Friendly School Programme" aims at improving competences of education professionals and parents as well as students in building constructive inter-personal relationships. The Republic of Korea combines the methodologies of human rights education with school counselling to facilitate conflict resolution. In Czech Republic, each school has an advisor who helps to prevent and solve conflicts in cooperation with teachers and other school staff. The "Working Environment Act" in Norway defines the school's obligations as "all pupils in primary, lower secondary and upper secondary schools are entitled to a good physical and psycho-social environment that will promote health, well-being and learning". In Chad, youth organizations encourage members to intervene as mediators in conflicts and disputes among peers. Spain created an observatory to collect and analyse information to diagnose problems and suggest measures for a safe school life.

17. A gap between policies and practices was noted in several reports. In most, teaching of peace and human rights is made compulsory by the national policies and curriculum, but some reported that the implementation is limited and that its quality remains as a challenge due to the lack of capacity of schools and teachers and inadequate teaching materials. Both institutional and individual capacity developments are considered essential. In the majority of the countries, human rights education is included in pre-service and in-service training for teachers and head teacher training. Germany suggested that more extensive and practice-relevant human rights-oriented pre-service and in-service training could be the most important leverage. Another continuous challenge is the lack of coordination and synergy among diverse structures and actors (e.g. ministries, national human rights institutions, NGOs, universities, development partners). The role of research was highlighted in filling the gap by Sweden: research informs the development of quality learning materials for schools; a collaborative mechanism is put in place in Japan between ASPnet and universities.

18. Several Member States emphasized the need for a systemic framework and tools for assessing impact on learners. For example, Italy has a policy for systemically evaluating the behaviours of students. The following are some of the indicators and quantitative and qualitative means of measurement of the effects of education on learners in terms of attitudes and behaviours reported by Member States: the atmosphere in classrooms on learners' satisfaction with the education they receive and their learning results; the "Civil Empowerment Index" studies show how pupils use their civil rights (Lithuania); surveys and studies using questionnaires, interviews and observation of attitudes and behaviours; changes in the number of violent acts in educational settings; evaluation of student initiatives, projects and competitions promoting peace and human rights in schools; youth engagement in voluntary work; exams; survey involving parents and the community at large. Several countries took part in the International Civic and Citizenship Education Study (ICCS, 2009) of the International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement (IEA).

Lessons learnt and way forward

19. Challenges. Education alone cannot fully promote the values of the Recommendation although all levels of education need to be prepared to take necessary actions whenever incidents occur; changes in political leadership may change thrusts of the ongoing efforts made by schools and communities; in some countries, these issues remain optional in higher education; pedagogy and teaching methods need to be improved in terms of adequacy and consistency; disparities between theory and social practices, including negative effects of media and the Internet need to be addressed, taking into account that young people learn informally from their home and environment; lack of capacities of school leadership, teachers, textbook authors, etc. to respond to new curricular demands.

20. Suggestions for future actions by Member States and UNESCO: (a) Further promote legislative and administrative measures for every relevant institution in view of a mandatory and systematic human rights education throughout society within a lifelong learning perspective; (b) promote continuous incentives for activities in this field using both bottom-up and top-down approaches; (c) ensure a systemic mechanism for the monitoring and evaluation of the policy implementation; (d) develop tools and framework for assessing the impact on learners, in terms of attitudes, knowledge, skills and behaviour; (e) improve coordination among existing structures and harmonize actions; (f) increase awareness-raising and capacity-building of policy-makers; (g) increase community participation in educational activities; (h) develop and promote informal learning programmes using information and communication technologies (ICT) and social media; (i) formulate strategies valuing and linking with local knowledge as appropriate; (j) further improve quality of teaching materials and pedagogy and more participatory and practical training programmes and make them available also using with ICT and other education media; (k) increase regional and international cooperation; and (l) share good practices and lessons learned. A compilation of examples of action submitted by all reporting Member States to the Fifth Consultation is being prepared and shared by the Secretariat on relevant occasions.

ANNEX II

LIST OF THE COUNTRIES HAVING SUBMITTED NATIONAL REPORT

Albania	Kazakhstan
Algeria	Kuwait
Andorra	Lithuania
Armenia	Mali
Australia	Mauritius
Austria	Mexico
Bahrain	Monaco
Bangladesh	Morocco
Belgium	New Zealand
Bolivia (Plurinational State of)	Niger
Bosnia and Herzegovina	Norway
Burkina Faso	Pakistan
Burundi	Peru
Chad	Philippines
Colombia	Poland
Congo	Republic of Korea
Côte d'Ivoire	Romania
Czech Republic	Rwanda
Democratic Republic of the Congo	Slovenia
Dominican Republic	Spain
Equatorial Guinea	Sweden
Ethiopia	Syrian Arab Republic
Germany	Togo
Georgia	Tunisia
Guatemala	Turkey
Hungary	Uruguay
Iran (Islamic Republic of)	Uzbekistan
Italy	Zimbabwe
Japan	

(57 countries as of 16 October 2013)

ANNEX III

192 EX/DECISION 20 (III)

IMPLEMENTATION OF THE 1974 RECOMMENDATION CONCERNING EDUCATION FOR INTERNATIONAL UNDERSTANDING, COOPERATION AND PEACE AND EDUCATION RELATING TO HUMAN RIGHTS AND FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOMS

The Executive Board,

1. Recalling 34 C/Resolution 87, 177 EX/Decision 35 (I) and 184 EX/Decision 20,
2. Having examined document 192 EX/20 Part III and the report of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations thereon (192 EX/45),
3. Notes with appreciation the replies of the 55 Member States which submitted their reports within the Fifth Consultation on the Implementation of the 1974 Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Cooperation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms;
4. Takes note of the concrete application of the 1974 Recommendation by Member States to further promote a culture of peace and human rights in and through education;
5. Requests the Director-General to ensure that the results of the Fifth Consultation be shared with the Office of United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights as UNESCO's contribution to the monitoring of the second phase of the World Programme for Human Rights Education;
6. Invites the Director-General to share the results of the Fifth Consultation with other specialized agencies through the International Contact Group for Citizenship and Human Rights Education;
7. Requests the Director-General to make the national reports available online through the newly established global database on the right to education and further requests the Director-General to transmit document 192 EX/20 Part III to the General Conference at its 37th session, together with the Executive Board's comments and any observations or comments that the Director-General may wish to make.